

## MDVL 302: WEEK 3: READING GUIDE: 1

### REASON

Recap: Reason in Guillaume's *Rose*:

46 (from 2982) - 48 (up to 3083)

NB: the number in brackets refers to the number at the start of a section (marked in the margin in your text, the Horgan translation), from the line numbering in the original Old French verse, in the standard (Lecoy) modern scholarly edition.

I've pulled out four strands/layers of the text, in the Reason section:

\*\*\* = Layers 1 and 2 will be important for Tuesday's lecture, and passages for commentary (midterm, final exam) may be taken from them.

#### LAYER 1: PURE REASON / ARGUMENT

Lover ponders, reflects, contemplates courses of action, in an emotional manner more reminiscent of first-person voice love-lyric than solid, clear, cold argument:  
63-64.

Reason and the lover in conversation, inc. the Socratic method and ticking the Lover off for being a forgetful/inattentive student:

\*\*\*64 (from 4199) - 65 (to 4232)

71 ("Thus Reason preached to me ..." to end of the page)

103 (from 6747) - 104

Reason's jibes at the Lover for needing proof:

\*\*\*84 ("Prove it, Lady...") - 85 ("...take this as your analogy.")

\*\*\*96 ("And if you are indifferent [...] I am ready to find a reason" + last 2 lines) - 97 (end of paragraph: "...have no raison d'être.")

The Lover misses the main point in an excursus about Love and Justice, jumping on a-- minor? "throwaway?"-- detail:

\*\*\*85 ("Justice reigned [...] as the book says.")

\*\*\*87 ("Lady, you have certainly paid me well...") - 88 (to 5733).

Reason then becomes flustered.

Reason's conclusion, Lover's response & rejection (see: 85-88 above):

\*\*\*105 (from 6845) - 107 (to 7007)

\*\*\*108 (from 7033) - 110.

#### LAYER 2: SET PIECES / SERMONS

Reason on love, and on the true/good love that is friendship:

65 (from 4232) - 67 (to 4391)

72 - 73 (to 4739)

Reason on "False love," desire for gain, and Fortune:

\*\*\*73 (from 4739) - 82 (to 5341)

\*\*\*90 (from 5809) - 91 (to 5891)

\*\*\*95 (from 6221) - 96 ("...honours, and powers.")

\*\*\*104 (from 6783) - 105 (to 6845)

## MDVL 302: WEEK 3: READING GUIDE: 2

### LAYER 3: tangents, rants, off-course rambles

On Youth and Age:

67 (from 4391) - 69 (to 4515)

On avoiding pregnancy, or, Shame vs. Delight; gifts and possessions (possessing vs. being possessed); excessive love:

69 (from 4515) - 71 (to top of page)

Side-debate about Love and Justice:

83 (from 5404) - 87

Reason misses the Lover's point, or side-steps it, or returns to her sermon (or some combination thereof), and then propositions the Lover:

88 (from 5733) - 90

### LAYER 4: EXEMPLA

Supporting evidence, gratuitous story-telling, retelling of Classical material (literary & historical), and other detail

Cicero:

72 (from 4717): woven into Reason's argument

83 (from 5375): used as counter by the Lover

Fortune's home:

91 (from 5891) - 94 (to end of page)

Fortune in action:

94-95, 97 (from 6313) - 99 (to 6459): Seneca, Nero Suetonius

99 ("Fair father...") - 100 (6563): Croesus and his wise daughter Phania, interpreting a dream: to be read in the light of the very beginning of Guillaume's poem (p. 3), on Macrobius

101-103: Recent/contemporary history: Manfred, Conradin, and Charles d'Anjou

103 (paragraph starting at 6711): Summary of cases cited

Homer:

103-104, woven into argument

Ptolemy's *Almagest* (early encyclopedic work):

107 (from 7007) - 108 (to 7033)

---

## FRIEND

Light relief, in the form of practical advice: step by step, blow by blow, cynical, manipulative, two-faced, hypocritical, concrete and earthy... Contrast with Reason railing against desire for gain, ex. 73-82; and contrast Friend's section's different tone, approach, and structure:

- The citation of authorities takes a different shape and style here: in the form of name-dropping, elegant throw-away gestures lightly peppering Friend's advice: Charlemagne, Ovid, Theseus, Solomon, Juvenal, etc.
- Tales are embedded within tales, in a sophisticated structure which may confuse the

## MDVL 302: WEEK 3: READING GUIDE: 3

reader: making it unclear who is speaking / to whom an argument or view should be attributed. Context may be important: as opposed to taking words or sections out of context (see also: Reason, 85-88)

- \*\*\* = Passages that will appear in lectures (in counterpoint with the *Querelle de la Rose* debate) and/or may appear on the midterm or final exam: important parts of the reading

Tactical approach 1: hypocrisy

111 (from 7251) - 121 (to 7837):

advice on dealing with Love, approaching the fortress, Evil Tongue, the Old Woman, Jealousy, Fear, Shame, Rebuff, other gatekeepers, Fair Welcome (quite a seductive courting, this last one). Note that the plot vacillates between an aim/quest of union with the Rose, and one of liberating Fair Welcome; these may sometimes appear to be one and the same thing, and sometimes one or other disappears from the scene.

Approach 2: an easy short-cut to capturing the castle: Lavish Giving, Wealth.

