SOJOURNERS

VOLUME 11

SOJOURNERS
UNDERGRADUATE
JOURNAL OF SOCIOLOGY
Volume 11 2019

Published by the UBC Sociology Students' Association (SSA) of the University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Sojourners: Undergraduate Journal of Sociology is a peer- and faculty- reviewed journal published annually by the Sociology Students' Association of the University of British Columbia. Our mandate is to provide a venue for the publication of outstanding undergraduate writing. Submissions are accepted in the fall of each year. Information regarding sub-missions, journal sales, and more is available on our website. For more detailed information about manuscript submission, please contact us.

Contributors

Acknowledgements

Letter from the Faculty Advisors

Dear *Sojourners* readers,

We are excited for you to enjoy Volume 11 of *Sojourners*. Undergraduate journals such as this one allows students to practice the craft of turning ideas into reality. Each of the articles selected for this publication profiles original sociological research and diverse forms of critical thinking in fields ranging from social movements to media to gender. Just as important as the end product is the blind peer-review process that each author and member of the editorial team participated in—a core scholarly practice central to academic excellence and integrity. As always, this year's publication offers an extremely valuable window into the rigorous scholarship of undergraduate sociologists at UBC and beyond.

Sincerely,

Elic Chan and Katherine Lyon
Faculty Sponsors
Sojourners

Letter from the Editors-in-Chief

Dear Readers,

We are pleased to present to you the 11th edition of *Sojourners*, UBC's Sociology Undergraduate Journal. Having received over 50 stellar essay submissions this year, it was once again no easy task to decide on the final handful for publication in the 2018/2019 volume. But once again, we are proud of the final eight papers that have been selected through a blind-review process from our editorial and faculty board, and we are confident that you will find as much value in them as we have.

Over the years, one of the key factors that has guided *Sojourners'* selection process has been a mindfulness of our place in academic discourse. Among other values, *Sojourners'* treads a discursive line, occupying a unique space within the realm of sociological academia. Being an established academic journal, we seek to share with our readers publications which display rigour in both thought and research. But being an undergraduate journal, we recognize a certain level of freedom in sharing not only rigorous, well-argued research, but also work whose importance is informed by their relevance and, often, their exploratory nature. As such, a real theme of 'resistance' tends to emerge, and we hope that you will find this year's edition of *Sojourners* proves to be no exception.

In this volume, Bachand-Bergeron examines the cultural space occupied by *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*, as well as its place within a tradition of neoliberal-informed media content. Samchee undertakes a qualitative approach to revealing some of the most salient themes of the migration process to Canada. Drawing on indigenous cultural and medical knowledge, Pavelich argues for a holistic and spiritual understanding of health as a means of addressing the harm caused by colonialist policies in Canada. Holmes evaluates current discourses around the contested topic of uniformed police presence in Pride parades, while Seufert evaluates the complex queering potential of substance use in LGBTQ+ populations. Lee exposes the global production paradox of how the dangerous state of mica mining informs the standards of hegemonic Western beauty. Fatima brings a critical eye to the disjunction between discourses of secularism around Bill 62 and its effects of promoting structural inequality. And lastly, Lougheed examines the nature of media framing around Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. These papers all share a critical outlook on some of the most relevant and important social and cultural challenges we are faced with today. They are issues which may appear discreet, or at times even personal, but they are in fact embedded in much wider

social and structural processes, and it is the aim of this volume of *Sojourners* to reveal as much.

Sincerely,

Curtis Seufert and Andy Holmes
Co-Editors-in-Chief
Sojourners

Table of Contents

2019

FRANCESCO DUINA
SCHOLARSHIP WINNER

Exploring Activist Framing in Vancouver's Uniformed Police Debate: Should Police March in Pride Parades?

Andy Holmes
University of British Columbia

Abstract. How do people defend their opinions regarding uniformed police marching in Vancouver's Pride parade? A sample of 100 comments were analyzed from two competing online petitions that both sought opposite action to take regarding the presence of uniformed police in Vancouver's 2018 Pride parade. The first petition was created by Black Lives Matter Vancouver and requested police to not wear their uniforms when marching in the parade. The second petition was created by activists to include uniformed police in the parade. Those who support including uniformed police in the parade frame their stance in six ways: protection, change, community, inclusion, and Black Lives Matter as Hateful. On the other hand, those who do not support uniformed police defend their stance through the frames of: origins of Pride, ongoing violence, oppressive institutions, solidarity, and safety. These frames contribute to literature on social movement framing and infighting within LGBTQ communities by demonstrating ways people frame their stance of uniformed police marching in Pride parades. This paper ultimately analyzes implications such frames pose in order to make larger theoretical arguments about limitations to collective LGBTQ social movements.

Introduction

On November 29th, 2017 the organizers of Vancouver's annual Pride parade announced that uniformed police officers would no longer be allowed to march in upcoming parades (Bedry 2017). Taking effect for the 2018 parade the following year, this decision ended the presence of uniformed police at the Vancouver Pride parade, who had been marching in uniform since 2002 (Pride in our Progress 2017). Other large Canadian cities, including Calgary, have mandated police to march in only plain clothes, alongside Toronto, which banned uniforms in 2017, and Halifax and Ottawa, whose police voluntarily agreed to participate without uniforms (Hamilton, 2017). In both Vancouver and Toronto, the request to remove uniformed police in Pride parades have come from the work of lesbian, gay, bisexual, trans, and queer (LGBTQ) members of Black Lives Matter (BLM), a transnational organization and social movement starting in 2013 whose goal is to end racialized, state-sanctioned violence against black people.

One of the main reasons behind these decisions has been the reaction to statements from activists since 2016 that the presence of uniformed police symbolizes state-sanctioned violence towards members of the LGBTQ community who are racialized, impoverished, transgender, sex workers, or disabled (Vancouver Pride Society 2017). In Vancouver, on July 15th, 2016, BLM released an open letter to the organizers of the Pride parade initially requesting that police could participate in the 2016 parade in uniform as part of a public service float but not as an individual entry. BLM Vancouver stated that an individual float "represents the police force as an institution that. . . remains fundamental to the perpetuation of structural violence against Black and brown bodies in North America." (Black Lives Matter Vancouver 2016). When organizers of Vancouver's Pride parade continued to allow police to march in the 2016 parade as part of the City of Vancouver, BLM Vancouver then created a petition in February 2017 titled "Remove the police from the Vancouver Pride Parade" which requested police to march in plain clothes. In response, some have accused BLM for having "[hijacked] the Pride agenda" (Blatchford 2016) in their request for police to march without uniforms, prompting the creation of a counter-petition titled "Pride in Our Progress" to maintain a uniformed police presence in Vancouver's parade.

Although uniformed police inPride parades has been a subject of debate, little research has been conducted on this topic. In this research study, I explore ways in which people on both sides of the debate frame themselves to the general public. My research question is the following: how do people frame whether or not they believe uniformed police officers should be included as participants of Vancouver's Pride parade? This research question will contribute to knowledge on LGBTQ social movements through framing theory (Benford & Snow, 2000., Rholinger, 2002) by deciphering the ways in which people frame the presence of police in Pride parades (Russell, 2017). Understanding such framing in Pride parades offers a case study of how larger discourses (Foucault, 1972;

Graham, 2005; Fairclough, 2003) are shaping contemporary directions in LGBTQ social movements. In the subsequent portions of this paper, I provide a brief overview of literature on social movement and framing literature, followed by reviewing literature on uniformed police in Pride parades. I then provide an overview of my methodology taken in this research study, followed by a discussion of my research findings. I find six different ways on both sides of the debate of how people frame their support, or lack thereof, of uniformed police in Vancouver's Pride parade. This study ultimately asks people interested in queer politics to reconsider broader theoretical questions about the relationship between intersectionality and infighting in LGBTQ social movements (Crenshaw 1989; Armstrong, 2002; Ghaziani, 2008; Ward, 2008; Mecca, 2009). I argue that these frames pose challenges for future LGBTQ social movements through debates regarding the use of a collective LGBTQ action frame.

Literature Review

Framing Theory

Understanding how people frame the debate of whether or not uniformed police should march in Vancouver's Pride parade requires understanding basic tenets of framing theory. Framing theory proposes that social movements present meanings to the public that encourage particular ways of thinking to understand an issue (McAdam, 1996; Benford & Snow, 2000; Rohlinger 2002). A central component to framing is about making a message resonate (Benford & Snow, 2000) with the public in hopes that it will enact appropriate social change. Another fundamental aspect to framing theory is a three-step process that first involves identifying a large problem, followed by identifying solutions and figures responsible for, often, an injustice, ending with a call for action (Rohlinger, 2000; Klandermans, 1997). Through this three-step process, social movement actors attempt to influence the general public to adopt desirable frames that persuade them to reconsider an issue and take appropriate actions.

Framing issues in desirable ways can help social movements persuade mass audiences of people to mobilize action and enact social change in ways that past social movement literature were limited in doing (Benford & Snow, 2000). Benford and Snow state that theory in social movement literature tended to ignore the importance of social movement members' agency by prioritizing "structural arguments...rather [than] movement actors." (p. 613). Up until the 1980s, the two dominant structural theories in social movement literature were deprivation theory (Smesler, 1962; Spilerman, 1971) and resource mobilization theory (McCarthy & Zald, 1977; Jenkins, 1983). Deprivation theory posits that social movements happen when basic human needs, for instance, income, food, or shelter are not met, which therefore leads people to taking actions to address these in-

equalities. Resource mobilization theory proposes the opposite: social movements can only happen when people have the ability to participate due to resources that might include financial security or social networks (Wilkes, 2004). What framing theory argues is that studying social movements cannot rely merely on structural explanations for individual behaviour. Rather, individuals demonstrate agency through carefully crafting messages they wish to articulate to the public. While framing theory is often applied to analyze how social movement organizations frame issues in the mass media, such as the debates on abortion (Rohlinger, 2002), the Idlenomore movement (Moscato, 2016), and gun control (Steidley & Colen, 2017), other scholars use framing theory outside a media context to focus on how activists compete with oppositional groups. Such cases can be seen with environmentalists (Martinez 2009), navigating alternative masculinities (Goicolea et al. 2014) and with debates on sex workers' rights (Jackson, 2016). Similar to those who use framing to discuss activist debates on social issues, I focus on the ways in which people debate the presence of uniformed police in Vancouver's Pride parades.

Given these points, the ways in which people frame the contesting of uniformed police in pride parades demonstrates larger theoretical contributions to larger LGBTQ social movements.

Uniformed Police in Pride Parades

Research on what frames people use to justify their stance to either support or reject police in Pride parades remains underdeveloped. Furthermore, there is limited research done on how people frame debates regarding the same social issue through analyzing comments in petition data. Only within the last couple of decades, with the rise of the internet, has petition data become available for scholars to analyze. In particular, analyzing petition comments can provide a way of understanding how people invested in sociopolitical issues express and justify their stances on controversial topics (McNeill; & Thornton, 2017). With this in mind, only within the last few years have scholars begun to write about uniformed police marching in Pride parades (Russell, 2017; Lamusse, 2016), therefore validating the need for future research. One exception is a study from 2008 (Gillespie) that focuses on cross-sectional survey data at Atlanta's 34th Pride parade evaluating attendees' satisfaction with police officers. Gillespie found "no significant differences in mean satisfaction with... different gender or racial groups" (p. 635), contrary to what the general public might expect in 2018. Gillespie's project sought to see if gay, lesbian and bisexual people's attitudes towards police officers had changed 35 years after the Stonewall Riots (at the time the study was done). The Stonewall Riots in 1969 were a series of events in New York city that occurred when patrons of the Stonewall Inn, a gay bar, resisted and fought back against violent police who attempted to arrest them (Duberman, 1993). Most scholars who study LGBTQ social movements attribute the Stonewall Riots for having started what would later become Pride parades (D'Emilio, 2002; Arm-

strong & Crage, 2006). Knowing this, Gillespie's findings indicate what seems to be a major shift in attitude towards police officers from gay, lesbian and bisexual people. Incidentally, this shift is indicative of one of the petitions analyzed in this study to defend keeping uniformed police, titled "Pride in our Progress."

On the other hand, recent publications indicate resistance to the idea of progress through debates over the presence of uniformed police in Pride parades. The first study by Emma K. Russell (2017) is a textual analysis of newspaper sources and books regarding how Australian police use "image work" to frame themselves to the public in desirable ways by negotiating a historically homophobic identity. Russell concludes by stating that police rupture the idea of their homophobic history by presenting themselves to the public through a more positive narrative of "institutional progress" (p. 290). This use of "image work" closely aligns with Goffman's notion of dramaturgy and impression management (1959) by demonstrating ways people present desirable frames of themselves to the public (Ma, 2017). In a second piece on uniformed police in Pride parades, Lamusse (2016) analyzes an attempt to thwart uniformed police from marching during Auckland, New Zealand's 2015 Pride parade by an Aboriginal activist group called "People Against Prisons Aotearoa." Here, Lamusse analyzes infighting within LGBTQ social movements by arguing that:

> Pride has been domesticated. Unlike Stonewall, Pride does not represent a threat to the settler colonial cisheteropatriarchal capitalist police order. Instead, it is an opportunity to gather revenue from tourism and, for those invested in the police order, to promote their rainbow-friendliness (p. 59).

From this quote, Lamusse argues that Pride parades have strayed away from the radical activism at the root of Pride protests and the 1969 Stonewall Riots in New York City. Furthermore, Lamusse points to the idea that Pride parades nowadays are invested in maintaining police authority through promoting a façade of LGBTQ friendliness. Here, investing in the police order demonstrates the normalization of the legitimate use of police authority (Weber, 1909) in ways that elicit what queer racial scholar Jasbir Puar terms "pinkwashing" – the rebranding of oneself as pro-LGBTQ in order to conceal their oppression towards other groups of people (2012). This concealment is used to understand how some people frame whether or not uniformed police should march in Pride parades (Lamusse 2016; Russell 2017).

Methods

Petitions can offer both quantitative data (in the form of signature counts) as well as qualitative information (in the form of comments) that signees may leave when supporting a social cause (Briassoulis, 2010; McNeill, & Thornton, 2017). Benefits to using petition

data include the degree of anonymity that can be provided through the medium of the internet—allowing people to use abbreviations of their names or initials if their privacy is important to them. This is especially important with petition comments which supply the reasons for why someone chooses to support a social cause. Furthermore, unlike surveys, where participants are contacted by researchers, petition data is comprised of social movement activists who are passionate about the causes they sign. This is significant because petition signees represent those who are most interested in engaging in social change, and therefore, constitute those most representative of the viewpoints of a particular social issue.

In order to find answers to how people frame their stance on whether or not uniformed police should march in Vancouver's Pride parade, I did a content analysis of two competing public online petitions started in 2017 directed at the organizers of Vancouver's Pride parade. The first petition was created by BLM Vancouver in February 2017 titled "Remove the police from the Vancouver Pride Parade" (Black Lives Matter, 2017) and requested that police march in plain clothes. At the time of writing, this petition had 1029 signatures and exactly 50 comments from people explaining why they signed. The second petition was made by Vancouver activists under the name "Pride In Our Progress" (2017), titled "Our Pride Includes the Police," and had 6076 signatures at the time this was written, and exactly 150 comments from people explaining why they signed. This petition called for Vancouver's Pride parade to keep the presence of uniformed police. In both these petitions, signees had the option to type a comment to explain their "Reasons for signing," which I analyzed to understand how people frame their stance on the presence of police in Vancouver's Pride parade.

I gathered comments from these two petitions on March 18th, 2018. Although these petitions existed in the public domain, I decided to refrain from using the names of commenters out of respect for the sensitive nature of this topic. With that being said, because both these petitions are ongoing, there is a chance that people may later sign the petition and add more comments. However, I suspect this will only be the case with "Our Pride Includes the Police" considering their petition is especially applicable with regards to police being required to remove their uniforms in Vancouver's Pride parade as of 2018 at the time this paper was written. Because there was in total 150 comments for "Our Pride Includes the Police," I took a random sample of 50 comments, taking every third comment in the petition. By taking every third comment, I attempted to minimize any selection bias I might have had as a researcher extracting comments that I might personally find provocative. Furthermore, by taking every third comment, I attempted to reduce any bias signees' may have had by writing something similar to the comment immediately before them. In terms of BLM Vancouver's petition, "Remove the police from the Vancouver Pride Parade," I decided to analyze all 50 comments in order to provide a balance in comments analyzed between the two petitions. Additionally, both petitions had pictures and descriptions of their petition presenting their own frames which signees would have read before leaving a comment. I also later compared the petition creators' own frames to

see if their frames differed from how commenters framed their own stance on police.

Taking 50 comments from each petition, I then carried out a content analysis using a mixture of open and analytic coding to develop thematic categories (Maxwell, 2013; Glesne, 2016). I analyzed each comment in my sample from both petitions with open coding to first jot down anything that stood out, even if these were not shared by all commenters (Babbie & Benaquisto, 2010; Strauss & Corbin, 1990). During open coding, I wrote jottings of anything that I thought could merit further analysis. Next, I analyzed all comments at an aggregate level and grouped them based on my jottings into larger themes. In this process of analytic coding I grouped together jottings into categories if that idea was mentioned at least five times in the comments data. Eventually, I arrived with six categories for both petitions in my analytic coding stage. In my last stage of analytic coding, I then collapsed two categories from each data set that I deemed to be too similar to constitute categories of their own, making five categories for each petition. These categories were the theme of "Vancouver Police Department as Gay-Friendly" which got merged into the theme of "Progress" (later renamed to "Change"), and the theme of "Continual Violence towards Indigenous Peoples, Black People & People of Colour" which was collapsed into the theme of "Uniform Symbolizes Violence" (later renamed to "Ongoing Violence"). After I finished my analytic coding, I deciphered five frames that people from both petitions used to justify their stance on uniformed police in Pride parades (see appendix 1 and 2).

Results

"Our Pride Includes the Police"

People who signed the petition in support of uniformed police in the parade used five different frames to advance their stance to the organizer's of Vancouver's Pride parade: 1) Role of Protection, 2) Change, 3) Our Community, 4) Inclusion, and 5) Black Lives Matter as Hateful. These frames collectively demonstrate counter-frames to Black Lives Matter and their supporters in an effort to justify why they believe police have earned their presence in Vancouver's Pride parade.

Using the frame of police officer's "role of protection," people drew upon notions that police are welcomed in Pride parades because they have earned their presence by fulfilling a role to protect members of society. Consider this excerpt from one commenter who states, "[in] the spirit of inclusion, recognizing the members for their service to the community, the contribution and collaboration to keep the city safe for everyone," it demonstrates the point that police are welcomed in the parade because they represent safety. Further to this, under the frame of "Change," commenters described how uni-

formed police belong in Vancouver's Pride parade because the police have taken specific steps to ensure amicable relationships with the LGBTQ community. Take for example the following comment that states,

> "Having Police participate, in uniform, as an institution, in the Pride Parade is not oppression. It is a remarkable testament to progress that has been, and is being made, for the equality rights of all people. It is precisely because the Pride movement was born in violence and LGBTQ and other people have been, and still are, oppressed by Police, that their participation is a victory to be celebrated."

In this quote, police are framed as having progressed away from their violent history towards LGBTQ people by being present in the parade in their uniform. What is intriguing about this quote and the frame of the "Role of Protection" is that these also seem to invoke counter-frames generated in response to the oppositional group. As I discuss further in this paper, police are in fact criticized in the other petition for being an "institution" that continues to "oppress" LGBTQ people today and deny their "safety". Counter-frames are discussed in social movement literature to have profound effects on people by creating competing ideas of the same situation, therefore compelling audiences either negate the other frame, or deny both altogether (Aklin & Urpelainen, 2013). This idea of a counter-frame further aligns with what Alinsky states as a strategic protest tactic that "makes the enemy live up to their own book of rules" (p. 256). In other words, by using the frames of the opposition, the frameworks of institutions and safety are challenged.

The next frame people tended to use was this idea of supporting police on behalf of "our community". While at first this frame might appear relatively simplistic, I argue that it is crucial to understanding longstanding discursive debates on who gets to speak on behalf of an entire community. Who is included in the "our" portion of community? This question invokes larger questions about the viability of a "collective action frame" (Klandermans, 1997) that can be taken to be representative of an entire, assumingly homogeneous LGBTQ community. Judith Butler states that "a discursive formation... of representational politics" (Butler, 2006, p. 3) is impossible because people have intersecting identities that challenges there being a singular community in which "our" can be representative of. This idea of "our" therefore attempts to mobilize political action on behalf of an imagined community (Anderson, 1991) that is contested when thinking about intersectional differences (Crenshaw, 1989) within the LGBTQ community on the axes of race, class, gender, sexual orientation or disability, for instance.

Subsequent to the use of "our community" to frame why a police presence in Vancouver's Pride parade is justified, commenters invoked the frame of "inclusion". A common idea among members of the LGBTQ community is this idea of unconditional acceptance, which is characterized by one commenter who states, "Love is love... whether black, white, brown, orient, Muslim, catholic, gay, bi, transgendered. This parade is about

inclusiveness and should stay that way." In this frame of "inclusion," people who signed the petition argue that Pride parades are ultimately rooted in the idea of inclusion irrespective of one's background. This frame is also strategically placed within the context of Alinksy's notion of making the opposition "live up to their own book of rules" (p. 256) by appealing to the idea that Pride is about acceptance irrespective of one's identity.

Lastly, members who signed the petition to keep uniformed police in Vancouver's Pride parade drew upon critiques of Black Lives Matter through a frame I term to be "Black Lives Matter as Hateful". In this frame, members of BLM Vancouver are cast as antagonists to all of the four previous frames, threatening the sanctity of positive change and relationship-building between police and the LGBTQ community. As two people's comment put it:

> No one should be excluded. BLM lost any claim to any moral ground when it used the killings at the Quebec mosque as a platform to further attack, including attacking the prime minister as a racist. Bullying a community event for one's own social justice warrior purposes is not acceptable. Let the police march and be part of it all.

> The Pride Parade should be focused on inclusion, not exclusion, and not cater to the agenda of a small minority of hateful individuals.

In passages, the commenters position BLM Vancouver as hateful bullies appropriating concerns about police racism through their commentary of an Islamophobic terrorist attack by a white shooter named Alexandre Bissonnette who shot and killed six Muslims praying inside their mosque (Page, 2018). Furthermore, what is significant about one of these quotes is the idea that "BLM lost any claim" to critique police in Vancouver, which is echoed in the petition's original description that signees would have read. The original petition states, "Black Lives Matter Vancouver. . . reflect historic and ongoing injustices against the black communities in major American and Eastern Canadian cities, they do not reflect relationships between Vancouver's LGBTQ communities with local law enforcement." (Pride in Our Progress 2017). What is significant about this frame is evidence of Charles Tilly's notion of a "wronged population" (1995). According to Tilly's idea of a "wronged population," social movements are composed of people who experience some form of deprivation, which provides a degree of legitimate action to be taken. Furthermore, considering that one of the comments notes that BLM Vancouver is composed of a "small minority of hateful individuals," we can apply this framing to understand Tilly's idea of W.U.N.C (1995). Referring to worthiness, unity, numbers and commitment, Tilly proposes that the success of a social movement is contingent on these criteria. By stating that only a "small minority" of people are supportive of BLM, those who support uniformed police frame BLM Vancouver as lacking enough substantial support to be taken seriously.

Similar to how commenters on the petition of "Our Pride Includes Our Police" discussed these five frames, the description of the petition itself also happened to invoke all of these frames except for the "role of protection". The petitions description strategically used the words of "our community" and "diversity and inclusion" which "signifie[d] the progress" and change police officers made while also positing BLM Vancouver's appropriation of external sources of racism.

Furthermore, what also differed between the petitions description and the comments from those who signed it, was that the original petition included a picture of a police officer in uniform holding two thumbs up and smiling at the camera. As alluded to earlier in my literature, this picture depicts what Russell would argue as "police image work" (2017). Police image work describes the positive portrayal of police to alleviate a once negative identity, which draws closely upon what I argue to be Goffman's notion of impression management (1959). After all, framing embodies aspects of the dramaturgical self by presenting to specific audiences (in this case the organizers of the Pride parade) certain desirable ways of approaching a debated topic. By analyzing these five frames people use to justify including uniformed police in Vancouver's Pride parade, we can better understand such perspectives within their given social movement contexts.

