Sojourners

Undergraduate
Journal of Sociology

SOJOURNERS:

Undergraduate Journal of Sociology

Sojourners

Sojourners: Undergraduate Journal of Sociology is a peer and Faculty reviewed journal published annually by the Sociology Students Association of the University of British Columbia, Vancouver. Our mandate is to provide a venue for the publication of outstanding undergraduate writing. Submissions are accepted in the fall of each year. Original research is preferred. Book reviews are limited to books published within the past five years. Information regarding submissions, journal sales, and more is available on the web at soci.ubc.ca. For more detailed information about manuscript submission, please contact the Editor-in-Chief at sojourners.eic@gmail.com.

Are you interested in volunteering for *Sojourners*? Do you have questions or comments about this year's edition? Do you have a paper you would like to submit?

Please contact us at socijournal@gmail.com.

Table of Contents

Letter from the Editor

Dear Readers,

It has been four years since Volume One of *Sojourners: Undergraduate Journal of Sociology* was first published in 2009. Since then, it has been our mission to discover and showcase outstanding undergraduate work not only by students of Sociology but all students whose work deal with topics of interest to sociologists. Thus, we have received and published papers from diverse fields such as Women Studies, Social Work, Political Science, Anthropology, History, Philosophy and Geography...just to name a few.

As sociologists, we are fascinated by society and all the things that comprise it. Underscoring that fascination, however, is a deep abiding interest in people -- how they organize their lives, how they interact with one another, and how they relate to the world around them. Over the course of the last four years, submissions have increasingly tended towards original research, with a notable emphasis on qualitative interviews or ethnographies. These trends not only reflect the growing rigour of undergraduate research in universities across North America but a shift towards more collaborative approaches in field research.

In Volume Three, Jasmine Luk interviewed several immigrants who either have worked or are currently working at Tim Hortons to explore the everyday ramifications of immigrant deskilling. Tara Pietski looks at the emotional labour performed by women who come to Canada as live-in caregivers. The articles by Amanda Cheong and Jeremy Withers deal with issues of representation: the former highlights "homeless blogs" as a creative

and subversive site where homeless individuals can combat stigmatized representations of homelessness in mainstream media. Drawing upon his experience producing a short documentary on Vancouver's Anti-Olympic Movement, Jeremy Withers explores film's potential as a tool for amplifying the subaltern's voice in ethnographic research. Taking a more macro level approach, Michael Kehl examines how ownership laws are being used by corporations like Monsanto to reinstate a feudal system of land ownership in North America's argicultural regions.

The offerings in Volume Four are equally diverse. Kayla Johnson, Sebastian Krammig, and Justin Van Westen use dialogue to explore sustainability from three theoretical perspectives: ecofeminism, ecosocialism, and deep ecology. Amanda Cheong and Estevan Izquierdo explore ideas around nationhood and Canadian identity in "Defining a Nation" and "Hockeyville Canada," respectively. Anita Sehagic investigates representations of the Occupy Vancouver movement in news media reporting. Similarly, Sam Markham examines media coverage of Bill C-389 and its subsequent implications for transgender rights in Canada.

The essays in this journal with speak for the authors' passion, ingenuity and dedication to sociological research. It has been a great pleasure and honour for the editorial team to have had the opportunity to work with them and see their work to publication.

Here, we want to thank all the editors who donated their time and energy to Sojourners from 2011-2012: Linda Chan, Amanda Cheung, Sasha Duncan, Mike Kehl, Helena Li, Melody Lotfi, Christina Nguyen, Laurel Rogers, Nicole Sto.Tomas, Jenniffer Tai, Anushka Samarawickrama, Anita Sehagic, Heather Stack, and Bard Suen. This journal would not be what it is without their effort and insight. We also want to thank Marco Firme, who provided the distinctive cover art, and Serena Chan, who lent us her expertise in graphic design. Our heartfelt appreciation goes out to all the faculty and staff in the Department of Sociology; their guidance and advice have been invaluable to us. Lastly, we want to thank you, dear Readers, for your support of Sojourners, undergraduate work and sociological research.

We hope that you will enjoy the articles in this journal as much as we did.

Yun-Jou Chang (2011)
Manhal Adam (2012)
Editors-in-Chief, Sojourners: Undergraduate Journal of Sociology

Volume 3

2011

Emotional Labour, Emotional Management and Feeling Rules in Canada's Live-In Caregiver Program

Tara Pietski

CANADA LACKS A SUPPLY OF AFFORDABLE CARE SERVICES. COMMON FORMS of caregiving include childcare, medical care for the sick and injured, as well as caring for aging parents or relatives. Seen as a traditionally female role, caregiving constitutes a large part of the "second shift," or the gender asymmetrical unpaid, domestic responsibilities executed by women in addition to the paid, professional eight-hour shift (Hochschild, 1989). As such, caregiving policies which make care services more affordable are key to mitigating gender inequality in Canada (Nelson, 2006). However, the strategy adopted by the Canadian government rests upon the exploitation of a foreign workforce (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1997). The strategy in question, termed the Live-In Caregiver Program, serves to supplement Canada's demand for cheap domestic labour by recruiting human resources from countries that are willing or those without alternatives but to participate. Over eighty-five percent of Live-In Caregivers are women and eighty-seven percent originate from the Philippines (Pratt, 2004). The phenomenon wherein women of colour serve as domestic workers is hardly new. Historically, racialized females have been marginalized to the lowest echelons of the socioeconomic ladder, taking on domestic responsibilities that allow middle- and upper-class white women time for leisure (England & Steill, 1997) or freedom to pursue career ambitions (Pratt, 2004). While financially accessible caregiving services may

help alleviate gender inequality, it often simultaneously reinforces other social stratifications.

Under the Live-In Caregivers Program, caregivers are required to live in the home of their employer for a two-year period and provide care for young, sick, or elderly persons. After the two-year period of the Caregiver contract has elapsed, the participant is able to apply for permanent residency status in Canada (Citizenship & Immigration Canada, 2010). The emotional trials, unfair labour practices and sexual exploitation for which the program has been criticized does not deter potential participants who believe the Live-In Caregiver Program to be the catalyst for a better life. More importantly, many women lack alternative options. As the primary breadwinners in their families, these women seek the Canadian wages offered by the program and the potential for Canadian permanent residency both for themselves and their family members – regardless of the trials and tribulations they experience in order to reach their goals.

The Live-In Caregiver Program has been criticized on several fronts by academics and feminists alike: for leaving its workers open to exploitation; for contributing to the perpetuation of gender and racial stereotypes; and for the reproduction of inequality within Canada (Bakan & Stasiulis, 1997; Heyzer & Wee, 1994; Pratt, 1997; Stiell & England, 1999). However, one hardship within the Live-In Caregiver Program has not attracted the same kind of attention - emotional labour. In this paper, I engage Arlie Hochschild's (1979) concepts of emotional labour, emotional management and feeling rules to analyze how the demand for emotional labour affects the experiences of Filipina live-in caregivers in Canada. I argue that the emotion work demanded by the "caring" position, the need to negotiate boundaries, and the dual "mother" roles that these women embody contribute to the taxing emotional demands of the Live-In Caregiver Program. This particular examination focuses on Filipina caregivers because they are the dominant demographic of the program[1].

EMOTIONAL LABOUR

Using Hochschild's ideas as my theoretical framework, I first explore existing literature on domestic workers to highlight how emotional labour is an integral part of the Live-In Caregiver position. Hochschild (1979) defines "emotion work" or emotional labour as the process of attempting

---

1 See Pratt (2004) for an in-depth exploration of why Filipina women are the dominant demographic of the program.

to alter the degree or quality of our emotions (p. 561) and "feeling rules" as unspoken expectations which guide when and how we should emote (p. 563). In order to explore how these concepts operate, I draw on Hochschild's (1983) examination of female flight attendants to address how in their careers, caregivers are similarly expected to emote, behave, and perform a role that is embedded in power relations. Hochschild's unprecedented exploration of flight attendants revealed the extent to which emotional labour becomes part and parcel of the job requirement of many service sector careers.

Acting as quasi-surrogate mothers, Filipina women take on all the responsibilities of a stereotypical maternal role: they are expected to "maintain the home" (which may include duties such as cooking, cleaning, shopping for groceries, and doing laundry), in addition to caring for the young, the sick, or the elderly (Tung, 2000, p. 66). According to England and Stiell (1997) "paid domestic work is 'women's work' – 98% of foreign domestic workers are women – and involves performing highly gendered domestic and nurturing roles" (p. 198). While Filipina caregivers have to perform the role of the "mother" in Canada, they are simultaneously expected to uphold mothering responsibilities to their family who remain in the Philippines. "Mothering" can encompass not only caring for one's children but may include supporting one's sick parents, aging grandparents and distant relatives (Pratt, 1997). Filipina caregivers are required to negotiate the dual mother roles they embody in Canada and in the Philippines (Tung, 2000). These roles can sometimes be contradictory, and because they are embodied within a single individual, they are constantly being shifted, juggled, and managed. In the following sections, I highlight the responsibilities of Filipina caregivers under the Live-In Caregiver Program to reveal how these women must constantly do "emotion work," that is, manage their emotions and perform according to "feeling rules" within the employer-employee relationship. I will also briefly touch on the importance of domestic workers' associations in the lives of caregivers, and how the information available via these groups functions as an undervalued resource for policy makers.

"SOMETIMES I MIGHT SNAP AT HER AND [THAT WOULD] HURT HER": EMOTIONAL MANAGEMENT AND THE DEMANDS OF CARE

In her analysis of Filipina health caregivers, Charlene Tung (2000) found that emotions were central to the performance of caregiving. In the words of one Filipina respondent: "it's not just care, we give them love"

(p. 69). However, negotiating the boundaries between an employer-employee relationship and a familial relationship requires a complex form of emotional management. Tung's (2000) study focused on live-in nurses whose responsibilities consisted of caring for elderly or sick individuals. In addition to daily tasks such as administering medication, bathing patients, helping patients brush their teeth, accompanying patients when they attend religious services, grocery shopping, cooking, and watching television, Filipina caregivers became their employer's main companions. "The lives of the caregivers," Tung (2000) states, "are acutely tied to their patients – physically and emotionally" (p. 69). The caregiver and the patient become constant companions and this relationship results in emotional expectations that are central to the caregiver's performance.

Serving as a constant companion is one of the most demanding aspects of a caregiver's job. In caring for the elderly, Terry, a live-in health caregiver, stated that her main task is "exercising" her patient's mind (Tung, 2000, p. 70). She accomplished this by asking her patient, Esther, questions about her childhood, discussing current events, and guiding the conversation when Esther began to repeat herself due to dementia. When Terry felt that she was becoming "too irritated" due to her patient's short-term memory loss, she found methods of emotional management that were central to her responsibility as a caregiver:

I just get out of her way until I could be OK again. Because it's difficult … I just get out of her way. I just do something else. I don't go near her. Because sometimes I might snap at her and [that would] hurt her. (Tung, 2000, p. 72) Terry's comment reveals the demand for emotion work in caregiving. Although Terry felt frustrated with the situation or with her employer/patient, she had to develop a strategy for controlling and mitigating her emotional reactions in order to avoid hurting her patient. Similar to the flight attendants in Hochschild's 1983 study, caregivers cannot express their frustrations to those they serve because their patients are their main "source of revenue" (p. 111). While those receiving care – young children and sick patients – may not necessarily pay the wages of the caregiver, the caregiver is nevertheless positioned within a power structure where her employment (and potential residency status) could be compromised if she fails to manage her emotions appropriately.

As the caregiver's job requires her to be a companion to the care recipient, and to care for him or her, anger is not an acceptable emotion for the situation and must be suppressed. Instead of expressing her displeasure, Terry evaded her patient until her annoyance passed. However, this process of emotional management can become complicated and exhausting due to the live-in requirement of the program, which demands that caregivers live and work in the house in which they are employed. Without opportunities to vent, the need to manage emotions becomes a 24-hour responsibility for Filipina caregivers. As Hochschild (1983) notes, the "separation of display and feeling is hard to keep over long periods [of time]" and this emotional dissonance may eventually lead to strain (p. 90). The live-in requirement of the program is an important characteristic that exacerbates the degree of emotional labour required of the domestic worker. Further in this analysis, I discuss the importance of domestic workers' associations as an emotional "venting site" for live-in caregivers.

NEGOTIATING BOUNDARIES

Caring can become precarious as domestic workers try to negotiate the boundaries of empathy between "employee" and "family member." Empathy is the process of identifying with the feelings, thoughts, or attitudes of another (Merriam-Webster, 2011) and is heavily associated with care. Consequently, empathy becomes an implicit job requirement for caregivers. The demands for empathy can become especially perilous when one is hired to care for the sick or the elderly. Leticia and Olivia, two live-in nurses hired to care for one elderly man, stated that "the hardest thing [is] seeing him not doing well [because] it's as if we are also sick" (Tung, 2000, p. 73). The nurses not only found it difficult to see their patient in pain, but identified with their patient's discomfort, thus taking on the emotional burden of empathy. This example illustrates how the experiences of compassion and empathy are interwoven in the context of caregiving.

While empathy may not be a professional responsibility directly demanded by the employer or the client, it appears to be a latent form of emotional work. Hochschild (1983) explored how flight attendants are commended for being both "naturally empathetic" and capable of "resist[ing] the numbing effect of having that empathy engineered and continuously used" (p. 98). In contrast to flight attendants who are able to take emotional breaks from their professional demands Filipina caregivers are compelled to

form long-term relationships with individuals who are in constant need of care. The caregiver lives in their employer's home and forms such an intimate relationship with the care recipient that it becomes difficult to engineer an ability to switch empathy "off." As seen in the above remark by Leticia and Olivia, caregiving can come with emotional demands separate from one's professional responsibilities. Their ability to feel the pain their patient feels reveals how the boundaries between employer and employee can become blurry. When the boundaries of empathy are vague, it becomes an emotional territory that the caregiver has to negotiate.

Drawing upon her experiences as a caregiver, Miriam Elvir (1997) discussed the challenges of being hired to care for children. As a "nanny," one is expected to mother the children during the day, and serve the employers in the evening. Given that the responsibilities of childcare are constantly shifting from nanny to parent and vice versa, the caregiver's relationship with the children can be continually disrupted. "During the week", Elvir states (1997), "we can control the kids, but during the weekend [their parents are home so] they can do anything they want. So Monday was always a new start" (p. 151). Elvir's comment reveals that caregivers are constantly attempting to forge emotional ties and assume a position of authority as their job demands, yet this process is disrupted when the caregiver is displaced as the central authority figure. Similarly, while the caregiver is expected to nurture the children, she must avoid fully assuming the maternal position.

While trying to build a relationship with the children and fulfill the functions of the mother role, Filipina caregivers must try to avoid assuming the role of mother completely, as this can threaten the employer's position. Pratt (1997) interviewed a placement agent who revealed the value of balancing the mother-nanny role:

> Insecurity comes in because sometimes you'll get it where the child doesn't want to go to the mother. And it runs for the nanny every time ... And then you get a mom with hurt feelings ... It's very, very hard on them. Believe me. And if you've got a kind, loving nanny that has enough consideration *that still makes* [*the biological mother*] *important to that child* it makes a difference. (p. 171, emphasis mine)

Pratt reveals that it is the employer's emotions that are privileged. The ideal nanny is characterized not only as kind and loving, but considerate enough to help maintain the mother's importance in the child's life. It is the caregiver's

responsibility to form a mothering relationship with her employer's child, yet still maintain enough distance to evade taking the place of the maternal position entirely. This becomes a feeling rule in the caregiver's workplace: she must manage her emotional connection with the child without trespassing professional boundaries.

At the same time, professional boundaries can be obscured by employers, who may attempt to create a hospitable environment by suggesting that the caregiver become a part of the family. Despite the fact that the caregiver lives in the employer's house and has been offered to the opportunity to become one of the family, Elvir (1997) asserts:

> There is always distance, as if they put up a wall. There were barriers at home. Domestics have their place. *We will never be part of the family, even if we have been told that we are*. (p. 151, emphasis mine)

Employers may invite caregivers to join the family or impose emotional distance, but it is the domestic worker's responsibility to negotiate the dichotomy between family member and employee. While the idea of being accepted into a "new" family may appear to be desirable, Elvir (1997) argues that it is simply a *fantasy* that domestic workers have the responsibility of managing. The contradictory emotional demands that result from being incorporated into the family of her employer can be emotionally hazardous for the transnational worker who leaves behind her own family in her country of origin. Mothering From Afar

It is crucial to understand that the Live-In Caregiver Program is a policy which allows foreign labour into Canada to care for our nation's families, yet many of these women are themselves mothers with familial obligations (Glenn, 1993, p. 7) and subject to the emotional demands of mothering from afar. Maintaining connections to one's own family in the Philippines can be an arduous task. Responsibilities largely consist of mothering one's children through letters, telephone calls or the internet and providing the family with financial support. Examples of financial support may include rent payments, food, tuition, medicine, and even, ironically, hiring a caretaker for one's aging parents or sick relatives. These responsibilities are not just reserved for the caregiver's immediate family members, but can extend to any and all relatives who are in need of assistance (Pratt, 1997, p. 165). In some cases, Filipina caregivers remit up to three-quarters of their salary to family members in

the Philippines (Tung, 2000, p. 65). Referring to working abroad to support their children, one nanny states:

> It's worth it, you know, because I can give [them] whatever [they] like. Not really everything, because *I'm not there*, but I can send them to good schools. I can buy them what they like. ... I miss their growing up. But what can I do? *I sacrifice*. (Tung, 2000, p. 67, emphasis mine)

This quotation is emblematic of the contradictory feelings fostered by the experience of mothering from afar; the opportunity to watch her children grow up is what she sacrifices in exchange for the financial reciprocity achieved through domestic labour. While Filipina caregivers leave the Philippines for the purpose of supporting their families financially, they must manage the emotions triggered by being absent from their family's lives in order to, ironically, care for another family thousands of miles away.

In addition to daily tasks outlined in a worker's contract, Filipina Live-In Caregivers must take on the emotional labour of dual "mothering" roles. They assume the role of the mother in their employer's home while simultaneously balancing the responsibility of mothering their own families who remain in the Philippines. The emotionally strenuous aspect of the childcare policy is rarely acknowledged by Canadian families or policy makers when they consider transnational caregivers: Canada's families benefit from the Live-In Caregiver policy, but these benefits demand large geographical and emotional cleavages between Filipino family members.

DOMESTIC WORKERS' ASSOCIATIONS

I will end my analysis by emphasizing the importance of domestic workers' associations in the emotional lives of caregivers. Many groups, such as the Kalayaan Centre, the Philippine Women Centre of British Columbia, and the West Coast Domestic Workers' Association, offer caregivers access to counselling support, resource materials, and free legal services. These associations are run by activists, volunteers, current and former domestic workers with the aid of private donations or government funding. These associations can be areas of refuge, where the caregiver is free from the "feeling rules" of her employer's home and can release tension, emotion, and strain (Elvir, 1997, p. 152). The West Coast Domestic Workers' Association, for example, "facilitate[s] a self-help and social network to help mitigate the isolation suffered by live-in caregivers". As caregivers both live and work

within the confines of their employer's home, escape from emotional labour is brief yet incredibly necessary: these safe spaces are "offstage" areas where they are free from the performance of their workplace/home and able to "ventilate" their frustrations (Hochschild, 1983, p. 118).

These associations are reservoirs of information that can offer policy makers valuable insight into the experiences of Filipina caregivers. Domestic workers' associations view the Live-In Caregiver Program with a critical eye because they are privy to the exploitative aspects of the policy: they witness the expression of the emotional and sometimes physical abuse that women experience as domestic workers. In 2009, the Kalayaan Centre published this report on the exploitative conditions of the Live-In Caregiver Program:

> For nearly twenty years, we have been in the forefront of exposing the exploitation and oppression of Filipino women in Canada. We have presented numerous briefs ... on the inhumane and violent treatment endured by thousands of Filipino women under the [Live-In Caregiver Program] LCP ... we are adamant that without the removal of the mandatory live-in requirement, the requirement to work 24 months within a three year period, temporary immigration status and the employer-specific contract under the LCP, the situation of Filipino live-in caregivers will never improve. The fundamental pillars of the LCP provide the systemic context for their abuse and vulnerability, and while these remain intact, unregulated work conditions and cases of abuse and exploitation of foreign live-in caregivers will intensify (Kalayaan Centre).

In assessing social policy options, the Canadian government can turn to domestic workers' associations to illuminate the neglected and overlooked consequences of the current program. Alternative, non-exploitative childcare options may be reached through working collaboratively with the individuals who experience the industry first hand.

CONCLUSION

The two-year course of the Live-In Caregiver Program comes with a range of emotional demands. In search of residency status, live-in caregivers labour physically and emotionally day and night, fulfilling the complex and delicate role of surrogate motherhood while struggling to maintain ties to their biological family thousands of miles away. The constant negotiation between the binaries of family member/employee, surrogate mother/"real"

mother, and caring as a *human emotion*/caregiving as an *occupation* are the most emotionally demanding aspects of the caregiver experience. This paper strives to demonstrate how Hochschild's ideas of emotional labour, emotional management and feeling rules function as an integral part of the Canadian Live-In Caregiver Program. Unfortunately, emotional labour is a fundamental aspect of the program that has been ignored by policy makers and employers alike.

Caregiving is an important and necessary social service that helps to narrow gender cleavages; however, one must recognize how certain caregiving policies may aggravate other social inequalities. Domestic workers' associations serve as beacons of refuge by advocating for the rights of domestic workers and harnessing their stories, frustrations, and experiences into political attempts to restructure the domestic labour system with the hopes of reducing the potential for harm and exploitation. Policy makers should recognize how these associations function and harness their vast knowledge in implementing a fair and equitable caregiving policy that does not rely on an exploited labour force.

REFERENCES

Bakan, A. B. and Stasiulis, D. (1997). Foreign domestic worker policy in Canada and the social boundaries of modern citizenship. In A. B. Bakan & D. Stasiulis (Eds.), *Not one of the family: Foreign domestic workers in Canada* (29-52). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Citizenship and Immigration Canada. (2010, May 5). *Working temporarily in Canada: The Live-In Caregiver Program*. Retrieved from http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/work/caregiver/index.asp

Elvir, M. (1997). "The work at home is not recognized": Organizing domestic workers in Montreal. In A. B. Bakan & D. Stasiulis (Eds.), *Not one of the family: Foreign domestic workers in Canada* (147-156). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Empathy. 2011. In *Merriam-Webster Online Dictionary*. Retrieved April 21, 2011, from http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/empathy

England, K. and Stiell, B. (1997). "They think you're as stupid as your english is": Constructing foreign domestic workers in Toronto. *Environment and Planning A 29*, 195-215.

Glenn, E. N. (1993). Social constructions of mothering: A thematic overview. In E. N. Glenn, G. Chang, & L. R. (Eds.), *Mothering: Ideology, experience, and agency*. New York: Routledge

Heyzer, N. and Wee, V. (1994). Domestic workers in transient overseas employment: Who benefits, who profits? In N. Heyzer, G.L. Nijeholt, & N. Weerakoon (Eds.), *The trade in domestic workers: Causes, mechanisms and consequences of international migration* (31-102). London: Zed Books Ltd.

Hochschild, A. R. (1979). Emotion work, feeling rules, and social structure. *The American Journal of Sociology 85*(3), 551-575.

Hochschild, A. R. (1983). *The managed heart: The commercialization of human feeling*. Los Angeles and London: University of California Press.

Hochschild, A. R. (1989). The second shift: Working parents and the revolution at home. New York: Viking

Kalayaan Centre (2009, May 20) *Scrap Canada's Live-In Caregiver Program: End Violence Against Filipina Women!* Retrieved from http://www.kalayaancentre.net/content/pressrelease/2009/may/napwc_may20.html

Nelson, A. (2006) *Gender in Canada*. Toronto: Pearson Prentice Hall

Pratt, G. (1997). Stereotypes and ambivalence: The construction of domestic workers in Vancouver, British Columbia. *Gender, Place and Culture 4*(2), 159-177.

Pratt, G. (2004). *Working feminism*. Edinburgh: Edinburg University Press

Stiell, B. and England, K. (1999). Jamaican domestics, Filipina housekeepers and English nannies: Representations of Toronto's foreign domestic workers. In J. H. Momsen (Ed.), *Gender, migration, and domestic service* (43-61). London: Routledge

Tung, C. (2000) The cost of caring: The social reproductive labour of live-in home health caregivers. Frontiers: *A Journal of Women's Studies 21*(1), 61-82.

West Coast Domestic Workers' Association (2011). *Mandate*. Retrieved from http://www.wcdwa.ca/

Who Works Behind Your Local Tim Hortons Counter?

An Examination of Immigrant Deskilling in Metro Vancouver

Jasmine Luk

> "This is not where I should be. This is not the position that I should have as a job. ... [My past and current occupations] are *completely* two different jobs. There's absolutely nothing that they have in common. [My work at Tim Hortons is] absolutely different from anything I've done in my life as a job before."
> – Amin, former high school math teacher in Iran

Although Canadian immigration policies actively recruit skilled individuals using a points system that evaluates immigration eligibility based on work experience, education, and other qualifications (CIC, 2007), systemic barriers lead many well-educated and highly-skilled immigrants in Canada to work in secondary labour positions that do not reflect or require their qualifications. As a result, many immigrants who come to Canada find themselves experiencing an unexpected downward shift in occupational mobility that can persist for many years. This transformation holds significant consequences for an individual's socioeconomic status, personal welfare, family relations, and identity construction. The process by which immigrants lose access to occupations for which they were previously eligible due to the devaluation and non-recognition of foreign work experiences and educational credentials is often described as deskilling.

This exploratory study examines qualitative accounts of the experiences of post-secondary educated immigrants who are employed at one of the many

Metro Vancouver branches of the popular Canadian doughnut and coffee franchise, Tim Hortons. In particular, this study explores how social factors such as gender, socioeconomic status, and the presence of ethnic communities mediate the experience of deskilling. Ultimately, the goal of this research is to develop a more complex and in-depth understanding of immigrant deskilling by capturing some of the detailed and contextualized experiences that cannot be acquired through quantitative research. By examining detailed accounts of individuals' experiences, attitudes, and reflections in regards to deskilling, this qualitative study aims to provide insights to how social structures and policies impact skilled immigrants' experiences at the ground level.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The devaluation and non-recognition of immigrants' international qualifications is a prominent issue widely-acknowledged by Canadian researchers (Li, 2008; Suto, 2009; Reitz, 2005; Bauder, 2003) and policy makers (CIC, 2010a; HRSDC, 2009). As Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC)'s 2009 progress report on foreign credential recognition notes:

> With an aging population and a declining birth rate, immigration has become the major source of population growth and a critical source of skilled labour for Canada. ... Immigrants come to Canada with high levels of education and skills, yet internationally trained workers have not been able to consistently transfer these talents to the Canadian context" (CIC, 2010a, p. 2).

Canada has indeed succeeded in recruiting high numbers of well-educated individuals: in 2006, 65% of immigrants in the core working age (25 to 64 years old) held a post-secondary certificate, diploma, or degree (Plante, 2010, p. 15), and very recent immigrants were more than twice as likely to have a university education as individuals born in Canada (Zietsma, 2007, p. 21). In 2009, the majority of immigrants (61%) entered Canada under the economic class, where admission is granted based on factors such as level of education, previous work experiences, proficiency in official languages, and other financial criteria (CIC, 2010b, p. 7). Yet despite immigrants' higher educational attainment, the average annual income for immigrants who worked on a full-time full-year basis in 2006 is almost 20% less than that of their Canadian-born counterparts (Plante, 2010, p. 9). This figure also does not take into consideration immigrants' higher unemployment rates, where very

recent immigrants in 2006 were more than twice as likely to be unemployed as the Canadian-born (Zietsma, 2007, p. 13). While common meritocratic beliefs suggest that individuals are rewarded according to their ability, researchers have found that an immigrant's level of education does not correlate with their labour market outcomes (Zietsma, 2007; Thompson, 2000).

Immigrant deskilling in Canada is conceptualized on many different levels: critical theorists point to exploitative structures and gate-keeping strategies as explanations for the differential treatment of foreign credentials and experiences (Bauder, 2003), while statistical analysts suggest that immigrants' current labour market outcomes may be the result of natural adjustment periods, time required for re-accreditation, or the average age of immigrants (Zietsma, 2007; Gilmore, 2008). Nevertheless, most researchers agree that deskilling is a systemic issue rather than a problem that occurs at the individual level (Bauder, 2003; Suto, 2009; Reitz, 2005; Li, 2003, 2008; Teo, 2007).

Many studies have documented the difficulties that immigrants and their families face in Canada due to systemic deskilling (Suto, 2008; Teo, 2007), including stress and depression resulting from the shift to working in menial and labour-oriented positions (Teo, 2007). In particular, the loss of prestige and respect associated with the shift to lower level work can be a major source of distress for many individuals. This loss of social status has been found to affect the way that skilled immigrants believe they are perceived by their family as well as by others around them. For instance, a participant in Bauder's (2003) study stated: "I don't want to get a [secondary labour job] because what am I going to tell my children, that their dad is now, instead of being the head of this company, is now a waiter in a restaurant?" (p. 709). Evidently, in addition to the stress that skilled immigrants accumulate from being unable to attain professional jobs and satisfactory sources of income in Canada, the disparity between pre- and post-migration occupations poses further emotional hardships. At the same time, individual experiences differ depending on how a multitude of dimensions interact with one another, including an immigrant's gender, place of origin, racial/ethnic identity, age of migration, accumulated savings, and social as well as professional networks. Aside from occupational difficulties, immigrants may experience further adversity due to the absence of supportive extended family networks, disparities in the cost of living

between Canada and their country of origin, and discriminatory attitudes towards certain accents in spoken English (Suto, 2008, p. 424).

In 2006, those who are born outside of Canada made up one-fifth of the Canadian population and slightly over one-fifth of the total labour force (HRSDC, 2011a; Statistics Canada, 2008). As a result, an examination of the employment experiences of immigrants is necessary for understanding a central component of the Canadian work force as well as population. While immigrant deskilling is hardly a recent phenomenon, the underutilization of immigrants' skills is becoming an increasingly pressing issue. For instance, studies employing different methodologies have estimated that the underutilization of immigrants' skills approximately amounts to a $2 billion loss annually (Reitz, 2001; Watt & Bloom, 2001).

METHODOLOGY

Tim Hortons was selected for this study because immigrants are more likely to be employed in the accommodation and food services industry than the Canadian-born (Zietsma, 2007, p. 23) and Tim Hortons is the largest publicly traded fast-food restaurant chain in Canada (Tim Hortons, 2011). As a well-known franchise with locations all over Metro Vancouver, Tim Hortons is an appropriate forum for conducting research on deskilling. It should be noted that this study focuses on the specific struggles of skilled immigrants who undergo a shift from professional work to manual labour. While immigrants without a post-secondary education also face many unique obstacles, these issues are beyond the scope of this paper.

Sample & Recruitment

The findings of this study are based on five semi-structured face-to-face interviews with highly skilled and educated Metro Vancouver residents who were employed at Tim Hortons. The selection criteria for this study are: (1) the individual was born outside of Canada, (2) the individual completed post-secondary education outside of Canada, (3) the individual is currently employed or has been employed at Tim Hortons in the last year, and (4) the individual worked at Tim Hortons for at least six months. In line with Statistics Canada conventions, post-secondary education was defined as any form of certificate, diploma, or degree in a recognized post-secondary institution (Zietsma, 2007, p. 8). It should also be noted that only those who had worked

at Tim Hortons for at least six months were recruited because new employees may have been unable to offer reflective comments on their experiences.

Following standard research procedures at the University of British Columbia, approval from the Behavioural Research Ethics Board (BREB) was sought and attained prior to recruitment. Potential participants were identified through the use of personal networks and recruited via a letter of introduction. Afterwards, potential participants were given two weeks to make their decision regarding participation. Once interviews began, additional participants were recruited through snowball sampling where interviewees were asked whether anyone else in their social networks fit the inclusion criteria. A twenty dollar gift card was prepared for each participant, although it was not accepted by all individuals.

Data Collection & Analysis

Semi-structured interviews were used because the format makes it possible to structure the interviews around a set of core questions that are addressed to all participants, while allowing the interviewer to ask unscripted questions specific to the experiences of each participant. Interviews were conducted in February 2010 and ranged from 30 to 65 minutes, with an average length of 50 minutes. Participants were asked about their location preferences for conducting the interviews and were accommodated in almost all instances. Interviews took place at the study rooms in local libraries, the participants' homes, and the interviewer's home.

All interviews were conducted in English. Although all participants were able to communicate reasonably well in English, most did not speak English fluently. In several of the interviews, participants commented directly on the difficulty of conveying their thoughts and ideas in English. Unfortunately, this could not be accommodated because the interviewer did not speak most of the participants' native languages and there was no budget to hire translators or interpreters. In one case, the participant (Amin) brought a family friend to act as an interpreter without prior notice to the interviewer.

Interviews were audio recorded and transcribed. Data was manually coded after the fieldwork by general themes, then interpreted and condensed into more specific categories. Field notes were also used to record meaningful gestures, facial expressions, or other body language that could not be captured by audio recordings. Since some participants did not have a wide range of

English vocabulary, their tone and body language often provided additional cues that helped with interpreting the deeper meanings and emotions behind the participants' responses, and generate appropriate probing questions.

Participants' Profiles

Of the five individuals who participated in this study, all were middle-aged, all were married, four were female, and four were Canadian citizens. Participants were educated in very different fields and had very dissimilar careers before working at Tim Hortons (see Appendix 1). The country of origin for these participants include: South Korea, Iran, Hong Kong, and Russia. All participants immigrated within the last thirteen years, and all but one individual immigrated over five years ago. Occasionally, the participant who immigrated within the last five years (Amin) would have outlooks on immigration and deskilling that were notably different from the other participants' perspectives. For instance, while most participants had come to accept their situations, Amin still reported experiencing "culture shock" and repeatedly stressed that migration is "a big revolution in one's life".

