SHIFTing
Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program

April 2022
# Table of Contents

We'd Like To Thank... ......................................................... 3
Introduction ........................................................................... 5
The Shifting Consumer Behaviour Program ......................... 6

The Stories Of Three Circular Innovators ............................... 10
Filfill Shoppe. ................................................................. 11
The Ethical Chair .............................................................. 13
The City of Portland .......................................................... 15

What We Learned ............................................................. 17
Applying SHIFT to the Marketing of Circular Solutions .............. 17
Program Value and Adaptations ........................................... 21

What’s Next ........................................................................ 22

The Five Shift Factors ....................................................... 23
Social Influence ............................................................... 24
Habit Formation ............................................................... 26
Individual Self. ............................................................... 28
Feelings & Cognitions ...................................................... 30
Tangibility .................................................................... 32

References ......................................................................... 34

---

**About the Share Reuse Repair Initiative**

Our mission is to foster a circular economy that makes the most of Things and serves as a meaningful waste and climate solution, enables everyone to “live circular” and supports resilient local communities and economies.
We’d Like to Thank...

The SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program is a collaborative effort based on the SHIFT framework¹ and workbook² commissioned by Sitra, the Finnish Innovation Fund.

The pilot program team was led by Rosemary Cooper, Director of the Share Reuse Repair Initiative (a project of MakeWay Charitable Society), who envisioned the pilot program and led on its design and execution, as well as co-facilitating program workshops. Dr. Kate White, Professor of Marketing and Behavioural Science at the UBC Sauder School of Business, authored the SHIFT framework for Sitra with her PhD student Rishad Habib. Kate brought her expertise into program design and workshop sessions, including new material for circular behaviour change. Rishad Habib and Siddhanth (Sid) Mookerjee, both PhD students of Kate’s, provided invaluable logistical and communications support, as well as Alice Henry, an SRRI Program Manager.

We also engaged aligned partners. We are grateful to Markus Terho and Sari Laine from Sitra Sustainable Everyday Life who commissioned the original SHIFT framework and provided strategic input. Dagmar Timmer, Manager of Strategic Initiatives at One Earth, led on linkages between the SHIFT program and the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC,³ an adaptation of Sitra’s Smart Consumption Profiles. Lindsey Boyle, Strategist and Founder of Circular Citizen Consulting and qualitative lead for the Lighter Living Motivations, shared the motivations in a workshop as means to enhance target market identification and understanding.

We’d like to extend our appreciation to our funders. The McConnell Family Foundation and Vancity were our core funders together with additional contributions from the Portland Bureau of Planning and Sustainability.
We are eternally grateful to the **nine circular innovators** who joined us in the pilot program. Thank you for your time and efforts to apply SHIFT to the marketing and communications of your circular goods, services or programs – and for your ideas to improve the program.

› **Fulfill Shoppe**  
Zero waste grocery delivery service (Pam McEwin and Lori Crump). Since Fulfill Shoppe’s participation in SHIFT, they have partnered with [Jarr](#).

› **Modo**  
Car Sharing Co-operative

› **Perk Eco Inc**  
Coffee shop cup and waste recycling program (Jennifer Henry)

› **The City of Portland Bureau of Planning and Sustainability**  
Program to promote thoughtful consumption (Alicia Polacok and Lindsey Maser)

› **The Ethical Chair**  
Upcycled 2nd hand furniture (Rebecca Mears and Mahbod Rouhani)

› **Susgrainable**  
Nutritious upcycled flours and baking mixes (Marc Wandler)

› **Tradle**  
A clothing-as-a-service platform for children (Blyth Gill)

› **Urban Repurpose**  
Harvests items destined for the landfill and sells them for re-use, upcycling and creating new treasures from old (Maureen Cureton and Tom Riessner)

› **Zero Waste Washington**  
Drives policy change for a healthy and waste-free world (Kami Bruner and Xenia Dolovova)

**Writing and graphic design** was a collaboration of Rosemary Cooper as Managing Editor, Alexandra Eady (lead writer) and Keiko Lee-Hem (graphic designer with Keiko Creative). Appreciation also to Natalya Amirova, a circular economy graduate student from Sweden who designed the Certificate of Completion. Sid Mookerjee wrote an overview of the SHIFT factors and Dr. White and Alice Henry reviewed the Report.

Many thanks, as always, to **SRRI’s Steering Committee** who provide strategic guidance to all our efforts: Bryan Buggy (Vancouver Economic Commission), Michelle Bonner (Vancity Credit Union), Lyndsay Poaps (Recycling Council of BC) and Louise Schwarz (Recycling Alternatives). Appreciation also to Dagmar Timmer (One Earth) from our Advisory Committee for her guidance particularly as it relates to the intersection between SRRI’s work and sustainable lifestyles.
Introduction

We heard from circular innovators that they face a common challenge—getting enough people to adopt circular behaviours. For businesses, this impedes their ability to secure enough customers to scale. For non-profit organizations and governments, it challenges the success of their campaigns or programs to encourage circular behaviours.

This challenge cuts across a range of circular behaviours. How do we get more people to buy second-hand or upcycled goods made from waste materials? To share cars, tools or clothing? To repair instead of buy new things? To refill containers or coffee cups? To participate in take-back programs? To deconstruct homes rather than demolish them?

Through our existing relationship with Sitra, the Finnish Innovation Fund, we knew that there was a tool that could be really useful for these innovators. The SHIFT framework was specifically designed for marketing and communications to shift behaviour in more eco-conscious directions. It was developed by BC’s own Dr. Kate White and Rishad Habib from the UBC Sauder School of Business for Sitra.