"Remove the Police from the Vancouver Pride Parade"

People who signed the petition in support of removing uniformed police in the parade also used five frames to advance their stance to the organizer's of Vancouver's Pride parade: 1) Origins of Pride, 2) Ongoing Violence, 3) Oppressive Institutions, 4) Solidarity, and 5) Safety. These frames draw attention to continual challenges faced by members of the LGBTQ community that warrant a critique of police officers for perpetuating social inequalities.

People who wanted to remove uniformed police from Vancouver's Pride parade proposed the frame of paying attention to the origins of pride. According to this logic, because Pride parades originated as places of resistance against police violence targeting LGBTQ people, it is inappropriate for police to be celebrated when they continue to be violent towards some members of the LGBTQ community. According to one commenter:

> Pride was originally a riot against police treatment of LGBT people, lead [sic] by black trans women who were most affected. In the past century since, there has been a continued specific negligence and brutality by police officers to people of colour and trans people (exemplified by the growing statistics in the states and even here in Canada with all the murdered and missing indigenous women) who deserve to feel safe at pride, as they are essential to our community. I don't think it's respectful to have this history with important leaders of

our community and refuse to take off a uniform, and it feels like marching in
a parade started by those targeted by police negligence and brutality is some
sort of sick joke.

In this quote, the fact that Pride parades started as riots against police violence
targeting LGBTQ people, especially black trans women (most notably Marsha P. Johnson)
is important from a historical social movement perspective. Marsha P. Johnson was a trans
black woman who is widely attributed to being one of the most prolific activists behind
mobilizing protests in response to the 1969 police raid of the Stonewall Inn. Sylvia Rivera,
another prominent activist, is also regarded as the figure who 'threw the brick' that started
the Stonewall Riots. She was a Latina trans woman that worked as a survival sex worker
who was also incarcerated in male prisons[1].

Historian Susan Stryker notes in *Transgender History* that immediately following
the 1969 Stonewall Riots, a heterogeneous group of LGBTQ activists formed the Gay
Liberation Front and was comprised of gays, lesbians, bisexuals, transgender people, the
working- and middle-class, and people of colour (2008). However, it is also known that
following the formation of this group, as sociologists Elizabeth Armstrong and Suzanna
Crage note, "the movement took shape [by] center[ing] the experience of upper-middle-
class white gay men and marginalized the concern of less-privileged individuals" (2006,
p. 744). As a result of this fraction, it was particularly young male white middle-class
activists that broke apart from the Gay Liberation Front to form the Gay Activists Al-
liance, which sought to reform laws rather than engage in more radical activism (Stryker,
2008). In addition to the formation of the Gay Activists Alliance, the Gay Liberation
Front further dissolved into the creation of the Street Transvestite Action Revolutionaries
to address the needs of impoverished black and Latino trans street youth, while lesbians
who were not welcomed in the Gay Activists Alliance branched off to join women's
movements (Stryker 2008).

These examples of fragmentation or infighting within incipient queer organizations
demonstrate how social movement actors will choose to either suppress or emphasize
aspects of their identity. In "Celebration and Suppression: The Strategic Use of Identity
by the Gay and Lesbian Movement" (1997), Bernstein argues that depending on a social
movement organization's structure, the type of opposition, and access to politics, this
shapes whether or not a movement celebrates difference or suppression. In her article,
Bernstein compares and contrasts activists in Oregon vs. activists in New York City.
The activists in Oregon were primarily white middle-upper class businessmen who chose
to suppress their differences because they were seeking narrow legal professions within
their workforce, whereas in New York, activists who sought to add "sexual orientation" to
anti-discriminatory policies were primarily working-class people. Bernstein's findings are
applicable to the previous case of fragmentation within the Gay Liberation Front where

---

[1]For more information regarding Marsha P. Johnson and Sylvia Rivera, see Susan Stryker's *Transgender
History* (2008).

members who formed the Gay Activists Alliance rejected seeking radical change, and rather sought reform through suppressing their differences. Applying this article to the case of BLM Vancouver and the activists at the Stonewall Riots, both social movement groups emphasize their differences, which can in part be explained by their lack of access to politician networks and the opposition they espouse to change.

As demonstrated by the separation of the individual interest groups from the Gay Liberation Front, some social movement scholars recognize coalitions to be a "double-edged sword" (Murphy 2005). That is to say, coalitions bring benefits and detriments to the efficacy of social movements. While coalitions might expand the number of people involved in a movement, they can also promote one group to dominate the others. At first, coalitions might seem to positively contribute to Tilly's W.U.N.C. formula by supersizing the number of people involved, but coalitions also undermine a movement's unity. Mirroring the breaking off of the Gay Activists Alliance from the Gay Liberation Front, contemporary Pride parades also exemplify the shortcomings of coalitions through competing interest groups who debate the presence of uniformed police. Hence, this frame that recognizes the "Origins of Pride" demonstrates a larger discussion into social movement literature that discusses the shortcomings of coalitions if those who critique uniformed police argue that Pride parades promote the interests of one dominant group over other members of the LGBTQ community who are racialized, trans and poor.

In addition to the frame of the "Origins of Pride" is the notion that uniformed police should not be able to march because their uniforms are symbolic of ongoing violence towards some members of the LGBTQ community. Similar to how the previous frame highlights flaws of coalitions, this frame further builds upon a critique of coalitions by distinctly stating how not all members within the LGBTQ community are treated equally by police. According to one comment that uses this frame:

> I am a Tsilhqot'in Transgender woman. I was a victim of police violence and racial profiling on more than one occassion [sic]. While I accept the police have a job to do, I am not comfortable celebrating Pride with an instituiton [sic] that has historically treated Aboriginal people and LGBTQ unfairly. Pride was born out of protest, a protest against unfair treatment of gay men at the hands of police. We in the LGBTQ community, regardless of ethnicity should never forget this. Sadly, it seems alot [sic] of people involved with Pride have lost sight of this. These are the reasons why I choose to sign this petition. Thank you.

In this quote, the person signing the petition frames their stance on uniformed police from their own personal experience of violence and racial profiling as an Indigenous transgender woman. While this quote also draws upon the previous frame's analysis into the origins of Pride parades being born out of protests against police, this quote further insists that this piece of history is important because violence continues to happen today

in her life. What this quote demonstrates through the frame of ongoing violence is evidence of deprivation theory (Smelser, 1962; Spilerman, 1971; Wilkes, 2004) if her basic human needs to safety are violated by police.

In addition to the frame of "Ongoing Violence," people who signed the petition requesting for uniformed police not to march in Vancouver's Pride parade also emphasized notions of the police representing an "Oppressive Institution". As two commenters state, "police institutions are based in racism and homophobia and misogyny," and "if cops are queer, you are welcome, but the police force is systematically flawed in its protection and support of queers, especially queers of color." What these two comments do is frame police not as individuals, but rather, as part of larger social problems. This frame attempts to redirect attention from arguments put forth by the opposing perspective that states gay and lesbian cops should be able to march in their uniforms. By critiquing police as an institution, this frame argues for people to challenge what Tilly terms "power holders" (1995). Rather than focus on individual police officers who may be progressive, or members of the LGBTQ community, this frame posits that police represent an oppressive form of government that serve a function to enforce the laws of the state. Because police represent "power holders," people who signed this petition insist that police institutions are "systematically flawed" and therefore cannot march in uniforms that represent injustice.

With this frame of police as an oppressive institution in mind, the next frame invoked the idea of "Solidarity" to justify the worthiness of the cause. Ideas of solidarity were brought forth by comments including the following, "I'm standing in solidarity with qtibpoc [queer, trans, two-spirit, intersex, Indigenous, black, and bisexual people of colour] communities and their needs for safety and spaces free of state control to express themselves." In this frame, allies who support the cause of BLM Vancouver and QTIBPOCs to remove uniformed police in Pride parades demonstrate what McCarthy and Zald call "conscience constituents" (1977, p. 1221). Conscience constituents are members who do not directly benefit from the goals of a social movement, yet, nonetheless play an integral role. Thinking back to Tilly's notion of W.U.N.C., conscience constituents can emphasize the numbers of a social movement, and also contribute to a movement's commitment by providing resources that beneficiary constituents (members who are directly oppressed or benefit from the goals of their movement) might lack. Hence, conscience constituents who stand in solidarity with a movement also contribute to coalition building, except those who stand in solidarity attempt to avoid the pitfalls of coalitions by deliberately relinquishing power by recognizing their privileged position.

Consequently, the frame of solidarity was further built upon with the last frame of "Safety" that petition signers indicated in their comments. Under the notion of safety, we see a direct parallel to what the competing petition framed as the police officer's "Role of Safety". In this frame of "Safety," people who signed the petition to remove uniformed police in the Pride parade emphasized the idea that if people did not feel safe attending the parade, police should remove their uniforms. In the following quote, one commenter

states:

> All powered alliances need to listen to, not ignore, the experiences of their brothers and sisters in the struggle who live within more oppressive structures which limit their freedom to be safe being themselves. Just because my privilege and position has me feeling safe with police marching in my parade does not mean it is safe for all. C' mon now, unpack your privilege for a moment and get clear on our purpose! Inclusion does not travel alone, it relies on the sharing and giving up of power to create equity, not exclusion!

In this quote, the commenter frames safety within a larger discourse of allyship, which further contributes to the frame of solidarity. Furthermore, this comment states that the "freedom to be safe being themselves" is paramount to what inclusion is fundamentally about. This frame of safety therefore exists in dialogue to frames brought forth from the competing petition, which also used discourses of "inclusion" to resonate with common values associated with being a member of the LGBTQ community. Furthermore, what the frame of safety demonstrates is further evidence for deprivation theory if some members of the LGBTQ community feel motivated to seek social change due to the inability for other members to have their safety guaranteed.

Similar to how commenters on the petition of "Remove the Police from the Vancouver Pride Parade" discussed these five frames, the description of the petition itself also happened to invoke all five frames of the "Origins of Pride," "Ongoing Violence," "Oppressive Institutions," "Solidarity," and "Safety". With that being said, the original description of the petition that commenters signed also had a large image similar to the competing petition. In "Remove the Police from the Vancouver Pride Parade," there is an image of a rainbow fist held up high. This fist is symbolic of the Black Lives Matter resistance that originated in the United States. What is significant about this image and the Black Lives Matter movement in Canada is that the movement's success in Vancouver (for achieving their goal to remove uniformed police in the parade) reflects McAdam's "Political Process Model" (2010). According to the Political Process Model, the success of a social movement is contingent on pre-existing systemic factors, including expanding political opportunities. In other words, considering that the Black Lives Matter movement has existed since 2013 in the United States, its portability as a transnational movement in Vancouver likely resonated with the established discourse and hashtag BLM.

Discussion

People who support keeping uniformed police in the parade emphasize frames of protection, social change, our community, inclusion and depicting Black Lives Matter as hateful. What these frames share in common is a larger framework of progression away

from the need to see police as oppressors. In other words, people who argue that uniformed police should remain in the parade state that police should be included because of their devotion to protecting members of the LGBTQ community, which is indicative of their progress away from their historical days of oppression. This idea of progress is characteristic of what what Amin Ghaziani calls a "post-gay" society (1998-present) in which the distinction between heterosexual and gay culture has blurred (2011). In other words, some forms of LGBTQ activism has become less about the distinction between "Us versus Them" but rather "Us and Them" (p. 102). To apply this to police in Pride parades, police become symbolic of "Them" while "Us" is reflective of those who believe uniformed police should be in their Pride parades. That is to say, particular identities within LGBTQ culture have assimilated within larger discourses of heterosexual culture, which have historically been institutionally protected by the Canadian state by police (Gentile, Kinsman, & Rankin, 2017).

Perhaps in consideration of this historical oppression by police, the notion of having them in Pride parades is to fortify coalitions and strengthen key criteria for social movements under what Charles Tilly termed as W.U.N.C. (1995). By having uniformed police visible in Pride parades, they effectively demonstrate not only larger numbers of supporters, but also the prominence of powerful coalitions. Police do not simply represent just any coalition though; they are what Max Weber would designate institutional forms of legal-rational authority (1922/1978). Police have the legal authority to exercise power mandated by the Canadian state, and arguably demonstrate the LGBTQ community's achievement of recognition from power-holders. Hence, to revisit Tilly and the success of social movements, I argue that uniformed police in Pride not only represents what Ghaziani terms as an example of "post-gay" culture, but also, deliberate attempts to sustain a social movement through investments in the safety and protection that police represent.

In "Cycles of Sameness and Difference in LGBT Social Movements" (Ghaziani, Taylor, Stone, 2016) the ocscillation of LGBTQ social movements in the United States is contingent on the perception of "political threat" (p. 167) which shapes the goals, and subsequent activist tactics produced. In their paper, Ghaziani, Taylor and Stone analyze three social movement case studies on 1) gay liberation and lesbian feminism, 2) queer activism, and 3) marriage equality and concluded that "in each cycle, disputes over sameness and difference created an imprint that lingered in the movement's later campaign for same-sex marriage, illustrating that activist identities are historically contingent and strategic." (p. 177). Similarly, the controversy of uniformed police in Pride parades raises questions over whether the LGBTQ community should emphasize a form of "sameness" or "difference" with uniformed police in Pride parades. As Ghaziani, Taylor and Stone note in their article, it is not unusual that rifts among LGBTQ groups develop, as this represents the intersectional identities and political goals of this heterogeneous community.

While this enmeshment between LGBTQ culture with police might appear indica-

tive of positive social change characterized by the inclusion of uniformed police in Pride parades, the petition to remove them used the frame of "ongoing violence" to draw attention to what is argued to be an inappropriate erasure of continual violence faced by some members of the LGBTQ community. Those who do not support uniformed police present their case through the frames of police representing historical injustices that represent systematic oppression in both the past and in the present. Furthermore, the frames of solidarity and safety are used to further emphasize notions of the need for belonging through deprivation theory characterised by what Tilly states makes a social movement "worthy". Hence, removing the uniformed police in Pride parades merely symbolizes recognition that police represent the legal-rational authority of the Canadian state that continuously reproduces social inequalities that disproportionately affect Indigenous, Black, transgender, poor, and sex workers who happen to also be members of the LGBTQ community (Gentile, Kinsman, & Rankin, 2017; Dryden, & Lenon, 2015). For instance, while Canada's black population comprises approximately 3% of the total population, they represent 10% of people in Canadian prisons (Owusu-Bempah, & Wortley, 2014). Similarly, while only 4% of Canada's population is Indigenous, they represent 23% of those incarcerated in Canadian prisons (Government Services Canada, 2013). Hence, uniformed police become representative of larger social inequalities associated with Canadian state and their presence in Pride parades is seen as inappropriate.

Ultimately, by comparing how people frame police on both sides of the debate, my findings demonstrate the importance of distinguishing between different levels of social movement organization. Social movement scholars McCarthy and Zald (1977) distinguish between social movement organizations, industries and sectors when thinking about how a movement can be conceptualized. As depicted from these two competing petitions, different social movement organizations (for instance, each petition) exists within the same social movement industry cause of LGBTQ rights. Yet, I argue that because each petition focuses on different issues within LGBTQ rights on the axes of race, gender and class, that what one might think are the same social movement industries, are in fact different industries with the broader social movement sector. I argue this is inevitable when we consider the prominence of intersectionality (Crenshaw 1989) during infighting within the LGBTQ community (Armstrong, 2002; Ghaziani, 2008; Ward, 2008; Mecca, 2009). Due to fragments within social movement industries, it is becoming ever more difficult to conclusively determine if a collective action frame (Klandermans, 1997) exists that the LGBTQ community can take. By synthesizing together the frames from both competing petitions, If no collective action frame exists, I argue that this poses future challenges for social movement organizing within LGBTQ communities.

Conclusion

While the use of petitions can provide rich qualitative data in the form of user comments, several limitations to this data should be noted. First, unlike in in-depth interviews, there was no way to ask follow-up questions with signees to further understand or clarify their reasons for signing. There was also no way to verify demographic information of those who signed - for instance their gender, age, race, sexual orientation, social class, etc. Petitions are also at risk of being influenced by fake signatures used to produce the illusion that a cause has more support than it actually does. Hypothetically, there could be one person who makes multiple accounts to sign a petition while also leaving a plethora of comments. Further research on the topic of uniformed police in Pride parades could include in-depth interviews with those who both support and do not support uniformed police in Pride parades, as well as ethnographic research including field observations of Pride parades to note how uniformed police are specifically being represented.

By analyzing how people frame the debate of uniformed police in Vancouver's Pride parade from looking at comments left on two competing petitions, I apply social movement concepts to better make sense of this social controversy. Those who support including uniformed police in the parade use the frames of Protection, Change, Community, Inclusion, and Black Lives Matter as Hateful. What these frames share in common are key characteristics that sustain social movements according to Charles Tilly's W.U.N.C. formula. Through using counter-frames to the oppositional petition, as well as assimilationist investments in the legal-rational authority of police, these frames demonstrate how people justify their stances on uniformed police in Pride parades. On the other hand, those who do not support uniformed police defend their stance through the frames of Origins of Pride, Ongoing Violence, Oppressive Institutions, Solidarity, and Safety. What these frames demonstrate are the difficulties in social movement organizing over the notion of a unified social movement frame in the name of the "LGBTQ" community. Because of the different struggles among those in the LGBTQ community with police, their uniforms are seen to be inappropriately celebrated in a parade historically meant to be about political resistance to social inequalities. Ultimately, the findings from this study's analysis of online petition data offer new insight, as well as barriers, to mobilizing collective goals in the LGBTQ community when internal political agreements are fragmented due to persistent social inequalities.

References

Aklin, M., & Urpelainen, J. (2013). Debating Clean Energy: Frames, Counter Frames, and Audiences, *Global Environmental Change*, 23(1): 1225-1232.

Alinsky, S. D. (2005). Protest Tactics (from Rules for Radicals). *The Social Movements Reader: Cases and Concepts.*

Anderson, B R. (1991). *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Revised and extend, 2nd ed; Verso: London.

Armstrong, E. A., and Suzanna M. Crage. (2006). Movement and Memory: The Making of the Stonewall Myth, *American Sociological Review* 71(5): 724-751.

Babbie, E., & Lucia B. (2010). *Fundamentals of Social Research*: 3rd Canadian edition. Toronto, ON: Nelson Education Ltd.

Bedry, D. (2017, November 29). Vancouver Pride bans uniformed police from 2018 parade. DailyXtra. Retrieved from: https://www.dailyxtra.com/vancouver-pride-bans-uniformed-police-from-2018-parade-81777

Benford, R and D, Snow (2000). Framing processes and social movements. *Annual Review of Sociology* 26: 611–639.

Benford, R., & David S. (2000). "Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment." *Annual Review of Sociology* 2661 1439.

Bernstein, M. (1997). Celebration and Suppression: The Strategic Uses of Identity by the Lesbian and Gay Movement, *American Journal of Sociology*, 103(3): 531-565.

Black Lives Matter Vancouver (2017). Remove the police from the Vancouver Pride Parade. Retrieved From: https://www.change.org/p/vancouver-pride-society-remove-the-police-from-the-vancouver-Pride-paradeBlack Lives Matter Vancouver Website. (Accessed 2017, Nov 30). "What about police officers who are gay and want to be in the march?". Retrieved from: https://blacklivesmattervancouver.com/faq/

Black Lives Matter Vancouver. (2016). "Open Letter to the Vancouver Pride Society and the Vancouver Police Department from Black Lives Matter Vancouver". Retrieved from: https://blacklivesmattervancouver.com/2016/07/15/open-letter-to-the-vancouver-pride-society-and-the-vancouver-police-department-from-black-lives-matter-vancouver/

Black Lives Matter Website. (Accessed 2018, April 10). "About". Retrieved from: https://blacklivesmatter.com/about/

Blatchford, C. (2016, November 15). Christie Blatchford: $104M lawsuit against anti-gay activist a political witch hunt, lawyers say. *National Post*. Retrieved from http://news.nationalpost.com/full-comment/christie-blatchford-104m-lawsuit-against-anti-gay-activist-a-political-witch-hunt-lawyers-say

Briassoulis, H. (2010). Online Petitions: New Tools of Secondary Analysis?, *Qualitative Research*, 10(6): 715-727.

Butler, J. (2006). *Gender trouble: Feminism and the subversion of identity*. New York: Routledge.

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum*: 139-167.

D'Emilio, J. (2002). *World Turned: Essays on Gay History, Politics, and Culture*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Dryden, O. H., & Lenon, S. (2015). *Disrupting Queer Inclusion: Canadian Homonationalisms and the Politics of Belonging*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Duberman, M. B. (1993). *Stonewall*. Penguin Books: New York.

Fairclough, N. (2003). *Analysing discourse: Textual analysis for social research*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Foucault, M. (1972). *The archeology of knowledge and the discourse on language*. New York, NY: Pantheon Books.

Gentile, P., Kinsman, G., & Rankin L. P. (2017). *We Still Demand! Redefining Resistance in Sex and Gender Struggles*. Vancouver: UBC Press.

Ghaziani, A., Taylor, V., & Stone, A. (2016). Cycles of Sameness and Difference in LGBT Social Movements, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 42(1): 165-183.

Ghaziani, A. (2011). Post-Gay Collective Identity Construction, *Social Problems*, 58(1): 99-125.

—. (2008). *The Dividends of Dissent: How Conflict and Culture Work in Lesbian and Gay Marches on Washington*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Gillespie, W. (2008). Thirty-five Years After Stonewall: An Exploratory Study of Satisfaction with Police Among Gay, Lesbian, and Bisexual Persons at the 34th Annual Atlanta Pride Festival, *Journal of Homosexuality* 55(4): 619-647.

Glesne, C. (2016). Finding Your Story: Data Analysis in *Becoming Qualitative Researchers: An Introduction*. Pearson Publication: 183-217.

Goffman, E. (1959). *The presentation of self in everyday life*. New York, NY: Anchor Books.

Goicolea, I., Coe, A., & Ohman, A. (2014). Easy to Oppose, Difficult to Propose: Young Activist Men's Framing of Alternative Masculinities under the Hegemony of Machismo in Ecuador, *Young*, 22(4): 399-419.

Government Services Canada (2013). The Federal Incarcerated and Conditional Release Populations by Aboriginal and Race. Retrieved from: https://www.canada.ca/en/parole- board.html

Graham, L. (2005). *Discourse analysis and the critical use of Foucault*. Paper presented at Australian Association for Research in Education Annual Conference in Sydney, Australia.

Hamilton, G. (2017, July 27). "'A tragic error': Growing push to exclude police from pride parades divides LGBTQ community". *The National Post*. Retrieved from:http://nationalpost.com/news/canada/a-tragic-error-growing-push-to-exclude-police-from-pride-parades-divides-lgbtq-community

Jenkins, C. (1983). Resource Mobilization Theory and the Study of Social Movements, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 9: 527–53.

Klandermans, B. (1997). "Principles of Movement Participation" in *The Social Psychology of Protest*. Blackwell Publishers: Hoboken, New Jersey.

Lamusse, T. (2016). "Politics at Pride?," *New Zealand Sociology*. 31(6): 49-70.

Maxwell, J. (2013). Reading: Methods: What Will You Actually Do? In *Qualitative Research Design: An Interactive Approach*. SAGE Publications: 87-120.

Ma, M. (2017). Affective Framing and Dramaturgical Actions in Social Movements, *Journal of Communication Inquiry*. 41(1): 5-21.

McAdam, D. (1996). "The Framing Function of Movement Tactics: Strategic Dramaturgy in the American Civil Rights Movement." Pp. 338-355 in *Comparative Perspectives on Social Movements*, edited by McAdam, McCarthy, and Zald.

McAdam, D. (2010). *Political process and the development of black insurgency, 1930-1970.* University of Chicago Press.

McCarthy, J D. and Mayer N. Zald. (1977). Resource Mobilization and Social Movements: A Partial Theory, *American Journal of Sociology*, 82:1212–41.