RESULTS & DISCUSSION

i. Deskilling at Tim Hortons

The narratives captured by the interviews in this study describe some of the common deskilling experiences that highly skilled and educated immigrants face in Canada. For many participants, taking on a position at Tim Hortons was the last resort in a lengthy and difficult job hunt that produced few positive results. Most participants considered their work at Tim Hortons to be so different from the positions they held prior to immigration that they could not compare the two, and many were amused by the prospect of being asked to make a comparison. When asked to describe their previous careers, participants typically cited highly positive experiences:

> *Natalie: I love it so much. [laughs] The pay is so good. [laughs] ... They pay me very well at that time. ... The work is not so difficult. I can get off at five thirty, very steady hours, and only five days a week, and I have money to hire a[maid] in Taiwan, so everything is going so well.*

Annika: I like my job. I don't want to tell no word about what I didn't like because I liked everything. ... I worked with very good people, and it was very fun to work with them.

Amin: Really happy with my job. Maybe my pay wasn't the best, but my job was really, really good for me. [I got retired and] that was the only thing [I didn't like about it.]... I loved my job.

While these responses may have been partially influenced by a comparison with the more menial positions that they occupied at Tim Hortons, the job descriptions provided by the participants suggest that these well-educated immigrants had enjoyed relatively satisfying occupations and comfortable lifestyles.

In contrast, most participants regarded their jobs at Tim Hortons as very "basic" or "simple" positions where few skills are required and "cheap money" is paid. The following accounts paint a vivid picture of the work environments with which individuals are confronted:

Amin: Very hard work, very busy. I find working at Tim Hortons very hard and demanding. [The storefront workers are] very demanding. They keep yelling. The people at the front – they keep yelling to the people at the back [the bakers]. That we need this, and we need that. ... And you know, I've got two hands. More than that, I've given my all and yet they're still very demanding at the front.

Lisa: The work was too hard for me. Difficult. ... For example, I had to stand for long time without stopping. Just thirty minutes break after four hours or five hours. Sometimes I had to stand for seven hours or later. And, yeah...it was hard. I didn't take physical work before, so... Especially working in the drive-through. I had to work with young girls. Some girls are very rude and unrespectful at all. ... I couldn't deal with them. [laughs] It was really hard. If something happens...it's nothing, but they get angry. ... Even if they do not complain or shout to us, but it hurts me sometimes. Sometimes they fight to each other [laughs] but it hurt to me and it bothers to me. 'Cause the environment it bothers me. I don't want to get involved in this kind of situation. 'Cause I never experience that kind of things in my life, so...

Amin and Lisa's descriptions reveal that work at Tim Hortons takes place in a fast-paced and labour-intensive environment. Both found it difficult to

meet physical labour demands and disliked working in a setting that fosters anxiety or conflict between workers.

In particular, Lisa's account reveals that deskilling not only involves the transition from a professional position to one associated with manual labour, but entails significant shifts in collegial relationships, one's attitude towards work, and the type of pressures placed on individuals. As Lisa repeatedly expressed, it was emotionally difficult for her to work at a place where direct forms of conflicts occur because such work dynamics were outside of her experience. Despite these difficulties, participants had gradually adapted to the Tim Hortons environment and did not consider their overall work experiences or collegial relationships to be unpleasant.

Nonetheless, these accounts highlight the disparity between the positions held by skilled immigrants before and after migrating to Canada. In particular, these five participants' transitions from working at banks, schools, and hospitals to the storefronts and kitchens of Tim Hortons were marked by emotional as well as physical strain. Lack of Canadian work experience, difficult reaccreditation processes, and insufficient English abilities were highlighted as some of the most significant factors prohibiting skilled immigrants from finding professional work in Canada. In the next section, I explore how these factors have led highly skilled individuals to work at Tim Hortons.

ii. Structural Factors Contributing to Deskilling

a) Lack of Canadian Experience

A lack of Canadian work experience was described as one of the main factors behind participants' inability to find work commensurate with their education and skills. All participants strongly believed that having Canadian experience was critical to finding work in Canada:

Amin: In one of those jobs, what happened was I didn't have enough experience in that field in Canada. ... I went with my wife to Best Western hotel. I applied over there and a lot of people...told me that I actually was qualified as far as being able to do the job. They said that I was qualified to do the job. However, due to my lack of experience in Canada, I wasn't accepted

Annika: It's so very difficult to find better job if you don't have the Canadian experience. And I went to couple of store to ask about if they have application,

but first I came to Value Village and they ask me...for [my past employer's] number from Israel. They wanted to call to Israel to ask about me. I tried to find basic job...and it was very difficult. But I came to Tim Hortons and I saw an application and I just apply and they take me to work. ...Very difficult because nobody wants to take me because I didn't...have experience in Canada. [Canadian experience is] very, very important. I couldn't find job for when I started to look for job. I couldn't go to work in Value Village. It's very simple job. [laughs] ...and I didn't have Canadian experience and they didn't hire me. [laughs]

Each of the above responses provides a personal account of the barriers to employment created by a lack of Ca nadian experience. In Annika's case, the lack of domestic experience also manifested as a lack of references – a key component of job applications. In turn, this created additional barriers to finding employment.

However, employers' insistence on Canadian work experience may not be fully justified. While having domestic work experience may indicate a certain degree of familiarity with working in a Canadian environment, the non-recognition of experiences gained outside of Canada disregards the value of transferrable skills. Chong-Hee discusses this issue using her nursing experiences:

I think most of Canadians don't [recognize our country's credentials]. Even though I have a lot of experiences in hospital, they don't know because I cannot speak English very well, I cannot explain very well. If I work there I can work very well even though without English. ...But just look at the situation, I can work...because I have experience. [But] then nobody knows but me, right?

While Korean and Canadian hospitals likely differ to some degree, Chong-Hee's years of experience caring for patients and working in hospitals are highly valuable and transferrable. If re-accreditation processes were more accessible, even technical skills such as calculating drug dosage or administering shots could be transferred.

Furthermore, Amin and Annika's narratives demonstrate that the general demand for Canadian experience can coerce skilled immigrants to take on menial positions through both push and pull factors: the need for Canadian work experience pushes immigrants to take on whatever positions they can

attain, while menial jobs draw immigrants because they are more likely to hire those without Canadian experience. Amin and Lisa both reported that a main reason they decided to work at Tim Hortons was to quickly gain work experience in Canada. The requirement of domestic experience is clearly a structural barrier since most new immigrants who have just landed in the country are unlikely to possess Canadian work experience. On the whole, these narratives illuminate the importance that Canadian employers place upon domestic work experiences, even for basic positions at places such as Value Village.

b) *Non-Recognition of Foreign Credentials & Difficult Re-accreditation Processes*

The question of re-accreditation is closely linked to the non-recognition of foreign credentials – often one of the first issues that confront immigrants in Canada. While international credentials are not equivalent to Canadian credentials, foreign credential recognition policies and programs could facilitate a better transfer of immigrants' education and skills. As Bauder (2003) argues, it is ironic that skilled immigrants are "selected by a point system that gives credit to education and credentials that are not recognized in Canada" (p. 708). Most participants in this study expected neither the non-recognition of their credentials nor the need to undergo re-accreditation.

Re-accreditation through local post-secondary institutions can be a way to acquire necessary Canadian credentials. However, findings from this research echo previous studies (Bauder, 2003) which suggest that re-accreditation is a process that can be expensive, challenging, and risky. The following comments provide a discussion of the complications involved:

> *Lisa: So if you upgrade yourself, you can get the new job too. Some people do not have enough time – they have to support themselves by working in physical work or totally different work. And some people are scared of re-educate themselves. … They have came here in their old age…there're usually many immigrants come here at their late age.*

> *Chong-Hee: I really want to get the nursing course in here – to take the nursing license. But it's so hard for me. …To study again hard because I cannot speak English very well. That's problem.*

Natalie: I think if I'm younger and willing to spend money to do, like, a refresher course in office administration. Like, [if] I'm willing to spend, like, ten thousand dollars or something like that, to go to a college to do some short refresher course, I think definitely, it's not so difficult to find a job in the office for me. … And quite risky, you know? If I spend ten thousand, twenty thousand, go to school, and eventually I cannot find a job in an office, then all this money will be wasted. So I don't want to take this risk.

These narratives suggest that re-accreditation is not only a difficult process, but also one that can be complicated by dynamics such as age, English proficiency, and socioeconomic status.

Although it becomes more difficult to return to school as an adult learner, Amin, Chong-Hee, and Lisa demonstrated high levels of persistence in their pursuit of Canadian credentials. However, both Amin and Chong-Hee found that they were required to improve their English before they could enroll in their programs of interest. For Chong-Hee, the result of six months of adult education was advancement into the Foundations Five curriculum – the equivalent of grade five English. In these cases, a lack of proficiency in English creates further obstacles for immigrants who wish to go through the re-accreditation process and these setbacks create additional barriers to an already challenging path. Most participants in this study saw a direct correlation between re-accreditation and better employment in Canada. Unfortunately, opportunities for re-accreditation are far less accessible for immigrants who do not have sufficient funding, time, or English proficiency. As a result, the non-recognition of international credentials and the often prohibitively difficult path to acquiring recognized credentials deny many skilled immigrants access to more professional work in Canada.

c) English Skills

English competency plays a significant role in immigrant deskilling and most participants believed that they would be able to acquire a better job if they had better English. Almost every participant in this study had completed some level of English education in their home country, but most were "surprised at how much [they] still needed to learn" after arriving in Canada. Amin provides an example with his situation:

If my English was better, I'd find a better job. 'Cause I'm that kind of person, I'm a go-getter. I go and fight and I could've done better if my

English was better. I studied English in high school as well as in university. And a year prior to coming here, I also studied English. But it still wasn't enough. … The people that…go to university [in Iran] are very well-educated in English. …Your grammar will be full, but due to the lack of vocabulary, once you come here, you just – you can't really talk.

Interestingly, the participants' experiences suggest that in some situations, language skills play a more significant role than other skills and experience in terms of job-finding. Since jobs in the service sector are communication-intensive, it is possible that the emphasis placed on language skills becomes magnified. For instance, Chong-Hee explained that working as a storefront clerk at Tim Hortons was easier than working as a baker in the back. However, in order to work at the storefront, individuals need to have a higher level of English proficiency.

While English proficiency plays an important role in re-accreditation and finding higher-level work in Metro Vancouver, individuals' occupational outcomes cannot be explained by a single factor. Among the participants, stronger English skills were demonstrated by Natalie and Lisa: Natalie studied in an English stream in high school where the entire curriculum was taught in English and later attained her diploma at a British college, while Lisa held a diploma in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages (TESOL) and taught English in South Korea. In spite of their English skills, both had come to work at Tim Hortons and were not necessarily placed in higher positions than participants with lower English skills. In this case, a more contextualized consideration of Natalie and Lisa's situations can provide a better understanding of their experiences.

iii. Factors Influencing Deskilling

a) Gender

While barriers faced by skilled immigrants in Canada are structural in nature, deskilling is not a uniform process with consistent effects on individuals. Instead, systemic barriers interact with various dynamics to produce unique experiences for immigrants. Child-rearing is cited as one of the greatest factors that prevent immigrant women from fully participating in the labour market. All female participants reported that they had been unable to participate in the workforce at some point due to child-rearing responsibilities. Natalie, Annika, and Lisa explained that they decided not to

work when they first immigrated to Canada because they needed to care for their young children. These women did not re-enter the workforce until their children were in high school or university. Since an individual's age and time away from the workforce influences their occupational outcomes, gendered child-rearing responsibilities have significant effects on immigrants who are also mothers of young children. The following narrative provides a concrete example of this dynamic:

> *Natalie: Actually, [my previous employer in Taiwan] landed a position for me [at the Scotiabank in Chinatown] and he told me, take it, you know? It's hard to get a job in Canada. At that time I declined because I said my daughters are still very young. They are still in elementary school. I came here for them, so I don't want to go into a job and not be able to take care of them. So I said, leave it…I want to concentrate in bringing up my daughters first. Let's wait and see. …I've been away from the workforce for…at least ten years. There's a big gap, you know? During these ten years, so much [has changed]. Like, in the computer, you have so much you can do, like, with the balance sheet and so on. There are so much things [that] can be done in the computer but I don't know or did. … [Yet] if I had taken my job at that time, I think I would be able to work there until I retire.*

Notably, if Natalie had accepted the position that her previous employer acquired for her, she would likely have experienced little deskilling upon migration. Transferring from one Scotiabank branch to another would have allowed her to stay in her field of work and remain in a similar work environment. However, Natalie's decision to concentrate on raising her children placed her in an entirely different work trajectory and her experience demonstrates the long-term effects that child-rearing responsibilities can have on the careers of immigrant women.

Similarly, Chong-Hee delayed her plans for re-accreditation when she first immigrated and only started taking English courses after her children became older. Her recent decision to adopt a relative's daughter also influenced her work as it resulted in the transition from full-time work to part-time work. Many female participants explained that being a housewife is a full-time job, and household responsibilities evidently had direct effects on female immigrants' career pathways.

However, it is important to note that child-rearing responsibilities are not necessarily perceived negatively by women. Although Natalie's decision to

"wait and see" resulted in a loss of access to her previous field of work, it was clear during the interview that she did not regret her decision. Chong-Hee also shared her view on providing childcare on a full-time basis instead of working:

> I work in Korea very much, I cannot take care of my children by myself. After I came here, I have to care of them by myself and I stay...at home. So that's nice.

Interestingly, there is little indication that these women viewed the tasks as a burden or a hindrance to their career. Although these examples demonstrate the priority that mothers place on their children, childrearing responsibilities are gendered and automatically assumed to be a woman's responsibility in many of the participants' households. As a result, gendered expectations and roles can significantly impede female immigrants' ability to find better work.

Another theme involving gender is the control that husbands may be able to exert over their wives. Interestingly, both of the South Korean women in this study (Chong-Hee and Lisa) did not initially want to immigrate to Canada but eventually agreed to do so because of their husbands' wishes. This reflects existing studies which find that men may initiate the movement of women through marriage (Walton-Roberts, 2003). In regards to work, Chong-Hee related a situation where her plan to gain relevant Canadian experiences by volunteering at a senior's home was met by her husband's opposition:

> I want to volunteer but my husband doesn't want to volunteer because I have good [nursing] experience, and [he asks,] 'Why do you work there, you don't get the money. Why do you work that free? In Canada it's very rich country so you don't need volunteer to them. ... If you can get the money, you work there.' ... Yes, I think good [to volunteer]. And then I [tell] my children, have to volunteer. But I didn't because my husband disagree with me and then I cannot.

When asked why she did not proceed with her decision regardless of her husband's opinion, Chong-Hee replied:

> No. Everything I agree with my husband so we cannot fighting. If I didn't agree with him, we – maybe we are fighting.

Chong-Hee's decision to forgo a volunteering opportunity that would allow her to gain nursing experience in Canada because of her husband's opposition demonstrates the detrimental effect that husbands can potentially have on

their wives' attempts to overcome barriers to employment. Thus, in addition to childrearing responsibilities, the dynamics within a marital relationship can further impact immigrant women's career opportunities and deskilling experiences.

Like women, men experience a set of gendered expectations and pressures, and this also affects the deskilling process:

> *Amin: As a man, I find because I have to be strong for my family – for my wife, for my kids – I have to put up with whatever I have to put up with, even if it's hard work. And because I wanna provide them with positive energy.*

Despite the hardships associated with deskilling, Amin suggested that men need to "put up" with their circumstances because it is an inherent part of their duty as husbands and fathers. Although he encountered difficulties finding desirable work, Amin had to continue to be a source of support for his family, both financially and emotionally. Since men are traditionally expected to be the breadwinner in a household, they may face additional emotional stress when they are unable to find work that allows them to fulfill this role.

Both female and male participants referenced the need to fulfill gendered expectations and responsibilities. The most prominent theme pertaining to gender that emerged during interviews was women's inability to fully concentrate on their careers or develop their skills due to child-rearing responsibilities. Additionally, as the narratives of the two South Korean participants suggest, cultural expectations of gender and marital dynamics may also affect the way female immigrants experience processes of immigration and deskilling. While female participants did not express any discontent regarding their husbands' influence, gender roles nevertheless have a significant impact on immigrant women's careers.

b) Ethnic Communities

Participants offered numerous accounts of how social ties within ethnic communities can provide work opportunities. For instance, Natalie and Amin both obtained their current positions at Tim Hortons as well as previous jobs through referrals from friends within their ethnic communities. In other situations, jobs are contingent on the existence of ethnic communities in Canada or transnational ties. Natalie was referred for a position at the Scotiabank in Chinatown prior to immigrating partially because the branch

"need[ed] some people who [could] speak Mandarin and Cantonese" for that particular branch. In another example, Chong-Hee's husband operated a transportation company that dealt with imports and exports to and from South Korea. Since the company dealt with transnational operations, ties with the Korean community in Vancouver and in South Korea were critical to the company's well-being. As these examples demonstrate, the roles of ethnic communities, social networks, and employment are very often intertwined for immigrants in Metro Vancouver.

Interestingly, some respondents also resisted working in jobs associated with their ethnic communities. This typically stems from a desire to improve their English, which was seen to have a positive effect on future employment:

> *Chong-Hee: I have to improve my English. Because I live in Canada so I need to speak English, right? So I don't want to work with Koreans.*

> *Amin: I personally would choose not to immerse myself into the Persian community right now because I would find it would restrict my learning curve...in English.*

Nonetheless, it should be noted that these views may have been influenced by self-selection, since participants were immigrants employed at Tim Hortons rather than workplaces more closely associated with ethnic groups.

On the whole, ethnic communities can be both a resource and barrier for immigrants in Canada. Although participants cited many examples of drawing resources from networks within their ethnic communities, immigrants who maintain weak social ties with their ethnic communities have been found to earn more than their counterparts who preserve strong ties at the aggregate level (Li, 2008). The participants of this study may have recognized the value of developing social networks outside of their specific ethnic communities, since many wanted to improve their English skills by working at a dominantly English-speaking environment.

c) *Socioeconomic Status*

While issues related to socioeconomic status were not mentioned as frequently as gender or ethnicity, they still influenced the degree to which deskilling affected the participants of this study. For instance, Natalie stated that she was able to immigrate to Canada without making any plans for re-education or work due to her family's socioeconomic status:

> I didn't worry about it financially because my husband got a job in Taiwan and we're able to make good money. So I thought, oh, as long as we have money to survive for our daily living, you know? I don't really care whether after I bring up my daughters I have a good job or not. I don't care.

Since Natalie was not concerned about her employment situation, deskilling had a far lesser impact on her financially and emotionally. Her relative lack of financial concern and dependency on her job also transfers to the way she exerts herself at work:

> I worked for a short time also in the bakery job. ... But I end up quarreling the boss or something. Because they make some unreasonable request or they are picky [or] they don't like the way I work or say I'm slow or something, I forgot. So I quit. [laughs]. ... They are so peculiar. Like, [they would demand] how many buns they have to put in what kind of box. And, like the toast, you have to put it in what particular type of bag. You have to stick to that. Yeah, and then when I couldn't remember I just put it in whatever bags I liked and they are mad. [laughs very hard].

For many, the tasks described above would not have been considered "unreasonable" or "picky." Workers in less comfortable economic situations who cannot afford to leave their jobs are less likely to challenge their employer's requests or exercise a level of autonomy that exceeds the position, let alone start an argument with the employer after disregarding given instructions. Natalie's story provides a vivid example of how higher economic status can provide individuals with greater control over their work, less pressure to find work of any level, and more leverage with their employers.

Additionally, immigrants from upper socioeconomic backgrounds have demonstrated the ability to draw on a wealth of resources and support from extended family members in similar situations to make a comeback in their careers despite not having occupied a professional job for many years. In the case of Chong-Hee's husband, limited entrepreneurial and employment opportunities led him to discontinue the business he started in Canada. Yet their connections with those of similar socioeconomic status in South Korea allowed Chong-Hee's husband to make a successful return to the type of work that he did prior to deskilling:

> *Chong-Hee: After last year, [my husband] went to Korea. Before he came here, he had a business. And then he gave his brother his company and then*

> *his brother doing that company. It's secured bigger than before and then his brother helped him - my husband. ...He can get the job very hard to in here.*

Aside from their financial advantages, immigrants from higher socioeconomic backgrounds may also have access to resources in the form of social capital – the value that can be directly or indirectly drawn from social networks. However, the accessibility of these resources for immigrants often depends heavily on the maintenance of transnational ties and may erode over time.

Many participants in this study appeared to have come from relatively comfortable socioeconomic backgrounds. While the loss of quality employment may have had a significant impact on individuals' financial circumstances in Canada, participants demonstrated their ability to moderate the deskilling experience by using various economic and social resources. Although deskilling still creates considerable difficulties for immigrants of higher socioeconomic status, these immigrants may have more resources at their disposal to develop strategies for combating deskilling.

CONCLUSION & IMPLICATIONS

Deskilling not only has significant implications for Canada's foreign-born population but the country's social and economic policies as well. A longitudinal report by Statistics Canada found that from 1980 to 2000, up to one-third of male immigrants who were aged 25 to 45 at the time of landing experienced out-migration within 20 years after their arrival (Aydemir & Robinson, 2006). Furthermore, emigration rates were particularly high for those who were admitted under the skilled worker and economic classes (Aydemir & Robinson, 2006). Through focus group discussions with 56 return migrants to Hong Kong, Ley & Kobayashi (2005) found that limited job opportunities was a primary factor behind their departure from Canada, while economic motives drew individuals back to Hong Kong. Returnees to Hong Kong often expressed that they enjoyed many aspects of Canadian life, but were compelled to leave for occupational and financial reasons:

> Almost everything is polluted in Hong Kong so when I retire I don't want to stay in Hong Kong. There's no fun, you can't go fishing; you can't go skiing. If I can, I want to go back [to Canada] tomorrow. But I can't afford to go back there right now because I need to make a living. (Ley & Kobayashi, 2005)

Similar views and experiences regarding out-migration were documented in Teo's (2007) study of recent immigrants from mainland China. Given Canada's reliance on immigration as a source of population growth and workforce labour, government policies which facilitate immigrant access to quality employment through credential recognition and re-accreditation are indispensable.

Recent policy initiatives reflect a number of efforts to address these issues. In 2005 and 2007 respectively, the Foreign Credential Recognition (FCR) program and the Foreign Credentials Referral Office (FCRO) were established to facilitate the assessment as well as recognition of international credentials and to assist educated immigrants with finding work in their field of training in Canada (HRSDC, 2007). Some groups currently targeted for integration include international medical professionals, engineers, and health-care professionals (HRSDC, 2007). Despite official government recognition of foreign credentials, many regulatory associations have refused to accept immigrants with these credentials into their associations (S. Leung, personal communication, March 11 2011). This discrepancy between government initiatives and ground level effects raises questions around the efficacy of current policies and suggests that successful implementation requires greater collaboration with regulatory associations.

In British Columbia, a new immigration agreement with the federal government increased immigrant settlement funding from $40 million in 2005-2006 to $114 million in 2010-2011. This saw the expansion of settlement services, including adult English language training for more than 18,000 residents annually (WelcomeBC, 2010). In order to reduce barriers to participation, English classes are available on a full-time and part-time basis, and free childcare is available at selected community service providers. Participants who had used these services noted that while these programs provided useful information and resources, they were not always effective in connecting newcomers to professional jobs. For example, Annika indicated that settlement services fall short of fully addressing the employment challenges of immigrants who already have some English competency, citing cost and a lack of daycare services as barriers. However, most participants used these programs before the expansion in 2010 and it would be useful to explore whether these programs have made notable improvements since.

Despite their limitations, new policy initiatives in Canada appear to correspond to the needs expressed by the participants in this study. Recent government initiatives demonstrate that efforts have been made to address employment obstacles associated the non-recognition of foreign credentials and experiences. Given that immigrant deskilling has been an ongoing concern in Canada, the government must respond to these issues in a more timely and effective manner. Specifically, policy makers need to increase the scope of key programs, ensure their timely delivery, alleviate structural obstacles to accessibility, and provide sufficient funding.

Limitations

In addition to linguistic barriers discussed in the methodology section, a major limitation of this study was participants' reticence to speak more deeply about their feelings, experiences, and emotions. Although much effort was made to build rapport with each of the participants, the process proved difficult at times due to the age difference between the interviewer and the participants. Most participants were also very conscious of the presence of the audio recorder and would sometimes act and speak less naturally as a result. Participants may have shared more of their personal thoughts in a focus group setting, since it was observed that participants communicated much more openly about their feelings with each other than with the interviewer. However, focus groups would have been difficult to organize due to time constraints. Individual interview times were already difficult to arrange since child rearing, work schedules, and the need for family time often limited participants' availabilities. Findings may not be generalizeable to the rest of Canada's foreign-born population because this was a pilot study which only involved five participants from vastly different backgrounds.

Future Research

Since this is an exploratory study, there are many ways to expand on research in this area. First, it would be valuable to examine the effectiveness of relevant programs and resources provided by various government and non-profit organizations. In particular, this would include reviewing whether immigrants in Canada are generally aware of the FCR and FCRO, as well as program success and program users' experiences. Second, future research could examine personal factors that mediate skilled immigrants' occupational

experiences and pathways, including marital status and the presence of children. While all participants in this study were married with children, those who are single or without children may experience deskilling differently. Finally, since the non-recognition of international qualifications is cited as a major barrier to finding professional work in Canada, it is important to examine whether reaccreditation produces the expected amount of improvement in occupational outcomes. If reaccreditation is positively correlated with occupational outcomes, researchers can begin to consider how policies can address the question of its accessibility. If reaccreditation produces little change in immigrant occupational outcomes, other institutional factors which may limit immigrants' labour market outcomes should be investigated.

The interview narratives in this study demonstrate that despite the efforts that well-educated and highly-skilled immigrants make to acquire necessary experience and credentials, structural barriers make it difficult to find work commensurate with their prior education, skills, and experience. From employer demands for Canadian qualifications to the lengthy re-accreditation process, structural barriers can create prohibitively difficult obstacles that prevent skilled immigrants from finding quality work in Canada. To complicate the issue, factors such as gender, the presence and size of ethnic communities, as well as socioeconomic status interact with structural barriers to produce differing experiences and employment outcomes. Through an examination of how immigrants' deskilling experiences and specific career pathways are mediated by the interaction of various social factors, this study ultimately highlights the need to consider the issue of deskilling in more contextualized and nuanced ways.

REFERENCES

Aydemir, A. & Robinson, C. (2006). *The Canadian Immigrant Labour Market in 2006: Analysis by Region or Country of Birth*. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 11F0019MIE. Ottawa, Minister of Industry. 49 p. Analytical Studies Branch Research Paper Series, no. 273. HYPERLINK "http://dsp-psd.pwgsc.gc.ca/Collection/Statcan/11F0019MIE/11F0019MIE2006273.pdf" http://dsp-psd.pwgsc.gc.ca/Collection/Statcan/11F0019MIE/11F0019MIE2006273.pdf (accessed January 5, 2011).

Bauder, H. (2003). "Brain Abuse," or the Devaluation of Immigrant Labour in Canada. *Antipode*, 35(4), 699-717.

Canada Research Chair in Urban Changes and Adaptation. (2009). *An Evaluation of the Manitoba Provincial Nominee Program*. Winnipeg: Carter, J.

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2007, Oct 31). "Annual Report to Parliament on Immigration, 2007." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/

resources/publications/annual-report2007/section1.asp"http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/resources/publications/annual-report2007/section1.asp

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2009a, June 8). "Minister Kenney Celebrates CIC's Award Winning Young Newcomers Internship Program." Retrieved from

HYPERLINK "http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/releases/2009/2009-06-08.asp" http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/releases/2009/2009-06-08.asp

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2009b, June 11). "Immigrating to Canada." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/immigrate/index.asp"http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/immigrate/index.asp

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2010a). "A Commitment to Foreign Credential Recognition – Government of Canada Progress Report 2009." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.credentials.gc.ca/about/pdf/progress-report2009.pdf"http://www.credentials.gc.ca/about/pdf/progress-report2009.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2010c, Sept). "Canada Facts and Figures 2009: Immigrant Overview – Permanent and Temporary Residents." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/facts2009.pdf" http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/pdf/research-stats/facts2009.pdf

Citizenship and Immigration Canada (CIC). (2010c, Oct 5). "Government of Canada Launches New Federal Internship for Newcomers Program." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/releases/2010/2010-10-05.asp" http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/releases/2010/2010-10-05.asp

Gilmore, J. (2008). *The Canadian Immigrant Labour Market in 2006: Analysis by Region or Country of Birth.* Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 71-606-X2008002. Ottawa. Minister of Industry. 42 p. Immigrant Labour Force Analysis Series, no. 2. <HYPERLINK "http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2008002-eng.pdf"http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2008002-eng.pdf>. Accessed October 17, 2009.

Gilmore, Jason and Christel Le Petit. (2008). *The Canadian Immigrant Labour Market in 2007: Analysis by Region of Postsecondary Education.* Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 71-606-X2008004. Ottawa. Minister of Industry. 32 p. Immigrant Labour Force Analysis Series, no. 4. <HYPERLINK "http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2008004-eng.pdf"http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/71-606-x/71-606-x2008004-eng.pdf>. Accessed October 17, 2009.

Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC). (2011a, Feb 21). "Canadians in Context – Immigration." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www4.hrsdc.gc.ca/.3ndic.1t.4r@-eng.jsp?iid=38" http://www4.hrsdc.gc.ca/.3ndic.1t.4r@-eng.jsp?iid=38

Human Resources Skills Development Canada (HRSDC). (2011b, Feb 9). Launch of the Federal Internship for Newcomers Program. *Intersections.* Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://hrsdc.prv/eng/corporate/e-news/intersection/your_community/2011/02/09/00/index.shtml" http://hrsdc.prv/eng/corporate/e-news/intersection/your_community/2011/02/09/00/index.shtml

Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC). (2009, Dec 11). "Overview – Foreign Credential Recognition." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/workplaceskills/credential_recognition/transf/backgrounder_fcr.pdf" http://www.hrsdc.gc.ca/eng/workplaceskills/credential_recognition/transf/backgrounder_fcr.pdf

Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC). (2005, Nov 5). "Foreign Credential Recognition." Retrieved from HYPERLINK "http://www.credentials.gc.ca/media/backgrounders/2007-05-24a.asp"http://www.credentials.gc.ca/media/backgrounders/2007-05-24a.asp

Ley, D. & Kobayashi, A. (2005). Back to Hong Kong: Return Migration or Transnational Sojourn? *Global Networks,* 5(2), 111-127.

Li, P. (2003). Destination Canada – Immigration Debates and Issues. Ontario: Oxford University Press.

Li, P. (2008). The Role of Foreign Credentials and Ethnic Ties in Immigrants' Economic Performance. *Canadian Journal of Sociology*, 33(2), 291-310.

Plante, J. (2010). *Characteristics and Labour Market Outcomes of Internationally-Educated Immigrants*. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 81-595-MWE. Ministry of Industry. 92 p. Culture, Tourism, and the Centre for Education Statistics, no. 84. < HYPERLINK ″http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-595-m/81-595-m2010084-eng.pdf″ http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/81-595-m/81-595-m2010084-eng.pdf>. Accessed February 15, 2011.

Reitz, J. (2005). Tapping Immigrants' Skills: New Directions for Canadian immigration Policy in the Knowledge Economy. Institute for Research on Public Policy. Montreal: IRPP Choices 11(1).

Reitz, J. (2001). Immigrant Skill Utilization in the Canadian Labour Market: Implications of Human Capital Research. *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 2, no. 3: 347-78.

Suto, M. (2009). Compromised Careers: The Occupational Transition of Immigration and Resettlement. *Work: A Journal of Prevention, Assessment, and Rehabilitation.* 32, 417-428.

Statistics Canada. (2008). *Canada's Changing Labour Force, 2006 Census*. Catalogue no. 97-559-X. Ottawa. HYPERLINK ″http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/as-sa/97-559/pdf/97-559-XIE2006001.pdf″ http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/as-sa/97-559/pdf/97-559-XIE2006001.pdf

Sweetman, A. (2004). "Immigrant Source Country School Quality and Labour Market Outcomes." Analytical Studies Research Paper Series, Catalogue No. 11F0019MIE – No. 234. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

Tim Hortons (2011). Tim Hortons – Investors FAQs. Retrieved from HYPERLINK ″http://www.timhortons.com/ca/en/about/faqs.html″ http://www.timhortons.com/ca/en/about/faqs.html

Teo, S. Y. (2007). Vancouver's Newest Chinese Diaspora: Settlers or "Immigrant Prisoners". *GeoJournal*, 68, 211-222.

Thompson, E. N. (2000). "Immigration Occupational Skill Outcomes and the Role of Region-Specific Human Capital." Quebec: Human Resources Development Canada Publications Centre.

Walton-Roberts, M. (2003). Transnational Geographies: Indian Immigration to Canada. *Canadian Geographer.* 47(3), 235-250.

Watt, D. and M. Bloom. (2001). Exploring the Learning Recognition Gap in Canada: Phase 1 Report. Recognizing Learning: The Economic Cost of Not Recognizing Learning and Learning Credentials in Canada. Ottawa: Conference Board of Canada.

WelcomeBC. (2010, Apr 9). "About WelcomeBC." Retrieved from HYPERLINK ″http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/about.page?″ http://www.welcomebc.ca/wbc/about.page?

Zietsma, D. (2007). *The Canadian Immigrant Labour Market in 2006: First Results from Canada's Labour Force Survey*. Statistics Canada Catalogue no. 71-606-XIE2007001. Ottawa. Minister of Industry. 26 p. Immigrant Labour Force Analysis Series, no. 1. <HYPERLINK ″http://dsp-psd.pwgsc.gc.ca/collection_2007/statcan/71-606-X/71-606-XIE2007001.pdf″http://dsp-psd.pwgsc.gc.ca/collection_2007/statcan/71-606-X/71-606-XIE2007001.pdf>. Accessed October 17, 2009.