The framework is particularly effective at addressing the “intention-behaviour” or “say-do” gap, common in the area of sustainable consumption. Dr. Kate White, Professor of Marketing and Behavioural Science at the UBC Sauder School of Business, explains:

“Most people have fairly positive intentions around sustainable actions, but they don’t always follow through. One study found that 65% of consumers said they want to buy from sustainable brands, but only about 26% actually made purchases.”

When we learned about SHIFT in 2019, it had proven success in encouraging eco-conscious behaviours, but not specifically for circular innovations. So in late 2019, we brought together 25 circular innovators to learn about and pre-test the framework. They showed a strong interest in a longer and more supported approach, so we developed the SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program in response.

Read on to learn more about the pilot program and what we learned from it, including stories of three innovators that applied the SHIFT framework for their marketing and communication efforts. We also share some ways that cities, businesses and nonprofits can tap into the SHIFT program and tool.
The SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Program

With initial funding from the McConnell Family Foundation and Vancity Credit Union, we designed a SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program for businesses, municipalities and nonprofits to help them improve marketing and communications of their circular goods, services or programs. Our goal was to test the value of the SHIFT framework for these circular innovators and to learn which SHIFT factors, alone and in combination, are most relevant for effective marketing in the circular economy.

The SHIFT Framework in Brief

The SHIFT framework distills global, evidence-based best practices in marketing, psychology and behavioural economics into a practical tool for encouraging eco-conscious consumer behaviours. Each letter of the SHIFT framework represents a key factor proven to change negative (and maintain positive) sustainable behaviours when effectively applied: Social Influence, Habit Formation, Individual Self, Feelings and Cognition, and Tangibility.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Influence</th>
<th>Habit Formation</th>
<th>Individual Self</th>
<th>Feelings and Cognition</th>
<th>Tangibility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Making a behaviour seem more socially approved of, more commonly engaged in by one’s peers or socially desirable in some way.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Habit Formation: Making sustainable choices a habitual or automatic part of daily routines; breaking bad habits and building positive habits are both key.

- Individual Self: Appealing to the core values, motivations, norms and self-interests of individuals; individual differences of target audiences are key to consider.

- Feelings and Cognition: Tapping into people’s feelings, both positive and negative, as well as their thoughts through the information and experiences they internalize over time.

- Tangibility: The sense that something is real and substantial, including being close in time or distance, concrete and easy to imagine.

Source: definitions draw from the Sitra SHIFT report and workbook
Each of the five SHIFT factors has a number of nuanced sub-factors that drive behaviour change. To read about the SHIFT factors in more detail, and see examples of them in action, see the **Five SHIFT Factors Overview** at the end of this Report.

The SHIFT framework is designed to take the guesswork out of marketing. It provides a step-by-step approach for innovators to understand the barriers and motivations of their target audiences around a behaviour change. This informs their ability to design and test messages to shift the attitudes and choices of their target audiences in desired circular directions.

Testing is the key to success. The SHIFT framework highlights a wide range of different drivers for marketers to tap into. An A/B test compares two different versions of SHIFT-based messages, with one key element changed. Often, the winning message is tested against another message with a new variation—an approach which ultimately discerns the best way to market an innovation to a specific target group.

### Designing the SHIFT Pilot Program

We designed the SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program to include five workshops with targeted support provided throughout by members of the project team. We also designed the program around a cohort model, recognizing that there is tremendous value in learning and connecting with other circular innovators.

### The SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program

| WORKSHOP 1 | Setting the Stage – identify the desired circular behaviour and the barriers and motivations of specific target markets to undertaking it (drawing on the 2021 guide to [7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC](#)). |
| WORKSHOPS 2 & 3 | Understanding SHIFT – learn about the five SHIFT factors in depth. |
| WORKSHOP 4 | Design Marketing Messages to Test – design SHIFT-based messages and learn how to set up an A/B test; receive support on message design and testing approach. |
| TESTING | Test the Messaging – over a two month time-period with guidance from the project team. |
| WORKSHOP 5 | Share, Adapt and Wrap – innovators share their test results, discuss challenges and consider future tests with the same or new target audiences; the project team pulls trends and lessons for the circular economy more broadly. |

“Our intuitions aren’t always right. We may believe we’ve pinpointed the driver of a sustainable behaviour, but it’s critical to test our hypothesis to confirm which messaging is most effective in shifting consumer behaviours in the desired direction.”

—Dr. Kate White
Professor of Marketing and Behavioural Science, UBC Sauder School of Business
Unique to SRRI’s SHIFT program is the use of the **7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC**. Nonprofit OneEarth adapted Sitra’s Finnish Smart Consumption Profiles for the Canadian context, in partnership with SRRI. As part of the SHIFT program, the BC Motivations help innovators gain deeper insights into their target market and what drives their customers’ decisions. The 7 distinct motivations segment the BC population by their dominant motivators, attitudes, and behaviours related to lifestyle choices and consumption patterns. A key difference between the motivations is whether people’s choices are consciously motivated by the planet or if their actions are motivated by other needs and values such as: need and practicality, saving time or money, comfort and pleasure, tradition, local production, being an example to others, etc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivation</th>
<th>BC Pop.%</th>
<th>I am motivated to...</th>
<th>Design for...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waste Not, Want Not</td>
<td><strong>22%</strong></td>
<td>Use and own only what I need&lt;br&gt;Reduce waste in all aspects of my life</td>
<td>Zero-waste, community, repair / reuse, price / discounts, eco-attributes are secondary, facts / rational thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eco-Trends</td>
<td><strong>20%</strong></td>
<td>Align myself with progressive trends&lt;br&gt;Reduce my environmental impact, both by buying more consciously and buying less</td>
<td>Quality, durability, time-efficiency, overt eco-attributes, emotion &amp; pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shop, Style &amp; Social</td>
<td><strong>20%</strong></td>
<td>Buy things that make me look good&lt;br&gt;Live life to the fullest (by popular culture standards) and try new, cool experiences &amp; things</td>
<td>Style, digital / tech-enabled, social sharing, eco-attributes are secondary, emotion &amp; pleasure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthy Life &amp; Planet</td>
<td><strong>14%</strong></td>
<td>Do what’s best for my health and wellness and for the planet&lt;br&gt;Advocate for wellbeing in my community</td>
<td>Health, community wellbeing, overt eco-attributes, facts / rational thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rugged Independence</td>
<td><strong>10%</strong></td>
<td>Live the way I like—I don’t think about how my choices affect the environment&lt;br&gt;Seek durability and utility in the products I buy to support my lifestyle</td>
<td>Durability, repairability, being prepared or off-the-grid, avoid eco-attributes, facts / rational thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practical Traditions</td>
<td><strong>7%</strong></td>
<td>Buy only the things I need based on the best price&lt;br&gt;Stick with what’s practical, and not be swayed by progressive, eco-friendly ideals</td>
<td>Simplicity, repairability, cost effectiveness, avoid eco-attributes, facts / rational thought</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Hard, Live Large</td>
<td><strong>7%</strong></td>
<td>Work hard and spend my money on things that give me a comfortable, convenient and enjoyable life&lt;br&gt;Buy things as a way of making myself feel better and giving me something to do</td>
<td>Comfort, convenience, cost-competitiveness, no overt eco-attributes, emotion &amp; pleasure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC
Implementing the SHIFT Pilot Program