121 (7857) - 122 (to 7931)

From the particular to the general: how to deal with women by seducing them with gifts:

\*\*\*126 (from 8159) - 128 (end of paragraph starting at 8307)

\*\*\*148 (from 9649) - 153: note that it's possible that there are no good women... (152, section of l. 9887)

EMBEDDED TALE 1

*Exemplum* / anecdote from personal lived experience: Poverty, Unrestrained Generosity, Fortune

122 (from 7931) - 125 (to 8085)

EMBEDDED TALE 2

Nostalgia for the Golden Age and equality:

\*\*\*128 (from 8307) - 130 (to 8425)

\*\*\*144 (from 9391) - 146 (fourth line from the top, "... for they loved one another with a natural love")

EMBEDDED TALE 3

Within 2: Friend tells the tale of the jealous husband: impassioned speech, verbal attack on his (i.e. husband's) wife, featuring a critique of marriage, and bemoaning the lack of good honest women:

\*\*\*130 (from 8425) - 134 (second-last paragraph)

135 (from 8803) - 143 (up to 9331)

\*\*\*143 (8803) - 144 (to 9391): as retold by Friend, a purportedly hypothetical case of wife-beating

EMBEDDED TALE 4

Within 3: who tells this tale?...

134 (last paragraph) - 135 (to 8803): embedded tale of Abelard and Heloise

APPENDIX: EARLY CIVILIZATION

The fall from grace / the Golden Age: Fraud, Sin, Misfortune, Contentment, Pride, Covetousness, Avarice, Envy, Poverty, Larceny:

146 (near top of page) - 148 (to 9635)

Which explains why gold is important and women need to be bought (i.e., Approach 2).

## MDVL 302: WEEK 3: READING GUIDE: 4

### FALSE SEEMING (a.k.a. False Semblance)

154-158: the Lover puts Friend's advice into practice: Wealth (feat. Unrestrained Generosity, Poverty, Hunger, Theft, Faint Heart); Evil Tongue.

This next section (up to 166) and its resumption after False Seeming's account of himself (from to 190) is one of most realistic parts of the romance: speeches to troops before battle, formal court procedure, oaths of allegiance / swearing fealty...

Love and the Lover: master/apprentice, teacher/student, priest/priesthood member at confession. Reminder that this work does have *some* plot, and what it was: although the three comforts of Pleasant Looks, Hope, and Fair Welcome are gone. Love summons his troops, the Army of Love, to a parliament: barons and their followers. False Seeming turns up, somewhat out of place.

158-161 (to 10465)

Love addresses his troops: discrete name-dropping (the Classical amorous experts); note especially the references to Guillaume de Lorris and Jean de Meun, the future writers of the *Mirror of Lovers* (as renamed here)

**\*\*\*161 (10465) - 164 (10651)**

Strategic planning: realistic, feat. popular sayings and real-world peoples (Breton, etc.); except for the reminder that Love's mother is Venus (165, 10719; plus Saturnine comment--166 paragraph 2--an intratextual joke with reference to p. 85-88...). Love continues his address, with occasional responses from his assembled barons:

164 (10651) - 167 (10889)

False Seeming, of crucial importance to the planned action, is accepted into the Army of Love: but he is first subject to formal (and properly legal-style) questioning by Love, gives an account of himself, and this includes an impassioned excursus on the End of the World being nigh/upon us. Including some highly inflammatory remarks about greed, corruption, and the "religious" i.e. clergy (and not the "secular," "temporal," or "worldly": everyone else): certain orders in particular:

167 (10889) - 169 ("Without further delay..."): introduction

False Seeming: Critique of "the religious" and their hypocrisy (especially the Cistercians, a.k.a. White monks). References to characters from the *Romance of Reynard* (the next text in MDVL 302). "The habit does not make the monk"; wolves in sheep's clothing:

**\*\*\*169 (" ' Barons, hear me now...") - 171 (to 11133)**

False Seeming: Anti-Franciscan attack: on poverty in imitation of Christ, vs. working with one's hands (feat. Solomon, Justinian, St. Paul):

**\*\*\*172 (end of page) - 176 (end of page)**

False Seeming: Disguise, deceit, being two-faced, and the liar paradox:

**\*\*\*171 (just after 11133, "I am certainly a traitor...") - 172 (end of page)**

**\*\*\*178 (from 11507) - 179 (to 11570)**

**\*\*\*184 (11897) - 185 (to 11985)**

A significant digression is woven in, relating to recent politics re. Franciscans, Paris University, academic independence, heresy, and the End of the World. I will mention this only

## MDVL 302: WEEK 3: READING GUIDE: 5

briefly in class: re. the way that recent real-world references are combined with references to the Antichrist and Apocalypse: as this is important to how the *Romance of the Rose* functions as an ALLEGORY. The following section is tough, elliptical, enigmatic, and very definitely optional extra reading:

177 - 178 (to 11507)

179 (from 11607) - 184 (up to 11897)

False Seeming and Constrained Abstinence defeat Evil Tongue, enabling the taking of the castle. Tactics: disguise, lying, using a mixture of feigned simple pathos and brilliant sophistry.

185 (from 11985) - 190 (end of page)

WARNING, contains graphic violence (190, from 12331 to end)