APPENDIX

Participants Profile

Name	Natalie	Chong-Hee	Amin	Annika	Lisa
Gender	Female	Female	Male	Female	Female
Birth Place	Hong Kong	South Korea	Iran	Russia	South Korea
Residence before Migration	Taiwan	South Korea	Iran	Israel	South Korea
Age Range	50–59	40–49	60–69	40–49	50–59
Year of Migration	1995–2000	2000–2005	2005–2010	2000–2005	2000–2005
Citizenship Status	Citizen	Citizen	Permanent Resident	Citizen	Citizen
Educational Attainment	Diploma in Secretarial Studies (England)	Diploma in Nursing (South Korea)	Degree; Certificate in Education (at top 10 university in Iran)	Degree in Geometrics (Russia)	Degree in Business Administration; Certificate in TESOL (South Korea)
Previous Occupation	Secretary to the General Manager at Scotia Bank (for 8+ years)	Nurse	High school math teacher (for 30 years)	Worked with interbank transactions	English teacher at a supplementary education institution
Position at Tim Hortons	Storefront clerk (PT)	Drive-through clerk (PT)	Baker (PT)	Storefront clerk (PT)	Supervisor (discontinued)

Pseudonyms are used for all participants

Where the Wind Blows:

Patented Seeds and the Sociological Effects of Roundup
Ready Canola

Micheal Kehl

T HE PATENTING OF LIVING ORGANISMS REPRESENTS A CLASSIC EXAMPLE OF
the law's inability to keep pace with technology. Living organisms pose
a problem for current patent legislation because they can easily extend
themselves to new areas through their natural reproductive processes and,
under current laws, take with them all existing property claims, even if the
new lands are the private property of another. This paper seeks to examine the
effects of the tension within current legal understandings of ownership rights
by focusing specifically on the example of Monsanto Corporation's "Roundup
Ready" canola. With Roundup Ready canola, Monsanto has leveraged the
outmoded state of Canada's patent laws to their advantage, using them as a
means to institute their own system of governance and land ownership based
on the technology use agreements established with farmers.

More than a simple legal or philosophical debate, Monsanto's form
of *de facto* land control – effective maintenance of control over land not
by the ownership of the actual lands, but by the ownership of what is
grown on them and can be grown on them in the future – has had profound
social consequences for rural farming communities. The limits imposed
by technology use agreements have served to deskill farmers and render
useless traditional farming techniques that have been passed down through
generations. Further, enforcement of these agreements is structured around
incentives which encourage farmers to report their neighbours for growing

genetically modified foods without a license. Combined with the tactics through which they are enforced, the limits imposed by technology use agreements create an atmosphere of distrust in which the independence of farmers is severely compromised and the social fabric of farming communities is slowly eroded. It is the goal of this paper to elucidate these changes, beginning with a discussion of the current legal debate around the patenting of living organisms in Canada.

A PRIMER ON ROUNDUP READY CANOLA

Monsanto first introduced its genetically modified transgenic herbicide tolerant "Roundup Ready" canola to the market in 1995. Roundup Ready canola is a type of canola that has been genetically engineered by the Monsanto Corporation to be immune to the effects of their proprietary herbicide "Roundup." This engineered immunity allows fields of Roundup Ready canola to be indiscriminately sprayed with Roundup herbicide in order to reduce weed-crop competition, and thereby increase overall crop yields[1]. Adoption of this new technology was rapid and widespread, and by 2005 Roundup Ready canola accounted for 78% of all canola grown in Canada (Eaton, 2009).

In order to use Roundup Ready canola, farmers must sign a technology user agreement. As part of the agreement, farmers are required to pay a usage fee of $15 per acre to Monsanto Canada. Farmers must allow Monsanto full access to their records, including all seed and chemical purchases. Lastly, farmers must agree not to save or replant seeds, promise to use Roundup specific herbicide, and allow Monsanto to inspect their crops periodically for up to three years after planting even if the seeds are in use for only one season (Monsanto, 2011).

CUTTING EDGE CROPS VS. TRADITIONAL CONCEPTIONS OF PROPERTY

Central to the Roundup Ready canola debate are issues of ownership and the relationship between public and private domains. John Locke's *Second Treatise of Government* informs this theoretical debate as it is the basis of much current legal reasoning regarding property ownership. In his second treatise, Locke (1689/2004) advocates a labour-based conception of property centred on the notion that property becomes owned through the process of

---

1 For a complete discussion of the nature, properties and uses of Roundup Ready canola, see Monsanto, 2009.

being mixed with one's labour. Locke posits that the earth and all inferior creatures are the common property of all humankind, yet all humans have within them their own property – "the labour of his body and the work of his hands" (Chapter 2, § 26). It is through the combination of human labour with objects in the state of nature that objects come to be owned: "Whatsoever then, he removes out of the state that nature hath provided and left it in; he hath mixed his labour with, and joined to it something that is his own, and thereby makes it his property" (Chapter 2, § 26). Labour adds value to goods, if in no other way than by allowing them to be enjoyed by humans. According to Locke, man, being inherently entitled to the fruits of his own labour, is thus entitled to all products resulting from its application. As they are considered legal persons, this reasoning can, of course, be applied to corporations as well. For example, a pharmaceutical company that removes a root from the rainforest and refines it to extract its medicinal qualities comes to own the root through this process.

Once property is removed from the state of nature it comes to be excluded from the common rights of others. However, an individual does not require the permission of others in order to acquire property as one's own. Theoretically, then, all individuals have equal right to access and claim previously unclaimed property without the assignation or consent of others (p. 18). From this perspective, individuals have an unfettered right of possession, disposition, and use of corporeal and incorporeal objects (rights, patents, or any object, such as the process used in isolating a specific certain gene, that has no value in physical form) which constitute unclaimed property (Underkufflert, 1991). This basic Lockean view of property rights has undergirded patent law in common law nations for centuries and is the underlying basis for establishing ownership of property even in present times.

Locke's conception of property is not without its detractors. Even in Locke's time, authors such as Edmund Burk (Burke & Clark, 2001, p. 208) and other scholars of his ilk (Hegel & Wood, 1991, §67-69; Harrington, 1656, p. 155-161) argued that the Lockean conception of property served to preserve the existing social hierarchy and guard against the political and social upheaval that could result from a purely meritocratic order. Property protected the propertied classes who possessed it from competition with non-propertied people of exceptional natural ability and talent.

More recently, Locke's critics have argued that his labour-based conception of property fails to suggest a limit as to how much property an individual may appropriate (Bell, Henry, & Wray, 2004). Two preconditions make up the foundation of Locke's conception of property. First, writing in the early half of the seventeenth-century, Locke's assumption was that there were enough goods that everyone could appropriate the objects of his labours without infringing upon goods that have been appropriated by someone else. Second, Locke presupposes that individuals will place a natural limit on how much they will appropriate; having so much of something that some may spoil is a fundamental violation of one of Locke's laws of nature. Locke (2004, p.28) believed that this human inclination towards moderation would hold true even within a monetary economy; even with a rudimentary system of system of commerce, Locke assumes that increased wealth will be distributed to the benefit of all. Obviously, the veracity of this assertion is open to question. Indeed, those who critique Locke from a Cartelist perspective (Bell, Henry, & Wray, 2004; Snyder, 1986) argue that when a proper conception of money is taken into account, Locke's own moral structures will be violated and his theoretical defence of the accumulation process undermined.

The omission of a limit on how much property one can possess is especially glaring when one attempts to apply the Lockian view to the patenting of life forms. His claims fail to provide guidance for determining the scope of rights of ownership established through the mixing of labour with living nature. Locke's conception can speak to the assignation of property rights to an individual who has used his or her labour to produce a single genetically modified organism; however, it is silent on the issue of whether or not the original creator should have rights to all subsequent copies the organism makes of itself through its own natural reproductive capabilities.

Carole Rose (1985) exposes the shortcomings of Locke's open-ended framework by asking, "[s]uppose I pour a can of tomato juice into the ocean: do I now own the seas?" (p. 74). This rhetorical question captures the essence of the property rights issues underlying the Roundup Ready canola dispute. Monsanto has put their labour into modifying the genetic code of the canola plant and, accordingly, they should have the rights to the sole possession and sale of their newly created property. Indeed, Monsanto strives to maintain sole possession of the rights to their property through their technology use agreements with paying farmers. However, once released

into the environment, Roundup Ready canola plants are able to reproduce and spread to other fields through the plant's natural dispersing abilities. Given the seeds' ability to travel up to 4km in ideal wind conditions, they have contaminated virtually all canola fields on the Canadian prairies (Marvier & Acker, 2005). In Rose's terms, Roundup Ready canola is the can of tomato juice and Monsanto's introduction of the seeds to the market represents the act of pouring it into the seas. What remains then, is the question of whether Monsanto now owns the seas. That is: do Monsanto's patent rights to Roundup Ready canola trump the property rights of the individual landowners onto whose lands the seeds have spread?

Determining the ownership rights of land contaminated with Monsanto's Roundup Ready canola hinges on two competing conceptions of property. The first conception is based on the inviolability of property ownership, specifically the ownership of land as a fundamental right in a democratic society. This conception is based on the twelfth-century British common law outlining the right to claim ownership of property between neighbouring farmers. The law stipulates that the landowner can claim property rights over anything that comes upon his land; for example, the offspring of a bull that comes onto a farmer's land and impregnates his cow (Müller, 2006). In contrast, the second conception, owing from the European-American expectation that one should enjoy the products of their labour not just immediately but in the future, places the right to intellectual property over the right of private enjoyment of property (Müller 2006). Intellectual property rights define a link between product and producer. Third parties may enjoy the property in question and create new property from it, but returns must include benefits to the original producer (Müller, 2006). Thus, becoming an owner of something does not extinguish the original producer's intellectual property rights.

> [T]he main purpose of patent protection is to prevent others from depriving the inventor, in part or indirectly, of the monopoly rights that the law seeks to provide them. Only the inventor is entitled to the full enjoyment of the monopoly conferred by the law (Cullet, 2005, p. 86).

In Canada, current intellectual property laws tend toward the second conception of property, resting on the assertion that money-producing products should go on producing returns for their original creators (Strathern, 1996).

THE CASE OF MONSANTO V. SCHMEISER

Monsanto v. Schmeiser is the largest and most public example of a legal battle over genetically modified crops to date (citation). It has also set the precedent for case law concerning the patenting of living organisms within Canada. In 1996, Percy Schmeiser, a farmer in Bruno, Saskatchewan sprayed Roundup herbicide on some canola plants growing around power poles on his farm. Noticing that the plants did not die, Schmeiser saved the seeds and used them the following year in his fields – a common practice among canola farmers (Fox, 2001). After receiving a tip that Schmeiser was growing Roundup Ready canola without a license, a private agency conducted several tests on the plants in Schmeiser's fields on behalf of Monsanto in 1997[2]. Monsanto's patented gene was found in the majority of his crops (Fox, 2001). The following year Monsanto filed suit against Schmeiser, claiming he had planted their patented canola in 1997 and harvested the seeds for replanting in 1998 without notifying the company or paying them the standard license fee of $15/acre (Makin, 2004). Schmeiser argued that he had not planted the seeds and speculated that they had blown into his fields from a neighbour's field or a passing truck carrying Roundup Ready seeds (Makin, 2004). After losing the initial trial, Schmeiser sought to appeal the decision at the Supreme Court.

After a two-year legal battle, the Supreme Court again sided with Monsanto in a 5-4 majority and found Schmeiser guilty of infringing on Monsanto's patent. The court ruled that Monsanto had not waived their patent rights by releasing their invention into the environment without attempts to control dispersal (Yoo & Bothwell, 2005). Further, despite agreement that Schmeiser was unaware of his infringement on Monsanto's patent, it was decided that his reproduction of the patented gene, and later selling of the harvested crop which contained the patented gene, constituted the appropriation and use of another's invention without permission (Fox, 2001).

Two years prior to Monsanto v. Schmeiser, Harvard University attempted to attain a Canadian patent on a mouse genetically modified to be susceptible to human cancers (Harvard College v. Canada 2002 SCC 45, judgement). In the case of the Harvard "Oncomouse," the Supreme Court ruled that, being a higher life form, the mouse was not patentable. A patent was issued to

---

2   In the summer of 1997, a private agency operating on behalf of Monsanto, undertook random audits of canola crops growing in Saskatchewan. The audited farms were chosen by Monsanto from their licensed farmers and from leads or tips suggesting that Roundup Ready seed might be growing on property of unlicensed farmers. (*S. v Monsanto*, 2001 FCT 256).

Harvard University for the process used to create the mouse, but they were not awarded the rights to any successive offspring. The decision was based on the reasoning that no human act, or in Locke's terms, "no mixing with ones' labour," was required beyond the production of the initial genetically modified cells to produce a mouse that was a "differentiated being" (Müller, 2006).

While "higher life forms" like mice cannot be patented in Canada (Ratanaseangsuang, 1998), Monsanto's Roundup Ready canola was not deemed a higher life form. Consistent with previous rulings, the court concluded in the Monsanto v. Schmeiser case that plants, as higher life forms, cannot be patented in Canada. However, a patent for a plant cell or a single chimeric or modified gene in a cell is not considered a higher life form and therefore may be patented (Yoo & Bothwell, 2005). This decision grants the patent holder the right to decide what others may do with the plant, as every cell within the plant contains the modified gene (Forge, 2005). Although Monsanto was not allowed to patent the entire plant, it did have the right to exclude all those without a valid license from the future offspring of plants containing the gene. In essence, the Supreme Court of Canada ruled that there is no legal distinction between mechanical inventions and Monsanto's newly created biotechnology. Despite the gene's ability to reproduce itself, the courts ruled that this gene should be treated as though it were simply another cog. The Supreme Court's decision in the Monsanto v. Schmeiser ruling privileged patent rights over farmers' private property rights, thereby siding with a conception of property that favours intellectual property rights over the right to private enjoyment of property.

Monsanto's lawyers argued that the chimeric gene is analogous to patented steel in a car or the ingredients in a cake (Müller, 2006). Canada's patent law states that "a defendant infringes upon a patent when the defendant manufactures, seeks to use, or uses a patented material that is contained within something that is not patented" (Monsanto v. Schmeiser, 2004 SCC 34, judgement: 42, cited in Müller, 2006). As the use of patented products such as the aforementioned steel or baking powder without license constitutes infringement, Monsanto's lawyers claim that the same applies to Roundup Ready seeds. As the patented genes are duplicated each time the plant reproduces, anyone knowingly or unknowingly involved in the reproduction

of the seeds infringes upon Monsanto's patent claim (Yoo & Bothwell, 2005). The court stated:

> [W]here a defendant's commercial or business activity involves a thing of which a patented part is a significant or important component, infringement is established. It is no defence to say that the thing actually used was not patented, but only one of its components. (Monsanto v. Schmeiser, 2004 SCC 34, judgement: 78)

Although the patented gene only constitutes a small part of the entire plant, the Supreme Court interpreted the patenting of this gene through a century-old Lockean framework of patent law, ultimately siding with Monsanto.

Arguing that their patent would become meaningless if farmers could isolate the Roundup Ready canola plants, reproduce them, and sell them as their own seed, Monsanto won the case. Monsanto's lawyers argued that if farmers had unlimited use of the seeds after original purchase, Roundup Ready canola would become like any other non-genetically modified seed and Monsanto would lose control over their product (Müller, 2006). As it stands today, Monsanto can claim property rights to all Roundup Ready canola plants. They have the legal right to level complaints of infringement upon any farmer who saves his or her own purchased canola seed. In essence, Monsanto "has achieved a power analogous to the one of feudal lords who collected rent on the crops grown by the serfs they controlled" (Müller, 2006, p. 17). Given the natural tendency for seeds to spread and the numerous fields which now contain Roundup Ready canola in the Canadian prairies (Marvier & Acker, 2005), it is likely that farmers who have never purchased or planted Roundup Ready may become financially indebted to Monsanto. This places farmers in a precarious position as Monsanto has demonstrated their desire to wield and extend their power through the legal enforcement of property rights.

ENFORCEMENT OF PROPERTY RIGHTS

At the Guelph Organic Conference in 2004, Percy Schmeiser outlined Monsanto's strategies for enforcing their patent rights. Schmeiser categorized Monsanto's strategies as taking one of two distinct approaches. In the first scenario, those suspected of illegally using Roundup Ready canola are either reported by other farmers through Monsanto's tip-line or discovered by the investigative firm hired by Monsanto. A pair of detectives from this same agency then goes to the home of the farmers suspected of growing

Roundup Ready canola without a license. In the second scenario, agents for Monsanto may aerially spray a small section of a field they believe to be illegally containing Roundup Ready canola with Roundup. If the plants do not die, then it can be concluded that the field contains Roundup Ready Canola. Regardless of the method of discovery, the next steps remain essentially the same.

Farmers are informed that they can either sign a licensing agreement with Monsanto and pay a certain percentage equal to the standard $15 per acre fee for the amount of the sale of the crop they are growing, or be taken to court by Monsanto. In lieu of being sued by a multi-billion dollar corporation most farmers concede to signing the agreement. If a farmer refuses to sign the licensing agreement, they receive letters stating that Monsanto has reason to believe that the farmer might be growing Roundup Ready canola without a license. The farmers are informed that in order to avoid being taken to court, they are required to pay to Monsanto a certain proportion of the yield of their crops– an amount typically in the tens or hundreds of thousands of dollars. If farmers pay this fee, they invoke a non-disclosure agreement preventing them from speaking about their receipt of the letter or discussing the nature of their settlement. It is through this process that Monsanto has been able to establish *de facto* control over lands it should have no right to possess. Monsanto's technology user agreements and the aforementioned enforcement tactics have had numerous negative effects on Canada's rural farming communities. These effects include the breakdown of trust between farmers, modification and deskilling of the role of farmers, and an erosion of the social fabric of rural communities.

FALLOUT FROM ENFORCEMENT TACTICS

Farmers growing Roundup Ready canola within the same region[3] pay the same amount per acre under the technology use agreement. Farmers who grow Roundup Ready canola without paying the requisite licensing fee, even unknowingly, profit significantly more than those around them. This creates a strong incentive for stopping "free riders" within agricultural communities (Beckie et al., 2002). The creation and extensive advertisement of Monsanto's tip-line, as well as material incentives offered by the company for those who

---

3 When pricing its products, Monsanto considers numerous tangible and intangible benefits the product provides as compared to competing alternatives. In some crops, these benefits differ between regions and these differences are accounted for through the use of regional pricing. Land areas are divided up by Monsanto into specific regions and all farmers within a given area pay the price which corresponds to the region in which they are located.

report patent infringers further increases the tendency to report other farmers to Monsanto. In rural communities, farmers suspected of growing Roundup Ready canola without a license are often ostracized by their community and subsequently investigated by Monsanto (Beckie et al., 2002). An atmosphere of distrust often lingers within the community in the aftermath of a Monsanto investigation. One farmer comments:

> [T]he farmer is often left wondering which neighbour caused him the trouble, so now we have the breakdown of farmers not trusting one another and afraid to talk to one another. We have a breakdown of our rural farm culture and society where farmers are not working together or trusting one another (Schmeiser, 2004, p. 22).

This new dynamic has been described by some as a "culture of surveillance," with new alignments and coalitions being formed for farmers to watch over one another (Beckie et al., 2002, p. 154).

The proliferation of Roundup Ready canola and genetically modified seeds has also resulted in the deskilling of farmers. One skill that grain growers have traditionally developed is seed saving. In saving seed, farmers actively work to reduce the risks from living and non-living parasites by selecting crops that suit soil, weather and other conditions (Stein, 2004). Over time, farmers learn to identify maturity rates, climatic conditions, soil quality, insect and disease prevention potential, and the value of the crop on the open market. These skills have become devalued as farmers are forced to adhere to Monsanto planting procedures and sell their crops through Monsanto distributors once they sign technology use agreements with Monsanto (Stein, 2004). After entering into these agreements, farmers are no longer able to save seeds with the most beneficial characteristics for replanting in subsequent years. Monsanto disallows seed saving despite the fact that plant breeders' rights are created and enforced in Canada and around the world with the explicit purpose of allowing farmers the right to practice seed saving techniques (Derzko, 1994). Plant breeders' rights have been overridden by the intellectual property rights assigned to the producers of genetically modified plants in Canada – rights that refuse exceptions even for research or farming (Derzko, 1994). Farmers who grow grains and oil seeds require a high degree of skill to buffer market and non-market stresses (e.g. crop output and climatic variation). Taking away farmers' ability to save seed

removes a major skill involved in farming and effectively reduces farmers' position to glorified seed planters.

Overriding plant breeders' rights with intellectual property rights can also potentially create negative economic effects for farmers. As previously mentioned, the technology user agreement farmers must sign in order to plant Roundup Ready canola explicitly prohibits the saving and replanting of seeds. Once locked into these agreements, farmers are prevented from saving seed that grows best on their land. Instead, they are dependent on a single source for seed, which makes them more vulnerable to fluctuations in the price of Monsanto seed and herbicide (Beckie et al., 2002). This serves to make agriculture a financially riskier prospect. In the future this may deter individuals from farming in Canada, which may in turn lead to increases in out-migration from rural communities (Beckie et al., 2002). This poses a very real threat to the social cohesion of communities that in many cases have already been relatively dispersed.

CONCLUSION

The current state of Canada's patent laws regarding the patenting of living organisms leaves much to be desired. In his discussion of the Oncomouse case, Knowles (2003) indicates that there are currently only two categories within property law: people and property; genetically modified organisms exist outside this dichotomy. Capable of self-replication, genetically modified organisms such as seeds pose new challenges for governance and raise fundamental questions about control over and responsibility for inventions. Many proponents of current patent laws fear their reform, as it is believed that barring corporations from patenting components of living organisms will disadvantage Canada and its economy by making it less appealing to researchers and organizations looking to create and market biotechnologies within its borders (Franks, 1999; Smith, Khachatourians, & Phillips, 2002). While this is a legitimate concern, the imbalance of power produced by patent laws must not be overlooked in favour of securing the needs of the economy.

Patent laws were designed to protect inventors' rights to the fruits of their labour, not to create a concentration of power in corporate hands (Rose, 1985). The current ambiguity of Canadian patent laws in relation to living organisms has allowed corporations like Monsanto to monopolize far more than simply the right to profit from their inventions. The Supreme Court's decision in Monsanto v. Schmeiser reinforces a new property regime that privileges

intellectual property rights over land ownership. Leveraging prevailing legal definitions of ownership and enforcing technology use agreements, Monsanto has effectively established control over land that they do not own. Monsanto's *de facto* control has had and will continue to have real effects on rural farming communities, deskilling farmers and creating a culture of mistrust and surveillance. Indeed, if left unchanged, current legislations around ownership may very well represent a return to a state where the rich elite control the majority of the state's resources and, thereby, the livelihood of the average person.

The centrality of Locke's definition of property in modern legal thought developed primarily as a result of the desire of the British Colonies – especially the United States – to break away from their colonial past and to ensure that the autocratic social order could never be reinstated (Snyder, 1986). Locke's definition of property became the foundation of modern legal thought because its combination of allowing all individuals the right to appropriate basic possessions that they needed, combined with the fundamental assertion that the government could not systematically violate these rights or allow them to be violated[4], would establish a conception of property that would produce a more egalitarian society where power, defined in terms of landed possessions, would not be concentrated in the hands of an absolute and irresponsible monarch (Hamilton, 1932). Now, modern technology has created a situation in which this labour-based conception of property ownership has the potential to restrict those it was originally intended to liberate.

Monsanto's Roundup Ready canola clearly illustrates how current intellectual property laws can in fact be used to effectively introduce a new form of feudal land ownership over the Canadian prairies. While Locke's conception of property is unable to address concerns that have emerged as a result of biotechnological development, his vision of a more egalitarian system of property still resonates in Canadian legislation. If the Canadian legal system wishes to uphold Locke's vision, it must change current classifications of what can be owned to reflect this in spirit and not merely in word.

---

4 While this belief is not necessarily true in practice, a fundamental assertion of Locke's theory is that government exists to protect, in an extended sense, the property rights of individuals. A government can only be considered legitimate if it is successful enough at carrying out this task that the governed continue to extend their consent to be governed.

REFERENCES

Beckie, H., Harker, N., Johnson, E., Lawton, M., Mulenga, A., Wolf, T., et al. (2002). Proceedings of the 2002 national meeting. *Canadian Weed Science Society* (pp. 154-156). Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: Canadian Weed Science Society.

Bereano, P., & Phillipson, M. (2004). *Goliath v. Schmeiser*. Cambridge: GENE-WATCH, CRG Council for Responsible Genetics.

Cullet, P. (2005). Monsanto v. Schmeiser: A landmark decision concerning farmer liability and transgenic contamination. *Journal of Environmental Law, 17* (1), 83-108.

Derzko, N. M. (1994). Plant breeders' rights in Canada and abroad: What are these rights and how much must society pay for them? *McGill Law Journal, 39* (1), 144-179.

Eaton, E. (2009). Getting behind the grain: The politics of genetic modification on the Canadian prairies. *Antipode, 41* (2), 256-281.

Forge, F. (2005). *Intellectual property rights in plants and the farmer's privledge*. Ottawa: Parlimentary Information and Research Service: Science and Technology Division.

Fox, J. L. (2001). Canadian farmer found guilty of Monsanto canola patent infringement. *Nature Biotechnology, 19* (2), 396 - 397.

Franks, J. (1999). The status and prospects for genetically modified crops in Europe. *Food Policy, 24* (5), 565-584.

Hamilton, W. H. (1932). Property - According to Locke. *The Yale Law Journal, 41* (6), 864-886.

Knowles, L. P. (2003). Of mice and men: Patenting the Oncomouse. *The Hastings Center Report, 33* (2), 6-7.

Locke, J. (2004). *Second treatise of government*. New York : Barnes & Noble Publishing.

Makin, K. (2004, January 27). The garmer, the canola and mighty Monsanto. *The Globe and Mail*, p. A14.

Marvier, M., & Acker, R. C. (2005). Can crop transgenes be kept on a leash? *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment, 3* (2), 93-100.

Monsanto . (2009, January 13). *Monsanto ~ Seeds and Traits*. Retrieved February 22, 2011, from Monsanto Canada: http://www.monsanto.ca/_pdfs/seeds_traits/2009_yr_seed_guide.pdf

Monsanto . (2011, January 1). *Monsanto~Seeds and Traits~Technology Use Agreement*. Retrieved March 2, 2011, from Monsanto Canada: http://www.monsanto.ca/seeds_traits/tua/default.asp

Müller, B. (2006). Infringing and trespassing plants: Patented seeds at dispute in Canada's courts. *Focaal—European Journal of Anthropology, 48* (2), 83-98.

Ratanaseangsuang, P. (1998). Patent pending: Are higher life forms patentable. *Appeal: Review of Current Law and Law Reform, 14* (1), 14-21.

Rose, C. M. (1985). Possession as the origin of property. *The University of Chicago Law Review, 52* (1), 73-88.

Schmeiser, P. (2004). *Percy Schmeiser vs. Monsanto*. Guelph : Guelph Organic Conference.

Smith, S., Khachatourians, G. G., & Phillips, P. W. (2002). Liabilities and economics of transgenic crops. *Nature Biotechnology, 20* (6), 537-541.

Sneider, D. C. (1986). Locke on Natural Law and Property Rights . *Canadian Journal of Philosophy, 16*(4), 723-750.

Stein, H. (2004). Intellectual property and genetically modified seeds: The United States, trade, and the developing world. *Northwestern Journal of Technology and Intellectual Property, 3* (2), 160-179.

Strathern, M. (1996). Potential property: Intellectual rights and property in persons. *Social Anthropology, 4* (1), 17-32.

Underkufflert, L. S. (1991). On property: An essay. *Yale Law Journal, 100* (3), 127-148.

Yoo, E., & Bothwell, R. (2005). Schmeiser v. Monsanto: A case comment. *Alberta Law Review, 42* (1), 553-560.

Homeless Blogs:

Identity Construction, Self-Expression, And Empowerment Among Homeless Canadians

Amanda Cheong

COMMON ASSUMPTIONS ABOUT WHAT IT MEANS TO BE HOMELESS HAVE BEEN socially constructed in an unequal and subjective dialogue involving the mass media, government policy-makers, scholars, community activists, and other voices presuming to speak on behalf of the homeless (Greenberg, May & Elliot, 2009). Due to their stigmatized and chronically silenced state, homeless citizens are rarely represented in social and political deliberations (Greenberg et al., 2009). Consequently, they are often portrayed negatively and linked to social pathologies such as substance abuse, violence, and criminality (Grzyb, 2005). However, the Internet has given homeless individuals an avenue through which they can resist these hegemonic discourses. This study sheds light upon alternative means through which homeless Canadians can express themselves within the public sphere. Through a review of existing literature, I outline the ways in which mass media outlets adopt and reinforce parochial representations of homelessness which are subsequently consumed by the Canadian public. I argue that homeless individuals living in Canada utilize blogs in order to negotiate the presentation of their identities, address negative stereotypes, and become re-engaged with civic society.

(MIS)REPRESENTATIONS OF HOMELESSNESS IN THE MASS MEDIA

Constituted by information widely propagated by major news corporations and generally assumed to represent popular opinion, the

mainstream media is not an objective source of knowledge; rather, events are interpreted at multiple levels and conveyed through a subjective lens (Greenberg et al., 2009). Inequalities are often reinforced through mainstream media, as corporate entities and powerful members of society exert control over the types of stories that are circulated as well as the perspectives from which they are told. When the marginalized are not rendered silent via exclusion from the news, they are often presented in ways that further reify their subordinate positions (Torck, 2001). Power inequalities shape the representation of disadvantaged in the media. According to Champaign (1999), "[The disadvantaged] are spoken of more than they speak, and when they speak to the dominant group, they tend to use a borrowed discourse, the very one the dominant offer about them" (p. 51). Media representations of the homeless often exclude these individuals from participating in generating the information concerning them and how this information is presented to the public.

Studies in and beyond Canada have found that the media consistently draws links between homelessness, criminality, deviant behaviour, and mental illness. In her discussion of the film *Through a Blue Lens*, a documentary about the interaction between the Vancouver Police Department and residents of the diverse neighbourhood, England (2004) argues that Vancouver's Downtown Eastside is essentialized as "Canada's worst drug community" and its residents portrayed as "drug addicts with immoral lifestyles" (pp. 303-304). England (2004) proposes that such representations pose tangible, material effects particularly on the lived realities of Aboriginal women, who are racialized and stigmatized both in the film and in their everyday interactions with the police. Similarly, Mathieu (1993) argues that the New York City government and the press "medicalized" homelessness during the 1980s by directly attributing the phenomenon to mental illness (p. 172). This has not only blinded policy-makers and the general public from the underlying socioeconomic factors which lead to homelessness, but enabled the government to more easily remove homeless individuals from public spaces (Mathieu, 1993).

The homeless are seen not only as a drain on public resources, but also as unfit to participate in civic affairs (Fiske, 1999). Inability to afford adequate shelter is accompanied by a de facto loss of one's legitimate claim to citizenship and its accompanying rights and privileges (Dreier, 2005). *Through a Blue Lens*' sensationalized snapshots of poverty, street life, and

drug use only serve to widen the gap between the civil domicile population and the damaged, inassimilable "other" (England, 2004). Homeless persons are commonly regarded by the general public as lazy, passive, and unable or unwilling to improve their positions in life—assumptions that effectively shift the onus away from governmental bodies, charitable agencies, and health organizations (Hodgetts et al., 2006; Jarvinen, 2003).

The highly parochial representations of the homeless in the media have tangible implications not only for how public policy is shaped, but also for the lived realities of individuals on the streets (Couldry & Curran, 2002). According to Hodgetts, Hodgetts, and Radley (2005), media projections of what constitutes homelessness are internalized and reproduced by homeless people themselves. Boydell, Goering, and Morrell-Bellai (2000) claim that negative representations in the media strip homeless persons of their dignity and sense of self. Nevertheless, they acknowledge the potential for the homeless to critically react to the stigmatization with which they are confronted, mainly via acts of resistance or renegotiation. Hodgetts, Hodgetts, and Radley (2005) claim that homeless individuals appropriate mass media images in order to articulate their self-identities. Homeless individuals resist dominant definitions of homelessness by actively engaging with media representations of homelessness and using them as "reference points" from which to interrogate and "conceptualize one's own situation and relationship with the domicile public" (Hodgetts et al., 2006, p. 504). Through this process, some homeless individuals go on to construct alternative, more positive representations of homelessness.

HOMELESS RESISTANCE: EMPOWERMENT THROUGH NEW MEDIA

Researchers have identified a range of defiant and collective actions taken by homeless persons against negative stereotyping and discrimination. Hodgetts, Hodgetts, and Radley (2005) observe that some individuals have taken ownership of their circumstances, reclaiming their rights to self-definition and civic participation by cultivating "cultures of resistance" (p. 514). They present examples of homeless people using their own voices to fight against alienation and victimization.

The advent of the street newspaper movement in the United States in the late 1980s quickly spread to the rest of North America and Europe, marking the beginning of one such major form of resistance. Street newspapers, which typically covered topics related to poverty and street life, were designed

to be purchased from the publisher and sold by homeless individuals at an established rate. According to Hanks and Swithinbank (1997), street newspapers empowered homeless persons by providing them with a source of income as well as the opportunity to interact productively with the general public. Daly (1996) noted that the lack of organizational structure in homeless communities prior to the popularization of street newspapers allowed members to be directed by outside groups who operated under a "control system based on a charity model and on naive assumptions about the need to dictate terms to the recipient population" (p. 9). However, Torck (2001) counters this claim, arguing that street newspapers are simply another form of mediated oppression. After analyzing four newspapers from the United States and Europe, Torck (2001) concluded that street newspapers "give a limited platform to homeless people's voices" and restrict them to pathos-dominated genres that further reinforce their marginalized statuses (p. 371). While street newspapers may be limited in their ability to facilitate grassroots activism and self-empowerment, the blog has emerged as a powerful medium for such expression.

The act of "blogging" or keeping "web logs" has come to be recognized as a form of social action (Grafton & Maurer, 2007). A vehicle through which anyone can "cultivate and validate the self," these independently-produced online journals have democratized the power to control meaning and identity (Miller & Shepherd, 2004, p.?). "Homeless blogs" constitute a relatively recent phenomenon in popular media and refer to blogs maintained by individuals who are or were homeless, which specifically document narratives of homelessness (Mauer, 2009). For homeless persons, blogs are an inexpensive, yet effective way to voice opinions hitherto overlooked by mass media outlets. Through blogs, homeless individuals can legitimize their presence within society as "writers, advocates, and citizens" who contribute to the discourses that shape how they are perceived (Forte, 2002). Arguably more far-reaching and flexible than street newspapers, homeless blogs promote a "democratic discourse" by allowing individuals to tell their stories firsthand, as well as engage in advocacy and civic action (Forte, 2002, p. 128). While this phenomenon has rapidly gained momentum across Canada, very little research has been conducted on the ways in which homeless bloggers both address popular representations of homelessness in the media, and assert their own identities and perspectives.

