

# RESTITUTION – UNJUST ENRICHMENT

Course Title	Course Code	Term	Credit Value	Teaching Times & Room
Restitution – Unjust Enrichment	LAW 436	Autumn 2022	3	9:30am–11:00am, Tuesdays & Thursdays Room 111
Course Instructor	Email Address	Office Location	Office Hours	
Assistant Professor Samuel Beswick	beswick@allard.ubc.ca	Allard Hall 444	By appointment.	

## CASEBOOK CONTENTS

### Cases

1. <b><i>Peel Municipality v. Canada &amp; Ontario</i>, 1992 CanLII 21, (1992) 98 DLR (4th) 140 (SCC)</b> <i>Could City recover from Crown costs of housing juvenile delinquents under ultra vires statute?</i> History – Crown liability – middle path – benefit (services) – incontrovertible benefit – incidental collateral benefit – juristic reasons – JR residual reason – general justice – UF ultra vires statute	1
2. <b><i>Gidney v. Shank</i>, 1995 CanLII 16455, [1995] 5 WWR 385 (MB QB); rev'd, 1995 CanLII 16347, [1996] 2 WWR 383 (MB CA)</b> <i>Could canoe refurbisher recover refurbishment expenses from canoe owner?</i> Benefit (services) – incontrovertible benefit – autonomy – JR gift – JR other – absence of relationship – UF mistake of fact – monetary remedy	17
3. <b><i>Stevested Machinery &amp; Engineering Ltd. v. Metso Paper Ltd.</i>, 2014 BCCA 91</b> <i>Could segment-holder manufacturer recover payment for work done from intermediary?</i> Benefit – valuation – incontrovertible benefit – JR contract – JR residual reason – risk-taking – UF failure of consideration – remedial constructive trust	30
4. <b><i>Moore v. Sweet</i>, 2018 SCC 52, [1]-[96] (majority), [97]-[144] (dissent)</b> <i>Could ex-wife recover life insurance policy proceeds from ex-husband's new spouse?</i> Three-party case – corresponding deprivation – interceptive benefit – JR statute ( <i>Insurance Act</i> ) – JR residual reason – remedial constructive trust	42
5. <b><i>Sun Rype Products Ltd v. Archer Daniels Midland Co.</i>, 2013 SCC 58</b> <i>Could high fructose corn syrup purchasers recover overpayments from price-fixing companies?</i> Class action – deprivation – indirect subtraction of benefit – quantification – passing on defence – <i>Pro-Sys Consultants</i>	65
6. <b><i>Garland v. Consumers' Gas Co.</i>, 2004 SCC 25</b> <i>Could gas consumer recover unlawful penalty charges paid to regulated utility company?</i> Unlawful penalty – class action – benefit (money) – juristic reasons – JR statute ( <i>Criminal Code</i> ) – JR residual reason – statutory defence – change of position defence – passing on defence	74
7. <b><i>Pacific National Investments Ltd. v. Victoria City</i>, 2004 SCC 75</b> <i>Could developer of Victoria City waterfront recover value of extra works done for the City?</i> JR gift – JR contract – JR statute ( <i>Local Government Act</i> ; <i>Land Title Act</i> ) – JR other – JR residual reason – UF ultra vires demand – UF mistake	86