McNeill, J, L., & Thornton, T, F. (2017). Pipelines, Petitions, and Protests in the Internet Age: Exploring the Human Geographies of Online Petitions Challenging Proposed Transcontinental Alberta Oil Sands Pipelines, *Annals of the American Association of Geographers*, 107(6): 1279-1298.

Mecca, T, A. (2009). *Smash the Church, Smash the State! The Early Years of Gay Liberation*. City Lights Books: San Francisco.

Moscato, D. (2016). Media Portrayals of Hashtag Activism: A Framing Analysis of Canada's Idlenomore Movement, *Media and Communication*, 4(2): 3-12.

Murphy, G. (2005) Coalitions and The Development of The Global Environmental Movement: A Double-Edged Sword. *Mobilization: An International Quarterly*, 10(2): 235-250.

Our Pride Includes Our Police (2017). Retrieved from: https://www.change.org/p/vancouver-pride-society-our-pride-includes-our-police

Owusu, Bempah, A., & Wortley, S. (2014). "Race, Crime, and Criminal Justice in Canada." *Oxford Handbook of Ethnicity, Crime and Immigration*: 281-320.

Page, J. (2018, April 5). "Videos of Fatal Mosque Attack Show Shooter Reload as Victims Seek Cover," *CBC News*. Retrieved from:

http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/montreal/alexandre-bissonnette-sentencing-1.4605036

Puar, J.K (2012). "The Golden Handcuffs of Gay Rights: How Pinkwashing Distorts Both LGBTIQ and Anti-Occupational Activism." *Feminist Wire*, 30 January.

Rohlinger, D. (2002). Framing the Abortion Debate: Organizational Resources, Media Strategies, and Movement-Countermovement Dynamics, *The Sociological Quarterly*, 43(4): 479-507.

Russell, E. (2017). A 'fair cop': Queer histories, affect and police image work in Pride March, *Crime, Media, Culture*, 13(3): 277-293.

Spilerman, S. 1971. The Causes of Racial Disturbances: Test of an Explanation, *American Sociological Review*, 36:427–42.

Steidley, T., & Colen, G. C. (2017). Framing the Gun Control Debate: Press Releases and Framing Strategies of the National Rifle Association and the Brady Campaign', *Social Science Quarterly*, 98(2): 608-627.

Strauss, A. L., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Stryker, S. (2008). *Transgender History*. Berkeley, CA: Seal Press.

Tilly, C. (1995). *Popular Contention in Great Britain, 1758-1834*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Vancouver Pride Society. (2017, December 1). "FAQ Regarding Police Decision". Retrieved from: http://www.vancouverpride.ca/news///252811/faq_regarding_police_decision_

Ward, J. (2002). *Respectably Queer: Diversity Culture in LGBT Activist Organizations*. Vanderbilt University Press: Nashville.

Wilkes, R. (2004). First Nation Politics: Deprivation, Resources, and Participation in Collective Action, *Sociological Inquiry*, 74(4): 570-589.

Weber, M. (1922/1978). *Economy and Society*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Appendix 1. Supports Police

Keep Uniformed Police in Parade

FRAMES	QUOTATIONS
Role of Protection:	"Our police are part of the community regardless of what they try to do to protect us and I want the police in the pride parade to show Pride for all of citizens of British Columbia."
Change:	"The police have changed since 1989. I will not create a divide. Inclusion not exclusion. Let's keep talking."
Our Community:	"Police are part of our community."
Inclusion:	"The Pride Parade should be focused on inclusion, not exclusion, and not cater to the agenda of a small minority of hateful individuals."
Black Lives Matter (BLM) as Hateful:	"No one should be excluded. BLM lost any claim to any moral ground when it used the killings at the Quebec mosque as a platform to further attack, including attacking the prime minister as a racist. Bullying a community event for one's own social justice warrior purposes is not acceptable. Let the police march and be part of it all."

Appendix 2. Does not Support Police

Remove Uniformed Police in Parade	
FRAMES	**QUOTATIONS**
Origins of Pride:	"Pride was originally a riot against police treatment of LGBT people, lead by black trans women who were most effected. In the past century since, there has been a continued specific negligence and brutality by police officers to people of colour and trans people (exemplified by the growing statistics in the states and even here in Canada with all the murdered and missing indigenous women) who deserve to feel safe at pride, as they are essential to our community. I don't think its respectful to have this history with important leaders of our community and refuse to take off a uniform, and it feels like marching in a parade started by those targeted by police negligence and brutality is some sort of sick joke."
Ongoing Violence:	"The police uniform represents ongoing violence for black people and other communities of POC, drug users, and cash poor persons. Their removal from the Pride Parade is necessary to acknowledge that violence, and make the parade safer for all participants. It's not like the police were ever there to serve marginalized communities anyways."
Oppressive Institution:	"Police institutions are based in racism and homophobia and misogyny."
Solidarity:	"The Pride Parade should be focused on inclusion, not exclusion, and not cater to the agenda of a small minority of hateful individuals."
Safety:	"Because we need to stand together until safety and justice for everyone is achieved."

2019

FRANCESCO DUINA
SCHOLARSHIP WINNER
(Honourable Mention)

Framing Fashion: Examining Media Coverage of the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week

Paige Lougheed
University of British Columbia

Dedication. I would like to dedicate this article to Dr. Catherine Corrigall-Brown, for her unwavering support and dedication to my development as a student, as well as her commitment to intellectual curiosity.

Abstract. Within the discipline of sociology and mainstream Canadian media, Indigenous peoples and Indigenous issues are often framed from a deficit standpoint, emphasizing the many challenges and oppressions that Indigenous people face (Dowell, 2013). While these issues are extremely important, major Canadian news authorities often fail to highlight or draw attention to the significant and courageous acts of resistance to colonization that Indigenous people perform each day. Drawing upon the asset-deficit model approach (Shapiro & MacDonald, 2017), this research uses an asset approach to highlighting the methods of cultural and political resistance observed by participating fashion designers at Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. The qualitative methods used to conduct this research were media content analysis, which included researching interviews and newspaper articles to inquire how different actors framed the event. The findings of my research demonstrate that four core frames were used by both participating fashion designers and journalists to shape how the event was perceived by the public. To illustrate, some designers framed their fashion as being political, whereas other designers insisted their fashion was just art and had no political association. Furthermore, many journalists

emphasized the relevance of cultural appropriation to the event before asking questions about the details or purpose of the event.

Introduction

A beeline of Indigenous and non-Indigenous models march the runway, their fashion illuminating the stage. A string of designers and spectators line each side of the stage and watch in awe as they walk forward. This event, Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, is a festival to celebrate the beauty of fashion. However, it is also much more. It is a celebration of Indigenous culture and is, at its core, political. The signs of this can be seen dripping from every corner of the event - when the models form fists with their hands and raise their left arm to the ceiling, when the attendees arrive dressed in red, a symbol of life in many First Nations cultures, ultimately linked with the political red dress movement drawing attention to the violence against missing and murdered Indigenous women.

It is evident that Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week is a varied event – it is political in nature, and Indigenous resurgence is emphasized, but it is just as much about culture and beauty. However, what remains hidden is that how people emphasized the politics or the cultural beauty of the event remained heavily dependent on their group affiliation. Although there are many ways of interpreting and making meaning out of Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, there are several 'frames' and prevalent themes throughout. In this study, I will explore the differing ways in which this event was shaped by different people, and why the communication of this event matters.

Fashion has historically not been taken seriously as an area of study because it is often associated with 'women's pursuits', a sentiment that has its roots in sexism (Aspers & Godart, 2013). Sociologists have long since failed to "take fashion seriously and give it the attention and study which it deserves" (Blumer, 1969, p. 290). Furthermore, fashion is routinely overlooked and not recognized as being an insightful function of symbolic interactionism where people create meanings from their identities through clothing. However, fashion is remarkably important because it allows individuals to express group affiliation and individual identity. Fashion is a mechanism of expression that can provide insight into the socio-historical context. To illustrate, Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week is an excellent example of how fashion is an important mechanism for artistic and cultural expression. Fashion, when worn under certain circumstances, such as at Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, can even be political. Fashion as a discursive mechanism for social change is what this study examines.

The media coverage on Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week can be better understood in the context of Canadian news coverage of Indigenous people. Generally, there has been a deficit framing of Indigenous people in Canada by the mainstream media.

To clarify, when discussing deficit framing, we are discussing how discourse can shape understandings about a group. 'Deficit discourse' is a narrative that consistently frames Indigenous people in a narrative of deficiency (Fforde et al., 2013). Many examples of this can be found in Canadian news coverage of Indigenous protests and the state of many First Nations reserves in Canada. Journalists often tend to focus on what is wrong with or lacking in Indigenous communities across Canada, without acknowledging the strength and resilience that already exists in these same communities. Deficit discourse matters for media coverage because the way Indigenous people are framed in the media by non-Indigenous folks will ultimately contribute to the level of agency that Indigenous people are perceived as having. Consequently, we form our ideas and stereotypes about groups of people through representation in television, newspapers, radio, and other forms of media. Media coverage can have real and tangible consequences for the affected, as Fforde (2013) stated: "Research has indicated a correlation between discourse surrounding Indigeneity and outcomes for Indigenous people" (p. 162).

As another example of deficit discourse, Baldridge (2014) discussed how after-school community-based spaces are frequently recognized in political and educational discourses as institutions that 'save' and 'rescue' Black youth. Baldrige (2014) further notes how "deficit framing disregards the assets that Black and minoritized youth bring to educational spaces, thus ignoring their agency - and thereby limiting the ways they are imagined, engaged, and educated" (p. 440).

In contrast to and in resistance of this deficit discourse, this study takes an asset approach to understanding Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. The asset approach is based off of the asset-deficit model, as Shapiro and MacDonald (2017) identify as being a model where asset discourse emphasizes what people have to offer, and deficit discourse highlights what people lack, or their deficiencies. Therefore, choosing to understand Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week through an asset lens prioritizes the voices of Indigenous participants in the fashion show, how they choose to create meanings about said show, and why they perceive the event as being important work. An asset approach matters because it is needed to fill the gap in pre-existing Canadian news coverage. An asset approach to understanding this event is needed to harness the strength that is so clearly demonstrated throughout the Indigenous fashion community.

Before delving into a discussion on media coverage surrounding Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, it is important to clarify the terminology I will be using in this paper. For the purposes of this paper, I use the term Indigenous when referring to fashion that is produced by and for First Nations, Inuit, Métis, and all other groups of Indigenous people. My usage of the term, "First Nations fashion" refers to fashion that is produced by Aboriginal peoples of Canada who are neither ethnically Métis nor Inuit. Furthermore, I will use the term Indigenous when referring to Indigenous fashion in a trans-local context.

Research Question

This study hones in on the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week that took place in mid-July, 2017 at Queen Elizabeth Theatre in Downtown Vancouver. Twenty-five predominantly Indigenous fashion designers participated in a four-day event where mostly Indigenous models showcased fashion from a variety of designers and nations. The event was well-attended with more than 100 attendees, and was so popular among its audience that it is set to take the stage once again in 2018. The event was produced by "All My Relations" Entertainment company founder Joleen Mitton. Joleen Mitton is a female-identifying Indigenous community activist with a history of modelling that fuelled her interest in Indigenous fashion. She is the primary face and driving force behind the fashion show, and she speaks on behalf of the event in most mainstream news articles.

I collected all available data on each designer who participated in the fashion show. I did this through researching their websites, blogs, profiles, as well as interviews and articles that had been written about them. I also examined news coverage of this event, from both mainstream media, such as the BBC, the Globe and Mail, the CBC, as well as alternative media, such as the Georgia Straight, Beatroute and Pri magazine. I used the data I collected from these sources to examine how Indigenous designers framed their fashion differently on their personal platforms than was portrayed in mainstream and alternative media. 'Framing' can also be thought of as the different ways in which an event is shaped or communicated by differing authorities. For example, through my findings it is evident that the mainstream media chose to discuss Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week in a very different way than some of the designers did. It is only natural to then ask a question of why some groups chose to talk about this event differently than others. Different groups, such as the mainstream and alternative media, chose to frame or 'shape' the event from four different lenses: the cultural appropriation frame, the art frame, the political frame, and the model frame. I will further explain how these groups chose to use these frames, however, it is important to note that these frames matter because they dictate how people who did not attend this event will interpret its meaning.

Literature Review

Fashion as an Outcome

Scholars have long been interested in the concept of fashion, starting with Simmel's 1957 article entitled, "Fashion". In this work, Simmel discusses fashion as a method of social equalization. He suggests that fashion is diffused through a process of imitation and differentiation, whereby those of lower class strata would imitate the fashion of the upper

class to improve their social status (Simmel, 1957). In summary, Simmel is suggesting that the meaning fashion holds is derived from how others value it.

Since Simmel's work, there has been much debate toward a definition of fashion (Aspers & Godart, 2013). Kawamura (2011) suggests that this is due to two meanings associated with fashion: fashion as change and fashion as dress (Aspers & Godart, 2013). Fashion as change refers to the production of fashion trends that reflect the social context under which they were created. Fashion as 'dress' refers to the physical clothing itself, and the term is generally used to describe how clothes embody meaning for those who wear and produce it. If Simmel were to read Kawamura's work, he would argue for fashion as change because he also discussed the diffusion practices behind fashion as a method of social equalization. Furthermore, for the purposes of this research, I refer to 'Indigenous fashion' primarily as being about dress rather than change. For instance, when discussing fashion, I will be discussing the cultural, political and social significance of the clothing itself, rather than Indigenous fashion as a changing reflection of Canadian society.

Additionally, Aspers & Godart (2013) suggest that fashion is a theoretical process of order. They imply that fashion changes against a social backdrop that remains consistent throughout time (Aspers & Godart, 2013). Furthermore, they discuss fashion as a cyclical, continuous and mutual "process of social adaptation... that links micro decisions to macro processes" (p. 173). Consequently, and according to Aspers & Godart, how we decide what is fashionable and 'trendy' can be approached from a symbolic interactionist perspective due to how our mutually constructed everyday interactions regarding what is or is not fashionable can affect what we purchase, which further affects the production of fashion trends.

Fashion as a Process

In "Sociology of Fashion: Order and Change," Fashion is further described as an inherently relational process that is "simultaneously inclusive and exclusive" (Aspers & Godart, 2013, p. 186). Through wearing shared symbols, or symbols that have mutually understood meanings, fashion can work to bring groups together and create cohesion. However, this can also indicate distinction between groups too because it demonstrates who is deemed as being an 'insider' or 'outsider' to the group. Furthermore, Aspers & Godart (2013) suggest that the inherently relational process of fashion dispersal is disseminated through a procedure of diffusion and adaptation. Fashion can be diffused through many different sources, including subcultures to macro structures such as the fashion industry. The rise of modern technology, such as the Internet, aids in the diffusion of fashion trends through its excessive accessibility to individuals in middle or higher social classes (Chen et al., 2012).

Several scholars have discussed diffusion and adaptation practices in relation to fashion processes. One of the earliest scholars to conceptualize fashion diffusion processes was Georg Simmel in his article, Fashion. Simmel (1957) argued that fashion was diffused through a process of imitation and differentiation. He stated that people of lower class strata would imitate the fashion trends of the upper classes in order to achieve social equalization. However, this imitation of fashion styles would lead the upper class into seeking to differentiate their appearance practices in order to maintain social status and distinction from the lower class. Simmel (1957) argued that these changes in fashion styles and trends represent a cyclical process of imitation and differentiation, which is how fashion trends are produced.

However, more recent scholars in the field of fashion studies such as Diane Crane (1999) have argued Simmel's model of fashion is no longer relevant due to changes in the global market. This is because Simmel's work focused on imitation and differentiation between the upper and lower classes, without considering new technologies that allow for the spread of fashion from a bottom-up approach. For example, YouTube allows for young fashion designers with relatively little social capital to disseminate their designs amongst the public.

Differentiation and imitation processes can be observed in a variety of different subcultures and social organizations. For instance, research by Clarke & Spence (2013) explores how lesbian and bisexual women navigate their identities through their appearance. Clarke & Spence (2013) note that the authenticity of lesbian and bisexual women's identities is often called into question if women fail to meet normative appearances of lesbian and bisexual women - doubt that is expressed from both within and outside lesbian and bisexual communities. For example, some lesbian women shared how they would "consciously 'butch up' in order to feel a sense of belonging and membership in lesbian spaces (Clarke & Spence, 2013, p. 29). Many women had to consider how they would manage authenticity between their 'authentic' lesbian selves and their authenticity as individuals. This sentiment led Clarke & Spence (2013) to state how the process of displaying a personal identity and expressing their inner self had a political dimension because it involved actively resisting "normative conceptions of lesbian visual identities and sexual styles" (p. 30).

Some groups use fashion politically. Not unlike the lesbian and bisexual women interviewed in Clarke and Spence's study of appearance practices, punks were assertive in creating a "counter culture" against the mainstream to resist normative identities of the time (Fox, 1987). Punks did this through dressing antithetical to "what the dominant culture deemed pleasing. One major reason punks dressed the way they did was to set themselves apart and make themselves recognizable" (Fox, 1987, p. 349). This notion of differentiation from normative identities of the dominant culture reflects Dick Hebdige's point that subcultures are often a product of the times and reflect the social context in which the subculture was formed (Hebdige, p. 75). This is political in that they seek to

differentiate themselves from the dominant culture and critique that culture in a visible way through fashion.

Other subcultures, such as the BMX riders featured in Shane and Mark's (2016) used fashion to assert their identities in a more selective way. They often chose to hide their BMX rider identity from their family, work colleagues and friends. Shane & Mark (2016) noticed how BMX riders within this subculture often demonstrated "ambivalence toward the mainstream" and hid their identities also by means of status preservation (p. 96). The riders study employed an ambivalent attitude toward differentiation from the dominant culture to communicate that they were less political in their intentions, and more focused on the individual gratification of risk-taking behaviour, a study of which is known formally as 'Edgework' in some disciplines (Shane & Mark, 2016, p. 95). Thus, the literature of these various subcultures has been discussed to illustrate how certain groups use shared symbols as well as Simmel's principle of differentiation from imitation to indicate authenticity within group memberships.

Applying Fashion to Culture

Simmel's theory of differentiation and imitation can be applied to the contemporary context of cultural appropriation within the fashion industry. To clarify, to 'appropriate' is to steal something and make it one's own. Therefore, cultural appropriation is the stealing of elements of another's culture for personal gain (Young, 2009). There are several examples of celebrities imitating and co-opting elements of another culture to achieve what is 'fashionable' or for personal gain. One of these many examples of cultural appropriation in fashion include the numerous videos that appear on YouTube in late November, around the time of American Thanksgiving, of 'Native-inspired makeup'. These videos often include non-Indigenous people demonstrating makeup tutorials of makeup techniques and styles that they deem to be 'Native', when in reality do not accurately reflect or have anything to do with Indigenous culture (J, Sailor, YouTube, 2017). In response to this, a Native American woman under the username 'Sailor J' created a YouTube video to resist the cultural appropriation demonstrated in these videos by producing a satirical video entitled, "How To Do Thanksgiving Makeup That Has Nothing To Do with these 566 Federally Recognized Tribes" (YouTube, 2017). The video features Sailor J performing a Native-inspired makeup tutorial while, whispering messages about the genocide of Indigenous people that took place during American Thanksgiving. Sailor J successfully challenged the imitation of Native American culture through the use of makeup in these videos by differentiating herself as an authentic Native American woman.

White celebrities such as Iggy Azalea have profited off the appropriation of Black culture through the appropriation of 'sonic blackness' and twerking (Cooper, 2014). The appropriation of sonic blackness is the co-optation of sounds and register of an accent

from a group of people (Cooper, 2014), while twerking is a dance from African cultures that has famously been appropriated by white female pop singers (Gaunt, 2015). In her essay on post-racial politics, Brittney Cooper discusses how Azalea "profits from the cultural performativity and forms of survival that Black women have perfected, without having to encounter and deal with the social problem that is the Black female body" (Cooper, 2014). Twerking has also been co-opted by pop singer Miley Cyrus. A notorious example of Miley Cyrus appropriating twerking can be observed at the 2013 MTV VMA Awards. In this live performance, Cyrus clearly imitates Black culture through twerking for fashion and personal gain (Gaunt, 2015). Gaunt (2015) suggests that Cyrus used twerking "as an ethnic marker to transform her brand identity, while black girls were twerking as a different kind of self-preservation of ethnicity and gender" (p. 246). Consequently, both Cyrus and Azalea were able to imitate black culture without facing the criticism and scrutiny targeted toward the black female body or dealing with the threat to safety for being black. Both Cyrus and Azalea embraced the disjuncture between culture as means of black survival and their whiteness, highlighting their white privilege. Cyrus and Azalea assert their privilege through choosing elements of a culture to imitate with no foreseeable consequences attached to their bodies.

To further illustrate, Wheeler (2013) discussed how the DJ group, A Tribe Called Red, took to social media to discourage concert attendees from wearing headdresses and war paint to their shows. Bear Witness, a member of A Tribe called Red, actively stated how Non-Natives donning headdresses and war paint at concerts does not represent his nation at all and is 'disrespectful' (The Globe and Mail, 2017).

First Nations Background and Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week

Before discussing the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, it is necessary to discuss the background of Indigenous issues in Canada. While the colonial project is an ongoing process in Canadian society, Indian Residential Schools began in the 1870s and lasted until the last school was closed in 1996. They were assimilative institutions that were federally, church-run schools where Indigenous children were taken from their communities in order to un-learn their language and culture. The lasting intergenerational trauma of Indian Residential Schools is still felt in many Indigenous communities today, as many survivors cope with Residential School Syndrome (Brasfield, 2001). The Indian Residential Schools Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) is an independent body that "oversees a process to provide former students and anyone who has been affected by the Indian Residential Schools legacy, with an opportunity to share their individual experiences in a safe and culturally appropriate manner" ("About the Commission", 2017). The TRC's 94 Calls to Action urge all levels of government to work together to begin the

process of reconciliation and attempt to repair the damage caused by Indian Residential Schools (Mas, 2015, CBC News).

In addition to the TRC Calls to Action, there have also been several notable instances of resistance to colonization through protest in recent years. Several protests are worthy to note as they contextualize the circumstances under which this research was conducted. For instance, the Idle No More Movement is a social movement started by four women in central Canada, which calls for environmental rights and accountability to the government. Furthermore, the noDAPL hashtag was created in response to the protests against the Dakota Access Pipeline that took place at Standing Rock Indian Reservation. These protests were "protecting and defending a sacred burial site and the water on the Treaty Territory surrounding the Standing Rock Reservation" (Delorme, 2017, p. 71). Water protectors protested pipeline workers from further colonizing the land and destroying the surrounding environment, which was broadcasted widely via social media outlets. Supporters of the protests began tweeting and sharing the hashtag "noDAPL" to show solidarity with the Sioux peoples living at the Standing Rock Reservation. It is worthwhile to note that the Standing Rock protests were non-violent and peaceful, however, the media framed the participating protestors as unruly, unreasonable and dangerous, which affected how the public responded to the protests.

The way in which an organization or body frames a group of people profoundly affects the agency that group of people is perceived as having. Many sociologists frame Indigeneity and Indigenous issues in Canada from a deficit-approach by frequently discussing the inequality and intersecting oppressions that Indigenous peoples face. While issues such as various socioeconomic barriers and reserve living conditions are essential to examine and act upon, it is equally imperative to also draw attention to the remarkable acts of resistance to colonization that happen within Indigenous communities each day. Research on the differences yielded between asset and deficit discourses has found that asset-based personal narratives can help to form agency within individual identity (Shapiro & MacDonald, 2017, p. 81). Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week is a prime example of an asset approach narrative because it builds upon the strengths that Indigenous fashion designers already possess and provides an opportunity to showcase their agency.

From July 26th-29th 2017, the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was launched as a part of the Calling of the Drum Festival by the City of Vancouver. The Drum is Calling Festival celebrates Indigenous arts and culture as a component of the Canada 150+ celebrations. In the context of this paper, it is necessary to name that Canada 150 is truly a celebration of the genocide of Canada's Indigenous peoples. Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week (or VIFW) took place over four days at Vancouver's Queen Elizabeth Theatre. The founder of the event is former model and community support worker, Joleen Mitton. Mitton is an Indigenous woman, community activist and former international fashion model who produced VIFW through her company, All My Relations Entertainment Com-

pany. This fashion show showcased the work of 40 Indigenous and non-Indigenous artists and fashion designers. The event was open to the public and was covered by several local and international news outlets, such as The Georgia Straight, the Province, The Globe and Mail and Maclean's magazine.