DATA AND METHODS

Three Canadian homeless bloggers were identified on the blog database compiled by Homeless Nation, a non-profit network dedicated to helping homeless Canadians harness digital media technologies in order to make their voices heard. By providing Internet access and training to homeless individuals, the organization seeks to "create a national collective voice by and for Canada's homeless population" in order to combat discrimination and marginalization (Cross, 2011). When accessed in October 2010, the database consisted of a spreadsheet that listed the names, locations, and web addresses to homeless blogs based in the United States, United Kingdom, and Canada. To maintain a local focus, I concentrated on the writings of the three bloggers who self-identified as Canadian. Instead of positioning themselves more generically, each of these individuals deliberately centred their blogs on the topic of homelessness, using their personal narratives to draw attention to a public issue.

James W. Breckenridge, who holds a Bachelor of Commerce from the University of Saskatchewan and was formerly employed as a chartered accountant, had been forced onto the streets by mental illness. In his blog, *Homeless in Abbotsford*, Breckenridge describes how he has managed to climb back to a state of mental health and financial independence through "time, hard work, and sheer strength" (2008, April 27). Derek M. Book, who maintains *Formerly Homeless*, is a rehabilitated street outreach worker and consultant living in Victoria, B.C. who had been homeless for six years as a teenager. Tim Barber, one of the main contributors to *Living Homeless: Our Write to Speak*, has been struggling with homelessness for twenty-four years due to addiction. He has experienced homelessness across the country in Toronto, Vancouver, Edmonton, and Calgary. These three writers use their blogs as a means of sharing their life stories and struggles, and presenting their perspectives on homelessness and related issues.

Each of these three blogs was examined in order to identify how the bloggers used their websites to construct their identities and convey their experiences of homelessness. Blog entries made between the founding date of each blog[1] and November 2010 were broadly examined during the initial reading. Particular attention was given to passages that directly addressed

---

1 Barber made his first post on February 10, 2010; Book on March 5, 2005; and Breckenridge on November 10, 2005.

issues of representation; these passages were then copied and stored for further analysis. Three main themes emerged from a close reading of these excerpts: (1) Blogging as a means of sharing life stories and personal triumphs over obstacles such a s mental illness or substance abuse; (2) Blogging as means of demonstrating one's independence and resisting stereotypes of passivity and laziness; and (3) Blogging as a means of asserting one's status as an active member of the civic community.

BLOGGING TO SHARE HOMELESS REALITIES AND LIFE STORIES

Blogging provides individuals with a public space in which they are free to construct a sense of self on their own terms, using their own words. Barber, Book, and Breckenridge work to humanize the issue of homelessness by personally relating their unique life stories– a right denied them by mainstream media. Reading homeless blogs may allow one to derive a greater understanding of the factors that contribute to the circumstances of people who live, or have lived, on the streets.

Through autobiographic narratives and eyewitness accounts of the experiences of fellow homeless individuals, Breckenridge uses *Homeless in Abbotsford* to paint a picture of homelessness that is characterized by perseverance and personal growth, rather than deviance and criminality. Breckenridge's detailed description of his struggle to overcome "Mr. Mental Illness" and the demoralizing "mental funk" he endured during his stint in the Canadian social welfare system is particularly noteworthy (2005, November 01). Breckenridge indicates that he was "considered an upstanding citizen" prior to the deterioration of his mental health. However, the long and strenuous process of reclaiming mental stability resulted in a significant drain on his personal funds, causing him to become entrapped in a self-perpetuating cycle:

> I did not set out to end up homeless and in need of social assistance. In fact, for more decades than I care to admit to, I was considered an upstanding citizen. Then Mr. Mental Illness decided to visit me and wreck [sic] havoc upon my life. Through friends I managed to start back up the steep mountain path that leads to better mental health. Unfortunately for me, my personal funds ran out before I had managed to get back on track. Thus I came to inhabit the level of Hell that is Social Assistance in British Columbia. Although applying the word assistance to a bureaucracy

whose purpose (despite what the "Minister Responsible" or others may claim) is demonstrated to be impeding your return to self-sufficiency, is bureaucratic doublespeak. And the kindest label you can apply to the character of anybody responsible for the current system, who is not calling for major humanitarian changes, is depraved indifference.

Here Breckenridge uses his personal account to expose the contradictions hidden within the Canadian welfare system and the toll that it can take on the dignities of individuals within it. Rather than help him resume his role as a participating member of society, Breckenridge indicates that the bureaucratic nature of BC's welfare system actually rendered him increasingly dependent upon social support. Rejecting the notion that homeless persons choose to exploit the social safety net out of sheer laziness, Breckenridge's story simultaneously highlights the plight of those who have come to be unwillingly confined in a cycle of dependency and critiques the individuals and the social system which have produced it. Breckenridge's autobiographic account of his bitter climb out of poverty and eventual reclamation of his life challenge common perceptions of those who are homeless as lazy, undisciplined parasites.

In his blog *Formerly Homeless*, Derek M. Book describes his transformation from a victimized "hobo" to a university-educated community activist and non-profit worker "dedicated to the fight against homelessness and poverty" ("About Me," n.d.). Forced onto the streets in 1985 at the age of fifteen, Book moved between Toronto, Winnipeg, Calgary, Kelowna, Vancouver "and all points in between" over the course of six years (2005, March 05a). After "putting [his] life somewhat together," Book enrolled in the University of Victoria in 1996 and graduated with a degree in Psychology and Geography. Since then, he has devoted his time to volunteering with various organizations in Victoria, such as the Crisis Line, The Citizen's Counselling Centre, The Alano Club, and the Victoria Cool Aid Society. Book infuses his personal anecdotes into blog entries geared towards educating the public about issues surrounding homelessness. In his post about street culture, Book recalls:

When I lived on the street, one person would bum a smoke, and they would be obligated to share it. This is generosity, but it is also attachment to community. There is a sense on the street that we are all in this together, and we should not abandon our buds in times of trouble. Emotional rescuing and what some people would call "co-dependence"

> are the rule on the street. If someone is feeling suicidal, for example, there are many around who will "come and get you." (2005, March 05b)

In this passage, Book details the informal norms adhered to by buds on the street, which range from common etiquette around sharing cigarettes, to more dire matters of how to intervene with suicidal peers. In addition to demonstrating that civility and compassion can be governing values in street life, Book challenges the negative connotations of the term co-dependence by suggesting that when one is living on the streets, "co-dependent" behaviour is not only the basis for community but a means of survival. Book's entries, which provide insight into his own experiences within the street community, humanizes the homeless population and gives them a level of multidimensionality not afforded to them by mainstream media.

Blogging is a therapeutic exercise for Tim Barber, who comes clean both figuratively and literally about his drug and alcohol abuse problems, child custody battles and struggle to cope with a history of childhood sex abuse in his blog, *Living Homeless*. The depth of personal information found in *Living Homeless* testifies to the "incredible bond" that Barber feels in relation to his Internet audience (2010, November 08). In fact, in the same entry, Barber goes so far as to describe blogging as both a source of motivation to "[stay] clean and sober" and a significant driving force in his life:

> I really enjoy my new job and I am happy to say that life is progressing in a manner in which I hope to no longer be homeless any more [sic]. In my opinion, writing on this blog has brought out a part of me that is genuine and honest and actually I am impressed with the difference I am seeing in my own life because of it. It is hard to explain, but I feel as though this blog has in a way saved my life! I now have a purpose and passion, and I hope I can continue to write things that are worthy of a good blog.

This passage highlights the confidence and strength that Barber derives from the opportunity to express himself and interact with an audience. The public reflexivity practised in his composition of blog entries not only holds him accountable to those for whom he writes, but also allows him to reflect critically upon his own actions.

Breckenridges, Book, and Barber use their blogs to speak candidly and unapologetically about their struggles with mental illness, substance addiction, and childhood abuse. In the process, they reframe homelessness as

a product of societal and structural factors, rather than the result of individual failures.

BLOGGING TO ADDRESS NEGATIVE STEREOTYPING

In addition to providing a medium through which the homeless may tell their own stories, homeless blogs can dispel the stereotype that individuals intentionally remain homeless because they are unwilling to work for a living. They offer instead an alternative conception of homeless individuals as oppressed and demoralized in their position within the social hierarchy. Much of Breckenridge's political commentary focuses on the Canadian social welfare system in which he himself had been formerly embroiled. While acknowledging that some individuals do choose to remain homeless and abuse the welfare system intentionally, Breckenridge states that "it is most often not the choice of those who are homeless, addicted, mentally ill, or in poverty but the choice of a society that has abandoned them to that state of being" (2005, November 01), thereby identifying the system as an impediment to regaining self-sufficiency. Although Breckenridge leads a financially stable and autonomous life today, he clearly recalls the anxieties and frustrations he experienced while trying to amass sufficient social and financial resources to find steady employment and escape the welfare system "before [his] spirit and ability to get a job were crushed" and he was "sucked into the abyss [of social assistance]" permanently. Contrary to popular opinion, Breckenridge argues, homelessness is not a result of individual shortcomings but a problem that persists due to structural conditions that exclude certain groups of people from participating actively and productively within society.

While Breckenridge explores structural issues that prohibit homeless individuals from participating in society and the workforce, Barber focuses more exclusively on the emotional and interpersonal difficulties experienced by individuals who seek to leave homelessness behind. Barber defends members of the homeless population from accusations of wilful dependency by arguing that self-sufficiency is preferable to subsisting on handouts given by strangers out of pity. He qualifies the statement "it ain't easy being homeless" with examples of financial, familial, and emotional hardships that he has suffered while living on the streets (2010, June 07). In one blog entry, Barber confesses that he is "sick and tired" of moving from shelter to shelter and not having "a place [he] can call [his] own" (2010, June 07). When Barber announces that he has moved into a place of his own three months later, he

declares: "I do feel much better about where my life is going," despite the fact that "it [the room]'s only a step up from the shelters" (2010, September 15). Whereas mainstream media tend to portray the homeless as unmotivated individuals who are happy to languish in shelters while subsisting on charity, Barber's desire to leave the shelters in favour of a room of his own signals a desire for independence and self-sufficiency.

In addition to being emotionally stressful, Barber's lack of steady employment and a stable living situation makes it difficult for him to gain access to his children. The desire to be with his children is a recurring theme throughout Barber's blog. Barber explains that his efforts to cure himself of the "disease" that is addiction and escape homelessness have all been undertaken in the hope that he can see his two children again for the first time in five years:

> The only real thing I care about right at this point of my life is when I finally get to have a life with my children once again..I need them to regain the only happiness I truly have felt in my life. I love and miss my children and I know that God will put me back with my children when God knows it is time. I truly believe that. I just don't want to be a messed up human being when that chance arrives. (2010, November 02)

The thought of being able to reconnect with his children has motivated Barber to strive for a more stable living situation. However, fears of being denied access to his children by the law and worries about "what they [his children] would think about a dad that's [sic] gets fucked up on crack" are not only distressing but discouraging (2010, November 29). Barber's detailed blog entries call attention to the intertwining material and emotional challenges that homeless individuals have to overcome in order to become reintegrated into society. In explaining the difficulties of his own situation, Barber compels the readers of his blog to see the homeless population as being constituted by as complex individuals with complex concerns rather than one dimensional deviants cut from the same cloth.

Book affirms that homelessness is experienced in diverse, complex, and deeply personal ways. Discussing the people on the street with whom he works, he writes:

> I can't look at somebody who is currently homeless and predict reasonably why they are homeless, or what it will take to get them off the street. I can guess, I can make assumptions, and I can make judgements.

> I can compare my own life to this person's life in the hope that we share some common threads, but I can't really know what they are going through. (2006, October 01)

Despite having been homeless in the past Book makes no claims to know the "homeless psyche;" for each individual comes to homelessness through a unique combination of factors and experiences homelessness in ways specific to their own history and subject position. By marking himself as an outsider who can only guess, assume and "make judgments" about any given homeless person, Book effectively critiques mainstream media for its simplistic and homogenous representations of the homeless population as a whole.

At the same time, Book admits that he is not impervious to bias against certain groups within the homeless population. In an August 2006 entry about his interactions with clients of a local needle exchange in Victoria, Book comes to terms with his own prejudices regarding intravenous drug-users:

> My relief comes from how darned normal they seem. My imagination has played tricks with me, telling me that needle addicts had "lost their souls," or had become "subhuman." I have been in a lot of nasty places, but I have never spent much time with this group of people, and hence, my position has perhaps come from ignorance. In reality, they couldn't be any more passionate, more funny [sic], or more insightful. The conversations have been great so far, and I would say that the violence level has been about one tenth of what you would find at a local pub. Not bad for a group of people I had written off. But that's why I took this job.

The fact that even Book, who had once lived on the streets himself, observed himself subscribing to common prejudices surrounding homeless persons is a testament to the persistence of such stereotypes and the difficulties in dispelling them. It is only through personal interaction with intravenous drug users that Book has come to revise and re-evaluate his preconceptions about this particular group of individuals. While homeless blogs fall short of immediate interaction, they provide readers with the opportunity to access the experiences of homelessness through the eyes of homeless individuals rather than the damning lens of dominant stereotypes. Given facts and stories about homelessness that are rarely published in mainstream media, readers are then free to make their own judgments of each blogger and the homeless community about which he or she writes.

BLOGGING FOR CIVIC ACTION AND SOCIAL CHANGE

Finally, blogs are a forum in which homeless writers can assert themselves as citizens whose opinions deserve to be given as much validity as those belonging to the domicile population. Through the virtual community's championing of free speech, individuals can more easily propagate their political opinions and engage civically in ways that would be hindered by their homelessness in real life. Rather than restricting themselves solely to discussing issues of homelessness, Breckenridge and Book comment upon a wide range of political and social issues. They adopt a perspective afforded to those who have experienced the successes and failures of social policies firsthand, providing grassroots insights and suggestions for making top-down governmental approaches work more effectively.

Through this process, Breckenridge and Book also establish themselves as citizens and stakeholders in their local community, acting as empowered spokespersons for the marginalized members of the population with whom they identify. For example, Breckenridge comments on the substandard treatment of homeless people by hospital staff and police offers, calling for greater equity and fairer practices. Book draws attention to the need for people who are homeless, addicted, or mentally ill to be recognized as individuals in order to ameliorate their conditions, arguing that the government's proposed "systematic solutions are likely to systematically oppress this population" (2009, September 22). In addition to making visible structural injustices that affect the homeless, Breckenridge and Book advocate for the rights of the disadvantaged in their role as formerly homeless individuals. Invoking vocabulary that establishes his place as a rightful member of society while speaking on behalf of the oppressed, Breckenridge tells the inhabitants of Abbotsford: "We as citizens of Abbotsford owe a duty of care to those seeking help in overcoming substance abuse problems" (2007, July 09). [NEED TRANSITION] Such writing allows homeless bloggers to reinstate themselves into the dominant society from which they were previously excluded.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

This study has explored the ways in which homeless persons can assert themselves and resist negative representations of the homeless identity through the use of blogs. Researchers have found that the homeless are rendered simultaneously invisible and hyper-visible in mainstream media,

which serves to further marginalize this already vulnerable group (England, 2004; Hodgetts et al., 2006; Wahl, 1995). Alternately ignored or portrayed as criminally deviant and mentally ill, the homeless are often divested of their civil rights and freedoms, and presumed to be lazy, unproductive, and incapable of caring for their own affairs (Fiske, 1999; Dreier, 2005; Hodgetts et al., 2006; Jarvinent, 2003). Such parochial characterizations not only ignore the reality that homelessness is experienced in a wide diversity of forms (Kingfisher, 2007; Klodowsky et al., 2001), but further strip homeless individuals of control over their own lives. Although they are often ostracized from the community and rendered silent by those who speak on their behalf, homeless individuals possess alternative means of constructing a sense of self and sharing their opinions.

The three Canadian homeless blogs explored in this paper are prime examples of a type of resistance that has been made possible by new media technologies. Through an analysis of three Canadian homeless blogs, it was found that these writers were able to personally share their life stories as they wanted to tell them, resist common conceptions of homeless people as lazy and passive, and re-assert themselves as legitimate stakeholders within the local community. The internet has allowed the three individuals in this study to address dominant representations of deviance, passivity, and civic powerlessness using their own words. Their unique perspectives support scholars' claims that homeless individuals can exercise agency to challenge negative construction of the homeless person that are so often perpetuated by the Canadian mainstream media (Boydell et al., 2000; Hodgetts et al., 2005).

However, in order to further expand the literature on homeless blogs the limitations of this study must be addressed. The sheer diversity with which homelessness is experienced makes it impossible for the opinions of three Caucasian male bloggers to be representative of the homeless population in Canada. It is important to note that while the homeless population consists of both men and women from a wide range ethnicities and walks of life, the voices of homeless women and ethnic minorities appear to be underrepresented in the blogosphere. Furthermore, the majority of the content on the blogs of Book, Barber and Breckenridge was produced at a time when the bloggers were no longer homeless. One must consider the impediments that currently homeless individuals may face in attempting to set up their own blogs, such as a lack of Internet access or computer literacy

skills. Thus, the findings in this paper should not be generalized, but taken as a starting point for formulating more comprehensive studies on how effective blogs are as a means of resistance and self-expression for members of the homeless community.

It should also be noted that blogs are not a form of real-time documentation, but an unregulated tool through which individuals can selectively construct and present the self. In considering what is featured on a blog, one must also ask whether certain details have been omitted or revised for public consumption. It cannot be determined which entries were honestly recounted by the three authors, and which entries were compromised by recall bias or blatant fabrication. Furthermore, the size of these blogs' readership is unknown, rendering questionable their potential to change societal attitudes towards homelessness. While this study has explored the alternative discourses disseminated through the medium of the homeless blog, further research must be conducted on the amount of influence these blogs truly have in terms of reaching large audiences and actualizing policy suggestions.

REFERENCES

Barber, T. (2010). *Living Homeless*: Our Write to Speak. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.com/

Barber, T. (2010, November 29). Homeless Winter. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.ca/2010_11_01_archive.html

Barber, T. (2010, November 08). You, My Reader, Are Incredible. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.ca/2010/11/you-my-reader-are-incredible.html

Barber, T (2010, November 02). TRYING TO PAY IT FORWARD. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.ca/2010_11_01_archive.html

Barber, T. (2010, September 15). Another Update. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.ca/2010_09_01_archive.html

Barber, T. (2010, June 07). UPDATE. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://livinghomelessourwritetospeak.blogspot.ca/2010_06_01_archive.html

Book, D.M. (2009). *Formerly Homeless*. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.com/.

Book, D.M. (2009, September 22). Untitled. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.ca/2009_09_01_archive.html

Book, D.M. (2006, October 01). I Know Everything! [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.ca/2006_10_01_archive.html

Book, D.M. (2006, August 12). Me and The Needle Exchange. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.ca/2006_08_01_archive.html

Book, D.M. (2005, March 5a). Welcome: Formerly Homeless Post #1. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.com/2005_03_01_archive.html

Book, D.M. (2005, March 5b). Defining Street Culture (Loosely). [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://housecanada.blogspot.com/2005_03_01_archive.html

Breckenridge, J. W. (2010). *Homeless in Abbotsford, B.C.* Retrieved from http://homelessinabbotsford.com/.

Breckenridge, J.W. (2008, April 27). A Tale of Two Addicts. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://abbyhomelessbackground.blogspot.com/

Breckenridge, J.W. (2007, July 09). Commentary on Abbotsford BC's Recovery House Policy – part 1. [Web log entry]. Retrieved from http://www.homelessinabbotsford.com/2007_07_01_archive.html

Breckenridge, J.W. (2005, November 01). Homeless in Abbotsford, B.C. – the Backstory. Retrieved from http://abbyhomelessbackground.blogspot.com/

Boydell, K.M., Goering, P., & Morrell-Bellai, T. (2000). Narratives of identity: Re-presentation of self in people who are homeless. *Qualitative Health Research*, 26-38.

Champaign, P. (1999). The view from the media. In P. Bourdieu et al. (eds). *The Weight of the World: Social Suffering in Contemporary Society* (trans. P. Ferguson, S. Emanuel, J. Johnson, & S.T. Waryn), pp. 46-59. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Couldry, N. & J. Curran (eds.). (2002). *Contesting Media Power: Alternative Media in a Networked World*. New York: Rowman & Littlefield.

Cross, D. (2010). About Homeless Nation. Retrieved from http://homelessnation.org/en/node/16973. (21 December 2010).

Daly, G. (1998). Homelessness on the street: Observations from Britain, Canada and the United

States. In N.R. Fyfe (Ed.), *Images of the street: Planning, identity, and control in public space* (pp. 111-128). London: Routledge.

Dreier, P. (2005). How the media compound urban problems. *Journal of Urban Affairs* 27 2, 193-201.

Fiske, J. (1999). For cultural interpretation: A study of the culture of homelessness. In E. Min (ed.), *Reading the Homeless: The Media's Image of Homeless Culture* (pp. 1-22). London: Praeger.

Forte, J.A. (2002). Not in my social world: A cultural analysis of media representations, contested spaces, and sympathy for the homeless. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*, 131-157.

Greenberg, J., May, T., & Elliott, C. (2009). Homelessness and media activism in the voluntary sector: A case study. *The Philanthropist* 20(2), 131-152.

Grzyb, A. (2005). *Representing homelessness in Toronto's tent city: Media, activists, and government response.* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the Canadian Communication Association, University of Western Ontario, London, ON.

Hanks, S. & Swithinbank, T. (1997). The Big Issue and other street newspapers: A response to homelessness. *Environment and Urbanization* 9: 149-158.

Hodgetts, D., Hodgetts, A., & Radley, A. (2006). Life in the shadow of the media: Imaging street homelessness in London. *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 9, 497-516.

Kingfisher, C. (2007). Discursive constructions of homelessness in a small city in the Canadian prairies. *American Ethnologist* 34, 91-107.

Jarvinen, M. (2003). Negotiating strangerhood: Interviews with homeless immigrants in Copenhagen. *Acta Sociologica* 46(3): 215-230.

Grafton, K., & Maurer, E.G. (2007). Public engagements and public arrangements of blog genres. *Proceedings of the 4th International Symposium on Genre Studies*. August 15-18. Tubarãol: University of Southern Santa Catarina: 164-74.

Mathieu, A. (1993). The medicalization of homelessness and the theater of repression. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 7: 170-184.

Mauer, E.G. (2009). "Working consensus" and the rhetorical situation: The homeless blog's negotiation of the public meta-genre. In J. Giltrow & D. Stein (Eds.), *Genres in the Internet: Issues in the Theory of Genre* (Pp. 113-142). Amsterdam: John Benjamins.

Miller, C.R. & Shepherd, D. (2004). Blogging as social action: A genre analysis of the weblog. In L. Gurak et al. (Eds), *Into the Blogosphere: Rhetoric, Community, and Culture of Weblogs*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.

Torck, D. (2001). Voices of homeless people in street newspapers: A cross-cultural exploration. *Discourse and Society* 12, 371-392.

Thick Depictions:

Representing the Other through Film

Jeremy Withers

Longtime ethnographic film advocate Paul Henley (1996) asserts that, "in order for ethnographic film to become of central importance to anthropology, its theoretical status has to be articulated in terms that relate to the current theoretical and methodological concerns of anthropology more generally" (p. 6). Henley's concern is timely. In the last thirty years, ethnographers have been attempting to find less totalizing, more interpretive, and more collaborative approaches. Film provides an attractive alternative to the medium of text in rising to this challenge. In this paper, I explore issues of representation through the medium of ethnographic film. Drawing on my experiences co-producing the documentary *A People United*, I seek to demonstrate the ways in which film can function as a collaborative and accessible space for showcasing the experience and wisdom of the members of the Vancouver 2010 anti-Olympic movement.

This paper's title is a play on Clifford Geertz's 2006 article "Thick Descriptions," in which he argues for generalizing within, as opposed to across, the subject's assertions. By stepping inside the logic of a statement made by the subject and trying to explain it from the inside-out, the researcher is forced to explore the social and personal background that contribute to the subject's opinions and, therefore, take the subject more seriously This practice of "explicating explications" was developed by Geertz (2006) as a key goal of participant observation (p. 322). An important more in film studies is

"show don't tell." Could the ethnographer's role then be to claim authorship over the showing, while our participants do the telling? It is here where film's ability to engage powerfully with post-colonial theory becomes clear. What first excited me about using film instead of text to tell the story of a group, a movement, a (sub)culture, was its capacity for fostering a relationship with the subject that text can sometimes dehumanize. A key motivation for post-colonial theorists is finding tools to move beyond "us versus them" constructs and create new ways of discussing difference as a matter of degrees (gradient difference) rather than separating "things-in-themselves" (digital difference). I hoped to take these concerns into consideration throughout the making of *A People United*. This paper attempts to assess the success of our attempts, as producers of this film, in doing so.

Emily Gladstone, Jamie Cooper and I designed, filmed, and produced *A People United* as part of the Department of Anthropology's Ethnographic Film Methods course at the University of British Columbia. Our film explores the various perspectives of protesters and organizers involved with the Vancouver 2010 Winter Olympics resistance movement. The treatment of the subject matter was strongly influenced by an interest in the aims and methodologies of both interpretive and post-colonial theory. These approaches offer a way of understanding difference without reference to utility or hierarchy, as well as the potential to engineer a space in which subject and researcher can draw from each other's strengths and explore the possibility of shared authority over how the story is told.

Before picking up the camera, our group strove to develop a relationship with members of the community. Our project was warmly received by community members through our attendance at a number of preliminary meetings. Our goal was to interview three prominent members of the community, each representing a particular perspective in the resistance movement: First Nations' grievances, social justice, and political-economic. After receiving permission to use the organizers' mailing list to recruit participants, we received a number of responses. Each person interviewed for the film was given an explanation of the film's aims and offered the option to have statements rescinded in retrospect. In fact, one of our first interviews was omitted entirely, as the subject had been arrested during one of the protests and we did not want the participant's statements to compromise them during the court proceedings in any way. We had a number of casual

conversations with our three key participants prior to filming, but conducted the actual interviews during and immediately after the events. This process helped us establish rapport with our participants, and allowed for a more fluid and trusting conversational interview. Time spent networking with parties involved in the movement proved invaluable for grasping the scope of opinions and their interplay, which in turn allowed us to more confidently represent points of divergence and cohesion and focus on emergent group concerns.

Despite my previous involvement in similar activities of the Vancouver left, I had more trouble placing myself within the Olympics resistance movement. While I remain conflicted with regards to some of the protesters' arguments, what increasingly impressed me was the positive resonance such a diverse group managed to project.

The film was tentatively titled "Reasons to Resist," but as the protests unfolded it became clear that such an aggressive name did not befit a movement driven by such festive excitement. Political allegiances aside, our group was moved by the unity celebrated by anarchists, anti-capitalists, First Nations' activists, eco-justice advocates, members of the Christian Left, and New Democratic Party members. In the words of organizer Yifan Li, one of the movement's goals was to "create what we wanted to see in the face of what we didn't." Many of the protesters we spoke to felt that the Olympics symbolized an increasingly exclusive and gentrified city, exemplifying privatized profit and socialized debt. Anti-Olympic organizers focused on fostering an inclusive event that included activities such as food sharing, childcare, and music. Through the practice of inclusivity, the resistance movement created a localized, communal space in which marginalized voices could be heard. This is not the story of black-masked polemics shouting and smashing to which so many media outlets almost exclusively devoted their attention. Rather, it was the story of how a diverse, ten thousand person strong movement created space for this drastically over-represented black masked minority.

The movement was commonly portrayed by mainstream media as composed of a loosely organized group of hooligans driven by visceral and reckless anger, whose voices were disparate to the point of dissonance, and who need only be quoted to corroborate these latent assumptions. These resolutely unreceptive discursive formations muffled the other voices within the movement such that they could not be heard without strain. The

dominant representation of the movement by mainstream media has many striking parallels to Said's (1978) observations of Western representation of the Oriental:

> "To the extent that Western scholars were aware of contemporary Orientals or Oriental movements of thought and culture, these were perceived either as silent shadows to be animated by the Orientalist, brought into reality by them, or as a kind of cultural and international proletariat useful for the Orientalist's grander interpretive activity." (p. 208)

Said critiques social scientists for their tendency to impose values upon Oriental populations with little to no concern for their common valuations, let alone their divergences. Subaltern groups like the Orientals only become useful to the scholar insofar as they act as stepping-stones to the scholar's preconceived ideas.

The application of Said's ideas helps frame the anti-Olympic movement within a wider discussion of subaltern representation. In *A People United*, we attempt to provide a space for these marginalized voices in which differences between the subject and the viewer can be portrayed as gradient, not binary. In *Orientalism*, Said (1978) critiques Occidental studies of the Orient for their use of discursive strategies dependent upon "othering." These strategies inevitably portray the "other" as qualitatively different from "us." Accordingly, "we" define ourselves by what we are not: "them." Given that ethnographic research is primarily concerned with representing groups of people, it is important to consider the potential for othering.

Ethnographic filmmakers can employ a number of strategies to address this issue of othering. First, *A People United* attempts to place the viewers in the protesters' shoes, thus inciting empathy and understanding rather than distance. The audience is quickly plunged into the thick of the protest, placed face-to-face with Mounted Police and a Coke truck trying to move through the crowd. The film uses shaky and candid over the shoulder, and shots from the protesters' point of view. These camera angles compel viewers to imagine themselves as the other by allowing them to see through their eyes. These techniques are used with the aim of instilling a shared sense of being, which allows the difference between us and them to become gradient and not binary.

Second, the film attempts to connect the wider Vancouver public with problems often associated with the Olympics, such as homelessness

and poverty. In relating the Olympics to an increase in homelessness, a protester states, "Most people in Vancouver are one paycheck away from being homeless." During the interview, the scene dissolves from a wide-shot of the Vancouver's Downtown Eastside to a panoramic shot of Olympic supporters in Robson Square conveying the proximity between the homeless and the average Vancouverite. The message is made clear and accessible, without resorting to alienating theoretical jargon. The city is identified as a hybrid space in which the other becomes one of us. Engaging viewers with the subjects' convictions and standpoints can be an effective strategy for combating othering.

While filmic imagery may produce accessible representations, ethnographers must engage with a subject's wisdom if the subaltern is to truly speak. Exploring the wisdom of a group means passing some of the project authority over to the subject, marking a shift towards researching with subaltern communities as opposed to simply researching on them (Menzies, 2004). Rather than reaching down to help represent those without agency, there is a desire to work towards mutual understanding in partnership with communities. Addressing a community's wisdom does not necessarily imply direct collaboration through all project stages. It does, however, often mean giving priority to subjects' assertions (emic) over the researcher's assumptions (etic).

Interpretive theory offers useful discussions of how to approach a collaborative ethnographic project. This paradigm does not completely remove scholarly authority, but instead assumes that all subjects, who are themselves social scientists of sorts, can share authority to some extent. In this sense, filmic representations can afford subjects more authority over their message than text. Henley (1996) asserts: "[f]ilm is most effective in representing the performative aspects of culture defined in the broadest sense...the symbolic aspects of everyday life" (p. 8). Film provides a platform from which a subject's vocal inflections, pauses, or winks can express what their story means to them more poignantly than words alone. It offers a richer context for diving into the emic, or what Geertz (2006) terms thick description. Thick description speaks to the importance of recognizing the subject's knowledge about their community. While an ethnographer may wish to contextualize an informant's observations by comparing across other cases, their chief role should be to explore within the observation (Geertz, 2006). By generalizing within rather than across subject assertions, the

ethnographer is compelled to analyze in-depth the statement's significance within the subject's worldview and position.

Film can elucidate diverse contextual cues embodied by the subject more easily than text. Geertz (2006) gives the example of exploring what a wink could imply. The camera may catch a wink that the anthropologist did not notice until the editing room, or did not notice at all but was left behind for viewers to catch. This very same wink may be lost to the notebook or the tape recorder, which have no way of recording visual cues beyond the point of interaction. While the tape recorder can capture the subject's tone of voice, their expression can only be retained in film. Filmic representation thrives in the realm of the descriptive, and may provide substantially more information regarding emotion and motivation than other media. The subject's expression and tone of voice index a great deal about the significance of the wink. Finally, the wider social context of this wink can be immediately registered by film. Cutting to a wider shot either pre- or post-wink can illustrate far more than a lengthy textual description. Throughout the film, wide shots of marching protesters captured both the general mood, and the diversity of responses. While I can report a generally festive mood, the odd jeering yell or bored face captured in the crowd provides a more detailed, nuanced picture.

While our film did not explicitly explore any winks, I had many opportunities to generalize within concepts put forth by subjects through words and body language. For example, in an interview with one of our key informants, Li asserts, "the age of single issue politics is over." This assertion, which resonated so well with our group's experiences throughout, inspired the film's focus. Our goal was to demonstrate this through our experiences as both filmmakers and participants in the protest. The result is a film that generalizes within Li's assertion by presenting the movement as a diversity of perspectives and tactics, all with a clear bottom line of solidarity: resistance to the Olympics. Working within the premise of Li's statement, we found that the Olympics provided a context or flash point for debating emergent local and global political-economic priorities. Various issues such as sustainability or First Nation's poverty have been brought to attention by the event's proceedings and accordingly protested not as "single issues," but in solidarity.

Incorporation of subject wisdom should be used with a caveat in mind. While it is true that the focus of *A People United* was inspired by a research participant, we would not have chosen it if it contradicted our understanding

of the movement. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (1988) stated, "When we come to the concomitant question of the consciousness of the subaltern, the notion of what the work cannot say becomes important" (p. 82). Here, Spivak asks whether the ethnographer can truly generalize within a statement if the subjects' world views contradict that of his or her own. Could the researcher take seriously a statement he or she deemed illogical or inaccurate? We were willing to incorporate subject statements with which we disagreed into our film, but their inclusion was motivated by a desire to demonstrate the movement's diversity, thus supporting rather than undermining our perspective.

A focus on power and authority illuminates what is not and cannot be said. Eric Wolf (2001) states that following any contestation of an epistemology which "challenges the fundamental categories that empower its dynamics," "[p]ower will then be invoked to assault rival categorical claims" (p. 396). Wolf's statement implies that social scientists are ultimately unable to incorporate a wider message that challenges their own epistemology and their own subjectivity. Researchers are left paralyzed by relativism. Spivak (1988) recognizes that the ethnographic project is problematic, as recovery and presentation of a subaltern voice would likely essentialize its message, negating the subaltern population's heterogeneity. Nonetheless, Spivak maintains that the project is impossible to discard: "To refuse to represent a cultural Other is salving your conscience, and allowing you not to do any homework" (Spivak, 1990, p. 62-63). Researchers must therefore move forward while being aware of both the problems and necessity of subaltern representation.