We knew the pilot program would give us the clearest results if the cohort consisted of a diverse mix of driven circular innovators. So in December 2020, we held an information session to outline the program and the application process in order to narrow down the pool to six to ten non-competitive innovators with consumer-facing products, services, or programs. Applicants needed to convey their desire to improve their communications, as well as a capacity to develop and test basic marketing materials. We chose seven businesses, one city and one non-profit to join the pilot program.

The SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Program ran from January to May 2021, taking the nine innovators through a step-by-step process to create and test messages using the five SHIFT factors, alone and in various combinations, to support a desired behaviour change with a specific target audience.

At the wrap-up workshop in May innovators shared back the results of their SHIFT message tests, including how it would inform their marketing efforts and what further tests they might do. We also asked innovators for their frank feedback on the value of the program for them and how we might improve it.

We held a public webinar in June 2021, to share the results more broadly which can be seen on SRRI’s website here. SRRI’s Project Director Rosemary Cooper also spoke to an international audience about the SHIFT program, together with the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC, in a session at the World Circular Economy Forum in September 2021, on “Communicating Circularity: Getting the Message Right”.

“Participation in the program helped my business to learn how to properly test key messaging related to behaviour change. It provided us with the groundwork to evaluate and target our testing in a way that we can repeat and improve upon!”

— SHIFT Pilot Program Participant
The Stories of Three Circular Innovators

One of the best ways to highlight the value of the SHIFT pilot program for circular innovators is to share examples of its application. In this section we share how an established business, a new start-up, and a city benefitted from their participation in the SHIFT pilot program.

For more information on the SHIFT factors featured in these stories, see the Five SHIFT Factors on page 23.
Fulfill Shoppe

Fulfill Shoppe is a zero waste store operating in BC’s Tri-Cities and the Lower Mainland, run by sister team Pam McEwin and Lori Crump. It delivers nutritious pantry staples, coffee, snacks, and eco-friendly beauty, household and cleaning products to suburban families using refillable jars and bags which avoids wasteful packaging.

**Desired Behaviour Change**

Fulfill Shoppe’s desired behaviour change was to drive traffic to their product page, get people to add items to their cart and then purchase them – with the goal of increasing sales.

Previous to Fulfill Shoppe’s participation in SHIFT, Lori and Pam had created two consumer summaries to inform their marketing. Learning about the Healthy Life & Planet and Eco-Trends* motivation groups provided deeper insights into these core customer groups and informed how best to communicate with these individuals to drive customer loyalty and sales.

*See page 8 to learn more about these motivations.*

**Test Design**

Fulfill Shoppe designed four distinct ads which tested the effectiveness of two SHIFT factors — Social Influence and Individual Self. The ads emphasized a range of product and service benefits including convenience, easy online ordering, ditching single use packaging, accessing healthy and tasty snacks, and products suited to a range of dietary needs and preferences.

The Facebook ad campaign ran for eight weeks, shifting from featuring the four ads to the two best performers at the 3 week mark in order to determine the winner.

"learning about the 7 Motivations to Lighter Living Action in BC was a game changer! We were able to gain a deep understanding of our target market’s core values and motivations which really helped us refine and focus our messaging to engage these key customer segments."

— Pam McEwin, Fulfill Shoppe Co-Owner

**MISSION**

To make it easy for suburban families to reduce packaging and plastic waste of household goods, food, and personal care products.

**TARGET MARKET**

Women aged 28 to 45; Healthy Life & Planet and Eco-Trends motivation groups for BC.

**OBJECTIVE**

To test which messaging would be most effective at driving traffic to their product page to make a purchase.

www.fulfillshoppe.com
Participating in the SHIFT program provided Fulfill Shoppe with invaluable insights about how to apply specific SHIFT factors to engage their target markets and increase sales.

The top two performing ads demonstrated that Social Influence and Individual Self factors were effective at reaching key audiences. However, ad reach was not indicative of an increase in purchases by new customers. It simply triggered repeat customers to reorder online. As such, Pam and Lori realized that Habit Formation was also integral to increasing regular sales.

Fulfill Shoppe is now exploring ways to encourage customers to reorder regularly, including: subscription based models, “reorder” reminder stickers on jars, and increased incentives.

They also hope to test further Social Influence-based messaging using “descriptive social norms” which describe what other people are doing. When applied to online ordering, descriptive norms can increase a new customer’s initial purchase of a green product by 65%.