8. <b><i>Kim v. Choi</i>, 2020 BCCA 98</b> <i>Could immigrant Kim recover overstated operating expenses of restaurant bought from Choi?</i> JR contract – UF illegality – illegality defence – unconscionability	98
9. <b><i>Atlantic Lottery Corp. Inc. v. Babstock</i>, 2020 SCC 19</b> <i>Could video slot machine gamblers recover their losses from lottery corporation?</i> Class action – Crown liability – JR contract – JR statute ( <i>Video Lottery Regulations</i> ; <i>Criminal Code</i> ) – UF ultra vires statute – wrongful conduct – disgorgement remedy – waiver of tort	113
10. <b><i>Gladstone v. Canada</i>, 2005 SCC 21</b> <i>Could indigenous fishermen recover interest on fish seized by the Crown?</i> Crown liability – public law – indigenous plaintiffs – abandoned criminal prosecution – JR statute ( <i>Fisheries Act</i> ) – UF legal compulsion – interest remedy – remedial constructive trust	122
11. <b><i>Kerr v. Baranow</i>; <i>Vanasse v. Seguin</i>, 2011 SCC 10</b> <i>Could common law spouse recover half of husband's assets on separation of their relationship?</i> Middle path – joint family venture – JR other – mutual benefit – JR residual reason – monetary remedy – quantum meruit – value survived – remedial constructive trust – resulting trust	127
12. <b><i>RBC Dominion Securities Inc. v. Dawson</i>, 1994 CanLII 4525, (1994) 111 DLR (4th) 230 (Nfld CA)</b> <i>Could securities brokerage recover overpayments mistakenly made on sale of shares?</i> UF mistake of fact – negligent II – change of position defence – estoppel – monetary remedy – quantum – interest remedy	150
13. <b><i>Pro-Sys Consultants Ltd. v. Microsoft Corp.</i>, 2013 SCC 57</b> <i>Could consumers recover payments on price-inflated software pre-installed on computers?</i> Class action – deprivation – indirect subtraction of benefit – offensive use of passing on – passing on defence – remedial constructive trust – <i>Sun Rype Products</i>	158
14. <b><i>Louie v. Lastman</i>, 2001 CanLII 28066, (2001) 199 D.L.R. (4th) 741 (ON SC); <i>aff'd</i>, 2002 CanLII 45061, (2002) 217 D.L.R. (4th) 269 (ON CA)</b> <i>Could mother recover expenses of raising her two (now adult) sons from their father?</i> Joint family venture – JR mutual benefit – limitations defence – laches defence – rescission	172
15. <b><i>BMP Global Distribution Inc. v. Bank of Nova Scotia</i>, 2009 SCC 15</b> <i>Could company recover money taken from its account by bank to reverse fraudulent cheque?</i> Alternative framework – mistake of fact – change of position defence – assumption of risk defence – tracing remedy – damages remedy	180
16. <b><i>BNSF Railway v. Teck Metals Ltd.</i>, 2015 BCSC 1082; <i>rev'd</i>, 2016 BCCA 350</b> <i>Could train co. recover ore transport charges paid to railway co. that had double-billed?</i> Alternative framework – money had and received – mistake of fact – limitations defence – remedial constructive trust – tracing remedy	193
17. <b><i>Kingstreet Investments Ltd. v. New Brunswick</i>, 2007 SCC 1</b> <i>Could nightclubs recover ultra vires liquor tax collected and paid to Province?</i> Alternative framework – Crown liability – public law – taxes – JR statute ( <i>Liquor Control Act</i> ) – UF ultra vires statute – UF compulsion – protest – passing on defence – limitations defence	215
18. <b><i>ILWU Canada, Local 502 v. Ford</i>, 2016 BCCA 226</b> <i>Could union recover stolen funds from thief's innocent spouse?</i> Alternative framework – money had and received – mistake of fact – innocent $\Delta$ – negligent II – change of position defence – limitations defence	228

## Legislation

1. Frustrated Contract Act, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 166, ss.1-3, 5-7, 9 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>240</b>
2. Law and Equity Act, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 253, s.59 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>242</b>
3. Family Law Act, S.B.C. 2011, c. 25, ss.3, 81-87, 198 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>243</b>
4. Limitation Act, S.B.C. 2012, c. 13, ss.1, 5-8, 21(1) <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>248</b>
5. Crown Proceeding Act, R.S.B.C. 1996, c. 89, ss.1-2, 11-12, 16 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>250</b>