Embracing "hybrid realities" can offer the researcher a useful base for representation whereby various perspectives are provided equal light. Homi K. Bhaba (1994) makes the argument that treating dominant and marginalized knowledge sets (for example,. Said's Orient and Occident) as binary opposites will perpetuate their existence as homogenous entities. Instead, he insists that the post-colonial world should valorize spaces of mixing–spaces where truth and authenticity move aside for ambiguity. Bhaba stresses ambiguity because a totalizing explanation cannot do justice to such a diversity of interpretations. Certain aspects of the event we captured on film are not more authentic than others and there is no final truth or outcome. There is, however, a diversity of experiences and narratives that have their own significance.

A People United attempts to enter this hybrid space through what Spivak (1988) terms "strategic essentialism." By this, she means speaking on behalf of a diverse group of people while using a clear image of identity to fight opposition. Strategic essentialism provides a useful framework for understanding the anti-Olympic movement and its protestors. Despite the diversity of the group, political pragmatism motivated the numerous parties involved in the movement to negotiate an organized and unified voice. The group maintained a united voice by strategically essentializing their messages. Various interviews that we filmed emphasized the importance of maintaining the solidarity produced by the debate around the Olympics and the resulting resistance movement. The Olympics served as a point of convergence for diverse groups and social critiques. So consistent were protesters on this point, that the group's receptiveness to various critical perspectives can be identified as the core of the movement. The film concludes with chants of "No Olympics on stolen Native land," "Homes not games," "Shut down tar sands," and other distinct messages. These chants roll smoothly together and ring in the end credits, effectively demonstrating the solidarity and diversity of the Anti-Olympic movement.

Through the application of interpretive and post-colonial theory, *A People United* attempts to portray the anti-Olympic movement as a fluid space that provides the context for a heterogeneity of perspectives and tactics. It recognizes the movement as a diverse and hybrid space, but also explores how the movement has strategically self-essentialized its messages. Through differently positioned subject's experiences and wisdom, various emic narratives are woven together to depict the protests' development. The medium of film, conditioned with interpretive and post-colonial theory, provided both the subjects and my group the opportunity to share this experience and wisdom more forcefully and accessibly. As anthropologists explore new ways to discuss difference and hybridity, a concomitant investigation into the merits of new modes of representation will prove invaluable. Film should feature prominently in this discussion, whether as a compliment to text or standing on its own.

REFERENCES

Bhaba, H. (1994). *The location of culture*. New York: Routledge

Geertz, C. (2006) [1973]. Thick Description. In P.A. Erickson and L.D. Murphy (eds.) *Readings for a history of Anthropological theory* (pp.341-359). Toronto: Broadview Press.

Henley, P. (1996). The promise of ethnographic film. *Visual Anthropology* 13: 207-226.

Menzies, C. (2004). Putting words into action: Negotiating collaborative research in Gitkxaała. *Canadian Journal of Native Education* 28(1/2), 15-32.

Said, E. (1978). *Orientalism*. New York: Random House

Spivak, G. (1988). Can The Subaltern Speak? In C. Nelson and L. Grossberg (eds.), *Marxism and the interpretation of culture* (pp.271-313). Basingstoke: Macmillan Education.

Spivak, G. (1990). *The post-colonial critic: Interviews, strategies, dialogues.* New York: Routledge

Wolf, Eric R. (2001). Facing power – Old insights, new questions. In *Pathways of power: Building an Anthropology of the modern world* (pp.383-397). New Jersey: University of California Press. (Original work published 1990).

About the Authors

Tara Piasetski is in her final year of the Sociology Honours Program at the University of British Columbia. Her primary research interests include race, ethnicity, gender, immigration and migrant labour. In her spare time, she attempts to build her gastronomic knowledge by cooking, going to food markets, perusing cookbooks and maintaining an online food blog. In the fall of 2011 she will be attending the London School of Economics and Political Science for an MSc in Sociology.

Jasmine Luk is graduating this year with a B.A. in Honours Sociology and Minor International Relations. Her primary interests include immigration, race and ethnicity, and social inequality. Jasmine enjoys being involved on campus and she has worked at the City of Vancouver, UBC's Department of Sociology, and Human Resources and Skills Development Canada during three co-op terms. Wherever life takes her, Jasmine aspires to always maintain a vivid sociological imagination.

Michael Kehl is a recent graduate, having just completed a major/honours degree in Psychology and Sociology. During his tenure at UBC, his primary academic interests included the interaction between law and society, the effects of the media on the law, and class-based differences in higher education. Currently working within the UBC Department of Family Practice he is now applying the same sociological perspective he brought to the above issues to the field of rural healthcare. He looks forward to pursuing his Juris Doctor in the fall of 2012.

Amanda Cheong first became acquainted with the homeless blog movement while serving as an Arts Peer Mentor for Dr. Katharine Patterson in the English Department at UBC. Intrigued, she decided to approach the topic through an academic lens in Dr. Rima Wilkes' Canadian Society class in the Sociology Department. She has presented her research

at the 2011 Sociology Undergraduate Student Conference at Kwantlen Polytechnic University, and has been invited to return as a guest speaker on the topic in the upcoming winter term. She would especially like to thank Dr. WIlkes, Dr. Patterson, her awesome SOCI-310 TA Alina Shepherd for their invaluable input and support on her paper. Amanda is also a member of the Sojourners editorial team.

J EREMY WITHERS IS CURRENTLY COMPLETING HIS MASTERS IN CULTURAL anthropology at the University of Toronto. Continuing with his interest in protest movements for his masters research, he is focusing on the politics of self-representation within the Occupy movement.

About the Editors

YUN-JOU CHANG IS CURRENTLY COMPLETING HER BACHELOR OF ARTS IN Honours English and Honours Sociology at the University of British Columbia. Her primary research interest lay in the field of communications, media, popular culture, sexualities, and community formation. Yun-Jou is honoured to have been a part of *Sojourners* for the last three years and looks forward to reading future editions of the journal in the years to come.

JENNIFFER TAI IS A RECENT GRADUATE FROM THE HONOURS SOCIOLOGY program at the University of British Columbia. In her time at UBC, she was involved as an executive of the Sociology Students Association and worked as a teaching and research assistant within the department. Her research interests fall within sociology of culture, in particular cultural meanings attributed to consumption. When not engaging in her academic pursuits, Jenniffer enjoys cooking, reading trashy novels, and the highbrow humour of Matt Groening's Futurama.

HEATHER STACK IS CURRENTLY IN HER FOURTH YEAR AT THE UNIVERSITY of British Columbia majoring in Sociology and minoring in Women's and Gender Studies. As a student with (dis)abilities areas her academic work stems from her background in community-based social justice projects aimed at addressing the ways that access is often barred to those considered 'other' or 'less than'.

BARD SUEN IS IN HIS FIFTH AND FINAL YEAR AT UBC, COMPLETING HIS Honours Degree in Sociology. Feeding into a research internship he is doing with local non-profit RangiChangi Roots Society, he is conducting research and writing his thesis on cultural diversity and the 'alternative food' movement. After graduation, he plans to apply for graduate school and specialize in food studies. Bard is grateful to have had the opportunity

to work with the *Sojourners* team, and to have learned so much about the editing process.

NICOLE STO. TOMAS IS GRADUATING FROM UBC THIS MAY WITH A Bachelor of Arts in Sociology. Her primary research interests include immigration and urban sociology. Nicole plans to take some time off from academia before pursuing a master's degree. She is thankful for being given the opportunity to be a part of the *Sojourners* team. In her spare time, Nicole enjoys cooking and collecting records.

ANUSHKA SAMARAWICKRAMA IS A THIRD YEAR SOCIOLOGY MAJOR AT UBC. Her research interests include gender, work, cultural studies and education. Although she has a few more years before she graduates, she hopes to pursue a career in Human Resources, and eventually complete a Master's in Human Resource Management and Organizational Behaviour. Being part of the *Sojourners* editorial team has been an enlightening and novel experience for her, and is grateful for being given the opportunity to be part of it!

MICHAEL KEHL IS A RECENT GRADUATE, HAVING JUST COMPLETED A MAJOR/ honours degree in Psychology and Sociology. During his tenure at UBC, his primary academic interests included the interaction between law and society, the effects of the media on the law, and class-based differences in higher education. Currently working within the UBC Department of Family Practice he is now applying the same sociological perspective he brought to the above issues to the field of rural healthcare.

HELENA LI IS GRADUATING FROM UBC THIS MAY WITH A MAJOR IN ENGLISH Literature and a minor in Sociology. She enjoys the combination of these two disciplines because both attempt to tell stories of people's lives, and everyone is part of one and many stories. Helena's primary interest is in urban sociology with a focus on examining the causes and consequences of class inequalities. In the near future, she hopes to tell the stories of people in Hong Kong as a Sociologist.

AMANDA CHEONG IS A FOURTH YEAR HONOURS SOCIOLOGY STUDENT AT UBC. She joined the *Sojourners* editorial team out of a desire to promote undergraduate research among Arts students. Passionate about issues related to migration, transnationalism, race/ethnicity, and using ethnographic research methods, she is currently working as a Research Assistant within the Sociology and Political Science departments, as well as conducting her honours thesis on the topic of stateless Chinese-Bruneian immigrants in Vancouver. When she is not in self-imposed isolation in the ANSO basement,

she trains as a member of the Canadian National Dragon Boat team, and spent the past summer earning multiple gold medals at the 2011 World Dragon Boat Championships.

CHRISTINA NGUYEN is graduating this May from UBC with an Honours degree in Sociology. Her thesis revolves around individual-level determinants on the formation of generalized and particularized trust within Canadian society. In her final year, she served on the executive of the Sociology Students' Association and also worked as the co-facilitator for the Sociology Undergraduate/Graduate Mentoring Program. Christina plans on taking a year off to move to South Korea to teach English before pursuing graduate school. In her non-academic life, she enjoys practicing yoga and baking. She appreciates the opportunity to have worked on the third volume of *Sojourners*.

VOLUME 4

2012

Occupy Vancouver:

Are news reports of the protest framed consistently with the aims of protestors?
- A Comparative Analysis -

Anita Sehagic

I. INTRODUCTION

'*Shhhhh... Media Sleeping*' – A WOMAN HOLDS UP A SIGN IN FRONT OF THREE parked news station wagons at the corner of Granville and Howe. It is October 15, 2011, the official beginning of Occupy Vancouver (OV). OV has sprung about from OWS[1], a leaderless resistance movement that started on September 17, 2011 in New York. Members of the movement identify as the 99% of society that will no longer tolerate the greed and corruption of the ruling 1% elite. Since, it has spread to over 1589 cities in over 82 countries worldwide[2]. In Canada, 15 cities to date[3] have joined the occupation in solidarity, including, Montreal, Vancouver, Quebec, Toronto, and Calgary (CBC News, 2011). Although this is an ongoing global movement, for the scope of this paper I will limit the focus and concentrate on Vancouver.

Socio-political movements, like any other story presented in traditional newspaper media, are influenced by and subjected to factors such as editor deadlines, getting 'the story', selection criteria, description bias, and target audience. Therefore, media influence what gets selected and printed out of

---

1 This refers to "Occupy Wall Street". Retrieved on October 15, 2011 from http://occupywallst.org/

2 Retrieved on October 22, 2011 from http://www.occupytogether.org/

3 This paper was completed before the dismantling of the physical Occupy protests at the Art Gallery and around the country.

events and consequently, portray a social reality that affects how readers perceive information. Johnson et al. (1994) state that the media play a crucial role in shaping a movement's image (in Carroll & Ratner, 1999). Existing research demonstrates how media have bias in portraying events (Ashley & Olson, 1998; Carroll & Ratner, 1999; Koopmans, 2004; Oliver & Maney, 2000; Smith et al., 2001; Wilkes et al., 2010; Wilkes & Ricard, 2007), in effect, shaping and organizing much of our reality. How does this affect the social reality of a specific movement? This paper will examine how Occupy Vancouver is framed by newspaper media in British Columbia; in particular, analyzing whether news reports on the protest are framed in ways consistent with the aims of protestors.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The media is not a passive or neutral channel, but rather a selection, creation, and distortion process. Oliver & Maney (2000) analyzed the complex triadic relationship of politics, protests, and the news media, stating the media is aware of selection and distortion, but that these are not its intentions. The authors argue, news coverage comes from predicable cycles of institutional and political life called 'routinization,' which encompasses various aspects that make something newsworthy, i.e. an event's size, disruptiveness, level of conflict, proximity to the news organization, and location in an issue attentions cycle (Oliver & Maney, 2000). Consequently, the ways in which the media chooses to portray events influence how audiences will interpret those events. Ashley & Olson (1998) go further and state that news media play a vital role in the success of a movement, as it can shape a protest's message for an audience by deciding whether to print or broadcast news of a social protest, what sources to use, and how to frame the issue. Movements are granted coverage when doing something newsworthy, i.e. "dramatic gestures, marches, sit-ins, demonstrations, and violence" (p. 264). Accordingly, society's knowledge of itself and the world is largely derived from mass media, relying on constructions of reality to gain information and reproduce it (Hardt, 2002).

By ignoring, putting an article at the back of a section, or downplaying issues of the protest, journalists organize discourse by implementing social and political frames that adhere to the status quo. A detailed discussion on how OV is framed by BC newspaper media will follow in the Findings section. For example, shedding light on trivial aspects such as dress, language, age, style, etc., marginalizes viewpoints and the group itself (Paletz & Entman, 1981).

Ultimately, these framing techniques are likely to create misrepresentations and misinterpretations, but nonetheless play a critical role in guiding the reader to sympathize with or disapprove of the movement.

Since the 1970s, studies of popular culture and social movements have viewed mass media as a key site of political contention in advanced capitalism (cf. Hall et. al, 1980; Fiske, 1989; Hackett, 1991; Ryan, 1991, as cited in Carroll & Ratner, 1999). Hence, the lens used by news and production thereof, will portray prevailing hegemonic cultural and political power. Traditional and modern media, politics, society, and protests are in direct interchange with one another. Movements trying to advance their political context rely on media, an influential source of power, to mobilize, validate, and enlarge the scope of their conflict, to then be granted standing, preferred framing, and sympathy (Carroll & Ratner, 1999). Resource mobilization and political process theories explain "how internal social organizations facilitate mobilization and how external political opportunities provide openings for challenging groups to initiate collective action" (Morris, 2000, p. 452). If the interaction between social movements, the public, and political authorities is largely mediated by mass media, we have to understand the important role it plays in reporting what appears to be versus what the protests advocate.

III. DATA AND METHODS

Is media simply a channel of information, an acting liaison between producer and consumer, a creator of realities, or an understanding tool? How far does the media offer an adequate portrayal of social reality if we know as Oliver & Maney (2000) put forth, that it constructs knowledge? The data and methods used to analyze (in)consistencies of news reports on protests with protestors' own reports will be drawn from a comparison of newspaper articles and a participant observer study. The articles chosen are meant to provide a diverse spectrum of newspapers read in the city of Vancouver. High readership statistics and recency of articles were the focus of the inclusion criteria in this research. Statistics Canada in 2009 reports the circulation of Canadian daily, community, and other newspapers amount to 872.4 million dollars in revenue, emphasizing circulation and readership of this type of medium. More specifically regarding newspaper distribution in Vancouver, the Canadian Newspaper Association's (CNA) most recent *Circulation Data Report 2009* revealed on average 338,337 copies sold daily and 2,030,022 weekly (Penney, 2010).

Since the beginning of OWS and OV, I have been following reports in both traditional print and online media. However, for my research, I wanted to get the most recent information available as in my opinion, it is more interesting and relevant to see how the movement has evolved rather than narrowing the focus on begin or mid reports. I typed "Occupy Vancouver" in a variety of BC newspaper search engines[4]. The following had the most hits on OV: *Metro News*, *The Province*, *The Vancouver Sun*, and *24 Hours*. Therefore, on October 23, 2011, these outlets were selected for a search of their most recent articles published on OV. Although *The Globe and Mail* is not a BC newspaper I decided to include it into my analysis, since it had the highest readership rating of all newspapers according to the CNA 2009 report (Penney, 2010). The Association reported daily circulation averages as follows: 315,272 for *The Globe and Mail*; 175,572 for The Vancouver Sun; and 162,764 for *The Province*, all exemplifying that these newspapers are a widely used source of information[5]. Metro Vancouver and *24 Hours* had a daily circulation average of 120,000 and 122,298, respectively. Table 1 outlines the most recent articles published on OV that were selected for analysis.

Table 1

Newspaper articles selected for analysis

Date	Source	Headline
October 21, 2011	Metro News	"Bush receives rude welcome in Surrey"
October 21, 2011	The Globe and Mail	"Protest movement fortifies Anton's mayoral campaign"
October 21, 2011	The Vancouver Sun	"Occupy Vancouver protest costs more than $500,000 over five days"
October 23, 2011	The Province	"Protestors take over downtown bank"
October 23, 2011	24 Hours	"Occupy movement aimless and disorganized"

For this particular study, I used Iyengar's (1991) categorical frames of episodic coverage (EC) and thematic coverage (TC) (as found in Smith et al., 2001). Episodic framing primarily presents details of the protest itself, e.g.

4 BC newspapers as found in the CNA 2009 *Circulation Data Report*: Alaska Highway News, Alberni Valley Times, Cranbrook Daily Townsman, Courier, Dawson Creek Daily News, Metro News, Nanaimo Daily News, Nelson Daily News, Penticton Herald, Prince George Citizen, Times Colonist, The Kamloops Daily News, The Province, The Trail Times, The Vancouver Sun, and 24 Hours.

5 Online readership is not taken into account, neither is the circulation of a purchased newspaper in an office, coffee shop, nor household – common places where newspapers are shared, and would likely contribute to an increased readership statistic.

"number of people, weather, speakers or entertainers," thereby marginalizing or deemphasizing issues behind the protest whilst relying primarily on government and other external authorities for information on the protest (p. 1419). Thematic framing instead stresses issues directly addressed by protestors, stating details raised by demonstrations, such as number of people involved to a particular problem, socioeconomic reasons for this problem, and/or pending legislation on that particular issue (Smith et. al., 2001). Aside mentioning underlying problems of significance of protest goals, the latter furthermore relies on internal information sources obtained from the movement itself.

Iyengar's coding method works best for my research purposes, as it allows me to differentiate from newspaper articles framing concrete events, such as stories that tend to reinforce status quo agendas (EC), versus newspaper articles that provide collective evidence (TC) that are framed to support social movements and their need for transformation. Sociologist Niklas Luhmann (2001) has argued that mass media is a social constructed reality of selected events, providing us with a "second-order observation" (p. 85). To move beyond this selected, packaged, and altered reality of events presented in newspaper articles, I chose to be a participant observer at the movement so I could self-observe and self-create in order to gain reality of first-order observation, leaving out the 'middle man' that channels second-order observations. Hereto I want to provide documentation of a collection of a personal account of events. True objectivity is not possible, as even an objective driven note taker will select and organize to record. Thus, I try to be as objective as possible in taking down what was said and done at the OV General Assemblies, rallies, and speeches, occurring on October 15, 19, and 21, 2011.

IV. FINDINGS

This section explores if and how OV is getting adequate coverage by BC newspaper media. My findings were expected based on past work that has been done in exploring whether news reports on protests are framed in ways consistent with the aims of protestors. In all five articles analyzed, it was evident that there is a greater tendency towards EC than TC. These include highlighting the number of protestors and tents, location of demonstration, policing and city resource costs, as well as discussing upcoming political candidates Robertson and Anton, with an emphasis on the latter two issues.

Ashley & Olson's (1998) research on framing techniques show that media has a powerful effect since it sets agendas by choosing what to emphasize and what to ignore or suppress, thereby organizing much of our social realities.

IV. I NEWSPAPER ARTICLES

Metro News' article features almost solely EC facts about George Bush's visit to Surrey, although the headline directs the reader to anticipate why members of OV were there to protest in the first place. The article maintains EC framing by exposing the number of protestors, police, and helicopters present at the event, as well as location and purpose of Bush's visit. It does not elaborate on why demonstrators took action that day, which if done, would affirm TC, thereby acknowledging demonstrators' motives. Labeling the only protestor's voice in the article as "a homeless mother", the article discredits OV and steers the discourse by selectively choosing to represent a certain image of OV's members (Kieltyka, 2011).

The majority of *The Globe and Mail* article serves as a media platform for the upcoming election, allowing Anton to criticize the leadership skills of her opponent Robertson for tolerating 'tent city'. Several other EC framing techniques are evident. For example, the article identifies the protest without any poll or statistics as "semi-popular", thereby revealing its position towards OV. It further introduces only frivolous details about which infrastructures OV has built on site, "a kitchen serving free food, a first aid tent, a library of sorts, a movie tent, [and] a communications tent" (Quinn, 2011). Also pointed out is how much the city is paying for OV: "the first five days of the protest cost more than half a million dollars, [...] the mayor says it's costing about $1,000 per day in additional city resources" (Quinn, 2011). Dwelling on costs could incline readers to attribute these to their tax dollars, leading to possible aggravation, and even disapproval of the entire movement. The only visible TC here is an aside mentioning how the group seems organized and non-hierarchically structured. Nonetheless, the reader learns nothing more about the underlying social problems to which the movement attributes some political and economic injustice.

The Vancouver Sun attempts TC by stating that the protest is about social and economic inequality. Yet, it fails to address these and other related issues discussed in-depth at General Assemblies, i.e. tar sands, environmental degradation, homelessness, greed, political corruption, military spending, and oppression by institutional hierarchies, as well as the difficulty of electoral and

legislative reform. Carroll & Ratner (1999) express how movements use media strategically to counter or disrupt the status quo, critiquing existing social and material conditions, and articulating alternatives, be it new discourse of codes, policies, or ways of life. However, coverage focuses on and remains surface material, asserting inconsequential aspects of the movement. The reporter reiterates EC throughout the article by stating facts such as number of protestors and tents, location, tent infrastructure, and Anton's scrutiny against Robertson. Additionally, it accentuates city and police expenditures five times, without mentioning once what OV specifically aims to accomplish or how they want to go about implementing change. The author also chooses to utter trifling weather conditions, saying the "week's rain hasn't weakened the protestors' resolve" (Hoekstra, 2011). Hence, OV's purpose and goals continue to be neglected.

The Province for example uses EC to highlight incidental concerns of noise and use of shop bathrooms as protestors' bathing sites. Albeit their headline "Protestors take over downtown bank," there is a mere factual EC mentioning the number of people inside the bank, the dancing on counters at the TD branch, drum play, and car honking. It mentions David Suzuki's speech, sheds light on protestors' diverse signs, and brings up "minor traffic tie-ups, [...] no violence or vandalism, [...] no damage reported at any of the banks, and no arrests" (Luk & Toyoda, 2011). Only 20% of the article is actually devoted to the title[6]. Although some TC is presented in the article, such as the concentration of wealth of corporate elite, putting money into a credit union as part of a solution, and the protesting against exporting natural resources, the article never goes further to explain demonstrator concerns on these major issues.

Findings from Smith et al. (2001) confirm that even when movements succeed at obtaining attention of mass media, reporters present events in a way that neutralizes or even undermines social movement agendas. The 24 Hours article maintains EC framing, using terms and language that delegitimizes OV, defining it as an "aimless, disorganized, unclear, and incoherent grab bag of mixed messages and random airing of grievances" that receives "over-the-top media coverage" for an unworthy cause (Marshall, 2011). The reporter commits a fallacy in generalizing and simplifying the movement and its actors, stating how one "young Burberry-clad protestor [...]

---

6 Ten out of fifty lines in the article were devoted to the issue of protestors in the TD bank.

sums it all up", after being asked by the reporter wwwwwhy someone should pay his tuition, he simply responds with "that's what I want" (Marshall, 2011). The author further applies EC by saying, "[a]ctually, it's a massive stretch to even call it a movement," effectively denouncing OV (Marshall, 2011).

The underlying ideologies of the analyzed newspapers articles in *Metro News*, *The Globe and Mail*, *The Vancouver Sun*, *The Province*, and *24 Hours* all seem to promote and uphold hegemonic neo-liberal ideologies. By prioritizing election and cost issues and highlighting other superficial facts, they effectively discredit and degrade the image of the OV movement, therefore ultimately conveying disapproval. As Smith et al. (2001) conclude, media reports do not favor interests of demonstrators, especially issues that could threaten economic and political elites. This is why being present at the movement can provide one with the ability to compare and contrast information from the protestors themselves against the news articles, therefore gaining another, more holistic perspective.

IV. II PARTICIPANT OBSERVATION

The first thing that I observed at OV was the diversity of its members. Yes, there were homeless people and young hipster kids as stated in the newspaper articles, but there were also people who worked full time jobs, many families, full time students, and elderly people. The General Assemblies that everyone attended took a lot of time so that participants who wanted to speak were heard. At one of these, it was exclaimed, "disagreements must be heard, [and] problems such as the white man's privilege, recognized and acknowledged". The organizational structure and also a main objective of OV was to be what they want to see in the world, i.e. a basic democratic societal model. Therefore, for the three days I observed I noticed the symposium process as being very slow and difficult yet thoughtful, involving a lot of patience, learning, teaching, and much discussion. For example, when members were deciding on how to proceed with next week's agenda on educating others and raising awareness of OV, the multiplicity of voices allowed for a variety of viable ideas to surface, which were then voted on by everyone standing in the circle[7].

Multiple times throughout, it was mentioned that the global Occupy movement is about sharing, caring for each other, and community building. During a speech, a man said, "We stand in solidarity with First Nations,

---

7 Although I stood in the circle beside members at General Assemblies, I did not vote nor participate once they broke off into small work groups, discussions, or workshops.

children, elders, females, and environmentalists, all of whom are marginalized groups in our society and continue to be oppressed". A systematic explanation for social problems centered on the concentration of power in governments, corporations, and the ruling elite. It seemed as if all priorities had reversed once I stepped on OV's site compared to what I had read about it in the media. Numbers and factual descriptions listed by the newspapers were unimportant. At OV the question of why seemed to prevail over the question of who and how. The movement's main aim as stated by its members, was to try and find ways to create a just and sustainable society. In a read out list of demands, the following were proposed; "greater transparency of governments and officials, free education and health care, a progressive tax system, expanding social safety nets, nationalizing banks, a higher minimum wage, and adequate housing". Much of these demands depend on electoral reform and financial stabilization to achieve positive change. The movement underlined "closing the gap of disparity" and not aiming for Marxist ideals of equality. Therefore, the role that newspaper media in BC has taken on regarding OV, namely, misrepresentation, falls short of depicting what the movement is about and what it advocates.

Oliver & Maney (2000) say coverage of an event depends on local and historical circumstances. Although Vancouver has a longstanding history of activism (cf. poverty, environment, anti-capitalism, women's, gay's, animal's and human rights), this movement is not like any other. For example, recent G20 and anti-Olympic protests both targeted one specific event and were more aggressive. In fact, G20 marked Canada's largest mass arrest in history (Hughes, 2010). With the exception of Rome, the global Occupy movement has been a peaceful one. Further, it was pointed out at one of the rallies that OV is a long-term occupation, as the movement wants actual change. An inclusive, holistic, democratic process takes time. The intentions are not to do something for the sake of doing it; rather, the movement seeks to build a foundation for future societies that could serve as a basis for legislative reform. The media, however, mentions none of this. As Smith et al. summarize:

> The contradiction between movement and media agenda are most dramatic for movements that directly challenge the economic system on which the corporate mass media depend, and here we can expect media coverage of protest to undermine the potential policy impact of movements (2001, p. 1399)

Through the participant observer study, my findings show that media portrayal of the movement did not correspond with the aims of the protestors. They instead use other methods of communication that do not depend on the sympathies of mainstream media. In the modern era, social media is ruled by information-highways and instant communication. Citizen journalism has gone viral and increased exponentially over the last decade, cf. Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, Blogs, Forums, Smartphones, etc. As I witnessed, movement mobilization occurs through informal networks, which are reflected in social media, representing a grassroots kind of communication infrastructure. In fact, on July 13, 2011 AdBusters – a non-profit organization based in Vancouver – posted an appeal on their website asking people to "flood into lower Manhattan, set up tents, kitchens, peaceful barricades and occupy Wall Street on September 17, 2011"[8] – marking the birth of the global Occupy movement. The communications, media, and information tent at OV exemplarily illustrate the extent of Occupy. Dedicated professional and non-professional writers and video editors work with an extensive network to escape the framing techniques of mass media.

V. CONCLUSION & DISCUSSION

Mass media is continuously born out of, creates, and recreates social realities. My research shows that news reports in BC are not framed in ways consistent with the aims of the protestors. The news spin on OV does not favour the social movement or its actors. Thematic coverage (TC) of how OV aims to transform political and social institutions is largely overshadowed by immense episodic coverage (EC). These descriptions, which rest primarily on interests in news, advertising, and entertainment as Hardt (2002) contends, form society's understanding of reality depending on what is observed and how it is observed by mass media organizations. The participant observer study allowed me to discern distinctions between the social and political discourse reflected in individual observations and media representations of reality. The movement organizers intended to draw attention to underlying themes of injustice, inequality, and oppression, seeking support for "claims that the economic and/or political system is the source of some problem and without reforms of the system the problem will persist" (Smith et. al, 2001,

---

8 Retrieved on October 20, 2011 from http://www.adbusters.org/blogs/adbusters-blog/occupywallstreet.html

p. 1403). Yet, the extent to which issues were raised at OV was not reflected in coverage.

The limitations for this research are important to note. I was the only participant observer at OV for this particular study, which restricts data collection and hinders a well-rounded perspective. Since the analysis only contains five newspapers, characteristically significant outcomes cannot be drawn. In addition, the number of articles analyzed and dates chosen were small to be representative.

It would be interesting to see how other major newspapers across Canada framed OV, which was too arduous for the scope of this paper. Further research could even examine how the entire Canadian Occupy movement is framed by Canadian newspapers. One could also compare and contrast what role new media plays in framing versus traditional media. Studies like these could enhance our understanding of which sources of information people use; how this influences reception, perception, and understanding of a movement, and how such in turn shapes social realities.

A social movement may be defined as a persistent and organized effort by a relatively large number of people designed to bring about social change and resist the status quo (West & Blumberg, 1990). There is no indication of a similar event to Occupy found in historical records. Yet, most attempts to challenge existing policies and cultural codes remain marginal and inconsequential, and success, however measured, is the rare exception (Koopmans, 2004). OV is just one participating city out of 1589 occupations globally, demonstrating that there is a large-scale unification advocating for change. Regardless of the physical and mental dispersions the movement faces, or the mis- and underrepresentation that mass media is accountable for, one thing is certain: each demonstrator is brought together by Democracy not Corporatocracy. Reporter Matt Taibbi quite nicely sums up that Occupy "is a visceral, impassioned, deep-seated rejection of the entire direction of our society, a refusal to take even one more step forward into the shallow commercial abyss of phoniness, short-term calculation, withered idealism and intellectual bankruptcy" (2011). OV, along with other Occupy communities are far from being hegemonic entities, thus they stand against a common enemy of inequality. In the future, it will need to come up with concrete goals, but for now, it is already a success, by simply existing, and being something different.

REFERENCES

Ashley, L., & Olson, B. (1998). Constructing Reality: Print Media's Framing of the Women's Movement, 1966 to 1986. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 75*(2), 263-277. Retrieved from EBSCO*host*.

Carroll, W.K., & Ratner, R.S. (1999) Media Strategies and Poltical Projects: A Comparative Study of Social Movements. *The Canadian Journal of Sociology, 24*(1), 1-34. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/

CBC News Canada (2011, Oct 15). *Occupy protesters camp out in Canadian cities*. Retrieved from http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/story/2011/10/15/occupy-canada-saturday.html

Hardt, H. (2002). The Reality of the Mass Media. *Journal of Communication Inquiry, 26*, 96-97. doi:10.1177/019685990202600108

Hoekstra, G. (2011, Oct 21). *Occupy Vancouver protest costs more than $500,000 over five days*. Retrieved from http://www.vancouversun.com/travel/Occupy+Vancouver+protest +costs+more+than +over+five+days/5586213/story.html

Hughes, L. (2010). G20 Protests. *Canadian Dimension, 44*(5), 48. Retrieved from EBSCO*host*.

Kieltyka, M. (2011, Oct 21). *Bush receives rude welcome in Surrey*. Retrieved from http:// metronews.ca/news/vancouver/33037/bush-receives-rude-welcome-in-surrey/

Koopmans, R. (2004). Movements and Media: Selection Processes and Evolutionary Dynamics in the Public Sphere. *Theory and Society, 33*(3/4), 367-391. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/

Luhmann, N. (2000). *The reality of the mass media* (Kathleen Cross, Trans.). Cambridge, UK: Polity Press. (Original work published 1996).

Luk, V., & Tovoda, L. (2011, Oct 23). *Protestors take over downtown bank*. Retrieved from http:// www.theprovince.com/sports/Protesters+take+over+downtown+bank/5594017/story. html

Marshall, K. (2011, October 23). *Occupy movement aimless and disorganized*. Retrieved from http://vancouver.24hrs.ca/Columnists/GuestShot/

Morris, A. (2000). Reflections on Social Movement Theory: Criticisms and Proposals. *Contemporary Sociology, 29*(3), 445-454. Retrieved from http://www.jstor.org/

Oliver, P.E., & Maney, G.M. (2000). Political Processes and Local Newspaper Coverage of Protest Events: From Selection Bias to Triadic Interactions. *American Journal of Sociology, 106*(2), 463-505.doi:10.1086/316964

Paletz, D.L., & Entman, R.M. (1981). *Media, Power, Politics*. NY: St. Martin's Press.