"The SHIFT program was super helpful and we learned a lot of takeaways and lessons that we will continue to A/B test moving forward."

— Pam McEwin, Fulfill Shoppe Co-Owner
The Ethical Chair

Operating in the Greater Vancouver Area, The Ethical Chair is a start-up that will sell reclaimed and upcycled pre-owned furniture, offering something for everyone. HotBox is a branch of The Ethical Chair developing an innovative circular approach that will use waste heat to clean and remove potential bedbugs from pre-owned furniture sourced from charitable partners like Big Brothers.

Desired Behaviour Change

The Ethical Chair wanted to drive the online engagement of its target market by sharing two distinct messages via social media.

They identified two key target market groups based on the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC: Eco-Trends and Waste Not, Want Not*. Eco-Trends are people most likely to purchase trendy and eco-conscious furniture. Waste Not, Want Not is a secondary audience keen to support furniture repair because it reduces waste and can be a cost effective option.

* See page 8 to learn more about these motivations.

Test Design

The Ethical Chair chose to test the Social Influence factor by using descriptive social norms – phrases which express what others are choosing to do. They opted to test ecological versus socially based motivational factors to gauge which was most compelling to their target market.

They tested their two messages on Instagram, measuring the number of “likes” and “follows”. They also conducted a poll on two of their Facebook accounts in order to test a broader set of six factors – Eco Good, Social Good, Repair, Affordability, Uniqueness and Buy Local – to confirm which resonated best with their audience.

“Through SHIFT we learned to align the specific needs and motivations of our key audience with precise messaging designed to drive target behaviours. This will make our marketing much more effective moving forward.”

— Rebecca Mears, The Ethical Chair
Results

The Ethical Chair learned that both ecological and social motivations resonated strongly for their target audience. The Instagram A/B test saw slightly more “likes” for social good vs. eco good (57% vs. 43%). In contrast, the Facebook poll found that the eco good message was the most popular (27%) followed by social good (20%) and then affordability (19%).

These findings reinforced the importance of messages that include both eco and social motivations, which are also consistent with the attitudes and values of the Eco-Trends motivation group. The Ethical Chair also realized that more affordable product offerings may be of value at some point.

Participating in the SHIFT program at the start-up phase was very beneficial to The Ethical Chair as it gave them upfront insights versus “accidental learning” into their target markets and effective messaging. It also gave them an effective methodology to apply as their business grows and the opportunity to connect with a supportive network of like-minded circular businesses.

“The testing allowed us to contrast what we thought was most important to communicate with what people actually wanted to hear and what would attract customers. SHIFT also gave us an effective process and tool for our toolkit.”

—Rebecca Mears, The Ethical Chair
City of Portland
Bureau of Planning and Sustainability

Resourceful PDX is a community program run by the City of Portland Bureau of Planning and Sustainability to promote thoughtful consumption. Since 2010, it has given residents the tools and resources to help them: buy smart, reuse, borrow and share, and fix and maintain their things. These are simple changes that help residents save time and money while reducing their environmental footprint and supporting the local community.

Resourceful PDX engages residents at four key life transitions: moving, growing a family, home improvement, and kids in school. These can be stressful times when people buy new items – and generate more waste – but also when habits are interrupted and there is more willingness to try new things.

Desired Behaviour Change

Borrowing items from tool libraries and patronizing thrift stores are two behaviours featured on Resourceful PDX’s map, together with other free or low-cost options for living more resourcefully.

For the purposes of the SHIFT program, Portland will focus on residents who have recently moved. The desired behaviour change is to encourage new movers to click on the city’s advertisements to learn more about tool libraries. It’s important to note that Portland has not yet run its A/B tests, but plans to in the future.

Test Design

Portland has created two distinct messages to test which is the most effective at encouraging new movers to participate in the desired behaviour. Both messages apply the Individual Self factor, honing in on self interest* by highlighting the benefits associated with using tool libraries – e.g., saving money, getting advice, and building community.

The two different ads will be run on Facebook targeting recent movers who have an interest in DIY, home improvement, sustainability, and/or environmentalism. The number of clicks for each ad will be measured. Each ad will also direct viewers to a Resourceful PDX blog post with more information and resources on tool libraries.

* Self Interest: highlighting a benefit or overcoming a barrier in a way which appeals to the self.
**Key Learnings**

Portland’s messages have been crafted and are ready for testing. Once complete, the most popular message will be featured on updated marketing materials designed for “movers” to encourage reuse, repair, and share behaviours within the community. Participating in SHIFT gave the City of Portland a chance to look at their Resourceful PDX program with fresh eyes. Looking ahead, Alicia and her team hope to conduct additional A/B testing linked to other share, reuse and repair behaviours so they can determine the most effective messaging to help support and encourage residents’ transition to lighter living actions.

To stay up-to-date with Resourceful PDX, visit the website. Review the City of Portland’s Sustainable Consumption and Production program and report here.

“What we learned in the SHIFT program will help us reach new, more targeted audiences with tested messages to help elevate Resourceful PDX as a go-to community resource for reuse, repair, and sharing in Portland— and drive action for our sustainable consumption priority.”

— Alicia Polacok, Sustainable Communities Coordinator, City of Portland

---

**Openness to Try New Things After a Move**

The Portland Bureau of Transportation studied the use of Biketown, a local bikeshare program. They found that people who recently moved into a neighbourhood with a bike docking station were four times more likely to redeem a free bike ride compared to residents already living in the neighbourhood.
What We Learned

Applying SHIFT to the Marketing of Circular Solutions

We designed the pilot program to test the value of the SHIFT framework for circular innovators and to see if certain SHIFT factors were particularly relevant for marketing in the circular economy.