In the "About VIFW" subsection of the website, event creators describe VIFW in the following quotation:

> Humans have always adorned themselves to explore beauty, story, spirit, and belonging as our lives, roles and the world expands. In Indigenous Turtle Island, regalia is a highest art form, always integrating materials and new truths. Contemporary Indigenous Fashion mixes modern day glamour, high regalia and street styles with legacies of colonization, industrialization, and raises up clothing as an art form and statement. The Fashion Week expresses political, environmental and economic truths of land, territory and rightful place. These designers showcase modern Indigenous regalia that's innovative, vibrant, visible, resilient, beautiful and proud. Brands and styles try to copy Indigenous designs around the world. VIFW upholds authentic Indigenous artistry and reclaims the strong stories that draw global eyes and longing. We raise up Indigenous artistry, materials, and legacy with power, visibility, and deepest beauty. (Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, accessed Nov 20, 2017).

Furthermore, this event was covered in the media through artists' blogs, websites, and news articles. Another way of discussing how an event is shaped or communicated is through describing how it is 'framed' by different actors, or groups or people. The Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was 'framed' in a variety of ways by mainstream media, alternative media, and the Indigenous designers themselves.

Media Framing

We learn about events such as Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week through the media. The media relays information to us, but it also works to frame that information. Framing can be thought of as the manner in which information is shaped, which will in turn affect how it is communicated and consumed by the audience. For instance, certain information about Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was emphasized in the media coverage of the event, while other information did not receive as much attention. Ultimately, framing refers to the different ways collective action can be framed by different actors (Snow, 2004). Gamson (2004) discusses how frames can gain power by tapping into certain cultural narratives. Gamson (2004) discusses how cultural themes can be a source of resonance for consumers of media. The master frame was introduced as a concept to

describe collective action frames that are larger in scope. Framing matters because the communication we receive about an event, such as Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, can become more important than the event itself. This is because there were only several hundred people who attended Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, however, it is very likely that thousands consumed the media coverage of the event. It is possible that many of these people never attended the event, so ultimately, some people will form their perceptions of the event solely based on how the media has chosen to frame it. So, if the media has chosen to utilize a cultural appropriation frame when talking about the fashion week and the Indigenous designers involved, this can shape how the media consumer will relate to Indigenous media in the future. This is also why asset framing is so important because it affects the perceived legitimacy and agency of media produced by Indigenous people. Framing takes on meaning beyond the meaning of the fashion show itself.

Corrigall-Brown, Wilkes and Myers (2010) also discuss the visual framing of collective action. The Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was a visual form of collective action because the messages relayed relied upon how the fashion was portrayed in images. More specifically, sometimes what is left out of an image can be even more telling of the way in which an event is being framed. An example of visual framing in the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week can be seen in how little the missing and murdered Indigenous women section of the fashion show was shown in mainstream media coverage. This image is primarily shown in The Georgia Straight magazine articles (refer to Figure 1).

Figure 1: Missing and murdered Indigenous women – Peter Jensen

Overall, mainstream media is less likely to use contentious political frames than that of alternative media, as the mainstream media only used the political frame 9% of the time when discussing the fashion week. The alternative media, such as the Georgia Straight, is more likely to include images that frame fashion week in a political way.

Methods

This study focuses on the questions of how different people framed Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, and why those frames matter. To answer the question of how people framed the event differently, I collected data on the different ways participants discussed the event, and organized those findings into four core frames that were used to discuss Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. I also collected data on how these different frames were used by different groups. The data was extracted from the websites, social media accounts and personal blogs of the Indigenous designers who participated in the fashion show.

When the following fashion designers discussed their fashion, they did so on their personal websites or in interviews conducted with small local newspapers. There were 25 designers who participated in the fashion show, listed below:

Designers	
Tyler-Alan Jacobs	Dominique Hanke
Michelle George	Linda Kay
Loraine Guss	Mia Hunt
Pam Baker Copper Knot	Curtis Oland
Oka/Shop Wrong	Dorothy Grant
Jill Stelah	Denise Brillon
Teresa Walker	Yolanda Sketlon
Alano + Manitobah	Korina Emmerich
Autumn Jules	Bill Reid
Shannon Kilroy	Dahlia Drive and Reg Davidson
Section 35	Jeneen Frei Njootli
Derek Packer	Sho Sho Esquiro
Evan Ducharme	

Table 1: List of Designers

Furthermore, here are all of the mainstream and alternative news sources listed. It is worthwhile to note that some news sources, such as The Georgia Straight, wrote several articles about VIFW.

Mainstream news sources	Alternative news sources
The Globe and Mail	The Georgia Straight
BBC 2	Pri Magazine
The Vancouver Sun	The Westender

Table 2: List of News Sources

Additionally, news articles about the event written by mainstream sources such as The Globe and Mail, BBC, and CBC were studied to analyze how these news authorities discussed the event. Smaller alternative news sources, such as the Georgia Straight and Pri magazine, were analyzed following the same methods. These articles were located through a Google search of news articles, and each article was analyzed from a framing perspective.

Through conducting content analysis of these different media documents and sources, I coded for elements of framing of the event. From my findings, the main frames I found were: the cultural appropriation frame, the art frame, the political frame, and the model frame. To highlight a study that uses a similar research method of media content analysis, Van Gorp and Vercruysse (2012) used a framing analysis of media content to examine how stigmatization of dementia is reinforced through dominant frames in the media.

Findings

The Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was a landmark event that was framed in four primary ways. I have identified four core frames that were used when describing the event. These core frames were the political frame, the art frame, the cultural appropriation frame, and lastly, the model frame. Each of these frames were used at different points by a variety of actors of Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, including the fashion designers and journalists who covered the event through mainstream and alternative media. Table 3 demonstrates the percentage findings of how often these four primary frames were used when discussing the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week.

As seen in Table 3, a large proportion (56%) of the alternative media sources used the political frame when describing the fashion. It is also evident that many of the Indigenous designers also described their fashion as being political (57%). However, the mainstream media did not reflect the political frame. Only 9% of the mainstream media coverage acknowledged the event as having political elements.

It is also noteworthy that a large portion (46%) of the mainstream media used the cultural appropriation frame, compared to the alternative media, which used the frame only 11% of the time.

These framing percentages matter because they highlight stark differences in how different groups talk about the same event. Framing matters because it affects how the public (even people who did not attend Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week), consume the media coverage and form biases and assumptions which can in turn affect outcomes for Indigenous people in Canada.

	Designers	Media	
		Mainstream	Alternative
Political Frame	57%	9%	56%
Art Frame	38%	9%	22%
Cultural Appropriation Frame	5%	46%	11%
Model Frame	0%	36%	11%
Total:	100%	100%	100%
Frames:	N=21	N=10	N=9

Table 3: List of News Sources

Furthermore, different groups framed the same event differently. Interestingly, some groups chose to use different frames simultaneously when talking about the Indigenous fashion. For example, some Indigenous designers used both the art frame and the political frame when talking about their fashion. This is used to highlight the fact that these frames are not being used mutually exclusive to each other.

Cultural Appropriation Frame

In articles written about VIFW, many journalists chose to ask questions relating to the cultural appropriation of Indigenous fashion broadly across Canada. Joleen Mitton, the creator and producer of Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week, was often interviewed to speak on behalf of the event in many of the mainstream news articles. To illustrate, when Mitton was asked about VIFW in the mainstream news coverage, they often asked her opinion on cultural appropriation without articulating the question's relevance or value to VIFW. Mitton was put in a position by the media where she had to comment as an Indigenous person on the state of cultural appropriation in Canada without bringing the topic up herself. This is problematic because many journalists used talking about cultural appropriation as a tactic to focus on cultural appreciation. For example, when Mitton was prompted to talk about cultural appropriation, she naturally follows up by sharing how VIFW is an 'authentic' event that appreciates Indigenous design, thus trying to frame the event in an accessible manner. For example, in an interview with Liz Guber from Elle Canada, Guber asks Mitton, "Did you see a lot of cultural appropriation happen in your career?" in the second last question of the interview. In this question, Guber is asking about Mitton's career as a model. Mitton responded by stating, "in general, respect needs to be a lot more practiced" (Guber, 2014). Through asking about cultural appropriation at the end of the article, the reader is left thinking that fighting cultural appropriation is the meaning of the event.

It is important to clarify the difference between cultural appropriation and cultural appreciation. While cultural appropriation is the stealing of elements of another's culture

for personal gain, cultural appreciation involves the consensual sharing of culture. Discussing issues of cultural appropriation as it relates to a Canadian context is by all means a positive and necessary discussion, however, this can become a problematic method of framing when non-Indigenous journalists speak over Indigenous voices to voice conversations on cultural appropriation leading to appreciation because it appeals to their readership.

For example, The Globe and Mail headlined the single article they published about the event as, "Vancouver's First Indigenous Fashion Week to celebrate 'cultural appreciation'" where Indigenous models and designers will come together to appreciate the fashion that is routinely appropriated by non-Indigenous folks (Szklarski, 2017). This is an issue because non-Indigenous journalists immediately labelled the event as being about appreciation and celebration without acknowledging the political motivations that many of the designers identified.

The article diverges into a discussion on authenticity in Indigenous design, where Mitton is quoted as saying "You don't have to buy that stuff from Urban Outfitters or Dsquared2 or any of that stuff, we've got that stuff already... if you like Indigenous aesthetic, buy it from those who create it and live it" (Szklarski, 2017). This is an issue because it implies that authenticity is valued for the sole purpose of consumer consumption. To draw attention to what Mitton stated in the Globe and Mail article, when designers were asked about cultural appropriation, some designers responded by stating that their fashion was an "authentic Indigenous aesthetic" because Indigenous designers produced it.

Big news outlets, such as the Globe and Mail, use the cultural appropriation frame because it is a frame that the majority of readers identify with and respond to. Conversations about cultural appropriation are prevalent in current discourse in mainstream media. The Globe and Mail does not pose any risk to its readers by discussing cultural appropriation in broad and non-specific terms, rather than delving into the context-specific political motivations at hand. To summarize, the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week is of course a reclaiming of identity through fashion, however, when journalists speak over Indigenous voices to label the meaning of the event as being about appreciating the culture that has been systematically dispossessed, it is an act of violence that is further colonizing.

However, some fashion designers, such as Curtis Oland, use the cultural appropriation frame as a means of cultural liaison between Indigenous and non-Indigenous folks. For example, Oland describes how acting as a cultural liaison through fashion can aid in the "ethical sharing of ideas" about participating in culture (Oland, 2017). Oland understands his fashion as a method of harm reduction through facilitating the consensual sharing of culture. Therefore, we can infer that Oland views the usage of fashion in Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week as a way of sharing culture, thereby leveraging the cultural appropriation frame (used by 5% of the designers) to demonstrate resistance to

co-opting elements of Indigenous culture.

Art Frame

In contrast to the political frame, the art frame was used when designers or journalists judged the fashion based on appearance, emphasizing the beauty or uniqueness of the fashion without discussing any political significance the clothing maintained.

Furthermore, some designers were adamant in insisting that their fashion had no political association and simply functioned as art. On the other hand, some designers advocated for their designs as being both political and artistic in nature. The relevance of this frame is to highlight what Goffman spoke of as "Master Statuses" (1963). Master statuses are salient identities that cloud an individual's perception of a person. This is especially important because although these fashion designers are Indigenous and produce fashion, their fashion is not inherently political because they are Indigenous. For example, designers who emphasized their fashion as being art included Dahlia Drive and Reg Davidson. Dahlia Drive and Reg Davidson shared in a video on their website homepage that the intent of their fashion is to make it accessible to everyone, asserting no political association with their fashion (Drive Davidson, http://www.dahliadrive.com/)

Political/Resistance Frame

When describing their own fashion, many participating fashion designers discussed their fashion in relation to political motivations. Many alternative news journalists also described motivations in relation to political motivations. These political motivations included the notion of 'being seen' and recognized as being present, as Indigenous people are not of the past. Many people also referenced their fashion in relation to Indian Residential Schools.

To illustrate, Evan Ducharme showcased his collection 'Atavism' at Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week (Ducharme, 2017), which describes his fashion as: "relating to or characterized as a return to something ancient or ancestral... [as well as] traits inherited from an ancestral form; usually manifested as a means of survival." I speculate that the designers discuss the political motivations regarding their fashion in order to speak to and communicate messages around Indigenous resurgence. The fashion is described in relation to cultural survival so it functions as an embodiment of Indigenous resistance. Because this research takes an asset approach to engaging with acts of Indigenous resistance, it is essential to highlight the ways in which the fashion designers framed their fashion in their own words. For instance, some participating fashion designers, such as

Evan Ducharme (Métis), framed the intent of their fashion as being political and decolonizing. Ducharme aligns himself to the political spectrum through his personal statement by describing his fashion as a means of cultural survival and resistance. To illustrate, one dress from Ducharme's Atavism collection is a red dress with a Métis belt (Figure 2).

Figure 2: Red Dress – Evan Ducharme – Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week

Red is a colour that symbolizes life in many First Nations communities, which further demonstrates how the fashion from Ducharme's collection is political in that it contains symbols of cultural survival.

Furthermore, Tyler-Alan Jacobs is a two-spirit Coast Salish (Skwxwú7mesh nation) fashion designer who openly discusses the challenges of being First Nations and gay. After facing bullying and harassment in his community after coming out as gay, Jacobs decided to reconnect with his two-spirit identity. Jacobs describes that with the support of his family, he began to explore traditionally female art forms such as beading and

fashion. Jacobs has since become a champion dancer and feels strongly about showing people that "it's okay to be gay and Native... and it's okay to showcase your culture." Jacobs discusses how his fashion designs are "100% authentic" and "it matters" to see Indigenous designs on a Canadian runway (Ghoussoub, 2014). Jacobs articulates through his interviews that he is passionate about representation and authenticity on Canadian runways, thus framing his fashion from a political perspective.

A design from Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week by designer 'Section 35' is overtly political because it shows the year "1491" embroidered on the bottom of the model's jacket, which is the year Columbus made contact (About 1491, http://aptn.ca/1491/).

Figure 3: Design by Section 35 – Photo by Peter Jensen

Furthermore, Jeneen Frei Njootli of the Vuntut Gwich'in nation investigates the relationship between "trade, ceremonial regalia, and the politics of First Nations art" (Kott, 2017). Njootli is well known for starting "ReMatriate," a collective for female-identifying

Indigenous artists. As a participating fashion designer, Njootli discusses how she often thinks of how "Indigenous bodies are consumed by different public" (Kott, 2017). Njootli aligns herself on the far end of the political spectrum through discussing intersectionality in art and fashion, and aiding in creating spaces that further creative development.

Model Frame

Joleen Mitton is the producer of Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. She is also the founder of All My Relations entertainment. Because Mitton is the face of VIFW, she was often interviewed to speak on behalf of the event. However, more often than not, Mitton was asked questions about her prior career as a model before interviewers inquired about the event itself. More interestingly, interviewers framed Mitton's modelling career differently than how Mitton framed herself. Interviewers asked questions to provoke answers about the alluring, exotic and 'dangerous' elements of Mitton's career, such as travelling, drugs and partying. These questions paint a narrative of a troubled young model who found her way through producing authentic Indigenous design. While parts of this journalistic narration are true, it does not reflect how Mitton describes herself in her own words.

Mitton describes how her modelling career benefited her in her work as a community activist. In a video interview, "Culture Saves Lives," Mitton describes how she felt as though she had lost herself through travelling the world for modelling, and upon returning home she learned how to do community healing through beauty. Mitton did this through working as a community support worker in Indigenous communities and hosting fashion shows. She also describes her modelling past as a way to connect with youth, as finding purpose in her modelling career meant using it as a form of expression to help fellow Indigenous people connect with each other in the community (True Calling, YouTube, 2017).

Conclusion

It is evident from the many articles that were produced about the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week from both mainstream and alternative media sources different groups framed this event in a variety of ways. However, irrespective of the ways this event was discussed, the Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week was a groundbreaking and landmark event. The significance of this event is spreading across the country, as Toronto gears up to host its first Indigenous Fashion Week Toronto in the spring of 2018.

Through media content analysis of the four dominant frames used by the media

when discussing this event, it is clear that the mainstream media is less likely to use contentious political frames when discussing the event. Sources such as the Globe and Mail, the BBC and the Vancouver Sun often talked about cultural appropriation to appeal to their readership and avoid conversations of reconciliation. However, the asset framing that was evident in the alternative media discourses supported the designers in expressing how they perceived the meaning of their fashion and the larger significance of the event itself. A limitation of this research is the chosen research method of media content analysis, because through qualitative interviews with the participating designers, a future researcher could identify what the designers thought of the framed media coverage surrounding the event and their fashion, thereby adding another layer of analysis.

We should also consider the differences between appropriation and appreciation. Cultural appropriation is the stealing of elements of another's culture, whereas cultural appreciation involves the consensual sharing of culture. When non-Indigenous journalists speak over Indigenous voices to label the meaning of an Indigenous-produced event as being about cultural appropriation when participants had not named it themselves, it is an act of violence that is further colonizing.

Ultimately, the media discourse surrounding this event should be interpreted in the larger context of Canada's Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Canada is by no means a perfect example of reconciliation as many of the 94 Calls to action have yet to be fulfilled (CBC Radio, 2017). However, Canada's active Truth and Reconciliation Commission means the conversation on Indigenous rights has changed. The context of the TRC puts into focus how differing conversations in the media about the event matter because they highlight how framing discourse can change outcomes for Indigenous people (Fforde, 2013).

References

About 1491: The Untold Stories of the Americas Before Columbus. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved from: https://aptn.ca/1491/?fbclid=IwAR155yMyR8D83jzHgurVNxYMWocG-pCrGjQnnl60D9Uo4d82UbSaO1Tc5a4

APTN. "The untold story of the Americas before Columbus." Accessed April 2018. Retrieved from: http://aptn.ca/1491/

Aspers, P. & Godart, F. (2013). "Sociology of fashion: Order and change." *Annual Review of Sociology*, 39: 171-192.

Baldridge, B. (2014). "Relocating the Deficit: Reimagining Black Youth in Neoliberal Times." *American Educational Research Journal*, 51(3): 440 - 472.

Blatta, E. (2017). "Made on Turtle Island: Vancouver's very first indigenous fashion week honours heritage, identity and expression." *Beatroute*. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from: http://beatroute.ca/2017/07/25/made-turtle-island-vancouvers-first-indigenous-fashion-week-honours-heritage-identity-expression/

Blumer, H. (1969). 'From class differentiation to collective selection.' *The Sociology Quarterly*, 10(3): 275 – 291.

Brasfield, C. (2001). "Residential school syndrome." *BC Medical Journal*, 43(2): 78-81. Retrieved from: http://www.bcmj.org/article/residential-school-syndrome

CBC News (2015). "National centre for truth and reconciliation opens in winnipeg". Retrieved April 14, 2018: http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/manitoba/national-centre-truth-reconciliation-winnipeg-1.3301305

CBC News. (2017). "Curious about how many of the TRC's calls to action have been completed? Check Ian Mosby's Twitter". Accessed April 2018, Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/radio/unreserved/how-are-you-putting-reconciliation-into-action-1.4362219/curious-about-how-many-of-the-trc-s-calls-to-actions-have-been-completed-check-ian-mosby-s-twitter-1.4364330

Chen, L et al (2012). A theory on fashion consumption. 3(4), 84-92.

Clarke, V. & Spence, K. (2013) 'I am who I am?' Navigating norms and the importance of authenticity in lesbian and bisexual women's accounts of their appearance practices.' *Psychology & Sexuality*, 4(1): 25-33.

Cook, M. (2014). "A hot new model at the Australian Indigenous Fashion Week." The Conversation. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from: https://theconversation.com/a-hot-new-model-at-the-australian-indigenous-fashion-week-25389

Cooper, B. (2014). "Iggy Azalea's post-racial mess: America's oldest race tale, remixed." Salon. Accessed April 13, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.salon.com/2014/07/15/iggy_azaleas_post_racial_mess_americas_oldest_race_tale_remixed/

Crane, D. (1999). Diffusion models and fashion: A reassessment. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 566(1): 13-24.

Dahlia Drive. Ravens, Eagles, Polka Dots. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved From: https://www.dahliadrive.com/?fbclid=IwAR0odFQkvyy-M27bjyecpXOnQGhTe_Tq369DJ6IDi72G6BbXqsLS2kCP1xE

Delorme, C. (2017). "NoDAPL A Movement of Nonviolent Indigenous Resistance." Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved from: https://www.policyalternatives.ca/sites/default/files/uploads/publications/National%20Office/2017/02/osos126_winter2017_NoDAPL.pdf

Dowell, K. (2013). *Sovereign Screens: Aboriginal Media on the West Coast.* Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press.

Ducharme, E. (2017). *Atavism*. Website. Accessed April 10, 2017. Retrieved from:
    https://www.evanducharme.com/atavism-2017/

Fforde, C et al (2013). Discourse, deficit and identity: Aboriginality, the race paradigm
    and the language of representation in contemporary Australia. *Media International
    Australia, Incorporating Culture & Policy*. 149, 162-173.

Fox, K. (1987). Real Punks and Pretenders: "The social organization of a
    counterculture" *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, 16(3): 344-370.

Gamson, W. (2004). "Bystanders, Public Opinion, and the Media." *The Blackwell
    Companion to Social Movements*. United Kingdom: Blackwell Publishing.

Gaunt, K. (2015). 'Youtube, twerking & you: Context collapse and the handheld
    co-presence of black girls and Miley Cyrus.' *Journal of Popular Music Studies*,
    27(8): 224 – 273.

Ghoussoub, M. (2014). "Coast Salish designer brings Native art to mainstream fashion."
    The Thunderbird. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved from:
    https://thethunderbird.ca/2014/12/01/coast-salish-designer-brings-native-art-to-
    mainsteam-fashion/

Goffman, Erving. (1963) *Stigma: notes on the management of spoiled identity*.
    Englewood Cliffs, N.J., Prentice-Hall.

Guber, L. 2017. 'The first Vancouver indigenous fashion week is here.' *Elle Canada*.
    Published July 25, 2017.

Harris, A. (2017). "Q&A: Joleen Mitton talks modelling, Vancouver indigenous fashion
    week." *The Vancouver Sun*. Accessed April 13, 2018. Retrieved from:
    http://vancouversun.com/health/women/q-a-joleen-mitton-talks-modelling-
    vancouver-indigenous-fashion-week

Hebdige, D. (1991). *Subculture: the meaning of style*. London: Routledge.

How To Do Thanksgiving Makeup That Has Nothing To Do with these 566 Federally
    Recognized Tribes. Youtube. Accessed Dec 4th, 2017
    ttps://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zYWt2mnalP8

Indigenous Foundations. Accessed Dec 5, 2017. Retrieved from:
    http://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/terminology/

Kawamura, Y. (2006). "Japanese teens as producers of street fashion." *Current
    Sociology*, 54(5): 784-801.