Penney, S. (2010, April). The Canadian Newspaper Association. *Circulation Data Report 2009*. Retrieved from http://www.newspaperscanada.ca/ daily-newspaper-paid-circulation-data

Quinn, S. (2011, Oct 21). *Protest movement fortifies Anton's mayoral campaign*. Retrieved from http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/british-columbia/ protest-movement-fortifies-antons-mayoral-campaign/article2210211/

Smith, J., McCarthy, J.D., McPhail, C., Augustyn, B. (2001). From Protest to Agenda Building: Description Bias in Media Coverage of Protest Events in Washington, D.C. *Social Forces, 79*(4), 1397-1423.doi:10.1353/sof.2001.0053

Statistics Canada. (2009). *Circulation revenue by type of paper, Canada, 2007 to 2009*. Retrieved from http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/63-241-x/2011001/t003-eng.htm

Taibbi, M. (2011, Nov 10). *How I Stopped Worrying and Learned to Love the OWS Protest*. Retrieved from http://www.rollingstone.com/politics/news/ how-i-stopped-worrying-and-learned-to-love-the-ows-protests-20111110

West, G., & Blumberg, R. L. (1990). *Women and Social Protests.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wilkes, R., & Ricard, D. (2007). How does newspaper coverage of collective action vary? Protest by Indigenous people in Canada. *The Social Science Journal, 44*, 231-251. doi:10.1016/j.soscij.2007.03.017

Wilkes, R., Corringall-Brown, C., Myers, D.J. (2010). Packaging Protest: media Coverage of Indigenous People's Collective Action. *Canadian Sociological Association, 47*(4), 327-357. doi:10.1111/j.1755-618X.2010.01243.x

Bill C-389:

What is the media really saying about transgender rights?

Sam Markham

INTRODUCTION

On March 3, 2010, NDP MP Bill Siksay presented Bill C-389 to the House of Commons for its first reading. Bill C-389 was a proposed amendment to the Canadian Human Rights Act that would add gender identity and gender expression to the list of prohibited grounds for discrimination in areas like housing, employment, medical care, and the requisition of goods and services. It also proposed to modify the criminal code to recognize discrimination based on gender identity and gender expression as a hate crime. On February 9, 2011 it passed its third and final reading in the house with an 145-135 vote (passbillc389, 2011). However, Siksay did not find a sponsor for the bill in the Senate before the most recent federal election was called, and the bill was dissolved.

The bill would have protected transgendered people from discrimination, as there are currently no protections for this group in Canadian law. Transgender is "an umbrella term (adj.) for people whose gender identity and/or gender expression differs from the sex they were assigned at birth. The term may include but is not limited to: transsexuals, cross-dressers and other gender-variant people" (glaad.org).

While Bill C-389 was in the House of Commons, it received a lot of media coverage. On the surface level, most mass media news articles with a focus on Bill C-389 implied in some way that they agreed with the bill, or presented

the bill positively in association with the equality we value as Canadians. However, in this study I will examine how these news articles also send other negative messages about transgender rights and transgender issues; messages that reflect the same climate that contributed to the failure of Bill C-389. The media has the ability to advance equality in Canada by providing informed coverage of transgender people, and due to the recent nature of the legislation in this case and the fact that the same bill under two separate names is on the waiting list to be raised in parliament again, this analysis is especially important.

LITERATURE REVIEW

While the literature collected does address the issues in media representation of LGBT (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgendered) individuals, for the most part the emphasis is on gay and lesbian individuals. Based on similarities between these two groups in their history (illustrated by the shared term LGBT) and treatment by mainstream society, a study on transgender representation in the media using existing literature on gay and lesbian people in the media as a reference is not only valid but, due to the lack of specialized literature on transgender representation in the media, also necessary.

Existing media representations of non-normative sexualities and gender identities are framed in a specific, narrow way. Although the ways in which they are framed are not blatantly discriminatory, subtle negative messages persist (Avila-Saavedra, 2009; Landau, 2009; Willox, 2003). There are three major tendencies that exist in the media's representation of LGBT individuals. These include: (1) the representation of non-normative sexualities/identities in conformity to the current normative social order, (2) the use of quotes in news articles from out-group as opposed to in-group members speaking about a group, and (3) the inclusion of hate speak to balance articles.

Even though gay and lesbian people are represented more often in mainstream media nowadays, this representation has the specific function of showing them conforming to the current social order. Television portrayals of gay main characters are limited to affluent white gays without political agendas (Avila-Saavedra, 2009), while the amount of legal discrimination against LGBT people, most visible in debates about gay marriage, means that politics are often inseparable from non-normative sexualities. Gay and lesbian parents are sensationalized in the media while being legitimized only by their ability to produce heterosexual, heteronormative children (Landau, 2009).

Heteronormativity, as defined by Jackson (2006), refers to "the numerous ways in which heterosexual privilege is woven into the fabric of social life" (p. 108). By not conforming to normative sexualities or gender identities in the first place, LGBT people can't fit into the heteronormative, heterosexual model of our society, and this has contributed to a community rich in diversity. For example, some gay and lesbian couples embrace the normative rite of marriage in Canada while others reject marriage due to its heterosexist, patriarchal roots and instead pursue relationships in different ways (Young & Boyd, 2006). Even though LGBT people do not fit the heteronormative model of society, or always wish to, they are represented in ways that encourage it to continue (e.g. being apolitical (Avila-Saavedra, 2009) and wanting heteronormative children (Landau, 2009)) instead of in ways that would challenge this discourse to make more room for the diversity they represent.

Another trend the literature has found in the media representation of gays and lesbians has to do with selection as a framing technique (Entman, 1993). Quotes from outsiders commenting on LGBT individuals are used with far more frequency than quotes from the members of the groups themselves (Gray, 2009; Landau, 2003); for example in articles about gay and lesbian parents, their heterosexual, gender-normative children usually speak (Landau, 2009). In this way gay and lesbian parents are legitimized for their ability to reproduce normative society, but it is the voice of this society, not their voices, that speaks.

Finally, the dialogue concerning LGBT political issues in the media is defined by the opponents to LGBT rights, who set the parameters of the debate that takes place (Liebler, Schwartz & Harper, 2009). Alwood (1996) states "the media thinks nothing of routinely including demeaning and hateful remarks from bigots and antigay zealots in stories about gay rights" (p. 323). This occurs because the media has a tendency to view gay rights as controversial topics still – perspectives from the extreme right wing opponents to LGBT rights are represented to create a 'balanced dialogue' (Alwood, 1996; Liebler et al., 2009).

In contrast to the larger body of literature on gay representation in the media, one of the few relevant academic articles on transgender representation in the media is Willox's analysis of media representation of Brandon Teena (nee Teena Brandon), a transgendered person who was brutally raped and murdered in 1993 and made the subject of the film "Boys

Don't Cry" (2003). Media representation of Brandon was also framed in a very specific way. He was often emphasized as a cross-dresser in the media and male pronouns were used in quotations to refer to him, thereby denying transgender subjectivity as transversing gender boundaries (Willox, 2003). By taking advantage of the fact that Brandon Teena was dead to frame him in this specific way, the media did not have to explain the non-normative concept of gender as subjective to the public.

This study will draw on the literature largely concerned with gay representation in the media as well as Willox's article to look at the specified themes in transgender representation in the media around the controversial Bill C-389.

Using Bill C-389 specifically to analyze transgender representation in the mass (mainstream) media is ideal as it is a current Canadian issue, it received a lot of coverage as a national issue, and in its failure there is evidence that mass media may represent the climate that led to the bill's failure.

DATA AND METHODS

I examined 17 news articles from March 2010 to February 2011 that were explicitly focused on Bill C-389. The articles were collected through searching the Canadian Newsstand database and the search engine on the UBC Library website for "transgender rights bill Canada", "transsexual rights bill Canada", and "bathroom bill Canada". I chose these sources for my search because they provide compilations of mainstream newspaper articles from March 2010 to February 2011, the time when the bill was in the House of Commons and subject to the most scrutiny. I looked at mainstream news sources for this search as they have a wide circulation and thus provide the perspectives that would have reached the most Canadians. For this reason I was not interested in smaller, specialty publications. Using databases to find these articles was ideal as they have kept all of the articles released by relevant news sources during this time period, unlike the independent websites of some of these sources. Papers with articles analyzed included:

- *Airdrie City View*	- *Burnaby Now*
- *The Vancouver Sun*	- *Calgary Herald*
- *The Globe & Mail*	- *Leader Post*
- *The Gazette*	- *Alaska Highway News*
- *Edmonton Journal*	- *The Bugle-Observer*
- *The Record*	- *The Ottawa Citizen*
- *Times Colonist*	- *Saint City News*

The articles for the most part involved discussion of the legal aspects of Bill C-389. Some of the articles involved quotes from anti-LGBT rights individuals calling the morality of the bill into question. This was done using the argument that it was a 'bathroom bill' and would let men into women's washrooms to prey on women if they simply dressed up in women's clothing (Minsky, 2011a; Ibbitson, 2011; Allen, 2010; Minsky, 2011d; Minsky, 2011f). A few articles included perspectives from the transgender community (Minsky, 2011c; Minsky, 2011a).

I analyzed my data using frame theory as outlined by Entman, who states that framing is selecting certain aspects of a perceived reality, and making them more salient in communicating them to others to promote a particular definition of the situation (1993). I went through the articles to find direct quotes and code them by speaker. The speakers themselves were noted, and I paid specific attention to whether the speakers were pro- or anti- LGBT rights. Secondly, I looked at the usages of the terms gender identity and gender expression, specifically if and how they were defined and whether they were annotated with quotation marks. I also considered whether the term transgendered was defined and, if so, how this was done. Finally, I looked more closely at a few of the articles to look at what kind of arguments were being made about transgender people, namely how the situation was being defined, and who was doing this defining.

FINDINGS

Although many of the newspaper articles take pro-LGBT perspectives, they also perpetuate negative stereotypes about transgender people by repeating these stereotypes and giving them equal weight with what is said by pro-LGBT speakers. The articles use terms beyond the complexity of a newspaper article without explaining them, contributing to misinforming the public, and define transgendered people within the current heteronormative order as opposed to looking at what might need to be challenged in this order to create equality for transgendered people in our society, as Bill C-389 aimed to do.

NARROWLY BALANCED REPORTING

Based on which speakers are quoted in the newspaper articles analyzed, and how many quotes they have in each article, as shown in the Table below,

it is clear that the media considers transgender rights a controversial issue in need of balance (Alwood, 1996), and thus conveys this opinion to the public.

TABLE: QUOTING IN MAINSTREAM NEWS ARTICLES ON BILL C-389

Article #	Siksay	McVety	Pro-LGBT (including Siksay)	Anti-LGBT (including McVety)
1			5	3
2			5	2
3			1	
4		1		3
5				
6	6		6	
7	1	2	1	2
8			1	
9	1	1	1	1
10				
11	1	1	1	1
12	1		1	
13	1	2	1	2
14	1		1	
15	1		1	
16	1	2	2	2
17				
Total	14 (9 articles)	9 (6 articles)	27 (13 articles)	16 (8 articles)

Bill Siksay had the most quotes in the most articles, which was predictable as he put forth the bill, but I also found that Charles McVety, the evangelical minister who was the most vocal opposition to the bill in the media, was quoted almost as many times as Siksay was, in almost as many articles, as can be seen in the Table "Distribution of Quotes in mainstream news articles on Bill C-389." Through the distribution of quotes the media has portrayed McVety, a man who thinks transgender rights means men can enter showers at the local swimming pool and shower with his daughter (Minsky, 2011a; Minsky, 2011b; Minsky 2011d), as having an equally valid opinion to the NDP critic on lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and transsexual issues.

In the same vein, looking at the total number of articles featuring pro-LGBT rights quotations (quotes from Siksay, sympathetic MPs, transgender activists and transgender private citizens) versus anti-LGBT rights quotations (McVety, opposing MPs, other right wing religious organizations), there

are 13 articles featuring pro-LGBT rights quotes and 8 featuring anti-LGBT rights quotes.

Looking at the number of quotations also reveals that in general, transgender people are not quoted. Out of 14 articles that include quotations, transgender people or transgender activists are only quoted in five of them (Grasmeyer, 2011; Kucerak, 2011; Minsky, 2011a; Minsky 2011c; Tait, 2011) (and in addition to this one article is written by a transgender individual (Allen, 2010)). Considering this bill had the potential to directly influence the life of every transgender person in Canada, the low number is surprising. Together with the rest of the findings from this analysis, this leads to a very clear picture of how even though the media contains arguments for the rights of transgender people on the surface level, selection is used so these arguments are only made by way of quotes from other people and groups.

MISSING DEFINITIONS

In the majority of the articles I found the validity of the terms gender expression and gender identity, the cornerstones of the bill, was questioned by the use of quotations, or scare quotes. As shown in an example from one of the articles: "the amendments add 'gender identity' and 'gender expression' to the list of prohibited grounds for discrimination in the Canadian Human Rights Act" (*The Ottawa Citizen*, 2011). Of 14 articles with some variation of this sentence, 10 articles used scare quotes around these terms while 4 did not. Gender identity "refers to how one feels or sees themselves as male or female (or somewhere in between) and isn't always based on biological sex" (Moreau, 2011, para. 7). Gender expression, according to Bill Siksay, "refers to an individual's outward expression of their inward sense of gender" (Minsky, 2011b; Minsky, 2011c; Minsky, 2011d; Minsky, 2011f).

Scare quotes are defined as "quotation marks used to foreground a particular word or phrase, esp. with the intention of disassociating the user from the expression or from some implied connotation it carries" (oxfordenglishdictionary.com).

Out of those 4 articles that did not use scare quotes and thus implied gender expression and gender identity were valid concepts, only one of these articles defined these concepts (Moreau, 2011). Seven articles in total defined gender expression and only one defined both terms. In the debate on Bill C-389 on February 7, 2011, Brent Rathgeber, a Conservative MP for Edmonton – St. Albert, Alberta stated, "we are left with uncertainty and vagueness about

what these concepts mean" (openparliament, 2011). Newspapers are meant to address a wide audience, and due to the varying education levels of the public, should not read beyond grade 11 English language comprehension competency. As Rathgeber has two bachelor's degrees (brentrathgeber, 2011) and still does not understand the specific use of these terms it stands to reason the terms are beyond the competency level at which newspapers should be at to be understandable to the general public. Therefore the fact that these definitions are largely exempt from newspaper articles (or trivialized by quotations around the terms) is extremely problematic in how it influences the public's understanding of transgender people and issues. A full, coherent and accessible definition and description of transgender peoples is incredibly important since there is a low visibility of transgender issues in the public eye.

ONE-SIDED DEFINITION OF THE SITUATION

In the majority of these articles the definition the public was given on Bill C-389 was not the same as the definition transgender people held. Real world examples of the consequences of the bill passing were for the most part invoked only by anti-LGBT rights speakers, such as McVety in this example:

> McVety, along with other critics from the Campaign Life Coalition, have dubbed C-389 the "Bathroom Bill" because of their believe that it can grant male cross-dressers and drag queens a legal right to use female bathrooms.

> "I have a 13 year-old daughter," McVety said. "And for a man to say that he can enter the local shower and shower with my daughter at the swimming pool is reckless." (Minsky, 2011b, para. 13-14)

This section of the article, though it does distance itself through McVety's opinion, provides a tangible consequence of the passing of Bill C-389. In contrast, this is the section from the pro-LGBT rights side of the issue in the same article:

> "It's a great day," said the bill's author, NDP MP Bill Siksay. "It's been in the works for six years, and it's great to see people from all parties supporting the bill. This is not a partisan issue, it's a human rights issue." (Minsky, 2011b, para. 2)

Though the newspaper article does not outwardly take any side, the people reading the article, who most likely do not have a pre-existing knowledge of transgender issues, are only left with a single detailed picture of the consequences of the bill passing. Bill C-389 was framed as a measure to combat discrimination, but the discrimination faced by transgendered people that the bill could have prevented is only made salient and personal for readers in a handful of articles. The specific, personal account of McVety talking about his daughter comes up far more often. Articles that repeat anti-LGBT messages to debunk them in defense of transgender rights fall victim to perpetuating these messages as well. One article in particular makes an argument in defense of transgender rights while quoting three anti-LGBT rights speakers while providing no concrete pro-LGBT arguments (Lakritz, 2011). Only five articles mention real world consequences of the bill from a pro-LGBT rights perspective. The difference between these and the above quote by Siksay is illustrated in this quote from the Vancouver Sun:

> "I was living two lives," [Mercedes Allen] said of the months when she was forced to dress and behave as a man at work because her employer hadn't established a policy for transsexual and transgender people. (Minsky, 2011a, para. 11)

Seeing this type of example draws attention to the fact that it is very rare in mass media coverage of Bill C-389, and that tangible positive consequences of the bill passing are rarely represented here.

Tied up in this is the representation of transgender people as part of the heteronormative order. One article in particular merits special attention in this case: *"Transgender people are just like the rest of us"* (Lakritz, 2011). The end of the article states, "The legitimization of gay marriage touched only the lives of gay people. A law that protects transgender people will have no effect on anyone except those who are of a mind to discriminate" (Lakritz, 2011, para. 16). As with the representation of gay people explored by the literature, transgender people are represented here as able to conform to the existing heteronormative order, thus perpetuating this order as opposed to challenging the discourse that led to this discrimination in the first place.

In the same vein, the definition of transgendered implicit in these articles is extremely narrow and restricted to heteronormative-type definitions. While transgender is an umbrella term, transsexual refers to an individual whose gender does not match the sex that was assigned at birth. It also refers to

individuals who have undergone sex reassignment surgery, and usually refers to individuals who feel their gender identity and sex are on opposite sites of the gender binary (merriam-webster.com). Four newspaper articles on Bill C-389 mention sex-reassignment surgery as a transgender issue (Moreau, 2011; Minsky, 2011c; Allen, 2010; Minsky, 2011a). Through not defining specifically who it is an issue for, this implies that all transgender people want to conform to the gender binary by transitioning to the gender that does not match their biological sex. In this way there is no discussion of the fact that some transgendered people are not interested in conforming to this binary at all. None of the articles differentiate between the broad term transgendered and the more specific term transsexual by including the definition of both terms.

When newspaper articles about Bill C-389 do not tell people about the situation at hand other than through the viewpoint of extreme right wing, anti-LGBT rights individuals and only include a narrow definition of the term transgendered, ignorance contributes to the ongoing lack of rights for transgendered people. As the majority of the public reading these articles doesn't have specific knowledge about transgender issues in the first place, anti-LGBT definitions of specifically what Bill C-389 will mean are all they're getting. If the mass media informed the public of these issues and portrayed transgendered people in a more visible positive light, this could potentially help shift public opinion in mainstream society and make it more likely that bills like Bill C-389 could pass to give transgender people more rights.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study has shown that the mass media, despite an outwardly sympathetic attitude toward transgender rights in the context of Bill C-389, does not promote an argument explicitly for transgender rights but a supposed balance (Alwood, 1996) of opinions. This is a similar pattern to representation of gays and lesbians in the media (Avila-Saavedra, 2009; Landau, 2009).

Of course, LGBT issues are often complex. There are many more terms for gender identity than are referenced in this study, and even transgender and transsexual are contested terms (glaad.org). Whereas some transgender people openly identify as transgendered, others, once they can pass as another gender, go 'stealth', defined as cutting all previous ties with transgender communities (Schilt & Westbrook, 2009) and might not be interested in identifying as transgendered anymore let alone openly fighting for these

rights. Despite the complications involved in representing this diverse group of people, mass media portrayals of transgender people and issues are extremely important. For young adults, who may still be navigating their own identities, most of the information received about LGBT groups comes from the mainstream media (Calzo & Ward, 2009), and for the rest of society, knowledge about LGBT groups and issues is essential to a larger push for rights.

Despite the results, there are multiple limitations to this study. The sample of newspaper articles analyzed was small, though looking at representation of transgender issues in the mass media in articles on one specific topic, Bill C-389, made it possible to focus the analysis. This study was also not set up to uncover a direct correlation between mass media news articles and transgender rights in this country, though this could be a topic of further study through looking at mass media representations and transgender legal protections in Canada compared to other countries with strong political stances for or against transgender rights. A study on mass media representation of transgender issues compared with other media representations might also be useful.

Through this study I have attempted to add to the small body of literature on transgender representation in the media, and I hope further research in this area will continue to highlight the issues here and what can be done about them.

REFERENCES

Alwood, E. (1996). Epilogue. In *Straight news: Lesbians, gays, and the news media* (315-328). New York: Columbia University Press.

Allen, M. (2010, December 17). MP Blake Richards has it wrong on Bill C-389. *Airdrie City View*, p. 9.

Avila-Saavedra, G. (2009). Nothing queer about queer television: televised construction of gay masculinities. *Media Culture Society*, *31*, 5-21.

About Brent. (2011). In *brentrathgeber.com*. Retrieved from http://www.brentrathgeber.com/about.html/.

Burnaby Now. (2011, February 16). There's no justification for discrimination; Will Canada's senators stand up and do the right thing – ensure that transgendered folks receive protection?. p. 6.

Calzo, J. P., & Ward, L. M. (2009). Contributions of parents, peers, and media to attitudes toward homosexuality: investing sex and ethnic differences. *Journal of Homosexuality*, *56*, 1101-116.

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward Clarification of a Fractured Paradigm. *Journal of Communication, 43*, 51-58.

GLAAD Media Reference Guide – Transgender Glossary of Terms. (2010). In Glaad.org. Retrieved from http://www.glaad.org/reference/transgender.

Grasmeyer, P. (2011, February 20). Basic Rights. *Calgary Herald*, p. A-12.

Grey, M. L. (2009). 'Queer Nation is Dead/Long Live Queer Nation': The Politics and Poetics of Social Movement and Media Representation. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 26*, 212-236.

Ibbitson, J. (2011, February 11). Unexpected moral win for transgender, transsexual Canadians. *The Globe and Mail,* p. A-6.

Jackson, S. (2006). Gender, sexuality, and heteronormativity: The complexity (and limits) of heteronormativity. *Feminist Theory, 7*, 105-121.

Kucerak, I. (2011, February 25). Bill C-389 before Senate. *Saint City News*, p. 28.

Lakritz, N. (2011, February 16). Transgender people are just like the rest of us. *Calgary Herald*, p. A-14.

Landau, J. (2009). Straightening Out (the Politics of) Same-Sex Parenting: Representing Gay Families in U.S. Print News Stories and Photographs. *Critical Studies in Media Communication, 26*, 80-100.

Liebler, C. M., Schwartz, J., & Harper, T. (2009). Queer Tales of Morality: The Press, Same Sex Marriage, and Hegemonic Framing. *Journal of Communication, 59*, 653-675.

Minsky, A. (2011a, February 10). Legal amendments will protect transgendered from discrimination; Evangelical minister calls changes dangerous and inconsiderate. *The Vancouver Sun*, p. 6.

Minsky, A. (2011b, February 10). Amendments pass House. *Leader Post,* p. 9.

Minsky, A. (2011c, February 10). MPs pass transgender rights bill; Majority of Conservative members vote against. *The Gazette*, p. A-15.

Minsky, A. (2011d, February 11). MPs pass bill to shield transgender, transsexual Canadians from persecution. *Alaska Highway News*, p. B-2.

Minsky, A. (2011e, February 11). Transgender rights bill moves to Senate. *The Gazette*, p. A-13.

Minsky, A. (2011f, February 10). House votes to extend protections to transgendered, transsexuals. *Edmonton Journal*, p. 5.

Moreau, J. (2011, February 12). Siksay's transgender rights bill passes. *Burnaby Now*, p. 1.

Scare. (2004). In *OED Online*. Retrieved from http://www.oed.com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/view/Entry/172014?redirectedFrom=scare%20quotes#eid24148539

Bill C-389 (Historical). (2011, February 9). In Openparliament.ca. Retrieved from http://openparliament.ca/bills/40-3/C-389/.

Schilt, K., & Westbrook, L. (2009). Doing Gender, Doing Heteronormativity: 'Gender Normals,' Transgender People, and the Social Maintenance of Heterosexuality. *Gender & Society, 23*, 440-464.

Tait, B. (2011, February 22). MP votes against gender bill; Allen says transgendered people were already protected. *The Bugle-Observer*, p. A-3.

The Record. (2011, February 16). There's no justification for discrimination, p. 6.

The Ottawa Citizen. (2011, February 10). National. Full rights for gender identity, expression. p. 3.

Times – Colonist. (2011, February 10). Transgender, transsexual Canadians protected. p. 9.

Transsexual. (n.d.). In *the Free Merriam-Webster Dictionary*. Retrieved from http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/transsexual

Willox, A. (2003). Branding Teena: (Mis)representations in the Media. *Sexualities, 6*, 407-425.

Young, C., & Boyd, S. (2006). Losing the feminist voice? Debates on the legal recognition of same sex partnerships in Canada. *Feminist Legal Studies, 14*, 213-240.

Timeline of Bill C-389. (2011, March 30). In *Your help is urgently needed to pass Bill C-389!*. Retrieved from http://passbillc389.wordpress.com/the-status-of-the-bill/.

Decelerating Towards Sustainability:

A Dialogue between Ecofeminism, Ecosocialism and Deep Ecology
Kayla Johnson, Sebastian Krammig, and Justin Van Westen

THE PURPOSE OF THIS PAPER IS TO CREATE A DIALOGUE BETWEEN ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology in order to more appropriately address the issue of sustainability in today's world. Within the field of environmental sociology, the concept of sustainability itself is closely related to questions of inequality and has been explored from many perspectives. The three theoretical perspectives with which this paper is concerned all fall on the left side of the political spectrum. Given the social pervasiveness of the neoliberal assumption that infrastructural development and economic growth are the driving forces behind civilization, it is unsurprising that leftist opinions on sustainability and equality are often dismissed as radical and unrealistic. Arguably, this is why ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology have been pushed to the borders of the discourse in environmental sociology, where their influence upon the field has been effectively constrained. However, we contend that ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology each provide useful conceptualizations of sustainability and equality which challenge the established social order and that, when merged, the three perspectives produce fruitful insights that can and should be used to enrich existing literature on environmental sociology.

The sociological dialogue on environmental issues should be expanded in order to develop more well-rounded solutions based on principles of social justice and equality. Lynne Woehrle (2010) discusses the possibility

of achieving change through a multidisciplinary approach, and suggests that the merging of sociological perspectives may be the answer to some of the world's environmental injustices. Thus, the contributions of environmental sociology, ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology, among others, should be allowed to influence our understanding of the relationship between environmentalism and social analysis (Woehrle 2010). Scholars and activists must critically assess whether it is possible to aggregate key concepts such as sustainable development, ecological sensitivity, human dignity and social justice, in order to come closer to societal transformation towards a greener culture. However, many scholars describe how differing perspectives are often pitted against one another within the realm of environmental sociology (Bookchin 1987, Kovel & Lowy 2008, Sessions 1991, Slicer 1995, Salleh 2005). Researchers appear to be more invested in discrediting each other than exploring commonalities between theoretical conceptions and developing strategies which will support a more positive approach to sustainability and environmentalism (Salleh, 2006). Adopting Woehrle's proposition, we strive to identify the similarities between three theoretical positions that, when joined, help to strengthen and give voice to the environmental movement.

In this paper, we will explore the theoretical frameworks of ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology, particularly their relative approaches to sustainability and equality. Furthermore, our dialogue will be organized in a debate-style structure, allowing for a critically-analyzed and well-informed accumulation of information between the three theoretical perspectives. We hope that this dialogue will provide a blueprint for future researchers who seek to develop alternative approaches to sustainability which emphasize equality and structural change, and serve as an example of the fruitfulness of interdisciplinary exchange.

Current approaches to sustainability can be broadly divided into two branches, developmental and social. The developmental approach to sustainability is favoured by dominant institutions such as the United Nations and the World Trade Organization. In 1987, the World Commission on Environment and Development released a report to the General Assembly of the United Nations entitled "Our Common Future" (Brundtland, 1989). This report consistently discussed sustainability in terms of sustainable development, which was defined as "development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their

own needs" (Brundtland, 1989, p. 784). This definition is important to note because it directly associates sustainability with development. Two years after the commission report was released, Brundtland (1989) addressed the issue of sustainability at the 44th Session of the United Nations General Assembly in New York, stating that a key principle in international considerations of environmental questions has been sustainability, "a clear recognition and admission that economic development so far has not been sustainable" (p. 785). Although she calls attention to the lack of sustainable economic development, Brundtland's statement strongly implies that sustainability can ultimately be attained through changes in developmental practices. Meanwhile, the necessity of continued economic development remains unquestioned.

The UN's developmental approach to sustainability closely aligns with what Don Clifton (2010) terms the "reformist-approach" (p.74). According to Clifton (2010), the reformist approach is currently the dominant approach to sustainability in North America and is consistent with mainstream sustainable development around the world. In essence, "[t]he reformist-approach sees the achievement of a sustainable-world in terms of reforming the current dominant socio-economic system through changes at the margin to make this system more environmentally responsible and socially just ('green-and-just')" (Clifton, 2010, p. 75). In other words, supporters of the reformist approach seek to modify developmental practices without altering the capitalist principles that perpetuate the belief that development and economic growth are essential and inevitable. Indeed, Clifton argues, this approach is "inherently resilience eroding and self-defeating" in a number of key respects (p. 74). Most importantly, this is because the reformist approach assumes the following key factors: human needs are met through focusing on the consumption of goods and services that are produced and consumed in green-and-just ways; poverty elimination and human development happens through continuous economic growth in green-and-just ways; ever advancing technology drives growth, improves human wellbeing, and solves negative ecological consequences that could harm human beings (p. 75). Thus, the reformist approach is anthropocentrically biased and based on principles that are inherently unsustainable. Therefore, even a more committed effort to fully execute the reformist approach will not solve the problems of human and ecological well-being that now confront our planet.

In contrast to those who endorse the reformist or developmental approach, proponents of the social approach look beyond the existing social, political and economic structure for more comprehensive solutions to the issue of sustainability. As such, social approaches to sustainability also constitute what Clifton (2010) terms the "transformational-approach" in that they challenge the fundamental beliefs of our current anthropocentric capitalist system (p. 74). For Clifton (2010), the central sustainable world goal is "the flourishing of life, incorporating human and ecological well-being, maintained over an indefinite time frame" (p. 74); this interpretation of sustainability does not focus on development, instead it emphasizes well-being for humans and the environment alike. Rather than struggling to design sustainable goals compatible with the status quo, supporters of the transformational approach "[see] the achievement of a sustainable-world as requiring fundamental and transformational socio-economic system change" (Clifton, 2010, p. 75). Ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology are all social and transformational approaches to sustainability. Despite differences in focus, all three theories reject the band-aid solutions proposed by the reformist approach and emphasize the importance of shifting to a social paradigm which values equality, social justice and well-being.

Ecofeminist:

I will begin the dialogue by taking from an ecofeminist approach to sustainability. In *Ecofeminism*, Maria Mies and Vandana Shiva (1993) introduce sustainability in terms of sustainable development and propose that it has been utilized as an answer to global environmental issues. They contend that economic growth and commercialization have been "offered as a cure for the ecological crisis in the form of 'sustainable development'" (p. 37). As a result, the very meaning of sustainability has been lost (Mies and Shiva, 1993). Similarly, Mary Mellor (1997) argues that, over time, sustainable development has become a conventional idea synonymous with "business as usual" (p. 36). Therefore, ecofeminists argue that it will be impossible to formulate a global solution that will alleviate our planet's ecological and social woes, unless we understand the patriarchal nature of the current capitalist system.

Ecofeminism inherits its fierce opposition to patriarchal systems from its feminist roots. The term "ecofeminism" or "écofeminisme" was coined by the late French feminist Françoise d'Eaubonne, who encouraged women

to "wrest power from 'patriarchal man'" (Mellor, 1997, p. 44). Once this power could be dislodged from the grips of men, d'Eaubonne believed that we would be much more capable of moving towards egalitarian management of the world (Mellor, 1997). Ecofeminism has continued to build upon this foundation, and the theoretical structure contains both a critical analysis of the dominant "patriarchal conceptual framework," and presents a feminist framework that is based in well-known ecological standards. (Sessions, 1991, p. 93). These ecological standards relate to the interconnected reality of nature, meaning that all parts of an ecosystem exist for a reason, are dependent upon one another and therefore should be considered to have equal value (Sessions, 1991).

According to Robert Sessions (1991), value-hierarchical thinking that characterizes patriarchal conceptual frameworks, has given rise to a "logic of domination" (p. 94). This dominance logic has produced a system of inequality where differences are treated as grounds for discrimination and unequal treatment instead of being recognized and respected for the diversity that they represent (Sessions, 1991). This logic of inequality not only alludes to the historical pattern where women were generally regarded as inferior, but also a complex system of social hierarchies. The effects of inequality are widespread and are visible throughout society in terms of racial or cultural relations, age-based discrimination, unfair treatment related to one's financial situation, the list goes on and on. In addition, society's dominant patriarchal devaluation of difference is deeply problematic for sustainability when we consider the ecological reality of interconnection, and the fact that all aspects of ecosystems have value embedded in their diversity (Sessions, 1991). Clearly, equality and respect for diversity are key components in formulating sustainable solutions which will ensure "the flourishing of life…over an indefinite period of time" (Clifton, 2010, p. 74).

In order to ensure human and ecological well-being for now and the future, society desperately requires equality on every level. However, to attain equality we must change the normative, patriarchal conceptual framework upon which our society has been built. Societal logic must shift from one of domination and conflict, to one that embraces diversity, and moving in the direction of progress. I argue that this will allow for more positive, reciprocal relationships to be established both between humans, as well as between humans and the environment.

Ecosocialist:

My collaborator points to equality from an ecofeminist approach as the main impetus to changing our society's ecological balance, and I agree that this is an important aspect of sustainability. In the lens of ecosocialism, however, equality is not just about abolishing patriarchal inequality and thereby establishing the route to a new environmental configuration. From my perspective as an ecosocialist, equality entails the recognition that all levels of inequality emerges out of what Murray Bookchin (1987) calls the origin of ecological degradation. What is to be understood by the idea an origin of ecological degradation is that the environmental crisis is not just a matter related to pollution, deforestation or over consumption, but a social issue that stems from the capitalist system which has become deeply rooted in our society (Bookchin, 1980). Ecological degradation developed through a path of socialized supremacy of man over woman, then man controlling man, which in turn has led to the justified mastery of man over nature (Bookchin, 1987).