While there is more to explore, our hunch was right. Using the SHIFT framework to design and test messaging that taps into the psychology behind people’s choices to adopt circular behaviours really works. It can overcome the “say-do” gap and encourage more people to embrace circular behaviours – allowing businesses to scale and improving the outcomes of behavior change campaigns led by government and nonprofits.

Key Learnings Gleaned from the Pilot Program

One size does NOT fit all.

While research shows that some SHIFT factors are really effective, they don’t work across the board. It is crucial to pinpoint the barriers and motivations of specific target audiences to a desired behaviour change, and then design and test SHIFT-based messages to see what works – and build from there.

**Example: Urban Repurpose** – Through testing of their messaging, Urban Repurpose found that Social Influence, specifically social norms, was the most effective SHIFT factor in engaging their target market. As a result, they plan to share more stories of what customers are doing with their purchases, feature before and after photos of creations, and build a community of influencers.

"SHIFT spared us a lot of guesswork around individuals’ barriers and motivators. We started the process full of doubts and hypotheses but the framework came to our rescue, helping us narrow down a target audience and develop messaging to address their core values."

— Kami Bruner,
Zero Waste Washington
Subtle changes in messaging can make a BIG difference.

It was surprising to many in the pilot program how small changes in messages can make a significant difference.

**Example:** Grasscycling Campaign in Calgary—The City of Calgary used SHIFT to determine how to encourage its citizens to grasscycle—the natural recycling of grass by leaving clippings on the lawn after mowing. Almost 700 households received door hangers which featured either “Social Influence” or “Individual Benefit” messaging, positioned from either an individual perspective (you as an individual can make a difference) or a collective one (we as a community can make a difference).

When a “your neighbours think you should grasscycle” message was shared from a collective perspective (we as a community...), grasscycling increased by 54% compared to the same “you should” message directed to the individual (you as an individual...)."
The Lighter Living Motivations can enhance “Individual Self” messaging.

The 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC help circular innovators gain a richer understanding of what drives the circular behaviours of their target markets. The description for each of the 7 segments (including the “design for” guidelines on page 8), provide a lot of information that innovators can use to refine their marketing messages.

→ Example:

- **Healthy Life and Planet**—messages resonate when focused on both personal and environmental health benefits, with tie-ins to community wellbeing.
- **Waste Not, Want Not**—messages should emphasize minimalism, waste reduction and saving money. Environmental benefits are secondary.
- **Shop, Style and Social**—messages should appeal to a desire to be part of popular culture and an interest in new experiences. Environmental benefits are secondary.

Persuasive messages may need to draw from multiple SHIFT factors.

Human psychology is complex. There can be multiple psychological barriers and benefits to a desired behaviour change. As a result, persuasive messages may need to draw from more than one SHIFT factor.

→ **Social Norms, Individual Self, and Habit Formation**

→ Example: As we learned from Fulfill Shoppe’s story (page 11-12), their messages which drew from Social Influence and Individual Self factors did reach key audiences; however, they also needed Habit Formation messaging, and some new related business practices, to trigger customers to regularly reorder online.

→ **Feelings & Cognitions together with Tangibility**

People are more motivated to embrace sustainable behaviours if they’re feasible to do and they know that it will make a positive difference (called self-efficacy). When the positive impact is made tangible through concrete, vivid and local images and facts, people believe it more, increasing the uptake of these behaviours.

→ Example: when people are able to recycle and know what a recycled item will become—also known as product transformation—they are 3x more likely to recycle.

The SHIFT program has helped me effectively reframe my outreach to potential clients and for that, I am very grateful! By sharing both Perk Eco’s successes to date and other coffee shop owners’ experience with the program, the conversation has changed in a big way.”

— Jennifer Henry, Perk Eco
The circular offering may need to be refined too.

As participants went through the SHIFT framework steps, some realized that it wasn’t just their messaging that needed to be refined, but also their circular offerings.

**Example:** start-up The Ethical Chair realized that their circular furniture offering would need to be different for two of their potential target markets:

- **Eco-Trends** – would be attracted to funky, unique, one-of-a-kind upcycled furniture and could be open to paying a higher price for it.
- **Waste Not, Want Not** – would want sharply-priced reused furniture that meets their desire to minimize waste and save money.

“The “Feelings and Cognitions” and “Tangibility” factors hold untapped opportunity.”

The research suggests that these factors hold strong potential for driving circular behaviour change, but they were only lightly tested in our pilot program.

**Feelings and Cognitions**

Some people respond best to messages with emotions and feelings while others prefer facts and rational thought. The *7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC* highlight message preferences for each of the 7 motivations and can be a valuable tool for circular marketing.

**Example:**

- **Healthy Life and Planet** – employ FACTS to support personal and environmental health benefits or people with this motivation may view a circular offering as greenwashing.
- **Eco-Trends** – use stories and EMOTIONAL appeals. People with this motivation want to feel like their decisions to live lighter are part of a broader culture of progressive change.

See the “**Feelings and Cognitions**” section to learn more.

**Tangibility**

Circular benefits can be distant and fuzzy. We see the potential for innovators to use more messaging and images that draw from the Tangibility factor to make circular offerings and impacts more substantial – including being close in time or distance, concrete and easy to imagine.

**Examples:** show new products created from take back or recycling programs. Make the embodied carbon and material savings of circular products really vivid and concrete versus simply using a number.

See the “**Tangibility**” section for more examples.

“Since we’re a fledgling business, we learned how to strategize messaging and market testing from the get-go. We are so equipped now!”

— SHIFT Pilot Program Participant
Program Value and Adaptations

The Program's Value

The SHIFT pilot program proved its value to participating innovators from private, public and non-profit sectors. Participants gave the program a **4.4 out of 5** for its value, and **92% strongly recommended it to others**. They told us of the following key benefits:

› They learned how to go through a step-by-step process to define target markets, identify desired behaviour changes, and plan effective, results-driven marketing strategies using an evidence-based approach that minimizes speculation.