Kingston, A. (2017). "The making of Vancouver's first indigenous fashion week."
    Maclean's. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from:
    http://www.macleans.ca/news/canada/the-making-of-canadas-first-indigenous-
    fashion-week/

Kott, K. (2017). "Jeneen Frei Njootli: Subverting, Reclaiming and Redefining." *Discorder Magazine*. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved from: https://www.citr.ca/discorder/april-2017/jeneen-frei-njootli/

Lau, L. (2017). "First-ever Vancouver indigenous fashion week to honour aboriginal craftsmanship and culture." *The Georgia Straight*. Accessed April 13, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.straight.com/life/913826/first-ever-vancouver-indigenous-fashion-week-honour-aboriginal-craftsmanship-and-culture

Lau, L. (2017). "From model to mentor, Joleen Mitton finds her calling at Vancouver indigenous fashion week." *The Georgia Straight*. Accessed April 13, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.straight.com/life/938271/model-mentor-joleen-mitton-finds-her-calling-vancouver-indigenous-fashion-week

Lobban, J. (2014). "As industry craves authenticity, aboriginal fashion week takes flight." *Business of Fashion*. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.businessoffashion.com/articles/global-currents/industry-craves-authenticity-aboriginal-fashion-week-takes-flight

Mas, S. (2015). "Truth and Reconciliation Commission offers 94 'calls to action'." *CBC News*. Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/truth-and-reconciliation-94-calls-to-action-1.3362258

Michelle Williams in 'redface' magazine cover controversy. *Toronto Sun*. Accessed Dec 4, 2018: http://torontosun.com/2013/03/19/michelle-williams-in-redface-magazine-cover-controversy/wcm/0960df93-9280-49fc-bfa6-8a5a735f760c

Montpetit, I. (2011). "Treaties from 1760-1923: Two sides to the story." *CBC News*. Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/treaties-from-1760-1923-two-sides-to-the-story-1.1081839

Narang, S. (2017). "These photos show the strength and beauty of Aboriginal cultures in Canada." *Pri magazine*. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.pri.org/stories/2017-09-20/these-photos-show-strength-and-beauty-aboriginal-cultures-canada

Oland, C. (2017). "About the brand." *Curtis Oland*. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved from: http://www.curtisoland.com/fashion

Shapiro, S. & MacDonald, M. (2017). "From deficit to asset: Locating discursive resistance in a refugee-background student's written and oral narrative." *Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, 16(2): 80-93.

Shane, S. & D Mark, A. (2016). "Edgework, fun and identification in a recreational subculture: Street BMX riders." *Qualitative Sociology Review*, 12(4): 84-99.

Shivji, S. (2017). "'Reclaiming what is ours:' 1st Vancouver indigenous fashion week instills pride." *CBC News*. Accessed April 12, 2018. Retrieved from: http://www.cbc.ca/news/entertainment/reclaiming-what-is-ours-1st-vancouver-indigenous-fashion-week-instils-pride-1.4223140

Simmel, G. (1957). "Fashion." *The American Journal of Sociology*, 62(6): 541-588.

Snow, D., Soule, S. & Kriesi, H. (2004). "Bystanders, public opinion, and the media." *The Blackwell Companion to Social Movements*. United Kingdom: Blackwell Publishing.

Staggenborg, S. & Ramos, H. (2016). *Social Movements*. Ontario, Canada: Oxford University Press.

Szklarski, C. (2017). "Vancouver's first fashion week to celebrate 'cultural appreciation.'" *The Globe and Mail*. Accessed April 12, 2018. Retrieved from: https://beta.theglobeandmail.com/news/british-columbia/vancouvers-first-indigenous-fashion-week-to-celebrate-cultural-appreciation/article35023690/?ref=http://www.theglobeandmail.com&

"The stolen generations." Australians Together. Accessed April 14, 2018. Retrieved from: https://www.australianstogether.org.au/discover/australian-history/stolen-generations

True Calling. (2017, Jun 20). True Calling: Indigenous Stories. Accessed April 22, 2019. Retrieved From: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XkT0_2JSIEk

Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada. Retrieved from: http://www.trc.ca/websites/trcinstitution/index.php?p=39. Accessed Nov. 20, 2017.

No author. "Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week shows off First Nation's designs." *BBC News*. Accessed April 11, 2018. Retrieved from: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-us-canada-40763306

Vancouver Indigenous Fashion Week. Accessed Nov. 20, 2017. Retrieved from: http://vifw.webflow.io/

Van Gorp, B. & Vercruysse, T. (2012). Frames and counter-frames giving meaning to dementia: A framing analysis of media content. *Social Sciences & Medicine*, 74(8), 1274-1281.

Wheeler, B. (2013). "Polaris-shortlisted A Tribe Called Red reclaim their First Nations culture". T*he Globe and Mail*. Retrieved from: https://www.theglobeandmail.com/arts/music/polaris-shortlisted-a-tribe-called-red-reclaim-their-first-nation-culture/article13262050/

Wilkes, R., Corrigall-Brown, C., Myers, D. (2010). Packaging Protest: Media Coverage of Indigenous Peoples Collective Action. *Canadian Review of Sociology*, 47(4): 327-357.

Wimborne, T. (2017). "How other countries have tried to reconcile with native peoples." *The Globe and Mail*. Retrieved from: https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/how-other-countries-have-tried-to-reconcile-with-native-peoples/article24826144/

Brooklyn Nine-Nine and Policing in Liberal Police Procedurals

Maude Bachand-Bergeron
McGill University

Abstract. Most academic writings on the criminal drama television genre have argued that it is inherently conservative by virtue of its basic values. Other authors, however, define the genre as being representative of the entire common ideological spectrum, yet little work has been done on the specific use of liberal values as support for the state apparatus in crime television. This paper outlines some of the prominent characteristics of crime dramas, its potential for influence upon audiences' views of policing—such as unconditional support for the institution of the police and the use of diversity as shelter from accusations of racism. Then, this paper examines how these features of the crime television genre and liberalism intersect and manifest in the 2013 crime comedy *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*, and analyzes some of its episodes using the framework delineated above. I argue that *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* occupies a specific ideological place in the genre with its left-leaning ideology and occasional criticism of police brutality, while keeping a distinctly neoliberal and individualized viewpoint on the institutions of police and white supremacy.

Introduction

Since 2014, discussions about policing, the excessive use of force, and racism have gotten a new amount of attention due to the murder of Michael Brown, the subsequent Ferguson riots, and the rise of the Black Lives Matter movement (Chernega, 2016). Over the year and a half following Brown's murder, more murders of black people by police officers and associated protests by the black community were publicized more than ever before. Despite this sudden (white) public attention on police brutality, the media coverage remained dedicated to undermining the black activists, with a clear emphasis on the prior arrests of the murder victims, the supposed violence of protestors and critiques of the movement

at large (Banks, 2018). The newfound prominence of these police-critical discourses in news coverage, on social media and in the white public's collective conscious has affected the socio-political discussions surrounding crime and policing. For the first time in American history, statistics of civilian killings by police officers were compiled in 2015 by the Washington Post, which found that almost a thousand people were killed. Specifically, 40% of those killed who were unarmed were black men, despite their making up only 6% of the American population. Additionally, of the thousand total civilian killings by police in 2015, there were only 18 indictments of officers for the killings (Kindy, Fisher, Tate & Jenkins, 2015).

The influence of the media attention on these issues can be very potent: Lasley (1994) examined attitudes towards police before and after the Rodney King incident of 1991 and found that opinions of the police declined sharply after awareness of police brutality, even for white and latinx populations. As this awareness of police brutality is rising again, it is important to examine the cultural and sociopolitical landscape that might influence or reflect public opinions of policing. As anti-police brutality activists have tried to increase public awareness of institutional racism and police officers' responsibility in this system, it also is important to analyze if the cultural context makes this systemic approach hard to propagate. In this case, I want to examine the neoliberal and liberal portrayal of police detectives in the television police sitcom *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* (Goor, Schur, Miner, Lord, Miller & Del Tredici, 2013) and how it portrays an individualistic outlook on problems found in police forces while simultaneously postulating as a progressive and liberal television show.

However, his article is far from the first to examine police procedurals and their surrounding political contexts: crime dramas have been the subject of much research in the past decades by both criminologists and media studies experts. The popularity of both the genre and the analyses of it can be attributed to the relevance of policing and crime in current political discourses. As De Bruin (2010) explains, "[police series] speak to the society in which they are produced and its citizens about their concerns regarding crime, policing and punishment" (p. 311). As I will argue, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* occupies a specific ideological place in the genre of crime television by using politically liberal strategies like diversity and discussions of racism in order to make the police propaganda of crime television more palatable to a liberal public, while existing in a post-racial and neoliberal context that prevents it from questioning the institution of law enforcement and white supremacy.

The purpose of this paper, then, is to examine *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* as a specific manifestation of liberalism in crime drama television and understand its position within the rest of the genre as a result. My theoretical framework relies on the intersection of crime television, neoliberal economic theory and liberal political ideology. With regards to genre, the characteristics of the crime procedural, comedic incarnations of crime-related entertainment as well as the potency of the genre's influence upon audiences are exam-

ined. This is followed by an analysis of the intersection of neoliberal market forces, progressive and liberal politics in media entertainment, specifically portrayals of law enforcement, and the use of diversity. After delineating the framework described above, I analyze some of the most prominent features of *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*, as well as a handful of specific episodes.

Police Procedural Genre

The prominence of crime drama television is made obvious by the sheer number of programs made since the emergence of the genre; in 2016, Dowler puts the count at almost 300 programs, excluding those not centered on police like programs about lawyers, criminals, or private detectives (2016, p. 2). Furthermore, this subset of television has been the subject of substantive research in the past years, although Nichols-Petick (2012) describes this body of research as mostly one-dimensional in its characterization of police dramas as conservative-leaning. This wide study of police dramas relies on the assumption that crime television discusses important matters for audiences, and that the images and information in crime television influence the audience's worldview. There is thus a reciprocal relationship between the ideologies presented on crime television and those held by audiences.

Nichols-Petick demonstrates the significance of studying a genre that reflects the current public discourse surrounding a major societal institution by drawing on John Corner on his definition of the "'extraordinary cultural dynamics' of television" to showcase the aforementioned relationship between television production and viewing. The cultural dynamic of mass media, as per Corner, is "the medium's ability simultaneously to 'ingest' elements of the 'culture-at-large' and to 'project' those elements back into the cultural arena in the form of stories" (as quoted by Nichols-Petick, 2012, p. 3).

Crime in Entertainment

Crime has been portrayed in media in multiple different genres and contexts. The presence of police detectives and crime resolution has been a prime subject not only in the television police procedural but in television news and multiple strands of entertainment media. The presence of crime, law enforcement and racial bias in televised news has been discussed above extensively, and the purpose here is to discuss the salience of crime and police fiction in modern entertainment genres, specifically the buddy cop movie and the televised police drama.

The buddy cop genre is one that was created and subsequently used in the 1980s and 90s as a response to changing racial paradigms in the United States. After the civil rights movement of the 1960s, the dominant entertainment industry responded by releasing a series of movies featuring mostly black men as superheroes, genre that became known as Blaxploitation (Artz, 1998). Artz (1998) explains that Blaxploitation movies, rather than being radical for their portrayal of black heroes, were a way to pander to black audiences and to monetize and depoliticize black power by repackaging black stereotypes into hero roles. Despite this hegemonic stereotyped representation of blackness, the rebellious heroic streak portrayed in Blaxploitation movies was largely written out by the 1980s, and black characters in movies were largely relegated to supporting roles (Artz, 1998). The result of this new change in popular movies representing black characters was the buddy movie: movies where a team of two police officers or spies, often one black and one white, and opposite in almost all other ways, cooperates to resolve cases. The characteristics that made buddy cop movies attractive to black and white audiences were two sides of the same coin: where black audiences saw their culture reflected, white audiences saw their stereotypes validated. Weak white characters being next to the strong and street smart main black character was only possible when almost every other character, and especially those in charge, were white (Artz, 1998).

Oh (2012) describes Rush Hour (1998), the first buddy cop to portray a duo with a black officer and a Chinese one, as a further step in the commodification of non-white stories and identities for the benefit of whiteness. He states that "multiracial representations often are used in ways that confirm neoliberal views about race, advancing the notion that institutional racism no longer matters because on the face of things representational equity appears to exist" (Oh, 2012, p. 352). Ultimately, the buddy movie, whether representing police officers or not, was a way for Hollywood to monetize anti-racist politics by portraying black heroes on screen without confronting or confronting stereotypes and institutional racism (Oh, 2012; Artz, 1998; Jeffries & Jeffries, 2017).

On the other hand, the main genre that exploits the crime and police genre as its main domain is the television crime drama, of which the genealogical tree is quite different. Differing from the Hollywood buddy cop movie which derived from a legacy of anti-racist politics, action movies and Blaxploitation movies, Primasita & Ahimsa-Putra (2019) explain that the crime drama genre is a specific subgenre of the established detective story, but with its own conventions. The crime drama genre differentiated itself from the detective story in the 1940s in response to the disillusionment that followed the Vietnam war and the ensuing distrust of many government institutions (Primasita & Ahimsa-Putra, 2019). The police procedural distinguishes itself from the larger detective genre by making use of police detectives as protagonists and by following specific departmental procedures as guideline in the crime resolution (Primasita & Ahimsa-Putra, 2019). There are more conventions to the genre of police procedural than those that define it as a separate subgenre from most detective stories, including the portrayal of police work as a thankless and hard profession, the police protagonist as an ordinary mortal for the

audience to relate to, and the pressing need for quick resolution of crimes (Primasita & Ahimsa-Putra, 2019). In differentiating crime dramas from news coverage and real-world statistics of crime, Donovan's 2013 dissertation outlines the overrepresentation of murder (56% on crime dramas as opposed to 0.1% in the United States in 2011), the pronounced emphasis on planned crime and individual responsibility over environmental or institutional factors and the constant depiction of civil rights violations by officers in a positive light.

Both the buddy cop movie and the crime drama program come from their own genealogical branch of fictional genres, and portray police officers in their positions in comedy and drama, respectively. *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* situates itself in the crime drama genre, conforming to all the conventions except that of the dramatic mode. Instead of the common dramatic mode and occasional comic relief of police dramas, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* uses the police detective and procedural conventions of one genre and pairs it with the comedy and conventions of the situation comedy genre. Co-creator Michael Schur stated in 2014 that the pairing of police procedural and comedies have been rare on American television (D'alessandro, 2014), and the specific ways in which *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* portrays police work within its specific conventions is worth examining in relation to other crime dramas. Compared to buddy cop comedies, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* has two major differences: The different comedic influences of the buddy genre and the sitcom, and most importantly, the potency of a weekly televised show that showcases characters who become regular occurrences in audiences' lives (Donovan, 2013). The regular presence of the television program in the lives and minds of audiences is necessary to its influence in the cultural landscape and in the opinions of the viewers.

Ideology and Politics

Jonathan Nichols-Petick's TV Cops (2012) delineates the history of the ideological development of the crime drama genre on television since the 1970s. According to Nichols-Petick, research on police dramas tends to characterize the entire genre as inherently conservative (2012), due to the myths of right and wrong, the obsession with morality tales and the portrayal of crime and punishment. Brooks Robard, as quoted by Nichols-Petick, defines crime procedurals as a "conservative genre that works to re-establish over and over again the importance of social order" (p. 8) due to the constant importance given to the authority and power of law enforcement. The author, however, disagrees with this characterization of police dramas as inescapably conservative, and thinks these analyses are reductive instead of explanatory (2012).

Nichols-Petick views the above critiques of the genre as a discursive attempt at defining the genre of police drama, rather than a real representation of the politics of the different programs (2012). While Nichols-Petick acknowledges that stories about the po-

lice are mainly concerned with power and politics, he argues that the large amount of police procedural programs represent the entire range of mainstream political opinions depending on their individual characteristics. He considers police procedurals as a series of entries into the sociopolitical discussions surrounding crime and punishment, and argues that they address our "most pressing concerns" about social rights, social responsibilities, and the concept of citizenship (2012). Looking at the different developments and innovations into the genre over the past four decades, Nichols-Petick also argues that "each of [the series studied] responded to changing social, cultural, and political conditions, specifically [...] changing discourses about law and order" (2012, p. 75). However, while television programs cannot be essentialized to a single strand of political thought, and the crime drama genre struggles with its portrayal of law enforcement as good despite problems with racism, homophobia and flippant attitudes about civil liberties, the genre remains firmly supportive of law enforcement and does not challenge the status quo of the existence of policing forces.

The discussion of specific portrayals of law enforcement is reserved for a later section of this article, but the motivations behind unshaking support for police supremacy remains important to the ideological qualifications of the genre. Ericson (1991) qualifies mass media as reflective of dominant ideologies, and argues that it is an ideological apparatus to maintain class distinctions. Furthermore, Ericson argues that mass media depending upon and being controlled by private capitalist forces makes its conformism inescapable (1991). He also hypothesizes more clearly on the position of television in the larger society, stating that "this mass media institution not only has a complete life of its own; it is constituted by and helps to constitute other institutions in the social structure" (Ericson, 1991, p. 222). In essence, mass media do represent a range of different political ideologies, yet by its very design, it will never be progressive enough to question the state apparatus, or challenge the capitalist class structure that both conservative and liberal ideologies sustain.

Similarly, Carlson's book *Prime Time Law Enforcement* (1985) designates the goal of mass media as the promotion of stability and the status quo, and more specifically says that attitudes presented by the most successful crime television tend to be the ones that reflect the opinions of the public. In the same vein, Carlson explains that mass media "tend to reinforce existing attitudes rather than develop and [change] them" (1985, p. 4). Considering Nichols-Petick's (2012) explanation that stories about policing help us understand the current state of law enforcement, it is reasonable to understand crime drama not only as discursive entries into discussions about the police, but also as attempts to justify the existence of policing to audiences across the political spectrum.

Crime Drama Audiences

The second part of the reciprocal relationship of crime television is the influence of the genre on audiences, and has been the subject of multiple studies and theories in the past. As explained earlier, the ideologies presented in fictional crime television reflects the audience's beliefs rather than confronts them, and always reaffirms the status quo of the existence of police. However, the implication is not that audiences take nothing away from television, but rather that their beliefs are amplified and strengthened by television. Obviously, the potency of television as a socialization agent is contingent on the amount of socialization every individual is currently experiencing in the other spheres of their lives (Carlson, 1985).

Much of the research done on the influence of media on public images of law enforcement have focused on nonfiction, namely police reality shows and news coverage of police work. Mastro, Knight Lapinski, Kopacz & Behm-Morawitz (2009) argue that the televised portrayals of black people as violent perpetrators increase fear of crime in white populations, as anti-black stereotypes seem confirmed in media. In news programs specifically, black people are overrepresented as perpetrators and underrepresented as victims, and they are more likely to be nameless and menacing. In Mastro et al.'s study of white college students being shown fake news reports, race was consistently significant as a factor in the blame attributed to perpetrators of sexual assault by all respondents regardless of gender. However, men allocated less guilt to the male perpetrators on average than to women, but their racial bias was more evident (Mastro et al., 2009).

Callanan & Rosenberger's 2011 study found news programs and crime reality shows to be the most significant in influencing opinions of the police. Their survey of California residents about their media-watching habits and opinions of policing found that black people were much more likely to distrust the police, think they were unfair, and think they regularly used excessive force across all other factors. Being Latino, having had past experience with victimization and/or arrests were linked with negative attitudes about the police, while higher income, Republican political association, and being white were associated with more positive attitudes. With regards to media consumption, both televised news and crime reality shows, like COPS, were correlated with higher confidence in the police (Callanan & Rosenberger, 2011).

Dowler & Zawilski (2007), on their part, found that news and crime-solving programs were the most significant in their influence on audiences. The race and socioeconomic effects were similar to the studies above: whites, higher-educated respondents, and men were more likely to think police misconduct was rare, and those who were previously charged thought misconduct common. Interestingly, heavy consumers of police dramas were likely to think that wealthy people are likely treated better by law enforcement, and heavy consumers of crime-solving shows (such as *America's Most Wanted* or

Unsolved Mysteries) thought the very opposite (Dowler & Zawilski, 2007).

The above studies highlight the importance of media in both informing and reflecting our opinions of police, yet their results about crime drama were largely insignificant. As a result, many researchers have dug deeper into the influence of fictional crime drama specifically. As Carlson (1985) mentions, television entertainment only works so well in the socialization of audiences for two reasons: firstly is that the message doesn't challenge values already held by the audience, and secondly, message is repeated constantly by numerous programs. In the context of police procedurals, Grant (1992) states that crime television portrays "decontextualized portraits of crime [that] pretend that crime is not a human invention designed to protect a set of social relationships" (p. 58), communicating to audiences a view of policing that protects the institution of police by reifying crime as a natural phenomenon. Furthermore, the use of force on these crime dramas, rather than abiding by the rules, proves that audiences accept and believe that justice can be done through repression and force (Grant, 1992, p. 58). Numerous writers echo this theory, explaining how police forces on television are always portrayed as sympathetic (Weitzer, 2005), as well as heroic and brave despite their illegal behaviour (Ericson, 1991; Donovan, 2013; Callanan and Rosenberger, 2011). As a result, even fictional police television can confirm beliefs in the righteousness of law enforcement forces for audiences, and reinforce the sympathy offered for "heroic" police officers in real life.

An additional study conducted by De Bruin (2010) with high school students in the Netherlands to determine whether the views presented on crime television affected the views of teenagers. The 121 students, aged between 14 and 17 and mainly children of colour from "black schools," a type segregated diverse Dutch high schools, watched part of an episode of Dutch crime programs and were subsequently interviewed in groups (De Bruin, 2010). The results of their interviews were highly contingent upon the race of the students: Children of colour were aware of racism from the police, and realized that the images presented in these television shows were idealized, clean images of police forces, but were not surprised by it (De Bruin, 2010). The use of stereotypical characters of colour in the episodes was also interpreted in opposite ways by white children and children of colour: despite these portrayals being stereotypical, the children of colour tended to enjoy them and relate to them, but these characters reinforced the racist beliefs of the white children, who made racist comments in many of the group interviews (De Bruin, 2010). This second result in particular shows the ways in which television is interpreted differently by those who watch it, reinforcing the beliefs of the different populations who watch them.

Carlson (1985) led a similar study to the one above, giving surveys to 619 students between the 6th and 12th grades in Rhode Island. However, these students were mainly Catholic, over representing the religion compared to its demographic presence, and race was not studied by the author at all (Carlson, 1985). Despite these limitations, Carlson tested the relationship between the students' crime drama viewing habits, and their views

on six different categories: Knowledge of the criminal justice system, support for the legal system, support for civil liberties, images of police, fear of crime, and political cynicism (1985). The study found that the children were overwhelmingly compliant with the law, generally dismissive of civil rights and liberties, and that they viewed police forces very positively, despite thinking they were too violent (Carlson, 1985). As for crime television, more frequent viewing of crime dramas were positively correlated with both support for the legal system and views of police as effective, and negatively correlated with support for civil liberties and views of police-community relations (Carlson, 1985). These results confirm that crime television helps with socialization of positive attitudes towards the police.

Furthermore, one of the most studied effects of crime television concerns the theory that the sympathetic portrayals of law enforcement on television actually impede the lives of real law enforcement: The "CSI effect," first mentioned after the premiere of *CSI* in 2000, could be detrimental by leading jurors to acquit when they would have convicted if their standards of the quantity of forensic proof wasn't heightened by the *CSI* television program. Cole & Dioso-Villa (2009) detail the popularity of the CSI effect by popular magazines, yet find little concluding evidence that this effect does, in fact, exist. However, Baskin & Sommers (2010) studied the links between views on forensic science and crime television watching to determine the pre-trial attitudes of potential future jurors in California and found that crime television viewing was correlated with a lower likelihood to convict without scientific evidence (Baskin & Sommers, 2010). Cumulatively, these two articles show that crime television is not only influential on the worldviews of their audiences and their potential to change or influence attitudes about policing are an important subject for both popular magazines, and academic research. On her part, Donovan (2013) examined at length the content of crime drama on television, as well as the effects of those programs on opinions of public policy. In three consecutive surveys of college students and their reactions to a written script imitating a typical crime drama episode, she found that controllability over the crime and certainty over guilt instigated feelings of anger in the respondents, and increased support over punitiveness. This result combined with her assessment that between 85% and 100% of offenders on three different crime dramas (The Mentalist, NCIS and Criminal Minds) were apprehended (Donovan, 2013, p. 150) indicates the ease with which viewers of crime dramas can become resenting of perceived criminals.

Donovan also performed analyses of individual randomized surveys on media consumption and policy attitudes. In a survey of Long Island residents, support for trying juvenile offenders as adults increased 14% for viewers of crime dramas, 56% from the zip code with least black people to the one with the biggest black population, and decreased 25% for black people themselves. An analysis of a 1995 survey showed that crime drama watching habits were positively correlated with support for the death penalty and that regular crime drama habits were the only significant predictor in support for higher spending on crime. Additionally, racial resentment was associated with a decrease in death penalty

support for crime drama viewers, and for non-viewers, with a high increase (Donovan, 2013). These different results confirm the wide array of research that shows that both being black and being anti-black have substantial effects on opinions of law enforcement policy and police themselves (Donovan, 2013).