Further inequalities are driven by the division of the global North and the global South (Lowy, 2006). According to Cy Gonick (2010), the global South can be equated with Marx's "proletarian" whereas the North can be identified as the "bourgeois," a pattern which speaks directly to the global division of class. Another ecosocialist, Victor Wallis (qtd in Gonick 2010), explains the effects of this inequality: pointing to the similarities between the archetypal proletariat and the poverty stricken South, both stripped of their homes and occupations in the wake of the capitalist dream. We can look to the writers of the "*The Ecosocialist Manifesto*," Joel Kovel and Michael Lowy (2002), for a deeper understanding of the exploitative relationship between the global North and the global South. In their text, Kovel and Lowy clearly demonstrate how the Western powers (mainly the United States) have taken on the role of the global bourgeois by reinforcing their own economic and military power through a subordination of the global South. These global inequalities are not accounted for by the ecofeminist approach. To return to my opening point, inequality must be addressed for environmental sustainability to take hold. However, discussions of inequality must move beyond the basic confines of feminist theory to a much broader, globalized framework which will address the many intersections that complicate human experience: gender, class, and race.

The weakness that I find in the ecofeminist theory is that even though the bifurcation within both gender and class is important, the issue of ecological sustainability cannot change without the deconstruction of the capitalist system (Kovel and Lowy 2002, Lowy 2006, Schwartzman 2009, Gonick, 2010). I argue that the capitalist structure is the source of worldwide inequality and that it creates this disparity through its commitment to the growth of capital by any means necessary (Gonick, 2010). Merrell Singer (2009) directs our attention to "essential features of the capitalist modes of production, consumption, and waste dispersal...[which] contradict long term sustainable development" by emphasizing continual growth and pushing for consumption on a basis of finite resources (p. 127). In other words, capitalism's main directive is growth and it is willing to do anything to achieve that directive. However, the growth model is based on the acquisition of resources which form the basis of the earth's ecological stability, and with over-production, imbalance and inequality almost inevitably begins to occur on a global scale. As the North expects to acquire the resources for their production from the South, the system furthers the imbalance of power by depleting the local resources of many of those already living in poverty.

Ironically, the capitalist construct proposes to solve the environmental crisis by 'greening' the "treadmill of production," thus continuing to endanger ecological sustainability while using the rhetoric of environmentalism (Schnaiberg 1980 p.220; also see Gonick 2010, Lowy 2006,). The longstanding belief that civilization as we know it can only be supported by the capitalist system and the growing awareness that our planet's resources are being rapidly depleted has placed policymakers and environmental reformists in the capitalist conundrum: How can we reconcile a balanced ecological planet with a model of infinite growth? We cannot. Indeed, if we continue to take for granted the levels of production and consumption afforded to us by the current capitalist system, then we not only risk exacerbating global inequality but destroying the ecological basis for continued human existence.

If the biggest barrier to a sustainable future is the current system of production and consumption, then the resolution to the capitalist conundrum is clearly the implementation of ecosocialism. Kovel (2008) speaks of emancipating labour and breaking ties to consumerism, and in doing so, freeing the worker from capitalist constraints. The new ecosocialist society will shift from the infinite growth framework, which propels the unsustainable

capitalist system, and put into effect a limited growth "moral economy" (Lowy 2006, Kovel and Lowy 2002). This "moral economy" would not be based in the market laws of capitalism; instead, it would be a form of democracy founded on the essential needs and priorities of the population that it serves (Lowy 2006). This model would move to an ecocentric practice that could bring social justice and equality to the ecosystem as well as human societies. The "moral economy" exemplifies sustainability through the process of utilizing renewable resources from an ecocentric stance. Once the imperative for profit has been removed, the public will support the development of geothermal, wind and solar power as key energy sources much more readily (Gonick, 2010). Stepping away from the capitalist endeavors that drive our system will allow us to practice a sustainable earth-centered model of energy production which may not generate nearly enough profit to satisfy a market system. To achieve a sustainable future, we must not only address the inequality produced by patriarchy but undertake the systematic socio-economic shift that is required to dismantle the capitalist ideology which privileges development and profit above all else.

Deep Ecologist:

I am not opposed to the contributions of the ecofeminist and ecosocialist positions, as the principle of equality is a key element of the deep ecology movement. Furthermore, several conditions dictated by the capitalistic economic system are incompatible with deep ecological beliefs. However, both ecofeminism and ecosocialism can be considered *shallow* approaches to sustainability; that is, they are extensions of an anthropocentric mentality, which finds reasons for preserving nature in human welfare. In contrast, deep ecology requires that we question the most basic, underlying assumptions of European and North American anthropocentrism. As Arne Naess (1989), the founding father of the deep ecology movement states, the goal is "not a slight reform of our present society, but a *substantial reorientation of our whole civilization*" (p. 45, emphasis in original).

Shallow environmentalists, or reformists in Clifton's terms, aim for sustainable development: trying to make development more environmentally appropriate while still accepting it as an underlying goal. Environmental reformists have done tremendously important work over the last few decades; without them, our natural environment would be in worse condition than

it is now. A vivid example is recycling, an approach of mitigating negative environmental impacts of our throwaway society. Over the last decades, there have been big efforts in many parts of the world to install recycling systems. For example, the European recycling pioneer Germany invested many billions of Euros to establish the world's biggest, most expensive, complex and efficient circular flow management (Charles 1997). According to a comprehensive study by the *Society for Innovation Research and Consulting* (2009), German utilization quotas for glass and paper are as high as 98%, for different plastics the quotas fluctuate between 25% and 60%. For a national recycling system, those numbers are extremely encouraging, and certainly the approach is more environmentally friendly than dumping waste on landfills.

With deep ecology we go beyond such an action oriented approach. That is, instead of dealing with solutions to get rid of vast amounts of waste we produce, we question development itself; which means asking if we need the product that we recycle in first place. It is important to note that deep questioning of the status quo does not make deep ecology an object of the analysis of moral philosophy, nor does the movement aim to be normative at any time (Naess, 1985). Rather, I want to illustrate the descriptive character that makes the deep ecology movement more a worldview than a normative practice, methodology, or moral philosophy (Naess, 1973). To understand the descriptive character of deep ecology and thus my position in this dialogue, it is crucial to apprehend deep ecology's two fundamental tenets.

The first is an axiology of "biocentric egalitarianism," which implies, in principle, the belief in a value system that grants equal rights to all organisms (Keller, 2008, p. 206). The "in principle" is a necessary qualifier because, as Naess (1973) states, "any realistic praxis necessitates some killing, exploitation, and suppression" (p. 95); no biological system can exist otherwise. Every living organism has to sustain itself somehow, inevitably creating some kind of food chain where organisms are both predator and prey, consumer and nourishment. Hence, instead of condemning consumption and exploitation altogether, deep ecology's emphasis on biocentric egalitarianism demands that we respect all living things and take no more from the environment than what we need to survive. In simple words, biocentric egalitarianism is about not over harvesting any resource to allow for your own exuberant debauchery. This simple principle is a key component of both sustainability and equality; in a world where everybody treats life and natural

resources with respect, there will be enough time for resources to regenerate and enough resources to sustain everybody.

The second fundamental of deep ecology is a metaphysical holism that perceives the lifeworld as a collection of "related individuals that make up an ontologically unbroken whole," rather than discrete entities which exist independently (Keller 2008, p. 207). This principle is comparable with ancient East Asian philosophy of interconnectedness and indigenous holistic reasoning, where entities are perceived as interdependent. Importantly, within this holistic approach, the subject is not defined by the border of its body, but rather by its interdependent relations with other subjects and objects. This concept of metaphysical holism, if internalized, inevitably contributes to a sustainable lifestyle in and through equality. For example, imagine yourself connected with your environment in such a way that you perceive your identity as constituted by your relationships with surrounding animals, plants, mountains, air, and water. If you go to the river and catch a fish to satisfy your hunger, that river and that fish are parts of you, they belong to your representation of self. Therefore, you will treat that river and that fish with a different attitude than if you perceive them as entities outside of your self. Since you would also perceive other humans as a part of yourself with this approach, metaphysical holism would naturally lead to more equal and sustainable practices.

As illustrated, these two fundamentals bear crucial implications for our attitude towards sustainability. To be able to live up to the concept of deep ecology, a perceptual shift is inevitable, especially in Western societies where individualistic worldviews dominate. Naess describes that perceptual shift in his "ecosophyT" (Naess, 1989, p. 26), a personal philosophy of eco-cultural harmony. It should serve as a template for other people's personal ecosophies, since to embrace deep ecology is to embrace a worldview. However, that worldview may not look the same for everyone. Rather, one develops a personal worldview or ecosophy based on the own understanding of the tenets of deep ecology. At the core of Naess's ecosophyT lies the concept of "Self-realization" (p. 27-29), which means to expand the dimension of what we call our Self. Self-realization "is the idea that we can make no firm ontological divide in reality between the human and the nonhuman realms. ... [T]o the extent that we perceive boundaries, we fall short of deep ecological consciousness" (Fox, 1984, p. 196). I want to clarify the implications of deep

ecological "Self-realization" for our daily lives by relating this philosophy to Kant's conceptualization of the moral act and the beautiful act (Naess, Drengson, & Devall, 2008). The moral act is tied to duty and obligation; in other words, ethics – the thing you should do, but which is not necessarily in alignment with your personal inclination. The beautiful act is what you want to do owing to intrinsic motivation, but this is often incompatible with ethics. With psychological development towards holism (self-realization), deep ecology now shifts the entire field from ethics to ontology. Once we begin to identify with other humans, animals, plants and all organisms, the moral act (i.e. living sustainably) becomes the beautiful act, because one realizes that biospherical interests are one's own – wanting to live in harmony, aligned with the whole ecosystem, instead of seeing protection as an obligation.

Glasser (2011) notes that intimate, personal knowledge of the environment has become rare in today's wealthy Western countries. Yet, comprehensive understanding of the ecological world in which we live is essential to developing an awareness of the wisdom of valuing that ecological world, and thereby, valuing ourselves. Allowing our future generations "*the equal right to live and blossom* [as] an intuitively clear and obvious value axiom" (Naess, 1973, p. 96) will necessitate radical change – change of a kind that cannot be realized through shallow or reformist approaches. Deep ecology applies to every major contemporary personal, social, economic, political and philosophical problem, and we will need to apply deep transformational approaches in all these fields if we really want to bring sustainability to fruition in its true meaning. Therefore, I want to close this contribution with the words of Albert Einstein who had already recognized many decades ago that "the world we have made as a result of the level of thinking we have done so far creates problems we cannot solve at the same level of thinking at which we created them."

Ecofeminist:

I agree that the deep ecologist's stance on anthropocentrism is warranted, yet there remains a giant shortcoming in adopting this approach. Deep ecology has provided a notable starting point, but the discourse needs to be further developed – something that can be achieved through an ecofeminist approach. Deep ecologists often emphasize that a dualism can be resolved or diminished by giving support to the undervalued component of the pair

(Sessions, 1991). This simply is not the case; for as the ecofeminist stance rightly asserts, dualistic thinking is the real problem, not just what has been undervalued in this model! Robert Sessions (1991) argues that a holistic and deeply analytical view needs to be undertaken to assess the issues on our planet, both socially and ecologically, and contends that this analysis must emphasize the various forms of domination that have taken place throughout human history, and the intimate logical and historical connections between them. Sessions (1991) describes the domination that has taken place in our world as "imperialistic, racist and classist structures and practices," which have been gruesome sources of affliction throughout history (1991, p. 95).

Relating back to the patriarchal conceptual framework that many ecofeminists allude to as the societal structure of inequality, Shiva and Mies (1993) introduce this concept as the "capitalist patriarchal world system" to provide some economic and political depth to this issue (p. 2). Our current global system is responsible for degrading the natural world under the flag of "modernization," "development" and "progress," while also marginalizing women as well as 'foreign' residents and their lands (Mies and Shiva, 1993). This contextualized knowledge of the ecofeminist approach is exactly what deep ecology has misunderstood. As Warren (1994) states, when we look at "the deep ecologist's single-tiered, linear understanding of our environmental problems versus the multi-leveled, "zig-zag" ecofeminist understanding of how our environmental problems are interconnected with and mutually reinforce our social oppressions," it becomes clear that the ecofeminist approach involves a stronger, more inclusive and realistic understanding of the unequal relationship between humans and the environment (p. 38).

The correspondence between history and a destructive, male-centered bias takes this argument one step further (Sessions, 1991). Sessions argues that without the inclusion of the word 'feminist,' environmental ethics exists as if it has no bias (p. 98). This is important because an environmental ethics that excludes feminist from its name also disregards the potency of male gender bias and, as ecofeminism argues, the dual oppressions of women and nature is constituted by male gender bias (Sessions, 1991). The main point here is that ecofeminism is completely opposed to the logic of domination as well as the particular historical values that have culminated in the domination of humans over a particular set of entities (Sessions, 1991). In this way, deep ecology is ignorant of the vast history and context of male-bias, which most

ecofeminists term androcentrism. Sessions further argues, that because this bias is so integrated within our society, there is a deeply masculinist nature of the interconnected forms of domination. This leads most ecofeminists to infer that the main problem here is really androcentrism, rather than anthropocentrism (Sessions, 1991).

Deep Ecologist:

I want to challenge the humanist foundations of the ecosocialist theory. Firstly, the humanist approach that ecosocialism takes in identifying the deconstruction of the capitalist system as an answer to the "flourishing of life" is weakened by the hierarchical constitution that is historically based in capitalist oppression (Clifton, 2010, p. 74). My ecofeminist colleague has already identified the historical context in which the current destructive, capitalist patriarchal world system is rooted. As a deep ecologist, I argue that moving away from a system such as capitalism will merely result in the transfer of former ideologies through support systems. David Johns (2008) frames this well in a question to Kovel and Lowy (2008) by asking how six billion people can be fed without a division of labour. The point I am trying to make here is that simply deconstructing the dominant economic model without implementing the transformational process of Self-realization will most likely result in another system of exploitation and oppression.

Secondly, if ecosocialism is an equality based movement, then why does it follow a strictly human directive? Considering that the consequences of capitalism impact more than the anthropogenic aspects of life, there is a serious lack of attention on the negative implications of our current system for species outside of the human race (Johns et al., 2010). There is a disregard for the interrelatedness of all living organisms that constitute the ecosystem, as has been indicated by the ecofeminist approach. Human beings are no more than one knot in the net of life. In my opinion ecosocialists have the right intentions, but the specifically anthropocentric form of transformation that they pursue leaves much to be desired. For example, coming back to Johns' (2008) question of how to feed six billion people without a division of labour, ecosocialism at no point considers the need to reduce human population in the long term. Every species' propagation in a closed ecosystem is constrained by natural factors, such as the availability of nourishment and space. Inferring from those factors, Catton (1980) coined the phrase "carrying capacity" to

refer to the number of people that the environment can support indefinitely. This debate cannot be ignored, since, until now, we have only managed to extend the world's carrying capacity through the usage of fossil fuels (Catton, 1980). This borrowed carrying capacity will end sooner or later, still leaving ecosocialists with the problem of sustaining humanity.

For the reasons listed above, ecosocialism can only be considered a shallow transformational approach in its current form; one that will not be able to facilitate the achievement of longterm sustainability for all living beings.

Ecosocialist:

Even though the deep ecological worldview includes some convincing points that could be reconciled with ecosocialism as well as ecofeminism, a major issue, which needs to be addressed, is the consequences created by the conviction of equality to all living things from bacterial microbes to charismatic mega fauna such as the blue whale. The assumption that every organism has the same value, makes the philosophy useless for reasoning in case of conflicting interests. Value distinctions are essential for the evaluation of moral situations, since they establish the basis upon which we determine our actions (Keller, 2008). Imagine the following simplified moral philosophical problem: two animals – one is the fifty millionth pigeon, the other is one of the last ten snowy owls that exist – both are in a dangerous situation and you can only save one, what do you do? How can you come to a decision without having a hierarchy of intrinsic values? Following this line of reasoning, we must conclude that the strict deep ecological ideal that all living creatures are equal cannot be usefully applied to realistic life practice. Moreover, the fundamental assumption of extreme metaphysical holism is debatable. Richard Sylvan (1985) puts it quite suitably when he writes:

> Certainly, removing human apartheid and cutting back human supremacy are crucial in getting the deeper value theory going. But for this it is quite unnecessary to go the full metaphysical distance to extreme holism, to the shocker that there are no separate things in the world, no wilderness to traverse or for Muir to save. A much less drastic holism suffices for these purposes. (p. 10)

Here, Sylvan suggests to the reader a less radical approach which maybe more conceivable to the general population. For the vast majority of people it would be difficult to consider one's self as not only equal but part of a singular entity that is one with all living things. For any possibility of success, deep ecology must go beyond a utopian fantasy by developing a less radical approach that can be adapted for practical applications yet still maintain its core values of empathy and respect for all living things.

Finally, I want to point out the structural tensions between biospheric egalitarianism and metaphysical holism (Bookchin 1988). No stable ecosystem, with or without human interference, allows for the prosperous thriving of all species next to each other. Certain species fulfill certain functions in the system and will, therefore, be treated differently by the system; this is the only way to achieve ecological permanence. For example the ecological niche of a species refers to the highly specific role that plays in its ecosystem. Given that the lion is the king of the jungle, it is at the top of the hierarchical food chain and commands the ecosystem in which it lives. Conversely, the role of the field mouse is to be hunted, consequently the species breeds at higher rates in order to sustain its ecological permanence. To further this point, Keller (1997) argues that it is not possible for individual creatures to live in harmony until old age, as in the ideals of deep ecology, for it is not an aspect of many living beings' natural existence nor does it serve the integrity of the ecosystem itself. Through the process of harmonic living, the unfettered population growth in certain species would exceed ecological capacity and, once again, what might have been corrected by "cutting back on human supremacy" (Sylvan 1997) would be over ridden by biospheric egalitarianism. In summary, it can be argued that the entire deep ecology movement is based on two fundamentals that are mutually exclusive. Therefore, deep ecologists should – to use their own terminology – ask *deep* questions about the underlying assumptions of their own philosophy.

CONCLUSION

Using an interdisciplinary approach and comparing ecofeminist, ecosocialist and deep ecologist perspectives on sustainability, we have tried to highlight the fact that all three approaches have idealistic intentions and seek to contest the prevalent capitalist growth perspective. Although ecofeminists, ecosocialists and deep ecologists have traditionally presented their theories as antagonistic and incompatible (Bookchin 1987, Kovel &

Lowy 2008, Sessions 1991, Slicer 1995, Salleh 2005), we found that all three theoretical frameworks envision a sustainable outcome which can be achieved without recourse to development; a goal contrary to how our society functions at present. Ecofeminists, ecosocialists and deep ecologists see the promise of a sustainable future in restructuring those dominant social systems and beliefs which systematically produce inequality. In this way, the three theories we present each outline a "transformational-approach" to sustainability (Clifton, 2010, p. 74), which challenges the fundamental beliefs of our present patriarchal capitalist system and refutes the hegemonic impulse inherent in the idea of sustainable development.

By bringing these so-called radical theories together and exploring their similarities we wish to emphasize, above all, that: The perception of sustainability needs to change! What does the word "sustainability" actually mean now that every corporate homepage has a "sustainability and corporate responsibility" section regardless of how environmentally degrading the company's practices may be? Are we, as a society, ready to commit to long-term sustainability? In other words, do we have the will to envision and actualize a society which will sustain an infinite cycle of reproduction instead of merely slowing degradation and gravitating towards buzz words? If we are prepared to accept a definition of sustainability that implies the never ending flourishing of all life forms (Clifton 2010), it is essential to emphasize the urgency of equality, a central tenet shared by ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology.

We argue that once environmental sociologists have committed themselves fully to the cause of equality, they will, of necessity, begin to question of one of the most unbalanced structures in our society: the economy. We believe that deconstruction of the capitalist system, which has its basis in inequality, would allow for the greatest probability of achieving sustainability. As the first step towards an equitable society, we advocate for a deceleration or slowing of our current destructive habits (modernization, production, consumerism, etc.) in order to create a society that allows all life on earth to maintain well-being over an indefinite timeframe.

In order to achieve a sustainable future, we need to overcome the capitalist patriarchal logic that "men are culture, women are nature" (Salleh 2006); for this mentality rationalizes the economic externalization of women and devalues material surplus generated by women's labor, indigenous labor, and nature itself. Furthermore, ethnographic research conducted around the

world indicates that it is usually women who are specialists in precautionary wisdom and sustainability (Salleh 2006). Thus, better education for women and more opportunities to become involved in global leadership will allow them to contribute valuable knowledge to dialogues on sustainability currently dominated by men (Salleh 2006).

In addition, we need to question more thoroughly the structural reinforcement of inequality within, as well as between, nations. Inherent in capitalism is the economic and social domination by one group over another which, in turn, forecloses the possibility for equality. It is time to rethink a system of growth in the global North that depends on the exploitation of resources and peoples in the global South. Western approaches such as Ecological Modernization (Janicke 1985) and Sustainable Development (Fousekis, Lekakis 1997), which try to resolve the ecological crisis by investing in green technology and leaving the rest to the market, seem to ignore or accept the structural depletion of the South. Social and economic systems that have their roots in hierarchy and domination cannot hope to achieve real long-term sustainability because they consistently fail to account for the needs as well as the productive potentials of those that they exploit or perceive as inferior.

It is undeniable that the environmental discourse has gained new importance and the current green cultural shift could potentially initiate social change, but it is hard to argue that the concurrence of sustainability and equality enjoys broad public appreciation. The trends of greenwashing and green consumerism raise important questions about public perceptions of the root causes and possible resolutions of the environmental predicament. Are we genuinely willing to better the system to allow the flourishing of all humans, future generations and other species, or do we simply intend to buy ourselves a green conscience, sacrificing some spare change rather than our luxurious lifestyle? As Woehrle (2010) suggests, one cannot be "deeply green without addressing the hierarchical nature of our social structure and without rethinking core norms in our culture" (p. 941). As the authors of this paper and representatives of ecofeminism, ecosocialism and deep ecology, we take a firm stance in locating equality at the heart of sustainability; however, this question will continue to be critical for future debates over the meaning of environmental sustainability and how best to achieve it. We hope that the sustainability debate will continue to take place in an interdisciplinary context,

where scholars and activists with a passion for transformative change can work collaboratively to develop creative solutions to the ecological crisis and connect their theories to practical applications.

REFERENCES

Becker, C., Grebe, T., & Kirbach, M. (2009). *The economic importance of the recycling and wastesector in Germany*. Retrieved from http://www.argus-statistik.de

Bookchin, M. (1980). *Toward an ecological society*. New York and Montreal: Black Rose Books, pp.73-85.

Bookchin, M. (1987). Social ecology versus deep ecology, Green Perspectives: *Newsletter of the Green Program Project, 4*(5), 17-26.

Bookchin, M. (1988). Social ecology versus deep ecology. *Socialist Review, 88*(3), 11-29.

Catton, W.R. Jr. (1980). *Overshoot: The ecological basis of revolutionary change*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Charles, D. (Interviewer) & Postoner, M. (Interviewee). (1997, Mar 09). *German recycling*.

[Interview transcript]. Retrieved from LexisNexis Academic

Clifton, D. (2010). Progressing a sustainable-world: A socio-ecological resilience perspective. *Journal of Sustainable Development, 3*(4), 74-96.

Fousekis, P., Lekakis, J.N. 1997 *Sustainable development in Western Europe: Coming to terms with Agenda 21*. Routledge. p. 131-150

Fox, W. (1984). Deep ecology: A new philosophy of our time? *The Ecologist, 14*(5/6), 194-200.

Glasser, H. (2011). Naess's deep ecology: Implications for the human prospect and challengesfor the future. *Inquiry, 54*(1), 52.

Gonick, C. (2010). Exploring ecosocialism as a system of thought, *Canadian Dimension, 44*(5), 36-42.

Heine, S. J. (2008). *Cultural psychology*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company

Janicke, M. (1985). *Preventive environmental policy as ecological modernisation and structural policy*, Berlin: Berlin Science Centre

Johns, D., Kovel, J. & Lowy, M. (2008). Has ecosocialism passed on the tough questions? *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 14*(2), 120-128

Keller, D. R. (1997). Gleaning lessons from deep ecology. *Ethics and the Environment 2*(2): 139–148.

Keller, D. R. (2008). Deep ecology. In *Encyclopedia of environmental ethics and philosophy* (2nd ed.,pp.206-211) Farmington Hills, MI: Macmillan Reference USA.

Kovel, J. & Lowy, M. (2002). House organ, *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 13*(1), 1-157

Lowy, M. (2005). What is ecosocialism, *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 16*(2), 15-24

Mellor, M. (1997). *Feminism & Ecology*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press.

Mies, M. & Shiva, V. (1993). *Ecofeminism*, Halifax, Nova Scotia: Fernwood Publications.

Naess, A. (1973). The shallow and the deep, long-range ecology movement: A summary. *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy and the Social Sciences, 16*, 95-100.

Naess, A. (1985). The world of concrete contents. *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy and the Social Sciences, 28*, 417-428.

Næss, A., Rothenberg, D. (1989). *Ecology, community, and lifestyle: Outline of an ecosophy.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Naess, A., Drengson, A. R., & Devall, B. (2008). *Ecology of wisdom: Writings by Arne Naess.* Berkeley, CA: Counterpoint.

Salleh, A. (1993). Class, race, and gender discourse in the ecofeminism/deep ecology debate. *Environmental Ethics 15*(3), 225-244

Salleh, A. (2006). Moving to an embodied materialism. *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 16*(2), 9-14.

Schnaiberg, A. (1980). *The Environment: From Surplus to Scarcity.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Schwartzman, D. (2009): Ecosocialism or ecocastrophe. *Capitalism Nature Socialism, 20*(1), 6-33

Sessions, R. (1991). Deep ecology versus ecofeminism: Healthy differences or incompatible philosophies? *Hypatia, 6*(1), 90-107.

Singer, M. (2010): Eco-nomics: Are the planet-unfriendly features of capitalism barriers to sustainability? *Sustainability, 2,* 127-144

Slicer, D. (1995). Is there an ecofeminism-deep ecology "debate"? *Environmental Ethics, 17*(2), 151-169.

Sylvan, R. (1985). A critique of deep ecology, part 2. *Radical Philosophy, 41,* 1-22.

Warren, K. J. (Ed.). (1994). *Ecological Feminism.* London, UK: Routledge.

Woehrle, L.M. (2010). Environmental/green cultural shifts: Dynamics of social change. *Sociology Compass 4*(11), 936-946.

Defining a Nation?

Re-inscribing Mythologies of the White Settler Society in the Opening and Closing Ceremonies of Vancouver's 2010 Winter Olympic Games

Amanda Cheong

A CONFLUENCE OF SPORT, COMMERCIALISM, AND DIPLOMACY, THE 2010 Winter Olympic Games in Vancouver were regarded as an opportunity for Canada as a nation to be "reimagined" on a global stage (Anderson, 1991, p. 6; Robidoux, 2002, p. 209). In the carrying out of any "nation-building project," however, certain voices are inevitably privileged, while others are silenced (Gehl, 2003, p. 72). Such power inequalities and discursive acts of exclusion were manifested in Vancouver's Opening and Closing Ceremonies, during which supposedly universal images of the Canadian nation were disseminated for consumption by an international audience (Razack, 2002, p. 1). Despite the fact that the city's bid to host the Games relied heavily upon claims of Canada as a multicultural mosaic, these Ceremonies functioned as a symbolic space in which History was reinvented by the country's predominantly white elite in ways that distorted the contributions of First Nations and minority populations. The Opening and Closing Ceremonies of the 2010 Vancouver Winter Olympic Games upheld Canada's national mythology of the white settler society through the perpetuation of indigenous racial stereotypes, the disproportionate representation of Anglo-Canadian voices, and the blatant erasure of visible minorities from History.

While the 2010 Vancouver Organizing Committee for the 2010 Olympic and Paralympic Winter Games (VANOC) made conscious efforts to represent First Nations peoples in the Ceremonies, the ways in which they were depicted

served to perpetuate stereotypes and gloss over Canada's long history of colonial exploitation. In her review of Indigenous representation in Montreal's 1976 and Calgary's 1988 Games, O'Bonsawin (2010) draws attention to the "paradox between the celebratory promotion of Indigenous peoples within an Olympic context and the everyday lived realities such populations experience in Canada" (p. 147). The orchestrators of the 1976 Games failed to consult or include Indigenous peoples in the planning and performance of the Ceremonies, instead choosing to dress up its 250 non-Indigenous performers to look like "Indians" (O'Bonsawin, 2010, p. 147). Calgary's 1988 Ceremonies similarly "appropriated Indigenous imagery for the purpose of promotional gain," employing symbols such as the headdress and teepee to perpetuate the archetypes of the pioneering cowboy and the wild Indian (McCallum, Spencer, & Wyly, 2005, p. 86; O'Bonsawin, 2010, p. 147). While VANOC made overt attempts to officially recognize that the Games were being held on the unceded lands of the Lil'wat, Musqueam, Squamish and Tsleil-Waututh peoples—an agreement that was formally institutionalized through the creation of the Four Host First Nations Society and other protocols—Indigenous representation in the 2010 Opening Ceremony remained problematic. Though the Ceremony prominently featured First Nations performers, they were exclusively shown wearing traditional costumes and performing alongside the stereotypical symbols of totem poles and drums. Such representations arguably lock First Nations peoples out of popular understandings of a modern, urban Canada, relegating them instead to the sphere of nature and the old-fashioned. Their prominence at the beginning of the Ceremony was immediately contradicted by the "Hymns to the North" sequence that followed, in which the terra nullius myth was implied (Razack, 2002, p. 4). A lone actor was depicted as stumbling upon a "vast [expanse] of open, snow-covered land," suggesting that Canada was a place that was "discovered" in a state of "pristine wilderness" (Razack, 2002, p. 4). This sequence supported the national mythology that Canada came into being at the time of settlement, discrediting the thousands of years prior to colonial contact in which Indigenous peoples inhabited the land.

The ritual of First Nations leaders welcoming the world to their territories obscured the historically-rooted struggles that continue to be waged by Indigenous peoples against the Canadian government (Day & Sadik, 2002, p. 6). O'Bonsawin (2010) situates the "No Olympics on Stolen Native Land" activist movement that emerged during the Vancouver Games within a

long history of colonial struggle over territorial and civil rights between white settlers and Indigenous peoples (p. 146). She points out a disjuncture between the powerlessness of First Nations people in the historical present, and VANOC's fictitious representation of the First Nations as a recognized political institution that holds sway within the Canadian governmental system (O'Bonsawin, 2010, p. 148). Great irony exists in the fact that Indigenous leaders were seen on international television as embracing the Olympics, while Indigenous groups in Canada were simultaneously protesting strongly against the holding of the Games on their traditional land. In relation to this, Coulthard (2007) argues that it is impossible for First Nations peoples to obtain sovereignty in negotiations that occur within the domain and on the terms of the white settler (p. 438). Efforts to gain recognition from the Canadian government merely serve to perpetuate the asymmetrical power dynamic between colonizer and colonized already in place (Coulthard, 2007, p. 440). VANOC's inclusion of Indigenous peoples within the Olympic structural framework served to diminish their autonomy through the further entrenchment of authority and legitimacy within the Canadian state. The First Nations peoples did not hold a large stake in the planning of the Ceremonies, but participated only at the behest of the Games' white-dominated organizational committee (O'Bonsawin, 2010, p. 150).

The Opening and Closing Ceremonies disproportionately featured white figures and voices, implicitly casting only a portion of the demographic as "rightful Canadians." The Olympic Ceremonies are not merely a reflection of national identity, but are sites in which notions of "identity and belonging" are produced and marketed for domestic and national consumption (Wamsley & Heine, 1996, p. 81). The national heroes that were venerated in the Ceremonies—including Wayne Gretzky, Steve Nash, Rick Hansen, Catriona LeMay Doan, Nancy Greene, Neil Young, K.D. Lang, Sarah McLachlan, Donald Sutherland, Bobby Orr, Anne Murray, among others—were conspicuously all Anglo-Canadian. Racial homogeneity was also implied through the uniformly white costumes of the performers in "Hymns to the North," which was actually meant to be a depiction of Canada's immigrant foundation. Furthermore, the "Who Has Seen the Wind?" sequence, which featured a solo white male dancing across the golden prairies, suggested that the "average" Canadian citizen springs from white rural origins. This exclusive veneration

of white Canadians subtly enforces the notion that race is a crucial factor in determining who is and is not a true Canadian.

Despite widespread criticism that the Opening Ceremony was racially unrepresentative, the Closing Ceremony marked a further departure from the reality of the heterogeneous makeup of Canada's population with its reinforcement of clichéd national stereotypes. Symbols such as the Royal Canadian Mounted Police, lumberjacks, beavers, moose, canoes, maple leaves, and hockey players were deployed in ways that concretized the notion that there is a universal set of Canadian values (Robidoux, 2002, p. 212). The monologues by William Shatner, Catherine O'Hara, and Michael J. Fox served to discursively flatten out internal differences in Canada by affirming a "collective imagination" of Canadians as monolithically polite, beer-swilling, hockey-obsessed nature-lovers (McCallum, Spencer, & Wyly, 2005, p. 88). Shatner interweaved the naming of supposedly Canadian values with descriptions of the country's "stunning sunsets...rocky mountains... and glaciers," establishing the parallel of both the white Canadian identity and the country's physical geography as natural and eternal. This grand narrative of Canada as a "white settler society" correspondingly neglected the existence and contributions of the country's visible minority citizens (Razack, 2002, p. 1).

The Opening and Closing Ceremonies made invisible Canada's immigrant populations through the exclusion of immigrant narratives, and the lack of visible minority representation among performers. The Ceremonies noticeably excluded any mention of Asian-Canadian culture and history in a country that has been profoundly shaped by its sizable Asian population (Mar, 2007, p. 13). This exclusionary reconfiguration of History disregarded the hundreds of years of discrimination and marginalization experienced by Asian-Canadians, the contributions they have made to the construction of the nation in its formative years, and their continuing presence and influence in present-day Canada. In her content analysis of Chinese-language Canadian newspapers that circulated between 1914 and 1945, Mar (2007) uncovers an alternative narrative of Canadian history as told by Chinese immigrants (p. 13). She shows that Chinese-Canadians were not merely passive subjects of discrimination, but were actively engaged in political mobilization against oppressive governmental measures, such as the Chinese Head Tax (1885-1924) and the Chinese Immigration Act (1923-1947) (Mar, 2007, p. 16). In light of her

findings, Mar (2007) criticises mainstream historical accounts of Canadian history that underestimate, or outright fail to acknowledge, the involvement of the Chinese in Canadian affairs (p. 34). The Ceremonies can be regarded as examples of such accounts that Mar (2007) attacks in her work (p. 34). Not a single cultural reference to Chinese or other ethnic groups was made, as the Ceremonies focused mainly upon its bilingual heritage. Though English and French are Canada's official national languages, as was demonstrated in the Ceremonies, the country's linguistic and ethnic diversity extends far beyond this dualism.