› The 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC helped them identify target markets more effectively and then gain a richer understanding of their values, needs and motivations to inform messaging – and innovation – design.

› The cohort model allows a unique opportunity to connect with, and learn from, other circular innovators and opens up the possibility of collaborations and cross-promotion on social media.

We also learned that the program is versatile and can be applied to both public and private innovators at various stages of business and program development.

Program Adaptations

Based on live participant feedback, program evaluations, and observations during the pilot, we have identified a few program refinements to build into future SHIFT program offerings.

› **Tweak the workshop flow** – Share the SHIFT process and factors in workshops spaced closer together up front and allow more time to design and conduct A/B testing of SHIFT-based messages. Add in an additional mid-way check-in workshop to get feedback on the A/B test approach.

› **Make the A/B Test optional** – It is not necessary for all participants to conduct an A/B test in order to participate in and benefit from the program. Not all pilot participants were ready to undertake A/B testing but still gained value from learning how to do so.

› **Provide more support for A/B testing for some innovators** – A few of the pilot participants had challenges with their A/B testing. This suggests more guidance would be helpful on how to set-up tests through social media and google.

**Program Participant Groupings** – There was some debate as to whether it was more beneficial for public and private organizations to participate in the SHIFT program together or in two separate groups. Pros and cons have been identified for each scenario, so we concluded that the program could be designed either way.

“**The SHIFT program helped our business to refine our understanding of how to approach behavior change and it provided a roadmap to piloting our campaign.**”

— SHIFT Pilot Program Participant

“We learned to take time to apply research-based approaches to our marketing campaign, and then test what actually works.”

— SHIFT Pilot Program Participant
What’s Next

Our pilot program has shown the value of the SHIFT framework for circular marketing to enhance the uptake of circular behaviours. It is versatile with benefits for:

› **Start-ups** – Gain rich, upfront insights about target markets in order to strategize market testing while learning a valuable marketing approach to use as they grow.

› **Businesses of all sizes** – Refine target markets and design marketing that addresses the “say-do” gap and secures more regular customers.

› **Local governments** – Improve the effectiveness of social marketing for waste prevention related to food, consumer goods, homes, single-use items and more.

› **Nonprofits and charities** – Develop targeted approaches for behaviour change campaigns that make the most of available funds.

Individual innovators can use this report and the **SHIFT workbook** originally developed by Sitra for a DIY approach. However, we have learned that there is tremendous merit in cohort-based approaches. So we look forward to hosting SHIFT workshops for groups of innovators with two options:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>OPTION 1</strong></th>
<th><strong>OPTION 2</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SHIFT Light</strong>&lt;br&gt;A ½ day workshop to review the SHIFT framework and process with a DIY exercise</td>
<td><strong>SHIFTing Consumer Behavior Program</strong>&lt;br&gt;5 workshops + support</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These options are relevant to many that support groups of innovators – business incubators, business associations, economic development agencies, marketing associations, circular economy entities and organizations/networks that represent or provide support to local government and the nonprofit sector.

While the pilot program was designed for circular innovators, the SHIFT approach is relevant to any eco-conscious behaviour change. As such, SHIFT Light and the SHIFT Program could be designed for a mix of circular and sustainable innovators.

To discuss interest in either of the SHIFT workshops, contact Rosemary Cooper, rosemarysrr@gmail.com
The Five SHIFT Factors

Each of the five SHIFT factors is a key driver of eco-conscious behaviour derived from global, evidence-based best practices in behavioural science, marketing, psychology, and economics. This section provides an overview of each factor, pulling out some research and examples relevant to circular behaviours involving the use and reuse of products and materials.

For those who would like to go deeper, see the original SHIFT report, *SHIFT: A Review and Framework for Encouraging Ecologically Sustainable Consumer Behaviour*.

It’s important to remember that even if a factor might seem relevant to a specific product or campaign, only after messages are designed and tested with a specific target market will it become clear how to move the dial towards a desired behaviour change. Messaging may draw from the SHIFT factors alone or in various combinations.
SOCIAL INFLUENCE

Social factors can have a powerful influence on whether or not consumers engage in a desired behaviour. People are social creatures so communicating that a sustainable behaviour is approved of by others, commonly engaged in by one’s peers, or socially desirable makes it more likely to be adopted. Highlighted below are four tools for harnessing the power of Social Influence.

Social Norms

Social norms are socially-driven, informal rules that guide behaviour. Descriptive social norms are one type of norm that describe what other people are doing and can greatly influence people’s behaviours.

Example: One study found that telling online shoppers that other people were buying eco-friendly products led to a 65% increase in people making at least one sustainable purchase.

WATCH OUT!

Unintended Consequences

“28% of all customers buying seafood in our shop yesterday chose sustainably certified seafood.” This message implies that only a minority of people buy sustainable seafood and that it is NOT the social norm, which can lead to a decrease in the desired behaviour.

Boomerang Effects

“Many past visitors have removed petrified wood from the park, changing the natural state of the Petrified Forest.” Dr. White shared that this sign led to an 8% increase in wood theft because it implied that ‘theft is common’ instead of ‘theft is bad’, the intended message.
Social Observability & Social Desirability

People want to do the right thing more when others are observing their actions – also known as social observability. Because of this, making actions public and visible to others can increase sustainable behaviour uptake in areas such as: preferences for hybrid and electric vehicles, sustainable food and coffee products, and recycling.

Example: One study found that participants were more likely to choose an eco-friendly granola bar with the tagline “good for you and the environment” when other people were present versus when the choice was made in private.⁸

People are more likely to engage in sustainable behaviours if they believe they are viewed positively by others. One way to enhance social desirability is to elevate the behaviour by associating it with famous people; likewise, enticing consumers with luxury brands like Tesla can increase the desirability of “going green” for some target audiences.