The last analysis performed by Donovan was a correlation analysis of the prominence of crime dramas in the yearly top-watched television shows and public support for more punitive policy with regards to crime in the past decades in the United States, controlling for news media attention, crime rates and economic and political conditions. She found that crime drama popularity was the only significant predictor of support for the death penalty, and that crime dramas were related to most punitive indicators, and with results on policy (Donovan, 2013).

This analysis is particularly significant because overall, literature on the effect of crime television on audiences finds many different and contradictory correlations. The analysis performed by Donovan, however, shows that even beyond individual effects, the presence and popularity of crime dramas is linked to public opinions of crime and response to crime.

Pautz (2016) stated that the media's portrayal of law enforcement is "a refraction of the reality, constructed in accordance with the organizational imperatives of the media industry, the ideological frames of creative personnel and audiences, and the changing balance of political and economic forces affecting both the reality and the image of policing" (252), and thus that examining crime dramas within the larger social, cultural and political landscape might be as important as the effects on individuals. Whether crime drama is a distorted mirror image of public opinions on law enforcement or a tool of propaganda meant to influence public opinions, its content is worth analysing closely.

Neoliberalism and Liberalism in the Police Procedural

Both neoliberalism and liberalism in this paper are discussed specifically within the context of crime television, and their effects on how crime and policing are treated. Here, it is important to differentiate between neoliberalism, the economic and political ideology that emphasizes personal responsibility, and the liberal political ideology defined as left-leaning policies on social spending, beliefs in civil liberties, anti-racism and anti-sexism, as per Langworthy & Whitehand (1986). Neoliberalism and liberalism, under this view, are typically opposed, especially as the rise of neoliberal policies in the United States law in the past 40 years has been correlated with a steep decline in the country's democracy ranking (Meyers, 2018). Here, the point is not to conflate them but to look at the way liberalism views policing, and at the way left-leaning politics have adapted to a neoliberal economic system.

First, it is important to describe and define neoliberal economics: As per Meyers (2018), neoliberalism is a specific kind of capitalism that emphasizes individual choice and personal responsibility as solutions to prejudice, as opposed to the social welfare programs made to reduce inequality. The chapter further explains that neoliberal ideas initially spread through the media, controlled by those advantaged by laissez-faire capitalism, and now permeates all media, regardless of political ideology or perceived neutrality (Meyers, 2018). The neoliberal ideology has also influenced the way racism is understood in the public mind. As Banks (2018) puts it, "under current neoliberal imposts, cultural values associated with individualism have generated a discourse of post-race where individuals not collective groups are made salient" (711). This post-racial ideology is important to analyzing current politics. As neoliberalism has permeated the viewpoints portrayed on television, programs are more likely to portray racism in accordance with post-racial theory, and thus that racism is a personal responsibility instead of a systemic, institutional, or community problem.

On the other hand, politically liberal ideology views social welfare programs as necessary to solve social inequality, yet have had to adapt to an insidious neoliberal ideology. As a result, even though liberal attitudes towards crime tend to be less punitive than their conservative counterparts and liberals tend to believe in prison and police reforms (Langworthy & Whitehand, 1986), these stances are still not dedicated to systemic solutions like police abolition and other radical stances. Furthermore, while liberalism views the causes of crimes to be social contexts like poverty, their stances on policing and prison shows that they are more concerned with reforming an existing system than with overthrowing oppressive social structures and institutions like capitalism and police forces. In crime television specifically, Carlson discusses three specific tactics used to foster and encourage compliance with the existing system, regardless of political values: the dichotomization between "good cops" and "bad criminals," showing violent consequences of crime, and proving the effectiveness of law enforcement (Carlson, 1985). These tactics are used by all television programs to justify and ratify the power and authority of police forces, yet liberal television poses itself as progressive by two additional tactics: The confrontation of police racism and brutality, and diversification of characters.

Policing and Abolition

One of the most popular crime television programs that has been qualified as politically progressive and liberal was the 1981 show *Hill Street Blues* (Bochco, 1981), which portrayed police officers as occasionally corrupt and racist (Nichols-Petick, 2012). Despite this representation, Grant (1992) argues that that the function of the corruption was to create a dichotomy between these corrupted bad apples, and the heroic figure of the main police character, Captain Furillo. Grant concludes that "*Hill Street* was as noteworthy for its honest portrayal of cops as for the fact that it ultimately functioned as a liberal apology

for the police" (1992, p. 58), because of how it excused the bad actions of certain police officers by promoting an idealized image of their supposed potential. Furthermore, the portrayal of police officers as the authority on criminality excuses bad behaviour on the part of the police, and justifies the abuse of power by proving the police officers right in their identification of the criminals (Nichols-Petick, 2012).

In the real world, most of the critiques leveled at police systems confront their repressive tactics and their racist policing habits. Weitzer (2005) argues that racial minorities get no help from the police, and are often abused by police officers and overpoliced. The explicit purpose of the Black Lives Matter movement and affiliated activist has been to shed light on the institution of police and how racism is a systemic problem, rather than an individualized one (Banks, 2018). This systemic analysis of police brutality has largely been ignored or distorted by the media, and Banks (2018) explains that media coverage of the Ferguson and Black Lives Matter protests were often filled with racist language and rhetorical strategies to undermine the credibility of the movement. One of the strategies the author discussed was the reproduction of post-racial discourse, through opposition to black activists' portrayal of racism as a structural issue and calling activists "race hustlers" (Banks 2018).

Following this trend, the issues of racism and police brutality at the hands of the police in fictional televised works can only be brought up if the cops are right and the character of colour is indeed guilty, removing the burden of racism from the police and proving them right in their racial profiling and stereotyping (Carlson, 1985). Weitzer (2005) explains that the diversification of police officers' races on television has been a way to ward off accusations of racism, and that this reality is echoed in the diversification of police precincts in real life.

Adding to this argument of using diversity as a superficial anti-racist strategy, Carte (1971) explains that the diversification of police officers has been a way to legitimize police action, especially in black neighbourhoods, and that the recruiting of racial minorities into police forces was a specific tactic by police, starting in the 1960s. He also differentiates between passive and active representation, where passive representation means giving police jobs to people of colour without granting them any decision-making capacity or potential to change the system as it currently works (Carte, 1971). Moreover, Carte states that "only passive representation can be achieved through administrative decision" (1971, p. 85), furthering his argument that active representation could lead to police reform, making it a potential threat to the establishment. Despite his belief in the possibility of reform, Carte (1971) does acknowledge that black communities distrust all cops equally, regardless of their race. While the author views this as proof that black officers are only passive representation within the police, there are contexts where they said black officers have decisive power, for example during arrests and concerning their own use of violence. However, black officers differ little from white officers in their treatment of citizens in these contexts (Weitzer, 2005).

This shows that, as many activists have argued, the problem of policing is systemic rather than individual, and that police reform cannot stop the repressive function of law enforcement. Seigel (2017) argues that any reform of the police due to racial profiling, police brutality, or any anti-black repressive tactic is impossible, because they are embedded in the existence of police systems themselves. His argument is based in the history of the development of law enforcement in the United States: modern police forces find their earliest iterations in systems of British colonial policing by the military to protect expanding capitalist forces and slave patrols, organized bands of rural police to keep African slaves in control (Seigel, 2017). These systems transformed into the the present-day police force because of racist priorities: Seigel states that "as labor and social relations shifted and threats to racial hierarchies emerged [in the 19th century], police would help to define new anti-black social arrangements and naturalize them via the categories of crime and the criminal" (2017, p. 480). This information illustrates that capitalism and racism are inherently linked, and that they are both inextricably tied to police systems both in origins and in development. Seigel furthers this argument by affirming that while modern states rely on capitalism, capitalism itself relies on race and on the subjugation of a mass labour force of black people (2017).

As a result, Seigel claims that police reform can never be appropriate to dismantle the oppressive institutions of racism, capitalism and policing (2017). He argues that liberal talking points such as police brutality and racial profiling individualize an institutional problem that cannot be solved by such a shallow analysis (Seigel, 2017). He resents the terms for these concepts themselves, stating that "like 'police brutality,' the term 'racial profiling' suggests that policing is a defensible democratic practice, good in theory and in general, but poisoned by a few rogue individuals or by vestiges of racism that can be purged from an otherwise benevolent institution" (Seigel, 2017, p. 476). The institution of policing must be gradually abolished in order for racism to be confronted properly, and any police reformist movements or beliefs ignore the depth and reach of the state's dedication to racism and to the repression of the black population of the United States (Seigel, 2017). As such, the confrontation of racism, use of the good cop/corrupted cop dichotomy, and other liberal devices in crime drama television only serve to extend this fantasy of a benevolent police force, when that is impossible by the very definition of the repressive institution itself.

Diversity and Representation

The fantasy of benevolent police forces is furthered by the liberal tactic of diversity on screen and representation of various minorities, racial ones in this instance. As explained previously, both real and fictional police forces use racial diversity to legitimize a racist police institution and deal with charges of racism. Tasker (2012) mentions the careful inclusiveness of police dramas, and adds that writers give certain characters knowledge and

a supposed impartiality about race in order to give them authority on these subjects and consequently to evade accusations of racism. These characters are often professionals like the white anthropologist Temperance Brennan in Bones (Tasker, 2012), but this purpose is functionally the same as the inclusion of characters of colour, who are assumed to be infused with inherent knowledge about racism, as well as an incapacity to perpetuate it.

Herman Gray has written extensively on the politics of diversity in television, and two of his theoretical frameworks are particularly useful. The first important text is the fifth chapter, "Television and the Politics of Difference," from his 2005 book *Cultural Moves*. He frames diversity on television as a liberal attempt at producing a coherent national identity via representations of different races (Gray, 2005). Tracing the politics of representation throughout the history of television, Gray argues that for television producers, white audiences have always been the priority audience, but they have moved to courting minorities through representation (2005). Representations of diversity in the network era were based in the desire to make the white, suburban "American Dream" palatable to more audiences, creating multiple representations of domesticity and nationalism (Gray, 2005). In the neo-network era, television uses diversity to brand networks and producers as progressive, and ensure loyalty of all audiences through consumerism (Gray, 2005). In either era, these diverse casts and programs have been used to monetize anti-racist discourses without challenging the institution of racism, much like the crime drama genre. This argument is parallel to the that of Banks (2018) about neoliberal forces dictating post-racial politics on screen. For Hollywood producers, the inclusion of characters of colour seems to be about little more than attracting larger audiences and their money, without attempts to deconstruct racism itself.

Secondly, Gray's 2016 article "Precarious Diversity: Representation and Demography," criticizes representations of diverse races on television as shallow. Gray contends that media studies evaluating representation by comparing the number of diverse characters to demographic statistics of the population ignores the quality of the representation itself, and why it exists (2016). He echoes his earlier argument that representation is mostly a branding tactic to attract audiences of all races, and Weitzer's (2005) statement that mass media addresses problems of racism using representation as a proxy (Gray, 2016). Echoing Artz's (1998) retracing of the rise of Blaxploitation and buddy cop movies, Gray denotes that politics of representation based in demographic statistics historically originates from the civil rights movement and black communities desiring to see themselves on television (2016), but that this has been co-opted by capitalist market forces. Lastly, he argues that media studies need to "move away from the assumption that a bid on image accuracy and authenticity, anchored by demography, will provide some assurance of social parity" (Gray, 2016, p. 251). His argument is that without any radical action to deconstruct racism, characters of colour on television are likely to remain stereotypical and the act of including minorities on screen without regard for quality or for representing different realities is not enough for any dismantling of racism at the roots. Gray's analyses of diversity provide a way to understand representations of diversity as meaningless

without social change, and even further, allow us to understand how mass media is itself a producer of inequality (Gray, 2016).

Gray is not the only one to have criticized representation on television, however: in De Bruin's 2010 study on high school children and police procedurals, multiple children of colour were bored with idealized portrayals of the police, even though both television shows presented had one out of four main characters be a racial minority. Despite this statistical representation, the portrayals of the police, as mentioned earlier, was not representative of their lived realities and experiences with racist police officers (De Bruin, 2010). Meyer (2015) analyzes the character of Angela Montenegro in the crime drama *Bones*, and argues that despite her presence on the show as a half-Chinese bisexual woman, the character itself ratifies multiple racist and homophobic tropes. The portrayal of Angela as the most sexually liberated, emotionally free and lacking in professionalism makes her characterization abundant with racialized misogynistic tropes of sexualized women of colour (Meyer, 2015). At Angela's opposite, the only other main woman of colour on the program, Dr. Camille Saroyan, is a black woman portrayed as overly strict, having extremely few romantic relationships, yet struggling with separating work and sex in much the same way Angela does (Meyer, 2015). Meyer criticizes *Bones* for relying on the presence of women of colour to seem progressive, and concludes that these portrayals "blend similarly into narratives that more commonly reify the status quo, while at the same time allow those narratives to appear, at least on the surface, progressive in their identity politics" (Meyer, 2015, p. 912).

The use of racial stereotypes on television is a common critique of diversity: De Bruin (2010) and Tasker (2012) discuss the technique of red herrings, where a stereotyped character of colour is assumed to have committed the crime because of racist assumptions, until they are shown to be innocent. The red herring is a way to challenge stereotypes on television, but its theoretical application is different from the reality; as previously shown, De Bruin's study concluded that white children thought of stereotypical representation of characters of colour as a confirmation for their racist beliefs (De Bruin, 2010). Additionally, these red herrings are often solved by the guilty party being found, who is often a second character of the same race and/or ethnicity as the first character, invalidating most of the progress made by the challenge to stereotypes (Tasker, 2012). Overall, the liberal pluralistic model and the use of demographic statistics are both inadequate for representation of diversity on television: Characters are often portrayed in ways that reify racist tropes, and do not challenge the status quo of racism.

Brooklyn Nine-Nine

The elements of the theoretical framework I will use to analyze *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* were delineated in the previous sections. First, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* uses liberal political ideology to present a team of police officers who are presented as "good cops". Under neoliberal market forces and a post-racial, these supposed good cops are presented as a solution to the individualistic problem of police brutality and racism which are caused by "bad apples" in the police force. Second, representation of racial minorities on television is a mechanism used to attract diverse audiences while refusing to confront the systemic causes behind racism, and even further individualizing the causes of racism.

In the context of this framework, the crime drama *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*, which features a team of police officers in New York, including two women of colour and two black men out of the main cast of 9 characters, does not fare well. The liberal/progressive show relies heavily on both discussions of the problems of modern policing and a diverse cast, but follows the liberal tradition in upholding the institution of policing as rightful. Additionally, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* features frequent humorous scenes about sensitive subjects, toeing the line between mockery and sensible discussion on subjects like racism, police brutality, and diversity. The very second episode of the series, "The Tagger" (Hiscock & Zisk, 2013), features the following dialogue between Detectives Rosa Diaz and Jake Peralta, which falls firmly on the mockery side:

> "Don't arrest [the suspect]. Just smack him—hard. With a phone book on a body part no one can see, know what I'm saying?"
>
> "So you're suggesting police brutality?"
>
> "Haha yeah, I guess so. Why?"

Even if this scene was more sensitive about the subject of police brutality, and despite the character making the joke being a woman of colour, I have previously established that crime television does not change the reality of racism by simply discussing it. Four episodes from the program's five seasons run explore further the use of liberalism, diversity and pro-policing values properly.

"The Bet"

Thirteenth episode from the first season "The Bet" bases the first half of its plotline on a bet taken by two of the main characters and love interests: Detectives Amy Santiago and Jake Peralta. The aforementioned bet was for either detective to make the most felony arrests in a full year, and "prove who is a better detective" (McCreary & Farino, 2014).

The first half of the episode then shows the last 8 hours of this year, and the tight race between the two detectives to imprison more supposed criminals. This story is reminiscent of Seigel (2017) and his argument about policing being considered rightful even by progressive liberals: here, we can see that not only are these detectives gleeful about putting criminals in prison, but they never question whether these criminals are guilty, the arrest count for the bet is made before any trial, and the police is deemed the only authority on the subject (McCreary & Farino, 2014). Furthermore, Detective Amy Santiago is a latina woman, proving that even in this idealized fantasy of policing, white and non-white police treat its citizens and treat policing itself in the same flippant manner. This episode, in a very clear and straightforward manner, justifies the use of policing, and puts the police in a position of unquestioned authority and power, no matter their race.

"48 Hours"

An earlier episode from this same first season, "48 Hours" has a more complex relationship to policing, and reveals the extent to which even progressive crime television like *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* justifies barely legal techniques in policing, and the disregard for civil liberties. The storyline for this episode features Jake Peralta, the main white male character, arresting a black man because he insulted him (Del Tredici & Lauer, 2013). Peralta, after having been called to investigate a robbery, realizes this matches perfectly the *modus operandi* of Dustin Whitman. He then goes to question him, when the suspect calls him "Joke Peralta," and the officer immediately reacts by arresting him and bringing him to the station (Del Tredici & Lauer, 2013). The law of this fictional New York states that a suspect cannot be held for more than 48 hours if the arrest was made without a warrant, and if the police is incapable of providing probable cause to the court, making the episode revolve around the need to find proof of guilt of Whitman.

When Peralta reveals the truth to his superior, Captain Raymond Holt, and the rest of his precinct, none of them admonish the detective for brimming on a suspect's civil liberties by arresting him without any proof or probable cause. Instead, Captain Holt reacts by asking the entire team to help Peralta find probable cause before the suspect has to be released, in which case they could be sued, which is presented as the worst possibility, and not arresting someone on the street with no evidence. At the same time, the rest of the precinct are upset and angry for being forced to give up their plans and work for the weekend, but none of them seem bothered by the thought of arresting a suspect with no evidence, proof, or anything other than a suspicion (Del Tredici & Lauer, 2013). The episode ends with Detective Peralta finding proof of the guilt of the suspect, thus justifying the breach of civil liberties committed, and proving the detectives to be right. The case is resolved and all characters have their Sunday nights available again, warranting the actions of the police both in their own eyes, and in the audience's.

In this episode, Carlson's (1985) three tactics of encouragement of compliance were all used: "Good cops" and "bad criminals" are differentiated, the criminal gets his civil liberties violated as a consequence of committing a crime, and the law is always effective and correct. Furthermore, the episode seems to conform to a common convention of crime dramas, that of the almost unconditional support between officers, despite illegal behaviour (Primasita & Ahimsa-Putra, 2019). Despite the program's diverse cast and liberal ideological tendencies, this episode makes clear that like more conservative crime dramas, the justification for the breach of civil liberties and inappropriate use of police power is as highly present. In the context of heightened racial and social tensions surrounding the authority detained by police officers, this episode showcases that crime television, even liberal-leaning, will help justify the abuse of power by police detectives and officers.

"Boyle's Hunch"

The episode "Boyle's Hunch," from the third season of the show, depicts a B-plot that addresses directly the problems faced by the New York Police Department. This storyline debuts with Captain Raymond Holt stating his perceived problems within the NYPD:

> It's no secret that the NYPD has an image problem. [...] Police approval ratios are – pardon my language – in the commode. All the headlines are about the bad cops, but there are good cops too, and I want to put up posters that showcase some of our best. (McAlpin & O'Donnell, 2015)

As made clear in the second part of the quote, the Captain wants to portray police officers to regain some higher ratings, and asks Detective Amy Santiago to feature on the first one, to which she instantly agrees. The only objection to this plan is posed by Gina Linetti, who interestingly is the only white character in this scene and also the only non-cop. She argues that posters of smiling officers will not solve the NYPD's problem, yet is ignored (McAlpin & O'Donnell, 2015).

Later in the same episode, Detective Santiago comes to Holt's office, highly discouraged because the aforementioned posters were vandalized everywhere in subway stations. The graffiti range from less politically meaningful drawings such as devil horns, targets and a ratted sign changing "New York's Finest" to "New York's Dumbest," to politically charged statements like "end stop and frisks," "end racial profiling" and "unlawful arrests is a crime." Captain Holt and Detective Santiago admit Gina was right about the posters being a bad idea. In a later scene, the Captain says that the NYPD's main problem is its refusal to admit mistakes, and reveals a second poster that says "We know we can do better, tell us how," concluding the plot (McAlpin & O'Donnell, 2015).

    The first thing here to notice is the post-racial discourse and clear reference to the "bad apples" perceived problem in the police. There is a clear refusal to portray police brutality or racism as systemic, both in the initial scenes and in the later ones. At the beginning of the episode, the solution proposed is to improve the police's image without changing the conditions; by the end, a small improvement is made and the newfound solution is to partly change the conditions in the NYPD. However, the solution proposed remains a fundamentally individual one. Instead of addressing systemic issues within the police department, reducing the potential for the police to harm citizens or increasing indictments on police officers guilty of police brutality, the proposed solution is to have one officer within the city's department addressing by himself with the concerns of citizens. Even when complaints from the graffiti in this very same episode named police procedures to entirely remove, like "stop and frisk," the solution is an individualized Band-Aid on a pervasive institutional problem.

"Moo Moo"

"Moo Moo," the sixteenth episode of the fourth season of the program, differs significantly from the episodes previous analysed, as this one contains a storyline focused entirely on racial profiling. After Detectives Peralta and Santiago babysit Sergeant Jeffords's children, the latter cannot find his daughter's "Moo Moo," the name given to her blanket, and when he finds it on the ground a few meters away from his house, he turns around to a white police officer confronting him (Augusta-Jackson & Carey, 2017). After the police officer in question asks him to back away and acts in a forceful manner, Jeffords finally convinces him that he is also a police officer and is let go. Later in the episode, Jeffords confronts the officer in question, who only acknowledges making a mistake by being suspicious of a police officer, not by being so easily suspicious of a black man (Augusta-Jackson & Carey, 2017).

    Jeffords, even more upset at this new development, asks his superior, fellow black agent Captain Holt, to file a complaint, and the Captain refuses. The ensuing conversation has Jeffords desiring to hold the white officer accountable for his racist actions, which could have escalated, and Holt wanting Jeffords to consider his own future, and the possible promotion he just applied for. At the end of the episode, Holt acknowledges that his protecting behaviour might not be appropriate for these supposedly new, changing times, and agrees to do "the right thing" and file the complaint, and tells Jeffords he was not given the promotion, for reasons that were not given, but are thought to be the whistle-blowing (Augusta-Jackson & Carey, 2017).

    While this episode deals sensibly with the effects of racial profiling on Sergeant Jeffords, and with teaching young black children about racism, it takes an unforgivably liberal viewpoint by refusing to mention or discuss ways in which policing could change

or be better. Despite the show making clear that this singular report had no effect, the white police officer is simply considered a single, corrupt officer, rather than an agent of the state that wields an incredible amount of power over racial minorities, power that is sanctioned by the institutions of both racism and law enforcement. The characters themselves admit feeling helpless in situations of police brutality, and rightfully so, because they are part of an oppressive institution that constitutes and furthers racism, and that can never be toppled with post-racial ideology. As characters in a television show made by neoliberal capitalist companies, and representing police officers in a genre that relies on the presence of policing, Sergeant Jeffords and Captain Holt are not allowed to question or challenge the institution of police forces or capitalism, and thus can never get rid of racism. The frustration depicted in this episode is only present in the context of this highly individualized framing of police abuse and racism. Similarly to Artz's (1998) description of buddy cop conventions being attractive to black and white audiences simultaneously, the episode's portrayal of police brutality is important by its shedding light on an issue faced by many African Americans, yet it can only exist in a context stripped of its radical power.

Reception

While no study has been done on the singularly liberal view of *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*, audience reactions and support for the portrayal of police officers as diverse and heroic officers of the law can be seen in mass media articles written about the subject. For example, Duca writes in a *Huffington Post* article that *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* shows the "nuanced moral seriousness that makes cop genre comedies work" (2014), showing that at least some audiences appreciate, and see their opinions reflected in the program's support for questionable, even illegal, policing techniques. Qualifying the values displayed by *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* of "nuanced morality" exemplifies perfectly the potency of both markers of liberal television; diverse casting and utilization of sensible subject matters like racism. Unashamed support for policing structures, including dubious arrests, are only nuanced insofar as people who value liberalism view it to be: the nuance here is simply in discussing matters like racism in more words than audiences are used to, not a nuanced view that challenges the institution of policing itself.