The "whitewashing" of the Canadian nation through the choice of programming in the Opening and Closing Ceremonies sparked heated reactions within the local community (Yang, 2008, p. 80). Journalist Craig Takeuchi, in an editorial piece for the *Georgia Straight* on 1 March 2010, pointed out the discrepancy between VANOC's claims of liaising closely with First Nations peoples, and the fact that the Ceremonies "[segregated] First Nations people into one segment in the opening ceremony and then [forgot] about them after that." *Vancouver Observer* correspondent Cathi Atmadjaja wrote on 19 March 2010 that "the exclusion and making invisible of diverse communities that represent the ethnic composition of Vancouver today were clearly manifest during the Opening and Closing Ceremonies of the Olympics held in Vancouver," and that "addressing the social issues of discrimination is necessary to achieve institutional completeness, which is the groundwork for achieving a multicultural society." She reported that the messages of "racial discrimination" in the Ceremonies prompted the creation of a formal dialogue on "racial profiling and systemic discrimination" that involved Vancouver city councillors, the Minister of Citizen Service and Minister Responsible for Multiculturalism and the Public Affairs Bureau of British Columbia, students from Kwantlen University and the University of British Columbia, and Sikh community leaders. Gary Hershorn reported for CBC News on 18 February 2010 that prominent members of the South Asian and Chinese communities made formal complaints about the Opening Ceremony's failure to showcase Canada's diversity—a disservice not only to the excluded racial groups, but to the reputation of the nation as a whole. Such critiques within the mass media signify attempts to change hegemonic definitions of Canada from below, as individuals and civil society groups challenged the legitimacy and representativeness of VANOC.

Nation-states and national histories are not fixed entities, but rather are social constructs that undergo constant discursive imagination and negotiation (Anderson, 1991, p. 6). The 2010 Winter Olympics in Vancouver provided a space for national meanings to be produced and mass-communicated to a worldwide audience. While Canada has officially moved away from its fixation on race towards more liberal and universalist definition of what it means to be a Canadian, such historical conflations of race and nation continue to persist into the twenty-first century. Within the nation-building project embedded in the 2010 Olympics, the unequal racial dynamics between white, minority, and Indigenous peoples were made to seem natural and unchanging. Stereotypical representations of First Nations peoples and culture, the erasure of immigrant populations from Canadian history, and the conflation of whiteness with being Canadian served to re-inscribe the mythology of Canada as a white settler society. Such a discriminatory and narrow conception of the nation did not go unquestioned, however, as individuals and groups mobilised in order to proffer alternative national meanings. In order to resolve Canada's ethnohistorical tensions in ways that acknowledge, rather than erase, history, stakeholders from all groups that make up the country's diverse population must be given a voice in how their stories are to be told to an international audience. This ongoing contestation of what it means to be Canadian is a testament to the subjective and fluid nature of notions of race and national identity, leaving open the possibility of a more truly inclusive and multicultural future for Canadian citizens.

REFERENCES

Anderson, B. (1991). Imagined communities: *Reflections on the origin and spread of nationalism*. London: Verso.

Atmadjaja, C. (2010, March 19). Panelists decry signs of racism in Opening Ceremonies of 2010 Olympic Games. Vancouver Observer. Retrieved from http://www.vancouverobserver.com/politics/2010/03/19/panelists-decry-signs-racism-opening-ceremonies-2010-olympic-games.

Coulthard, G.S. (2007). Subjects of empire: Indigenous peoples and the 'politics of recognition' in Canada. *Contemporary Political Theory 6*, 437-460.

Day, R.J., & Sadik, T. (2002). The BC land question, liberal multiculturalism, and the spectre of Aboriginal nationhood. *BC Studies 134*, 5-34.

Gehl, L. (2003). The rebuilding of a nation: A grassroots analysis of the Aboriginal nation-building process in Canada. *Canadian Journal of Native Studies 23*: 57-82.

Hershorn, G. (2010, February 18). More visible minorities at closing, VANOC hints. CBC News. Retrieved from http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/british-columbia/story/2010/02/18/bc-visible-minorities-olympic-ceremonies.html.

Mar, L.R. (2007). Beyond being others: Chinese Canadians as national history. *BC Studies, 156,* 13-34.

O'Bonsawin, C.M. (2010). 'No Olympics on stolen native land': Contesting Olympic narratives and asserting indigenous rights within the discourse of the 2010 Vancouver Games. *Sport and Society 13,* 143-156.

Razack, S. (2002). *Race, space, and the law: Unmapping a white settler society.* Toronto: Between the Lines.

Robidoux, M.A. (2002). Imagining a Canadian identity through sport: A historical interpretation of lacrosse and hockey. *Journal of American Folklore 115,* 209-225.

Takeuchi, C. (2010, March 1). 2010 Olympic closing ceremony: Why wasn't there any Aboriginal content? Georgia Straight. Retrieved from: http://www.straight.com/article-295558/ vancouver/2010-olympic-closing-ceremony-why-wasnt-there-any-aboriginal-content.

Wamsley, K. & Heine, M.K. (1996). Tradition, modernity, and the construction of civic identity: The Calgary Olympics. *Olympika: The International Journal of Olympic Studies 5:* 81-90.

Yang, Y. (2008). Observing the world from the perspective of multi-culture in Canada. *Journal of Politics and Law 1,* 79-83.

Hockeyville, Canada:

Demographic Analysis of a Symbolic Geography

Esteban Izquierdo

INTRODUCTION

The game of hockey holds an iconic place in Canadian national identity as the country's pastime. Hockey Night in Canada is no less iconic, consistently rating as the most-watched Canadian television show (Digital Home). Given this set of conditions, the recognition as "Hockeyville" carries with it a symbolic stamp of 'Canadian-ness'. CBC's 'Kraft Hockeyville' is a television series which airs in segments through the flagship 'Hockey Night in Canada' show. It pits Canadian towns in a competition that rewards the winning locale with C$ 100,000 for ice-rink upgrades, as well as a visit from two National Hockey League (NHL) teams for a pre-season game in the local arena. More importantly perhaps, the winner earns bragging rights over the whole nation for a year, earning the title of "Hockeyville" (CBC, 2011). The show is a collaboration between the CBC, Kraft, the NHL, and the NHL Players Association (NHLPA). An in-house panel chooses, according to undisclosed criteria, the top ten applications. Out of this selection, the public then gets to vote an unlimited number of times, online or by phone (CBC, 2011).

In this paper I look at certain demographics of these yearly ambassadors of our national game in order to get a better picture of who lives in these 'Hockeyvilles'. Through an exploration of population density, visible minority and aboriginal identity rates, mother tongue, educational achievement and median income, I attempt to bring forth an intersectional picture of

the idealized community of Hockeyville. These specific demographics were chosen in order to explore the roles of 'race' and class, of the rural/urban divide, and of course the quintessentially Canadian topic of official languages, in the active creation of our national identity. In order to do this, I have averaged the statistics for the the first six winners of the Kraft Hockeyville show (starting in 2006) and compared the resulting composite town with the same categories for Canada as a nation. I follow the logic that if hockey is "Canada's game", a symbol of national identity, then 'Hockeyville' itself becomes a symbol for Canadian society. Through the association of national identity to the sport in question, the term Hockeyville denotes a representation of the Canadian nation. My research intends to shed light on how accurate this representation actually is by comparing the demographic composition of Hockeyvilles to the multicultural make-up of the larger Canadian populace.

LITERATURE REVIEW:

A common foundational thread within the literature around the game of hockey and its place in Canadian national identity is based on the conception of nations as imagined communities. The creation of a national identity is seen as a process of communal imagination in which diverse populations through extensive territories come to see themselves as a national community through socially constructed fictions, such as television (Anderson, 1983). For the most part, the literature reviewed takes for granted the influence hockey has on our national identity. Rather than questioning it, the literature teases out different aspects of this relationship.

Patricia Cormack, in her study of the ties between the Tim Hortons coffee chain and Canadian identity (2008), picks up on the media's ability to continually replicate the tie between our national identity and the game of hockey. The racial aspects of the sport are explored through her discussion of a 'True Story' in which hockey is portrayed as a vehicle for the assimilation of immigrants (Cormack, 2008, p. 378). This particular commercial starts with a young Chinese-Canadian boy being discouraged by his immigrant father from playing hockey. It then flashes to his adulthood, as he watches his own son playing in full-gear in an ice rink. At the end, the story comes full-circle as his elderly father joins him at the sidelines with a cup of Hortons's coffee and full of pride for his Hockey-playing grandchild (Statistics Canada). Implied in Cormack's discussion of the ties between hockey and the donut chain lies

a testament to how integral the game is to national identity: It is so much so that other symbols of "Canadian-ness", such as Tim Hortons coffee, are solidly built upon it.

This understanding of hockey as a 'Candianizing' ritual is also seen in an analysis of the 2006 Edmonton Oilers' playoff run which highlights how "throughout [the playoffs], the print media articulated the importance of hockey for assimilating immigrants into Canadian culture" (Scherer and Davidson, 2010, p. 167). A college teacher, for example, was shown in the *Edmonton Journal* teaching new immigrants an appreciation for Canadian culture by explaining the game (Statistics Canada). This aspect of assimilation begins to illustrate the role of 'race' and the normative aspects of white Canadian culture in the active creation of our national identity.

Allain focuses on how Hockey's place in Canadian identity shapes national understandings of masculinity, bringing attention to ways in which the machinery that creates 'Kraft Hockeyville' affects the national gender discourse. Her work highlights, for example, the way in which the "notion of appropriate masculinity is frequently tied" to a working-class ethos through Hockey (2010, p. 13). She discusses the CBC's controversial and iconic commentator Don Cherry's claim that he molded (NHL superstar) Sidney Crosby into "a model of Canadian hockey masculinity" through his harsh criticism (Statistics Canada, p.15). Appropriate gender performance is thus directly tied to an idealized 'Blue Collar' national imaginary.

Between these works a pattern starts emerging in which, "to be a nation who plays hockey means to understand...Canadian as being raced (namely white), classed (namely middle-class), gendered (namely boys and men) and sexualized (namely straight)" (Allain, 2010, p. 8). There is agreement in the literature that this is the image being sold. The fact that hockey remains as the symbol of our society, despite how much Canada has changed since this identification was originally promoted, is shown as a sign of the continued domination of Canadian society by "certain groups of white men" (Adams, 2006, p. 82).

Adams states that "narratives about hockey...evoke small-town and rural Canada - Canada at its whitest" (2006, p. 75). This connection between race and geography, which harkens back to the budding, frontier-era decades of the nation and its white, European settler origins, is picked elsewhere. A study of sports tourism and place identity for example, deconstructs the 'Heritage

Classic' match between Edmonton and Montreal, an outdoor hockey game spawned by the NHL (not unlike the 'Kraft Hockeyville' show). It describes outdoor rinks (reminiscent of Adam's rural, 'whitest Canada'), as the church for the nation's religion (hockey) and "a place for fantasy and mysticism... distinctly Canadian" (Ramshaw and Hinch, 2006, p. 404). In this work, however, a contradiction becomes evident: while the romantic pond rink stays cemented in the national imaginary, in actuality it has been thoroughly replaced by the indoor rink, ubiquitous in most Canadian municipalities (Ramshaw and Hinch, 2006, p. 401). Here we see a glorification through Hockey of the rural, outdoor Canadian landscape, despite the fact that at least 80% of the nation's population now lives in urban areas (Human Resources and Skills Development Canada).

Another contradiction present between the nation's understanding of hockey and its perception of self, is explored by Robidoux in his encompassing historical analysis of the role of the game in our identity. He delves into the aggressive aspect of the game and exposes the divide between our international perception as peace keepers and the "ferocity, speed, and violence [of]...Canada's primary national symbol" (2002, p. 209). Robidoux' text is perhaps the most complete analysis of how this symbol came to be. His work supports Allain's (2010), as he thoroughly discusses the role of masculine (originally Native) identity in the development of hockey's popularity and its enshrinement as national culture (2002, p. 220). His conclusion, if expanded to include the racialized aspects of the game, could neatly wrap the sentiment of the literature here reviewed:

> "Canada's history is located firmly in patriarchy, heterosexism, and capitalism; thus the use of hockey to promote national pride and unity was not random then, nor is it today. Playing hockey is a means of constructing an image of a nation in the manner in which dominant forces within it wish to be seen" (Robidoux, 2002, p. 222).

The literature shows the power of the iconic game in shaping several crucial aspects of our national identity. Given that the annual winners of the 'Hockeyville' contest serve to represent a particular image of Canada, I wish to deconstruct this imaginary against our national reality.

DATA AND METHODS:

All information regarding the 'Kraft Hockeyville' show, including previous winners, contestants, and show rules, was obtained from both the NHLPA and the program's official websites (NHLPA, CBC). All demographic information was obtained from Statistics Canada, utilizing the "Community Profiles" search engine (2011). I chose to use information from the 2006 census due to the fact that it coincided with the debut of the show, giving a more accurate representation of the entire sample than the more recent 2011 census. To better understand the cultural and ethnic make-up of these 'Hockeyvilles', I explored and averaged the towns/cities' total populations, number of immigrants, total 'visible minority' population, 'aboriginal identity' population, and 'mother tongue' (English only, French only or other language[s]). I also looked at educational attainment and median income after tax. Finally, because there was no urban/rural specification in the census data, I looked at population density under the logic that higher density is more likely in an urban community, while lower density can be correlated to rural communities, as there was no such specification in the census data.

As the demographic information for a composite 'Hockeyville', to which I arrived by averaging the demographic information for the six locales in question. The data for this imagined community is then compared to the numbers for Canada as a whole in order to pit this fictitious geography against our national reality. The use of Vancouver is meant to provide a local context for the information.

FINDINGS

Table 1.(Statistics Canada, 2011) * All six winners averaged together. ** Persons over 15 years and over.

Demographic Comparison	Hockeyville*	Canada	Vancouver
Population	22,576	31,612,897	578,041
immigrants	7.3%	19.6%	45.1%
Visible Minority	3.1%	16%	50.5%
Aboriginal Identity	6.3%	3.7%	1.9%
Mother Tongue: English Only	72%	56.6%	47.6%
Mother Tongue: French Only	19%	13.1%	1.6%
Mother Tongue: Other Language(s)	6.2%	20.4%	49.5%
University Certificate, Diploma or Degree**	10.28%	18.1%	33.2%
Median Income After Tax** (C$)	23,080	23.307	21.896
Population Density per Square Kilometer	63.4	3.5	5,039

As the demographic information for all six 'Hockeyvilles' is analyzed, a clear pattern emerges. The List of previous winners, starting in 2006 is: Salmon River, NS., North Bay, ON., Roberval, QB., Terrace, BC., Dundas, ON., and most recently, Conception Bay South, NL. As I averaged these towns into one imaginary, symbolic 'Hockeyville, Canada', the population statistics agreed with much of what was discussed by the literature reviewed. The results were almost exactly what I had expected to find:

The composite 'Hockeyville, Canada' would be a considerably small town, with a population just above 22,000. In its ethnic make-up, 'Hockeyville, Canada' would be white by a large majority. In fact, the immigrant make-up of the town would be almost three times under the national average. The 'visible minority' population would be five times less than the national average. These results are in accord with my initial expectations, as well as with the literature that touched upon the racialized aspects of hockey as a white Canadian game (Adams, 2006, Allain, 2010 and Cormack, 2008). With regards to immigration in 'Hockeyville', the significantly lower average as compared to the rest of the nation is not surprising giving the assimilationist discourses present within the Hockey imaginary (Cormack, 2008, Scherer and Davidson, 2010).

A component of the ethnic identity of 'Hockeyville, Canada' that countered my initial expectations, was the fact that the 'Aboriginal Identity' (First Nations, Inuit, Metis) population in the composite town is almost double than the national average. As I have expressed, I expected an all-around 'whiter' community. I initially interpreted this result as being tied the links between native culture and the adoption of the game as a national symbol as discussed by Robidoux (2002). Upon further thought, however, I believe that this can be connected to the fact that Canada's Aboriginal population has been less urbanized than the rest of the country's demographics. While, as mentioned before, 80% of Canadians now lives in an urban environment, slightly over 50% of the country's Aboriginal population resides in cities (Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development Canada).

Understanding language as a cornerstone of national culture, the results in this category fulfilled my expectations. The history of 'official language' debates plays a central role in Canadian identity. The dominant role of English, despite the country's bilingual identity, does so as well. In accordance, the average 'Hockeyville' community is an Anglo community by a far higher degree (72%) than the nation's average (56%). I expected this based on the

fact that 'Hockey Night in Canada' is an English-language show. It is of interest that Canada's other charter language, French, is also represented to a higher degree (19%) than in the national average (13.1%). Non-charter languages as 'mother tongues', on the other hand, tallied at less than three times the national average. The results in this category show a 'Hockeyville' that is more Anglo and French, and decidedly less inclusive of other languages, and subsequently cultures, than the rest of the nation.

Given the results, I would consider the class make-up of 'Hockeyville, Canada' to be decidedly 'working-class' (in agreement with Allain's work). I base this on the fact that the town would have a lower level of university education (slightly over half of the national level), yet it's average income would only be C$ 227 short of the national median. These numbers agree with the myth of Hockey, and by extension Canada, as a 'blue collar' game and country.

Finally, based on the population density, it would be safe to say that 'Hockeyville, Canada' would be a rural geography. Its density of 62.4 people per square kilometer cannot be properly weighed against the national average (3.5 p/sq.k.), which is skewed by our large, sparsely habited territory. When compared to the context of Vancouver, however, 'Hockeyville' can be seen as decidedly low-density, a demographic phenomenon predominant in non-urban centers. This geographic characteristic is in agreement with what Adams (2006), Ramshaw and Hinch (2006), and Robidoux (2002) have to say with regards to idealized hockey locales. While we are clearly an urbanized country, this result shows Canada's attachment to the symbolic open landscape that shaped its identity since pre-confederation times.

FURTHER DISCUSSION AND LIMITATIONS

While I agree with the idea that the position of the game of Hockey within our national identity upholds the Canadian *status quo*, I believe that the picture that the game tries to consistently recreate, through 'Hockeyville' for example, distorts our national reality. Here are some reasons why.

There is a clear gap in the literature in that it does not acknowledge the ways in which people of color have appropriated the game, both as players and fans, challenging the 'white sport' image of hockey. Scherer and Davidson come closest to bridging this gap with their mention of three players of Afro and First Nations descent, although they are framed as a "select few" (2011, p. 13). While the game's players are white by a large majority, players of color

are growing as a minority in the NHL. From my familiarity with players as a hockey fan, I could list more than forty examples looking at the league's rosters (National Hockey League, 2011). Ray Emery and Wayne Simmonds (both of Afro-descent), Manny Malhotra (Indo-Canadian), Richard Park (Korean) and Jordin Tootoo (Inuk) are just some of the more recognizable names out of this growing list. These players are ignored by most of the literature, and underplayed in amount, impact and significance in the one reading that mentions them (Scherer and Davidson, 2010). While this could be attributed to the fact that this opening of the game towards players of color has been fairly recent, all of the literature reviewed is contemporary (except for Robidoux, 2002, all other texts are from the past five years).

Even more invisible in the literature is the role of fans of color in the game today. My personal experience in attending games and communal events (such as the public broadcasts of playoff games outside of the CBC) is that the fan base, at least in Vancouver, is as multicultural as the city itself. This might be a local phenomenon, but it should be further studied. The 'Hockey Night In Canada - Punjabi Edition' broadcast was a sign of this heterogenous fan base. While currently cancelled by the CBC due to their inability to find a sponsor (Allick, 2011), the broadcast successfully ran for three seasons. The show's cancelation has been a cause for organization in the city's South Asian community (Statistics Canada). Regardless of the success or failure of the campaign, the situation attests to how people of color also see the game as theirs. This is a stark challenge to the the picture painted by the literature which shows hockey as a game for and by white people.

Although Robidoux deals with the role of Aboriginal Canadians in the creation and popularization of the game, their presence is also minimal in the literature. While it is too big a topic to embark upon in this paper, the role of Aboriginal Canadians (First Nations, Metis and Inuit) within the country's national imaginary needs to be addressed further in order to tease out their place in the game, past and present, and its implications both for Aboriginal and national identity.

Issues of gender are explored in the literature through an analysis of the game and its role in the national construction of proper masculinity, there is a clear absence of women in the literature, and the symbolic image of Hockey. Despite our incredibly successful National Women's team, there is no female major Hockey league to compete against (or perhaps complement) the

all-male NHL. This issue of women and gender in professional sports goes beyond Hockey and is another large topic that could be further investigated to compliment the research I have presented.

Finally, the literature hinted at the growing disconnect between the national myth of Canada as a rural wilderness, and the nation's increasing urbanization. The idealization of rural Canada, reflected in the fact that every winner of 'Hockeyville' has been a 'small town', leaves room for theorizing around the prevalence of this imaginary. The issue of socio-economic status, deeply connected to urbanization, shows a similar disparity between reality and myth. Is Canada truly a 'blue-collar' nation? Why is this class ethic perpetuated and tied to national identity? And, how does this fit with the fact that Hockey has become a multi-million dollar business based around large urban centers? These are some of the further inquiries that my research brings up.

One limitation for the data that must be acknowledge is the fact that, although I used 2006 census information, there was an exemption. For Dundas, ON. (Hockeyville 2010), I used data from the 2001 census, due to the town's incorporation into Hamilton, ON. later that year. Also, educational information for Dundas was not averaged with the other winners due to census question differences between 2001 and 2006. This needs to be taken into consideration when reading and comparing data.

CONCLUSION

This research established that there is a well-documented and generally accepted tie between the game of hockey and Canadian national identity. The literature explained how this national symbol is composed of an imaginary that portrays Canada as a rugged, working-class, white, masculine nation, largely defined by its interaction with a physically-demanding outdoors. As Robidoux notes, the game as national symbol also speaks "to issues of gender, race, ethnicity, and region...albeit not in an entirely positive manner" (2002, p. 219). While this identity portrayed by hockey is more reminiscent of a frontier-era Canada, the imaginary has been kept alive "despite decades of tremendous social change" (Adams, 2006, p. 72) through the game and its archetypes (the hockey hero, the hockey town, the frozen pond, etc.). The television show 'Kraft Hockeyville' is a perfect example of how the national media both preserves (through repetition) and guards (through their say in who is worthy to compete) this national symbol in its past and present form.

While there is a democratic component to the crowning of 'Hockeyvilles', and this would speak more towards a popular incorporation of the national imaginary than elite manipulation of Canadian identity, the voting process does not constitute a truly representational choice at the end. Out of hundreds of applications, it is an undisclosed panel which chooses the handful of towns that the public will get to vote for in a process with no specific guidelines. Also, the fact that voting is unlimited and call charges apply further distorts the idea of a democratically-elected 'Hockeyville'. The choices then seem to reflect an imaginary shaped both from above and below. This is of great interest given the fact that for years now, both Hockey fans and players have moved past the mythological trappings of 'Hockeyville' as an imagined community.

The success of 'Kraft Hockeyville' (six seasons and running, increased prize money) points to the fact that the 'Hockey Night in Canada' public, wether in conscious agreement or not, are part of the cultural machinery that perpetuates a very specific national image. This image clearly represents a "particular mythology of Canadian identity" (Scherer and Davidson, 2010, p. 159), as the show ties our national game to rural, working-class, largely white, largely anglophone locales. This 'particular mythology' continues to affect the construction of our Canadian identity as it seeks to represent the entire nation through the demographic characteristics of the symbolic geography that would be the composite 'Hockeyville, Canada.'

REFERENCES

Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development Canada. (2012) *Fact Sheet - Urban Aboriginal Population in Canada*. Retrieved from http://www.aadnc-aandc.gc.ca/eng/110010001429 8/1100100014302.

Adams, Mary Louise. (2006). The Game of Whose Lives? Gender, Race and

Entitlement in Canada's "National" Game. In Whitson, David and Richard Gruneau (Eds.), *Artificial Ice: Hockey, Culture and Commerce*. (pp. 71-84). Toronto, ON: Broadview Press.

Allain, Kirsti A. (2010). Kid Crosby or Golden Boy: Sidney Crosby, Canadian National Identity, and the Policing of Hockey Masculinity. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*. 46.3, 3-22.

Allick, Chantaie. (Oct. 27, 2011). Fans Fight for Hockey Night in Punjabi. *Toronto Star*. Retrieved from http://www.thestar.com/news/article/1077022 .

Anderson, Benedict R. (1983). Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism. London, UK: Verso.

Canadian Broadcasting Corporation. (2011). *Kraft Hockeyville* . Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/hockeyville/home/en/index.shtml .

Canadian Broadcasting Corporation. (2011). Kraft Hockeyville 2011 Competition Rules. Retrieved from http://www.cbc.ca/sports/hockey/hockeyville/rules/en/index.shtml .

Cormack, Patricia. (2008). "True Stories" of Canada: Tim Hortons and the Branding of National Identity. *Cultural Sociology. 2*, 369-384.

Digital Home. (2012). *Top TV Shows in Canada are all American.* Retrieved from http://www.digitalhome.ca/2010/06/american-tv-shows-sweep-top-10-in-canada-2/.

Human Resources and Skills Development Canada. (2012). *Canadians in Context: Geographic Distribution.* Retrieved from http://www4.hrsdc.gc.ca/.3ndic.1t.4r@-eng.jsp?iid=34.

National Hockey League. (2011). *Players.* Retrieved from http://www.nhl.com/ice/playersearch.htm

National Hockey League Players Association. (2011). *Kraft Hockeyville.* Retrieved from http://www.nhlpa.com/News/Kraft-Hockeyville/ .

Ramshaw, Greg and Tom Hinch. (2006). Place Identity and Sport Tourism: The Case of the Heritage Classic Ice Hockey Event. *Current Issues in Tourism. 9.4-5,* 399-418.

Robidoux, Michael A. (2002). Imagining a Canadian Identity Through Sport: A Historical Interpretation of Lacrosse and Hockey. *Journal of American Folklore, 115.456,* 209-225.

Scherer, Jay and Judy Davidson. (2010). Promoting the 'Arriviste' City: Producing Neoliberal Urban Identity and Communities of Consumption During the Edmonton Oilers' 2006 Playoff Campaign. *Sociology of Sport. 46*(2), 158-180.

Statistics Canada (2006). *Community Profiles.* Retrieved from. http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfmLang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Colchester, Subd. C, Nova Scotia (Code1210001). 2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *North Bay, Ontario (Code3548044)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE.) Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Roberval, Quebec (Code2491025)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Terrace, British Columbia (Code5949011)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved fromhttp://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/ index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada . (2001). *Community Profile for Dundas.* Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/ english/Profil01/CP01/DetailsPage.cfmLang=E&Geo1=CSD&Code1=3525026&Geo2=PR&Code2=35&Data=Count&SearchText=dundas&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=All&Custom= .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Conception Bay South, Newfoundland and Labrador (Code1001485)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/ 92-591/index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Canada (Code01)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved from http://www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfm?Lang=E .

Statistics Canada. (2007). *Vancouver, British Columbia (Code5915022)* (*table*). *2006 Community Profiles. 2006 Census.* (Catalogue no. 92-591-XWE). Retrieved from http:// www12.statcan.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/92-591/index.cfm? Lang=E . Accessed Oct. 18, 2011.

About the Authors

Aᴺɪᴛᴀ Sᴇʜᴀɢɪᴄ ʜᴀs ɢʀᴀᴅᴜᴀᴛᴇᴅ ᴡɪᴛʜ ᴀ ᴅᴏᴜʙʟᴇ ᴍᴀᴊᴏʀ ɪɴ Sᴏᴄɪᴏʟᴏɢʏ ᴀɴᴅ German at UBC after having spent two years on exchange in Freiburg, Germany, and is now looking to pursue graduate school. She has served as Co-Vice President External of the Sociology Students' Association, Undergraduate Student Representative in the German Department, and Teaching Assistant in the Department of Sociology. Anita's research interests include consumption, education, media, phenemenology, social psychology, post-structuralism, culture, and sustainability. Outside of academia, she enjoys reading for herself, exploring nature, and being a travelling pants. She is very grateful for the experience she has gained through Sojourners and would like to thank all the people who were involved in the process, especially, Seb, Nina, and Jasmin :)

Sᴀᴍ Mᴀʀᴋʜᴀᴍ ɪs ᴘᴜʀsᴜɪɴɢ ᴀ Bᴀᴄʜᴇʟᴏʀ ᴏғ Aʀᴛs ɪɴ Sᴏᴄɪᴏʟᴏɢʏ ᴀɴᴅ Cʀᴇᴀᴛɪᴠᴇ Writing at the University of British Columbia. Her main research interests include LGBT issues and the social construction of gender. She writes young adult and children's fiction that includes positive representations of LGBT individuals, and she intends to publish these works as mainstream fiction.

Aᴍᴀɴᴅᴀ Cʜᴇᴏɴɢ (sᴇᴇ ᴘᴀɢᴇ 85.)

Kᴀʏʟᴀ Jᴏʜɴsᴏɴ ɪs ᴀ ᴛʜɪʀᴅ ʏᴇᴀʀ sᴛᴜᴅᴇɴᴛ ᴀᴛ UBC ᴡᴏʀᴋɪɴɢ ᴛᴏᴡᴀʀᴅs ᴀ major in Sociology with a minor in Environment and Society. Her upbringing in the West Kootenays instilled in her a deep passion for protecting and preserving the environment from human degradation. In the future Kayla hopes to pursue a career in environmental law with an emphasis on First Nations Law, Natural Resource Law and an aim towards global sustainability. With only one more year of undergraduate study left, Kayla is excited to fulfill her responsibilities with the Sociology Students Association as VP Internal next year.

Sᴇʙᴀsᴛɪᴀɴ Kʀᴀᴍᴍɪɢ ʀᴇᴄᴇɴᴛʟʏ ꜰɪɴɪsʜᴇᴅ ʜɪs B.A. ɪɴ Sᴏᴄɪᴏʟᴏɢʏ ᴀɴᴅ Psychology while on exchange at UBC from Freiburg, Germany. His focus lay in exploring the ecological human-environment predicament, particularly examining perceptions at the intersection of society and the individual. Pursuing a life philosophy of holistic reasoning, Sebastian intends to build bridges between the arts and sciences to help establish a more comprehensive understanding of pressing ecological issues through his graduate project.

Jᴜsᴛɪɴ ᴠᴀɴ Wᴇsᴛᴇɴ ɪs ᴀ sᴇᴄᴏɴᴅ ʏᴇᴀʀ sᴛᴜᴅᴇɴᴛ ɪɴ ᴛʜᴇ Fᴀᴄᴜʟᴛʏ Aʀᴛs ᴀᴛ ᴛʜᴇ University of British Columbia. He is working towards a minor in Sociology while directing his focus towards a Bachelor of Social Work. He strives to focus on Social Justice on a local and global scale while working within the framework of Anti-Racism and Anti-Opression. For the last seven years, Justin has worked locally in the field of addiction and support care with people who have been marginalized, and left to struggle with homelessness and barriers like mental health and addiction.

Esᴛᴇʙᴀɴ Iᴢǫᴜɪᴇʀᴅᴏ ɪs ᴀ Cᴏʟᴏᴍʙɪᴀɴ-ʙᴏʀɴ Cᴀɴᴀᴅɪᴀɴ ᴇɴᴛᴇʀɪɴɢ ʜɪs ꜰᴏᴜʀᴛʜ year of studies at UBC, working towards a Sociology major and a Latin American Studies minor. His research interests center around 'race' and ethnicity, nationalism and national identity, cultural sociology, immigration (in particular from South to North America), social movements, and youth movements. As a young immigrant to Canada, deeply interested in sports, he faced a lot of surprised looks when he quickly grew to love hockey. This awoke an interest in the ties between hockey (and organized sports in general) and perceptions of national and ethnic identity.

About the Editors

Linda Chan is a fourth year student majoring in Sociology with a Health and Society Minor. She is interested in immigration, race and ethnicity, identity politics, and the social factors involved with the promotion of health. Outside of her academic life, she enjoys swimming, learning new languages, and vegan cooking. Since the 2010 Winter Olympics, she is developing her interest in hockey, and occasionally enjoys watching Hockey Night in Canada with friends.

Yun-Jou Chang (see page 87.)

Sasha Duncan has attained a Bachelor of Arts in Sociology, and has been involved with the Sociology department over the past year as the PR Rep. Her focus has been mainly gender and sexuality topics. She hopes to pursue a career in writing and has had several articles published in various 'lifestyle' webzines. Sasha was recently accepted into Vancouver Film School and plans to study screenwriting there in the coming year.

Melody Lotfi graduated from the department of Sociology in 2011. She is currently working as a Research Assistant at UBC.

Laurel Rogers is in the third year of her English Honours degree at the University of British Columbia. Although she has only taken one "Sociology" course in her academic career, she has taken theory courses which have directed her interest towards the intersections between postcolonial theory and literature, specifically science fiction. When not frantically reading novels or writing essays at UBC, Laurel can be found down at False Creek, paddling with her dragon boat team, One West. Laurel has found the experience of working with Sojourners to be extremely exciting and a

wonderful learning opportunity, and she hopes to bring all her new skills and a fresh perspective to Volume 5 as Editor-in-Chief.

Anushka Samarawickrama is in her fourth year of the Sociology program and is grateful for being given the opportunity to be part of the Sojourners editorial team for the last two years. After completing her degree next year, she plans to commence her studies in Human Resources Management as part of her goal of specialising in change management and corporate learning and training. In her spare time, Anushka enjoys experimenting with new recipes, making travel plans and avidly leafing through IKEA catalogues.

Anita Sehagic has graduated with a double major in Sociology and German at UBC after having spent two years on exchange in Freiburg, Germany, and is now looking to pursue graduate school. She has served as Co-Vice President External of the Sociology Students' Association, Undergraduate Student Representative in the German Department, and Teaching Assistant in the Department of Sociology. Anita's research interests include consumption, education, media, phenemenology, social psychology, post-structuralism, culture, and sustainability. Outside of academia, she enjoys reading for herself, exploring nature, and being a travelling pants. She is very grateful for the experience she has gained through Sojourners and would like to thank all the people who were involved in the process, especially, Seb, Nina, and Jasmin :)