## Secondary Sources

1. Lord Denning, "Book Review: The Law of Restitution" (1967) 83 L.Q.R. 277 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>252</b>
2. Chaim Saiman, "Restitution in America: Why the US Refuses to Join the Global Restitution Party" (2008) 28 O.J.L.S. 99, 99-103 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>254</b>
3. Lionel Smith, "Unjust Enrichment" (2020) 66 McGill L.J. 165, 165-168 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>259</b>
4. Geoffrey Gomery, "Unjust Enrichment" in CLEBC (ed), <i>British Columbia Business Disputes</i> (2016), 3-3 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>263</b>
5. Mitchell McInnes, <i>The Canadian Law of Unjust Enrichment and Restitution</i> (LexisNexis, 2014), chapter 4, 210-216, 225-229 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>264</b>
6. Andrew Burrows, <i>A Restatement of the English Law of Unjust Enrichment</i> (OUP, 2013), 9-16 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>276</b>
7. Peter Birks, <i>Unjust Enrichment</i> (OUP, 2005), 49-63, 71 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>284</b>
8. Lionel Smith, "Restitution: A New Start?" in Peter Devonshire & Rohan Havelock (eds), <i>The Impact of Equity and Restitution in Commerce</i> (Hart, 2018) <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>300</b>
9. John D. McCamus, "Moore v Sweet: Four Lessons in Unjust Enrichment from the Supreme Court of Canada" (2020) 98 Can. Bar Rev. 109, 123-139 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>327</b>
10. Matthew P. Harrington, "Leapfrogging, Risk and Unjust Enrichment in Canada after Moore v. Sweet" (2020) 96 (2d) S.C.L.R. 191, 196-201 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>345</b>
11. Lionel Smith, "Demystifying Juristic Reasons" (2007) 45 Can. Bus. L.J. 281 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>352</b>
12. Mitchell McInnes, "Revising the Reason for Restitution: Garland Ten Years After" (2015) 57 Can. Bus. L.J. 1 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>376</b>
13. "Restitution at Home: Unjust Compensation for Unmarried Cohabitants' Domestic Labor" (2020) 133 Harv. L. Rev. 2124, 2124-2128, 2146-2147 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>407</b>
14. Charles Mitchell, "Unjust Enrichment" in Andrew Burrows (ed), <i>English Private Law</i> (3rd ed., OUP, 2013), 1078-1101 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>413</b>
15. Samuel Beswick, "Retroactive Adjudication" (2020) 130 Yale L.J. 276, 347-353 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>437</b>
16. Katy Barnett, "Restitution, Compensation and Disgorgement" in Elise Bant, Kit Barker & Simone Degeling (eds), <i>Research Handbook on Unjust Enrichment and Restitution</i> (Edward Elgar, 2020), 456-464 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>444</b>
17. Lionel Smith, "The State of the Law of Unjust Enrichment in Common Law Canada" (2015) 57 Can. Bus. L.J. 39 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>453</b>
18. Bruce H. Ziff et. al. (eds), <i>A Property Law Reader: Cases, Questions and Commentary</i> (4th ed., Thomson Reuters, 2016), 487-489 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>472</b>
19. Mitchell McInnes, "Interceptive Subtraction, Juristic Reasons and Constructive Trusts: Unjust Enrichment in the Supreme Court of Canada" (2019) 62 Can. Bus. L.J. 277, 301-304 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>475</b>

20. Lionel Smith <i>et. al.</i> (eds), <i>The Law of Restitution in Canada: Cases, Notes, and Materials</i> (Emond Montgomery, 2004), 328-331 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>479</b>
21. Albert Venn Dicey, <i>Introduction to the Study of the Law of the Constitution</i> (3rd ed., MacMillan & Co., 1889), 175, 180-182, 190 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>483</b>
22. Lionel Smith & Samuel Beswick, “Unjust Enrichment: Principle or Cause of Action?” in CLEBC (ed), <i>British Columbia Business Disputes</i> (2021), 1.1.6-1.1.15 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>487</b>
23. Graham Virgo, “‘All the World’s a Stage’: The Seven Ages of Unjust Enrichment” (SSRN, Sep. 2016), 1-2, 16-27 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>496</b>
24. Steve Hedley, “‘And So the Legal World Goes Round’: The Search for a Meaningful Law of Restitution” (SSRN, Oct. 2016), 1-8 <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>508</b>
25. Warren Swain & Sagi Peari (eds), <i>The Rethinking Unjust Enrichment Project: The Four Perspectives</i> (2022) <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>516</b>
26. Samuel Beswick, <i>LAW 436: Restitution – Unjust Enrichment Exam</i> (April 2021) <a href="#">↗</a>	<b>519</b>
27. Charles Mitchell, <i>Problem Question – Mistake and Change of Position</i>	<b>523</b>

Copyright in original works remains with the respective copyright holders.

Derivative editorial work by Samuel Beswick licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License](#).

July 2022