Rarely do writers take a more critical approach to the show, but it should not be surprising that one of those rare articles was written by a black woman. Harris's "I'm Wary of Cops. So Why Do I Love *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*?" (2015) discusses why she appreciates the fantastical, idealized portrayal of police shown by *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. The author judges some jokes tasteless in their treatment of subjects like police brutality, and finds herself wary of both the police in real life, and the overzealous character of Jake Peralta, and admits her enjoyment of the program is contingent on acknowledging it as a fantasy

and nothing more. Despite some audiences being critical of the program, and understanding that what is portrayed by the television show is only an idealized dream version of policing, this does not remove the possibility of large audiences seeing their ideas of the potential of "good" policemen encouraged by the show's portrayal of police forces. Furthermore, even this idealized version of a police precinct gets it wrong, depicting racist attitudes as inevitable, flippant views of both civil liberties and police brutality, and its storylines portraying arrests as unimportant to the police system, while it is incredibly important to those victimized by it.

Overall, despite its use of liberal tactics like the representation of racial diversity and discussions of prominent discourses surrounding policing, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* remains characteristic of crime television. The crime drama's tendency to encourage the social institutions of policing, but also racism and capitalism are echoed in this program, despite its left-leaning ideological tendencies in contrast to the qualification of most crime dramas as inherently conservative (Nichols-Petick, 2012). This ratification of police systems and racism is inevitable considering its presence in the capitalist and neoliberal television market, but it demonstrates that left-leaning programs are not immune to these political and economic forces.

Furthermore, as television crime drama and public attitudes about policing seem to run parallel (Donovan, 2013), it is interesting to look at the specific worldview presented by *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. It would also be important to examine the extent to which audiences respond to this post-racial individualized view of police brutality and racism. In conclusion, *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*'s liberal politics and values is an excellent example of the state apparatus being supported by police procedurals, and demonstrates that television across the political spectrum will always prioritize the status quo and the preservation of the oppressive institutions that constitute society.

References

Artz, B. L. (1998). Hegemony in black and white: Interracial buddy films and the new racism. In Y. R.Kamalipour & T. Carilli (Eds.), *Cultural diversity and the U.S. media* (pp. 67-78). Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Augusta-Jackson, J. (Writer), & Carey, M. (Director). (2017, May 2). Moo Moo [Television series episode]. In D. Goor, M. Schur, D. Miner, P. Lord, C. Miller & L. Del Tredici. (Executive Producers), *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company.

Banks, C. (2018). Disciplining Black activism: Post-racial rhetoric, public memory and decorum in news media framing of the Black Lives Matter movement. *Continuum*, 32(6), 709-720. doi:10.1080/10304312.2018.1525920

Baskin, D. R., & Sommers, I. B. (2010). Crime-show-viewing habits and public attitudes toward forensic evidence: The "CSI Effect" revisited. *Justice System Journal*, 31(1), 97-113.

Benoît, J. P., & Dubra, J. (2004). Why do good cops defend bad cops?. *International Economic Review*, 45(3), 787-809.

Bochco, S. (Producer). (1981). *Hill Street Blues* [Television series]. Hollywood, CA: National Broadcast Company.

Callanan, V. J., & Rosenberger, J. S. (2011). Media and public perceptions of the police: examining the impact of race and personal experience. *Policing & Society*, 21(2), 167-189, doi: 10.1080/10439463.2010.540655

Carlson, J. M. (1985). *Prime Time Law Enforcement: Crime show viewing and attitudes toward The Criminal Justice system.* New York, NY: Praeger Publishers.

Carte, G. E. (1971). Police representation and the dilemma of recruitment. *Issues in Criminology*, 6(1), 85-95.

Chernega, J. (2016). Black Lives Matter: Racialised Policing in the United States. *Comparative American Studies An International Journal*, 14(3-4), 234-245.

Cole, S. A., & Dioso-Villa, R. (2008). Investigating the CSI Effect Effect: Media and Litigation Crisis in Criminal Law. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 61, 1335.

D'alessandro, A. (2014, June 2). EMMYS Q&A: 'Brooklyn Nine-Nine' Co-creator Michael Schur on comedic cops. *Deadline*. Retrieved from https://deadline.com/

De Bruin, J. (2010). Young people and police series: A multicultural television audience study. *Crime, media, culture*, 6(3), 309-328.

Del Tredici, L. (Writer), & Lauer, P. (Director). (2013, November 5). 48 Hours [Television series episode]. In D. Goor, M. Schur, D. Miner, P. Lord, C. Miller & L. Del Tredici. (Executive Producers), *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company.

Donovan, K. M. (2013). *Real attitudes, fictional crime: How crime dramas impact policy attitudes*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Stony Brook University, New York, NY.

Dowler, K. (2016, November 22). Police Dramas on Television. *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Criminology*. Ed. Retrieved 30 Nov. 2018, from http://oxfordre.com/criminology/view/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264079.001.0001/acrefore-9780190264079-e-175.

Dowler, K., & Zawilski, V. (2007). Public perceptions of police misconduct and discrimination: Examining the impact of media consumption. *Journal of Criminal Justice*, 35(2), 193-203. doi:10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2007.01.006

Duca, L. (2014, January 14). 9 Reasons You Need To Start Watching 'Brooklyn Nine-Nine'. *The Huffington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.ca/

Ericson, R. V. (1991). Mass media, crime, law, and justice: An institutional approach. *The British Journal of Criminology*, 219-249.

Goor, D., Schur, M., Miner, D., Lord, P., Miller, C. & Del Tredici, L. (Executive Producers). (2013). *Brooklyn Nine-Nine* [Television series]. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company (2013-2018), National Broadcast Company (2018).

Grant, J. (1992). Prime time crime: television portrayals of law enforcement. *Journal of American Culture*, 15(1), 57-68.

Gray, H. (2005). *Cultural Moves: African Americans and the politics of representation*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Gray, H. (2016). Precarious diversity: Representation and demography. In M. Curtin & K. Sanson (Eds.), *Precarious Creativity: Global Media, Local Labor* (241-53). Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.

Harris, A. (2015, May 18). I'm Wary of Cops. So Why Do I Love *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*? Slate. Retrieved from https://slate.com/

Hiscock, N. (Writer), & Zisk, C. (Director). (2013, September 23). The Tagger [Television series episode]. In D. Goor, M. Schur, D. Miner, P. Lord, C. Miller & L. Del Tredici. (Executive Producers), *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company.

Jeffries, D., & Jeffries, R. (2017). Marxist materialism and critical race theory: A comparative analysis of media and cultural influence on the formation of stereotypes and proliferation of police brutality against black men. *Spectrum: A Journal on Black Men*, 5(2), 1-22. doi:10.2979/spectrum.5.2.01

Kindy, K., Fisher, M., Tate, J., & Jenkins, J. (2015, December 26). A year of reckoning: Police fatally shoot nearly 1,000. *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/

Langworthy, R. H., & Whitehead, J. T. (1986). Liberalism and fear as explanations of punitiveness. *Criminology*, 24(3), 575-591.

Lasley, J. R. (1994. The impact of the Rodney King incident on citizen attitudes toward police. *Policing and Society*, 3(4), 245-255. doi: 10.1080/10439463.1994.9964673

Mastro, D., Knight Lapinski, M., Kopacz, M. A., & Behm-Morawitz, E. (2009). The influence of exposure to depictions of race and crime in TV news on viewer's social judgments. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 53(4), 615-635. doi: 10.1080/08838150903310534

McAlpin, T. (Writer), & O'Donnell, T. (Director). (2015, October 11). Boyle's Hunch [Television series episode]. In D. Goor, M. Schur, D. Miner, P. Lord, C. Miller & L. Del Tredici. (Executive Producers), *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company.

McCreary, L. (Writer), & Farino, J. (Director). (2014, January 14). The Bet [Television series episode]. In D. Goor, M. Schur, D. Miner, P. Lord, C. Miller & L. Del Tredici. (Executive Producers), *Brooklyn Nine-Nine*. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting Company.

Meyer, M. D. (2015). The "other" woman in contemporary television drama: Analyzing intersectional representation on Bones. *Sexuality & Culture*, 19(4), 900-915.

Meyers, M. (2018). Neoliberalism and the media: History and context. In M. Meyers (Ed.), *Neoliberalism and the media* (pp. 3-18). New York, NY: Routledge.

Nichols-Petick, J. (2012). *TV Cops: The contemporary American television police drama.* New York, NY: Routledge.

Oh, D. C. (2012). Black-Yellow Fences: Multicultural boundaries and whiteness in the Rush Hour franchise. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, 29(5), 349-366. doi: 10.1080/15295036.2012.697634

Pautz, M. C. (2016). Cops on film: Hollywood's depiction of law enforcement in popular films, 1984–2014. *PS: Political Science & Politics*, 49(02), 250-258. doi:10.1017/s1049096516000159

Primasita, F. A., & Ahimsa-Putra, H. S. (2019). An introduction to the police procedural: A subgenre of detective genre. *Jurnal Humaniora*, 31(1), 33-40. doi:10.22146/jh.v31i1.15309

Seigel, M. (2017). The dilemma of 'racial profiling': an abolitionist police history. *Contemporary Justice Review*, 20(4), 474-490.

Tasker, Y. (2012). Television crime drama and homeland security: from Law & Order to" terror TV". *Cinema Journal*, 51(4), 44-65.

Weitzer, R. (2005). Can the police be reformed? Contexts, 4(3), 21-26.

Veiling Discrimination and Inequality as Secularism: An Exploration of Quebec's Bill 62 'Niqab Ban'

Sana Fatima
University of British Columbia

Abstract. In recent decades, the niqab has become a symbol of the conflict between growing Muslim immigrant populations and their Western governments (Fournier & See, 2012; Meer, Dwyer, & Modood, 2010). As countries in Europe adopt niqab bans, the province of Quebec in Canada has also followed suit. After several failed attempts, the recent Bill 62 was finally proposed and passed by the Quebec government in 2017. Officially titled "An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for requests for accommodations on religious grounds in certain bodies," the law serves to do exactly as it says. In its own words, Bill 62 aims to ensure equality, safety, secularism, and clear communication amongst members of the public (*Bill 62*, 2017). However, upon analyzing the various sections, it becomes clear that the law also limits religious freedom for those that choose to cover their face. By employing a theoretical perspective, I will apply an intersectionality framework to understand how Muslim women's gender, religion, and nation interact with processes related to Bill 62. I will utilize a symbolic interactionist perspective to understand how the niqab has been connected to a symbolic meaning that alludes to resistance and danger, and how this has been politicized in Quebec. Finally, I will use these concepts to establish how Bill 62 promotes structural inequality for Muslim women and denies their role as social actors with agency through the institutionalization of anti-Muslim symbolic meanings.

Introduction

In recent decades, the niqab has become a symbol of the conflict between growing Muslim immigrant populations and their Western hosts (Fournier & See, 2012; Meer, Dwyer, &

Modood, 2010). Following 9/11 and subsequent terrorist attacks in European and North American countries, the collective need for the West to address the presence of Muslim communities has manifested itself in policies that seek to integrate, assimilate, or isolate Muslims (McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012). In particular, through the act of regulating Muslim women that wear the niqab in public spaces, social norms and legislation have engaged in a cyclical relationship to institutionalize gendered racism in an attempt to integrate Muslims into Western society. The symbolic meanings associated with the niqab, such as anti-Western sentiment, patriarchal oppression, and danger (Bakali, 2016) are what have led to policies that ban the garment. As Sharify-Funk explains, this is because "...it is the symbolic meaning of divergent practices rather than the practices themselves that shape their significance for intergroup polarization and conflict mobilization" (2011, p. 137). These symbolic meanings are present in Quebec, but also extend to other places in the world. In Europe, countries like France, Belgium, the Netherlands, Italy and Spain have all enforced a ban on covering one's face in some capacity, with some explicitly referencing the niqab (Brems, Vrielink, & Ouald Chaib, 2013). While the Canadian government as a whole has not followed suit and maintains its stance on multiculturalism as a national policy (Fleras, 2017), the province of Quebec has consistently attempted to impose some form of a niqab ban on Muslims within its borders.

After a series of unsuccessful proposals, Quebec has finally seen success with the recent Bill 62, proposed and passed by the Quebec government in 2017. Officially titled "An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for requests for accommodations on religious grounds in certain bodies," the law serves to do exactly as it says, and more. Bill 62 aims to ensure equality, safety, secularism, and clear communication amongst members of the public (*Bill 62*, 2017). However, upon analyzing the various sections, it becomes clear that the law also limits religious freedom for those that choose to cover their face. In particular, it targets the face-covering, or niqab, worn by Muslim women. This law is important because it demonstrates the politicization of religion in the public sphere, and leads into our discussion of the imbalance of power and accessibility.

This paper aims to contribute to the discussion of the niqab in Quebec, Canada by theoretically framing how Bill 62 encourages the ostracization of Muslim women in Quebec. It also seeks to unravel the complex processes of creating social meanings for symbols and the structures that reproduce political inequality. In order to do this, I will analyze Bill 62, "An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for requests for accommodations on religious grounds in certain bodies" for themes related to the niqab itself, social integration, and the positioning of Quebecois values. I will also refer to numerous secondary sources by contemporary sociologists, cultural critics and researchers, such as Marie McAndrew and Mahsa Bakhshaei (2012), Lori Chambers and Jen Roth (2014), Naved Bakali (2015), and more. These sources will be assessed for topics that serve to explain the themes identified in Bill 62, including but not limited to: Quebecois values and identity, the niqab in popular culture,

institutionalized discrimination, and the regulation of Muslim women's bodies. Some of these sources contain first-hand accounts from Muslim women as they comment on identity, the niqab, and their role in the public sphere and Western society. Finally, this paper will make use of Canadian news reports from distributors like *Global News* and CBC for content about Islamic terrorism and the niqab ban. This will then be used to contextualize and frame attitudes towards Islamic practices in Quebec.

In using this literature to frame the discussion on the niqab ban in Quebec, I will first draw upon an intersectionality framework and assess how the intersections of religion, gender and nation enable Bill 62 to marginalize Muslim women that wear the niqab. Next, I will utilize a symbolic interactionist perspective and delve into the symbolic meanings that the niqab possesses, working to understand how Quebec's government has regulated the niqab on the basis that it allegedly opposes Western interpretations of values like freedom and equality. Finally, I will explore how the bill reinforces political inequality through structural disadvantages and complex bureaucratic processes. In doing this, I aim to showcase how social intersections, the institutionalization of symbols, and structural inequality converge to marginalize Muslim women in a society like that of Quebec.

Literature Review

The literature surrounding Muslim experiences in the West highlight how themes of Muslim identity and citizenship disrupt the uninterrupted narrative of multiculturalism that countries like Canada continue to push. In other words, it demonstrates that Western nations are not as democratic as they claim to be, with several lived experiences and policy examples serving to establish this. For instance, Bakali's 2016 study on Muslim youth's experiences with anti-Muslim racism explores this, as Muslim men detail experiences of being seen as unwanted and untreatable bacteria in their schooling years. Nagra and Maurutto's work with Muslim youth in Canada shows that state policing and institutionally discriminatory policies impact the individuals' identities and sense of safety in Canadian society (2016). These accounts extend to women that wear the niqab in Western countries as well, emphasizing the social problems that the decision to wear one presents. The Muslim women in Hancock and Mobillion's 2018 study on Muslim women's experiences with the niqab detail their attempts to resist racist attitudes as they struggle to establish that they are not dangerous to society nor oppressed by their religion. Bakht (2015) looks at how a Muslim woman's niqab became an obstacle for her testimony during a sexual assault trial, and Meer et al. (2010) discuss how due to historically-driven othering and threats of terrorism, the niqab is seen as an affront to British identity, causing the country to push Muslim voices to the margins.

As the lived experiences showcase racist attitudes that different groups hold towards

Muslims, the discussion of international policies that serve to ban religious symbols, particularly the niqab, also emerges. Brems et al. (2013) looks at the history of niqab bans in Europe, highlighting how local bans existed in Belgium, the Netherlands, Italy and Spain, far before nationwide bans began to be implemented in 2011 and onwards. Fleras (2017) and Chambers and Roth (2014) bring the conversation into Canada and discuss how the country approaches the niqab in the context of citizenship oaths and courtroom procedures, emphasizing how government officials on both the federal and provincial level openly express discomfort and disapproval towards the niqab's presence in state affairs. Helly (2004) argues that discrimination against Muslims has increased since 9/11, on both an everyday level and an institutional one, feeding into Musolf et al.'s (2009) ideas about symbolic interactionism and how symbolic meanings for the niqab are driving national and public attitudes towards the niqab and creating our social reality. Stolle et al. (2016) further argue that the niqab's symbolic meaning is what shapes policy attitudes, exploring how both ethnic origin and the presence or absence of the niqab influence the public's attitudes towards multiculturalism policy and border control.

The discussion further narrows down to Quebecois attitudes and policies, touching on topics of inequality, secularism as a tool for discrimination, and the role of intersectionality in the impact that is felt by the general public. Dubrow (2015) examines how policies have the power to enforce political inequality within a state, and this is supported by research on the niqab ban. Bakali (2015) identifies the role of the Quebec Charter of Values in creating the 'Muslim other' in Quebec society, a figure that serves as both a result of and reason for the province's commitment to secularism. McAndrew and Bakhshaei (2012) and Mathelet (2015) both examine how this commitment has made Muslim integration in Quebec a difficult task, and how Islamophobia continues to rise in response. Sharify-Funk (2011) and Fournier and See (2012) deliberate over 2010's Bill 94, working to understand how secularism is not only being promoted, but is in fact being weaponized for exclusion against Muslim women. They explore how the niqab ban is a women's issue in addition to a racial one, which connects to research on intersectionality, conducted by theorists like Crenshaw (1991) and Collins and Bilge (2016). As they discuss in their work, various axes of social identity overlap to create socio-political experiences, a phenomenon that is exhibited through Muslim women's experience with the niqab ban, identity, citizenship, nationhood and exclusion. This is further supported by Dubrow's work on political inequality as an international, interdisciplinary, and intersectional facet of society - one that requires careful analysis if it is pinpointed as a location for change (2015).

At this point, the literature requires further expansion, as the specific impact of discriminatory policies on Muslim women in Canada is not approached through a lens that acknowledges political inequality as being a result of intersectionality, as well as a product of symbolic meaning-making by both the general public and the government. In particular, the analysis of Quebec's Bill 62 is limited if nonexistent, even though it is an important example of discrimination under the guise of secularism and equality for all. In addition, the literature discusses forms of discrimination as being present in everyday life

or structural policies, but does not address how they often converge for policies like Bill 62, which seek to politicize both the personal as well as everyday public encounters.

Situating Bill 62 in its Sociopolitical Context

The contents of Bill 62 cannot be understood without the socio-political context that has worked to develop them. It is important to delve into a discussion about institutionalized discrimination, the location of Quebec within the realm of identity politics, and the role that Bill 62 plays in furthering agendas that arise from both of these aspects of society.

The Niqab Ban as a Case of Institutionalized Discrimination

As we grow forward into the 21st century, the religion of Islam continues to be conflated with images of violence and barbarism (Mahmood, 2002). In itself, Muslim culture is seen as being unchanging and tradition-based, and is thus repeatedly depicted as being incompatible with modern, secular and Western societies (Helly, 2004; Mahmood, 2002). As a political force, it is often described as being a breeding ground for terrorism, creating an output of violent radicals that pose a threat to innocent, usually non-Muslim, communities (McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012; Meer et al., 2010). Altogether, it is perceived as a symbol of danger for both Western ideologies and Western populations (Helly, 2004). Through this belief, global actors continue to utilize fear to push for certain policies and practices that bar the acceptance and inclusion of immigrants as a whole, but Muslim immigrants in particular (Brems et al., 2013). In countries where both national identity and the commitment to secularism are threatened by competing cultural out-groups, policies that seek to assimilate Muslims are constantly being proposed by politicians.

These policies are cases of institutionalized discrimination. Institutionalized discrimination is composed of negative or unfairly biased practices that are imposed upon individuals in society with the implicit or explicit purpose of marginalizing them, often through larger structures like governments, government agencies, corporations, and public schooling systems (Sampson, 2008). In the context of the niqab ban, it is important to first understand institutional discrimination in Canada as a whole before Quebec's identity politics and legislation are discussed. In Canada, institutional discrimination against Muslims expands to several areas of everyday life in the public sphere. For instance, Denise Kelly's research (2004) on discrimination in Canada after 9/11 shows that anti-Muslim sentiments are enforced in workplaces on a smaller scale through censorship of political opinions related to Islam and regulations on Islamic garments such as the hijab. However, they are also carried out on a larger institutional level through anti-terrorism laws like C-36 that allow for greater surveillance and control over members of Canadian society,

especially Muslims (Kelly, 2004). Through the 2001 law C-36, the Canadian Security Intelligence Service (CSIS) and the RCMP have been able to both increase security measures in airport facilities and collect information and intelligence from individuals in the Muslim community, often from those whose immigration status is pending and dependent on cooperation with Canadian authorities (Kelly, 2004). The implementation of laws like C-36 has had a long-standing impact on Muslims' experience with identity and safety in Canada.

In Nagra and Maurutto's study on Muslim youth in Vancouver and Toronto, it was found that most young Muslims are targeted for extra surveillance in airports, especially compared to their non-Muslim counterparts, and that this has created fear and insecurity surrounding the feeling of safety and identity (2016). The constant act of subjecting Muslims to extra screening and security checks is both informed by and reproduces the idea that the West needs to protect itself from uncivilized or dangerous Muslims (Nagra & Maurutto, 2016). It also brings into question the idea of citizenship in Canada, and which groups really possess it if there is a risk of human rights being stripped at the border for Muslim Canadians and residents ((Nagra & Maurutto, 2016). Although this issue is evidently present in Canadian society, it is not seen as a pressing issue that threatens the social fabric of society. This is because in a democratic country like Canada, it is hard to pinpoint when institutional discrimination is taking place and even harder to take steps against it. The nation's ideological stance is so focused on furthering equality and justice that it refuses to acknowledge its participation in racial profiling and discrimination (Nagra & Maurutto, 2016). This rationale, and the discriminatory laws that it permits, are able to function with the state's approval. By creating social and legal consequences for possessing or wearing symbols of Muslim identity like the niqab, the government institutionally discriminates against the Muslim community and makes it difficult for them to exist in the Canadian space without being perceived as a threat to the country's values and citizenry.

Quebec as an Arena for Identity Politics

In Canada, a country where national identity has been an arena for continuous identity politics between the English and the French, this pattern is also present. Although this conflict has also led to the systematic erasure of Indigenous communities, for the purpose of the discussion at hand, I will focus on its impact on French identity in the context of Quebec. Throughout Canadian history, English culture and language have dominated the public sphere, minimizing the presence and prominence of the Canadian French community (McAndrew and Bakhshaei, 2012). Although Quebec has established itself as a powerful province over time, it remains caught "... between democratic impulses for inclusiveness... versus xenophobic anxieties over losing its distinctiveness, identity, and political relevance as an isolated ethnic outpost in North America" (Fleras, 2017, p. 136).

In other words, Quebec seeks to abide by democratic values of inclusivity, diversity and freedom, but it fears that it may compromise its status as one of the strongest French communities in North America if it does not enforce laws that prioritize French identity and culture. These anxieties have propelled the Québécois into adopting attitudes that focus on preserving French identity, an approach that has often resulted in them being unreceptive and hesitant towards other cultural minorities (McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012). Their fears have also led to Quebec embracing a France-like secular approach when it comes to navigating religious influence in the socio-political realm. For Quebec, Catholicism and the Catholic Church heavily influenced the province until they were seen as impeding socio-cultural progress (Bakali, 2015). Secularization was a swift movement that took place in the latter half of the 20th century, and involved removing religious symbolism and influence from state institutions (Bakali, 2015; McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012). In keeping with these efforts, Quebec has passed legislation, such as Bill 94 and the Charter of Québec Values (Fleras, 2017), which essentially "...liberates Québec from the grip of religion in general, Catholicism initially, Islam more recently..." (Fleras, 2017, p. 137). Although framed as a commitment to secularization, Quebec's policies are becoming increasingly focused on regulating Muslim symbols and culture in particular, as evidenced by Bill 94 and the current Bill 62.