Social Group Memberships

Individuals are more likely to engage in sustainable behaviours if their peers or members of their “in group” are also taking part. Because people do not want their social groups to be outperformed by others, friendly challenges between groups can be very effective in driving change.⁹

Example: When business students were told that another group of students (computer science students) were outperforming them on positively-viewed sustainable behaviours (like composting), the business students were more than twice as likely to compost their coffee cups.¹⁰
HABIT FORMATION

Habits are behaviours activated by cues or triggers in our daily routines that then become relatively automatic over time. Unfortunately, many people’s existing habits are not sustainable or circular – e.g., using disposable coffee cups. The SHIFT framework provides many drivers that can be used to both break bad habits and form new positive habits.

Breaking Bad Habits

Moments of Change (aka Discontinuity)

Research shows that people are more likely to adopt new, more sustainable habits during ‘moments of change’ such as a recent move, starting a new job, or having a baby. ‘Fresh Starts’ are another ideal time to create new habits – e.g., New Year’s Day, the first day of the month, or your birthday.

Example: One study found that people were 62% more likely to commit to a goal on the first day of the week.11

See the City of Portland’s SHIFT story on page 15 to learn about shifting to circular habits linked to a recent move.

Penalties

Different kinds of penalties can help break bad habits, but care needs to be taken when using this tool. Research shows that fines can encourage behaviour change in areas like waste disposal.12 In the Circular Economy Bill 2021, the Government of Ireland is proposing that polluting products cost more by way of penalties and outright bans, with the aim of making these products cost more than environmentally friendly ones.13

WATCH OUT!

Negative backlash

If deemed to be unfair or extreme, penalties can cause customers to have negative feelings towards the entity issuing the penalty, which may reduce their desire to purchase goods or services from the company.

Fine as payment

If a fine is too small, people simply treat it as a payment and may continue the undesired behaviour. Dr. White considers fines to be a tricky way to prompt behaviour change and generally recommends more positive techniques.
Forming New Positive Habits

The following drivers can be used to encourage people to form new, positive habits.

- **Make it Easy**
  Remove friction associated with a sustainable or circular behaviour by making it easy to do. One way to do this is to make the sustainable choice the default option.

  ➜ *Example: One study found that 94% of people stuck to green electricity when it was the default option in residential buildings in Germany. If it wasn’t the default, only 1% of people made the behaviour change.*

- **Prompts**
  Use messages to remind people to engage in behaviours they already want to do. Prompts work best when located where the behaviour happens — e.g., leave reusable bags by your shoes or keys. Habit stacking — when a well-established behaviour becomes a prompt for a new habit — can be particularly effective, e.g., remember to floss after brushing your teeth.

  ➜ *Example: In one study, just placing prompts near a recycling bin led to 54% increases in recycling.*

- **Feedback**
  Use feedback to communicate how people are performing, either individually or in comparison to others, in areas like energy consumption.

  ➜ *Example: Household energy bills that show consumers’ usage compared to their neighbours encourage energy saving. Feedback is most effective when it is presented over a longer period of time, in real-time, and in a clear and engaging manner.*

See Fulfill Shoppe’s story on page 11 to learn how they are using prompts, incentives, and more to increase regular ordering and sales.

**WATCH OUT!**

**Things could backfire**

Some drivers of positive habits can backfire. For example, incentives like discounts, gifts or reward programs can work but not if they “crowd out” other intrinsic motivations to act sustainably. For some people, a discount can move their focus towards price and away from an existing desire to do something good for the environment.
INDIVIDUAL SELF

When navigating the waters of shifting consumer behaviours in more circular directions, it’s important to understand the role of the self. As highlighted in the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC, people’s decisions are strongly influenced by their core values and motivations so it’s important that circular offerings align with these. Here we dive into four key Individual Self tools which can be used to inform effective marketing.

Self-Interest

In order for products, services, and programs to be relevant to the end user, they must appeal to people’s self-interest in ways that overcome barriers – whether real or perceived – and highlight benefits linked to their natural motivations.

Overcoming Barriers

Research shows that sustainable options can be associated with barriers that need to be overcome, such as inconvenience, high cost, time-consuming, unattractive, lower quality or lower performance.

⇒ Example: The demand for shared services like tool libraries or car sharing is positively influenced by how convenient these services are perceived to be.\(^{17}\)

Highlighting Benefits

As revealed by the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC, about ⅓ of BC residents are consciously motivated by the planet in their daily life choices and behaviours. The other ⅔ are making sustainable choices for other reasons, such as health and safety, cost and time savings, convenience, local production, pleasure, style and looking good to others. It’s important to feature benefits relevant to the target audience and to consider when it might make sense to go beyond those that emphasize saving the planet.

⇒ Example: Second-hand consumption has been shown to be driven by frugality and cost savings, rather than purely by environmental concern.\(^{18}\)
Personal Norms

Personal norms are a kind of self-expectation. People often have a sense of personal obligation to hold themselves to their own self-standards, which can be tapped into when they align with features of the circular product or service.

Example: the higher a respondent’s environmental concern, the more likely the individual is to engage in upcycling and purchase upcycled clothing as a conscious effort to reduce waste.19

Self-Concept

Self-concept refers to how people view themselves. In order to encourage sustainable behaviours, it’s important to enhance the positive perceptions people have of themselves and overcome negative associations.

Example: Some men avoid eco-friendly options as they associate them with ‘feminine’ traits.20 To combat this, TruEarth launched a commercial with a tough guy doing the laundry using their product.

Example: Consumers who want to enhance their identity in areas like craftsmanship, empowerment, and a desire for uniqueness, enjoy taking part in do-it-yourself (DIY) projects.21

Self Consistency and Commitment

If customers can make initial, small commitments to engage in sustainable behaviours, especially in a public setting, they are more likely to consistently follow-through. Research shows that once people have said yes to one sustainable request, they are likely to continue to say yes to subsequent ones.22

Slacktivism Research

Small token public acts towards a cause – e.g., liking a post on Facebook or tweeting something on Twitter – don’t increase subsequent positive actions. Innovators can avoid this by asking people for real commitments which are meaningful, effortful, and specific – and not just symbolic displays.23
FEELINGS & COGNITIONS

When it comes to making decisions, people’s hearts (feelings) and minds (cognitions) often guide their actions. Feelings, both positive and negative, can play a critical role in shaping people’s behaviours. So too can the information and experiences people internalize over time. If innovators can positively influence how individuals perceive a circular product, service, or program, they will be more successful at gaining their support.

The 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC show that some target groups respond best to messages that use facts and thoughts while others prefer emotion and pleasure.

Negative Emotions

A small amount of a negative emotion, like guilt or fear, can be effective at moving the needle on sustainable behaviours, but too much can overwhelm people. It’s important to communicate messages likely to bring on feelings of guilt in subtle ways.

Sharing information on what people can do next is also helpful. Imagery can be motivating but only if it’s not too distressing or guilt provoking, causing the message to get lost.

Example: Placing negative emoticons – red frowny faces – along with messaging on trash cans increased the proportion of recycled material from 22% to 44%.

Example: The tendency to repair products partly arises from the desire to avoid feeling bad about sending repairable items to the landfill.

Positive Emotions

Positive emotions like happiness, hope, pride, awe, and gratitude also play an important role in motivating consumers to participate in sustainable behaviours.

Example: People are more likely to repair their possessions if they have a positive emotional connection to them. The greater the attachment, the more likely the item will be fixed.
Cognitions (or Thoughts)

How people think plays an important role in shaping their everyday decisions and behaviours. If innovators can create positive perceptions around eco-conscious choices, they will be more effective at shifting consumer behaviours.

Basic understanding is often necessary to set the stage for behaviour change, yet information campaigns alone are not enough. It’s important to strategically combine information with other behaviour change tools, like social norms.

Appealing to people’s cognitions can be important when the choice or behaviour is high involvement, and when there is distrust or concern about the attributes of a product. It’s also key when the people you’re trying to reach are motivated by facts, which include four of the 7 Motivations for Lighter Living Action in BC – Waste Not, Want Not, Healthy Life and Planet, Rugged Independence, and Practical Traditions.

Self-Efficacy

Self-Efficacy is the belief that a person can accomplish a certain behaviour and that this will have the desired positive impact.\(^{27}\) **Collective-Efficacy** is a variation linked to the combined or collective efforts of groups of people.

Research shows that consumers are more likely to undertake sustainable behaviours when they are confident their actions will make a difference.\(^{28}\)

\[ \text{Example: “I’m a water bottle and I want to be a bench. Recycle me!”} \]

When people know what a recycled item will become – also known as product transformation – they are 3x more likely to recycle.\(^{29}\)

For new products, communicating what an item used to be (past identity) makes the new product more appealing to consumers and increases purchase intentions.

\[ \text{Example: In a marketing campaign, the combination of two messages “I am a trendy backpack” + “In my previous life, I used to be an airbag”, was more compelling to consumers than just stating that the backpack was trendy alone.}^{30}\]
TANGIBILITY

For many people, the concept of sustainability is vague and distant – something that is hard to ‘get’ and difficult to act on, with uncertain pay-offs. This is where Tangibility shines by making sustainability seem more concrete and accessible. It can be used to paint a picture of what people’s specific actions can accomplish and when combined with others’ efforts, the results can be impactful.

If we want to encourage more people to adopt sustainable and circular behaviours, we must clearly and concretely communicate the benefits of doing so. Here are four ways to accomplish this.

• Make it Local

Communicate local impacts that are relevant to the audience. People are connected to their local environments and shaped by their personal experiences. So, it’s useful to incorporate familiar places and common experiences to help people visualize possible outcomes.

→ Example: In a campaign aimed at raising waste awareness, the City of New York highlighted that garbage accumulated in just one day could fill the entire Empire State Building.31

• Make it Concrete

Highlight the specific steps users can take and then share concrete outcomes from doing so. Additionally, sharing the impacts of action versus inaction in ways relevant to the audience can really put things into perspective.

→ Example: “Switching to cold water for one year can save enough energy to charge your phone for a lifetime.”32 In this message, Tide concisely outlines a specific action their customers can undertake and the tangible benefits to them.
• Make it Vivid

Use engaging material like pictures, stories, and graphs to communicate issues and outcomes. Sharing comparisons between more and less sustainable choices can also be very effective.

→ Example: images that show comparisons can be impactful. Toyota has an advertisement with an image of the back of sheep and Prius side by side, indicating that the GHG emissions from the sheep are significantly higher.

• Promote Intangibles or Experiences

Engage people’s desire for intangibles such as experiences, services and digital goods rather than the ownership of material goods.

→ Example: Metro Vancouver has a “Create Memories, Not Garbage” campaign which shares eco-friendly and experiential gift ideas to encourage citizens to celebrate the holiday season with less waste.
References


32 This was part of an advertising campaign from Tide: Procter & Gamble : Tide® Challenges Americans to Switch to Cold Water During Earth Week | MarketScreener https://www.marketscreener.com/quote/stock/PROCTOR-GAMBLE-COMPANY-4838/news/Procter-Gamble-Tide-Challenges-Americans-to-Switch-to-Cold-Water-During-Earth-Week-18305716/

Share Reuse Repair Initiative, 2022.

SUGGESTED CITATION
Share Reuse Repair Initiative (2022), SHIFTing Consumer Behaviour Pilot Program. Vancouver, Canada.