These unwelcoming attitudes towards Muslims are not just limited to the Quebec government, with some members of Quebec's general public also demonstrating anti-Muslim practices or outright hostility. In 1994, Muslim students that wore the hijab were often expelled from school (Helly, 2004). In recent years, Quebec has seen a rise in incidences of Islamophobia-related violence (Mathelet, 2015). In 2014, fourteen mosques and Islamic institutions had been vandalized within the span of the year (Mathelet, 2015). This sentiment continued to escalate. In January 2017, a shooter opened fire at a Quebec City mosque, killing 6 people and injuring 8 more (Lau, Ferreras, & Joseph, 2017). Thus, with both institutional and day-to-day interactions working together to create a hostile environment for Muslim communities in Quebec, it is clear that the conflict between the niqab and secularization is as relevant as ever. The effort to secure Frenchness and to maintain secularization manifests itself most recently in a series of proposed niqab bans, leading up to the eventual approval of Bill 62.

The Reasons for Bill 62

Bill 62 did not emerge without precedent. The debate regarding the niqab in the political space has been an ongoing one in several countries around the world, and especially in the West, where the face-covering must find its own respected space within established institutions and their respective guidelines, such as the courtroom (Chambers & Roth, 2014). There have been widely publicized cases in Canada in which the niqab has become a central point of controversy, particularly with regards to official ceremonies and legal

procedures. During the 2007 sexual assault trial R vs. NS, a veiled Muslim woman was asked to remove her niqab in order to testify, with her being informed that her refusal to do so could lead to the exclusion of her evidence in the courts (Bakht, 2015). In 2015, a Muslim woman named Zunera Ishaq had to fight for the right to undergo the citizenship oath ceremony while wearing the niqab, citing the Constitution and the Citizenship Act as support for her decision (Fleras, 2017). Both of these cases indicate that wearing the niqab and engaging in legal procedures is a process that requires continuous legal justification and controversy.

While this debate transcends provincial borders and exists as an issue throughout Canada, it has been heightened in Quebec due to pre-existing identity politics and the province's emphasized commitment to secularization. Over the course of the past decade, Quebec has not only objected to the niqab in legal contexts, but it has also attempted to regulate it in the general public sphere. In 2010, Bill 94 was proposed, which on the basis of gender equality and religious neutrality, claimed that all individuals must have their faces uncovered when receiving public services in Quebec, such as health services and childcare (*Bill 94*, 2010; Fournier & See, 2012). In 2013, Quebec's Parti Quebecois proposed Bill 60, commonly known as the Quebec Charter of Values (Bakali, 2015). The bill suggested that in accordance with secular and religiously-neutral values, no state employees or employees of state-funded institutions could wear religious symbols, such as the hijab, the turban, or a large cross (Bakali, 2015). Although both of these proposed bans were not passed into law, they ultimately worked to lay down a foundation for the current Bill 62.

Examining the Contents and Guidelines of Bill 62

According to official documentation released by the Quebec Ministry of Justice, the primary purpose of Bill 62 is to ensure religious neutrality in the public sphere (*Bill 62*, 2017). Under the law, employees of public bodies, as well as elected ones, must have their face uncovered when they are carrying out work-related services (*Bill 62*, 2017). Similarly, any member of the public that wants to access these services must also have their face uncovered (*Bill 62*, 2017). In keeping with these guidelines, public services encompass any body that is budget-funded or related to the government, such as government departments, municipalities, housing bureaus, public transit authorities, and public school boards (*Bill 62*, 2017).

The most publicly controversial part of the bill, and the focus of this paper, is *Division III: Accommodation on Religious Grounds*. This section, in accordance with the Charter of Human Rights and Freedoms, dictates that individuals can apply for religious accommodation if they want to wear a face-covering in public for religious rea-

sons. If they do this, they must ensure that the request is serious, consistent with gender rights, aligned with the idea that people are not discriminated against, consistent with the province's religious neutrality principle, and does not pose as a hardship for the rights or safety of others (*Bill 62*, 2017). However, the bill does not outline how individuals must go about doing this, and to which authorities they should appeal to when making their request. It only states that these guidelines will be determined by the Quebec Justice Minister and that they will be posted on the Ministry of Justice website for the general public to access when needed. This exclusive decision-making process confines power to one government official and encourages a political inequality that prevents all social actors from participating in and shaping the guidelines that impact the larger community, particularly Muslims.

In keeping with this, following the proposal and approval of the bill in 2017, Justice Minister Stephanie Vallée released a series of statements that aimed to clarify grounds for appeal as well as the process of it (Steuter-Martin, 2018). These statements, as well as the conditions set out in Bill 62, are what will serve as the focus of our discussion, especially as they relate to power dynamics, daily interactions, and discrimination through law.

Theoretical Framework

The Crossroads of Inequality: Intersections of Religion, Gender and Nation

Intersectionality is a framework that emphasizes the importance of recognizing diversity in experiences. It asserts that social inequality, people's lives, and the organization of power can be better understood if we acknowledge that there are multiple axes of intersecting social factors that influence people's experiences (Collins & Bilge, 2016; Crenshaw, 1991). These factors include, but are not limited to, class, race, gender, ethnicity, citizenship status, religion, sexuality, and ability (Collins & Bilge, 2016; Crenshaw, 1991). For Muslim women that wear the niqab, we can assume that at the very least, an intersection of religion and gender is present, with race also being an important factor for consideration. When this intersection interacts with Quebecois law and the government, the additional component of 'nation' engages with the already complex dynamics of the gender-religion intersection.

The intersection of religion, gender and nation creates lived experiences for Muslim women that exist for a few reasons. Gender and nation intersect in a way where women are seen as the ones that are responsible for biological reproduction in a nation (Meer et al., 2010). Not only do women give birth to future generations, but they also play a central role in raising and socializing them with ideas of national identity and culture, amongst other

things. Thus, women "...become the signifiers of national differences in the construction, reproduction and transformation of national categories" (Meer et al., 2010, p. 85), whereas men are more connected to politics and military-related aspects of nationhood. Gender and religion intersect in a way that often results in Muslim women being othered more aggressively than their male counterparts, due to the fact that the hijab and niqab are more obvious symbols of identity and separateness (Bakali, 2015). Finally, religion and nation intersect in a way that institutionally marginalizes minority religious groups while also promoting them as a threat to unified national identity. For instance, Muslim communities in Quebec are seen by some as replacements for Catholicism, intending to revitalize the same role and influence of religion in a pre-secular Quebec (Bakali, 2015).

When the three axes of religion, gender and nation intersect for Muslim women that wear the niqab in Quebec, they force the women into making difficult choices between their religious identity and their national one. Laws like Bill 62 make public services inaccessible for individuals that cover their face, so Muslim women must either compromise their religious identity and take off their niqab, or they must give up access to everyday services. If they choose the first option, then they sacrifice the right to freely practice their religion, raising questions about the application of Canadian rights and freedoms. If the women continue wearing the niqab, then they confine themselves to the private sphere, as they are not as easily able to move about in public. This is an issue because by limiting these women to the private sphere, we remove their presence from not only the social arena, but also the political, cultural and economic one (Fournier & See, 2012). It becomes difficult for Muslim women to represent themselves in government institutions because they cannot engage with anyone while veiled. The women cannot participate in cultural activities or share their own experiences because they are no longer involved in the community. Furthermore, as a result of not being able to access public offices and provide their services while veiled, they are unable to hold onto or secure positions of employment. These disadvantages make the women more susceptible to various types of vulnerabilities, and further rid them of the agency that they should be able to practice as members of Quebec society.

The Symbolic Interactionist Perspective: The Niqab as a Symbol

Symbolic interactionism lays out a framework that situates human interactions at the centre of social meaning and experience. According to the theory, individuals learn behaviour through iconic, verbal, and nonverbal symbols, with these symbols developing as a result of consensual and ongoing meanings (Musolf, 2009). Symbols are not permanent in their meaning, nor do they have universal meanings, but they are what shape social interactions and relationships. For instance, the current meanings for Islamic practices center on incompatibility with Western society and the state of 'otherness' (Bakali, 2016). In the workplace, this can often manifest as discrimination against the hijab, modest clothing

and long beards (Kelly, 2004), creating social interactions that cause Muslims to experience discrimination or isolation in society. While symbolic meanings can change over time as a result of socialization through institutions, the family, and more, the experiences and relationships that result from them take much longer to shift. The symbolic interactionist approach is important to this discussion because it emphasizes the role of the niqab as a symbol in Canadian and Quebecois society.

The niqab is a symbol with complex and diverse meanings, relative to the nature of an individual's exposure to Islam and Muslim women. For Muslim women that wear the niqab, the practice possesses multiple meanings. In a 2016 study on Muslim women's choice and agency in wearing the niqab, it was found that their choice to wear the niqab is connected to "...religious piety, observance to the Quranic prescriptions, public modesty, rejection of consumerist values, protection from the male gaze and a sense of liberation based on the anonymity that the niqab provides..." (Zempi, 2016, p. 1750). For instance, one participant in the study described the experience of wearing a niqab as being a form of freedom:

> When I am fully covered I feel liberated. I feel I can be whoever I want to be. Nobody knows who I am. I can walk freely without anybody judging me by what I look like or the shape of my body (Zempi, 2016, p. 1750).

While Muslim women in the West largely dictate experiences such as these, this meaning is not the one portrayed to or perceived by others in the global community. In the political arena especially, the niqab can be seen as a tool of oppression, a form of resistance, and a threat to Western civilization, beliefs and safety (Helly, 2004; Zempi, 2016). These beliefs about the niqab are arguably extensions of public attitudes towards the religion of Islam as a whole. Although Islamic orientalism created attitudes that led to Muslims being seen as barbaric 'others', it is more recent public fears about Islamic terrorism that frame public attitudes in the 21st century, prompted by recent events such as 9/11, the November 2015 Paris Attacks, and the 2016 Orlando nightclub shooting. Thus, the niqab does not possess one universal meaning in Canadian or Quebecois society, as varying socio-cultural influences largely define how it is perceived by different groups.

With regards to Bill 62, the notion that the niqab holds multiple meanings that liberate its wearers is completely disregarded. In fact, the bill adopts two particular symbolic meanings and gives them political leverage, mobilizing them to create discriminatory legislation. The niqab is established as a symbol of two threatening meanings, in that it is a form of resistance to assimilation to Quebecois culture, and that it is a danger for the general public.

The Niqab as a Symbol of Resistance to Assimilation

The niqab, and by extension the hijab, are seen as a form of resistance to assimilation (Chambers & Roth, 2014). On one level, by refusing to reveal their faces, Muslim women deny the Western gaze access to a crucial part of the self. On another level, by adorning an obvious symbol of religion that demands a different form of communication and interaction, Muslim women are seen as going against everyday norms. In fact, some even argue that the niqab stands against Canadian values of communication, without quite explaining the nature of these values. For instance, in 2011, there was a lot of controversy surrounding the removal of the niqab for the Canadian citizenship oath ceremony. When the Minister of Citizenship, Immigration, and Multiculturalism at the time was approached about this, they asserted that since the citizenship oath is a public act, it must be taken openly and cannot involve any practice that contradicts Canadian values of openness and freedom (Chambers & Roth, 2014). This stance was supported by Prime Minister Stephen Harper, when he claimed that the act of hiding one's identity was offensive to Canadian values of transparency, openness and equality (CBC News, 2015). Even when a Federal Court ruling permitted women to wear the niqab during the citizenship oath ceremony, the Harper government asserted that it would work to challenge the ruling (CBC News, 2015). As a result of beliefs like this, the niqab is viewed as being incompatible with Canadian values and any attempts to insert it into Canadian society are seen as dangerous resistance.

This perspective extends to other members of the general public as well. For groups that hold assimilationist beliefs regarding immigrants, Islamic religious garments worn by women can make all the difference when it comes to voicing support for immigration and multiculturalism. In one recent study, attitudes toward immigrant groups were measured for Canadian participants across the political spectrum (Stolle, Harell, Soroka, & Behnke, 2016). The survey showed that positive attitudes towards immigrants is heavily dependent on the physical indicators of their potential to assimilate (Stolle at al., 2016). They found that while Portuguese women who don't wear Islamic religious garments were more positively perceived by study participants, Muslim women that wore the hijab were met with more polarized results (Stolle et al., 2016). In Quebec especially, women that choose to wear the hijab and the niqab are seen as being especially non-integrated in society, as data shows that most Muslims in Quebec do not demonstrate many outward displays of religious identity and practices (McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012).

The Niqab as a Symbol of Danger

According to the rationale outlined in Bill 62, covering one's face poses a potential risk to public safety and the rights of others (*Bill 62*, 2017). This risk is connected to the importance of maintaining secularization throughout Quebec, which implies that covering one's face not only threatens public safety, but also French values. Through this, the

niqab becomes synonymous with the notions of terror and danger, posing as a symbol of danger to Quebec in both a literal and figurative sense. In a literal sense, the fact that the niqab covers the face is seen as a danger because it conceals one's identity and prevents outsiders from determining who they are looking at. This 'fear of the unknown' often leads to people assuming that women that wear niqabs might be hiding weapons under their clothing (Hancock & Mobillion, 2018). In a figurative sense, the niqab is dangerous to the feminist movement's progress and to the fabric of liberal, modern society (Hancock & Mobillion, 2018). Many liberal feminists often assume that the niqab is a result of male oppression in Muslim households, which turns the niqab into another symbol of the patriarchal stronghold that dominates women's lives (Hancock & Mobillion, 2018). The decision to wear the niqab is one that Muslim women often make for themselves, but popular rhetoric like this frames it as being a decision that is imposed on Muslim women and removes them of their bodily autonomy. This feminist belief ignores the fact that if laws forcing women to remove the niqab are implemented, it would be a very similar form of patriarchal oppression, one that would once again prevent women from making decisions for themselves. However, because the niqab is less about bodily autonomy and more about symbolic resistance to the fight for Western definitions of feminism and gender equality, liberal feminists see it as contrary to progressive values (Sharify-Funk, 2011). This perception has transformed a Muslim woman's personal decision into a socio-political one, and has led to the niqab becoming a symbol of danger and anti-Canadianness.

The Reinforcement of Political Inequality

Political inequality is a form of social stratification, in which there is an imbalance in how much access and ability individuals have to influence governance structures and policies (Dubrow, 2007; Dubrow, 2015). How much citizens are able to voice their concerns, how often these voices are heard, and the subsequent patterns of policy-making that demonstrate an implementation of solutions all tie into how political inequality is enforced (Dubrow, 2007). Political inequality is closely related to structural formats, and how structures and institutions disadvantage particular groups in society (Dubrow, 2015). With respect to this concept, Bill 62 is a clear demonstration of how government-created policy can structurally disadvantage a group. In this case, it is Muslim women who wear niqabs that are being disadvantaged, whether it is through social isolation, ostracization, or enforced inaccessibility to public services, unless exempt. While the scope of Bill 62 is limited to Muslim women in Quebec, the discussion on the niqab is a national one and gradually expands itself to other provinces as the issue of religious freedoms and national values continues to persist.

The political inequality that manifests as a result of the implementation of Bill 62 depends on a combined effort on the part of the actual approved bill and the Quebec Justice Minister, Stephanie Vallée. According to the bill, individuals seeking religious

accommodation must meet a set of criteria when making their request. However, it is Justice Minister Stephanie Vallée that defined how one could make a request once this criteria was met. In a press release in May of 2018, Vallée made several statements regarding the implementation of Bill 62 (Boissinot, 2017). Although there were various exchanges between Vallée and the press as to how individuals could seek religious accommodation, two important statements emerged from the conversation. These important statements took form as the following:

> 1. If an individual wants to be exempt from the law on the basis of religious accommodation, then they must appeal to each individual authority for which they want the exemption (Boissinot, 2017)

> 2. All requests for religious accommodation will be treated on a case-by-case basis (Boissinot, 2017)

These statements are important to the discussion of political inequality because they demonstrate how accessibility is restricted for individuals that choose to wear a face-covering in public. To begin with, these statements are an issue because they represent the way in which the sole decision-making power is given to the Justice Minister, without requiring input from communities that utilize the face-covering for religious identity and practice. Most notably, Muslim women are disproportionately affected by this bill, yet they are completely absent from the political consultation arena. The guidelines that will govern the implementation of Bill 62 come from a centralized authority, instead of involving the local actors that will be interacting with the rules on a day-to-day basis.

In addition to the method through which the guidelines are established and released, the actual content of the statements is also controversial and disadvantageous to Muslim groups. Statement 1 demonstrates how structural inequality is reinforced through bureaucratic methods instilled by the government. As a result of the claim described in the statement, instead of having exemption-seeking individuals file a request to one central authority and gain widespread permission to wear a face-covering, these individuals must separately appeal to each authority that governs each public service that the individuals seek to access. By requiring people to dedicate time and effort into filling out an abundance of paperwork and submitting it to various authority figures, this law makes religious accommodation incredibly difficult to obtain, and in some ways even inaccessible. Statement 2 also serves as an area for critique, as the application of the case-by-case concept further promotes institutionalized inequality between the creators of the law and the practicers of it. Vallée claims that the actual religious accommodations will be made on a case-by-case basis (Boissinot, 2017). Over time, this may prove to be an issue for two major reasons. Firstly, although the case-by-case approach allows for the tailoring of responses for needs of accommodation, there exists the issue that there is no overarching pattern or precedent that will dictate the grounds on which an exemption can or cannot be granted. Second of all, since each case will be seen as its own entity, there will be

no concrete guidelines or rules that the applicants can appeal to if their request is denied. This removes both transparency and clarity from the decision-making process.

In fact, the decision-making process emerges as one of the greatest reasons for a critique of Bill 62, as it completely bypasses the participation of the general public. In reviewing each request on a case-by-case basis, the bill allows lawmakers and enforcers to exercise discretion over decision-making, without consulting the individuals involved in implementing the decision. It centralizes power to the governing body, and removes the agency of everyday people in making decisions. Vallée gives public transit as an example, stating that transit employees like bus drivers will not be making the decisions as to who gets on and off the bus (Steuter-Martin, 2018). Rather, the highest authorities for the public transit system will make that judgment, and expect the bus drivers to merely enforce it. This lack of power for the employees translates to them not being able to make any decisions in the moment as to who is able to make use of the services while wearing a face-covering. While this may not be detrimental for individuals taking transit, it can have severe consequences for individuals trying to access more critical assistance, such as that found through health care services. Ironically, with Bill 62, while the authorities will use a case-by-case approach, service providers cannot exercise the same, as their ability to assist individuals will already be pre-determined at that point.

Due to this, political inequality simultaneously emerges as both a major force behind the bill and a consequence of it. Muslim women that are already facing the effects of complex intersections must now navigate through the lengthy process of accessing basic rights and services.

Conclusion

Bill 62 stifles individual religious freedoms under the pretext of safety, communication and national values like secularization. It effectively bans the wearing of the niqab while using any public service, marginalizing Muslim women that were once able to freely exercise this right. By banning the act of covering one's face and connecting this to the value of secularization, Bill 62 bans a symbol of the Muslim faith without directly having to claim this. With Quebec's contemporary history of proposed niqab bans, with specific reference to Bill 60 and Bill 94, this new legislation is just a better-worded reiteration of the same initial policies that work to remove the niqab from the public sphere. The implicit meaning that is derived from the ban is that Islamic religious garb is not seen as being compatible with Quebec society. In imposing this meaning upon the general public, Bill 62 takes away agency from both the wearers of the niqab and the people that interact with them. Leading up to this law, institutions and authorities did not possess the power to turn away individuals that had their face covered. Now, the bill allows for

more limitations to be imposed upon Muslim women, and further pushes them out of the public sphere, in terms of cultural representation, community participation and economic stability.

The bill does allow for religious accommodation, but the process is tedious and heavily bureaucratic. Bureaucratic procedures are lengthy and complex, characteristics that often discourage and disadvantage groups that must partake in them. This enforces a socio-political inequality that is further complicated by intersections of religion, gender and nation, amongst several others that will inevitably impact Muslim women's access to requesting religious accommodations. Furthermore, the government's parameters for reasonable accommodation only refer to "...the legal concept that if a norm within an organization necessary to the pursuit of the mission of the organization is found to discriminate against employees or clientele, the organization must seek, but not necessarily reach, a compromise with the affected person..." (McAndrew & Bakhshaei, 2012, p. 941). This is significant because if the entire bill is arguably a concerted effort to discriminate against women that wear the niqab, then reasonable accommodation for religious reasons will be very difficult for individuals to obtain. Thus, Bill 62 criminalizes a religious symbol, focusing on just the symbolic meanings of the niqab without once mentioning the niqab itself.

While this paper has attempted to address the sociological structures and processes that enable inequalities that stem from Bill 62, the actual impact of the bill on Muslim women remains to be seen. As they navigate bureaucratic processes, exercise their religious rights in public, and voice their opinions against the discriminatory law, how will these women reassert what it means to wear the niqab in Quebec? This paper is limited in predicting this, as it is unable to incorporate the plethora of theories that address various aspects of this law. In its formulation, what rhetoric shaped the bill? In its implementation, how does Bill 62 impact Muslim women's perception of national identity? How does it influence their relationships with the workplace and the public sphere? How does this law affect perceptions of the niqab in Quebec, and do these trends resemble patterns seen in European countries that have implemented more clearly defined niqab bans? In addition, how do other intersections, such as those of race and class, further influence Muslim women's experiences with Bill 62? Perspectives that explore intersectionality and inequality within the context of economic trends, critical race theory and legal theory must be further investigated and applied to the topic in order to gain a more thorough understanding of what Bill 62 means for Muslim women in Quebec.

Taking all of this into account, the use of intersectionality and symbolic interactionism to understand political inequality for Muslim women is an important first step. It is not until we understand the simultaneously connected and conflicting axes of social factors that we can accurately determine the impact of legal decisions for different communities. Furthermore, in order to assess the significance of the niqab it is imperative that we explore the symbolic meanings behind it for various communities. Through this

paper, these two frameworks converge and allow us to formulate a clearer picture of just how Canadian legislation, particularly that of Quebec, continues to be used for discriminatory agendas. Bill 62 may be the outlawing of a symbol, but its impact is gearing up to be the slow-building marginalization of an entire community.

References

Bakali, N. (2015). Contextualising the Quebec charter of values: How the Muslim 'other' is conceptualised in Quebec. *Culture and Religion*, 16(4), 412-429.doi:10.1080/14755610.2015.1090468

Bakali, N. (2016). *Islamophobia : Understanding anti-muslim racism through the lived experiences of muslim youth*. Dordrecht: Sense Publishers.

Bakht, N. (2015). In your face: Piercing the veil of ignorance about niqab-wearing women. *Social & Legal Studies*, 24(3), 419-441. doi:10.1177/0964663914552214

Bill 62, *An Act to foster adherence to State religious neutrality and, in particular, to provide a framework for requests for accommodations on religious grounds in certain bodies*, 1st Session, 41st Legislature, 2017. Retrieved from http://www2.publicationsduquebec.gouv.qc.ca/dynamicSearch/telecharge.php?type=5&file=2017C19A.PDF

Bill 94, *An Act to establish guidelines governing accommodation requests within the Administration and certain institutions*, 1st Session, 39th Legislature, 2010. Retrieved from http://www.assnat.qc.ca/en/travaux-parlementaires/projets-loi/projet-loi-94-39-1.html

Boissinot, J. (2017, October 24). How will Quebec's Bill 62 work? What we know (and don't) so far. *The Globe and Mail*. Retrieved from https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/national/quebec-bill-62-explainer/article36700916/

Brems, E., Vrielink, J., & Ouald Chaib, S. (2013). Uncovering French and Belgian face covering bans. *Journal of Law, Religion and State*, 2(1), 69-99. doi:10.1163/22124810-00201004

CBC News. (2015, February 12). Niqab-citizenship ceremony ruling will be appealed, PM Says. *CBC*. Retrieved from https://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/niqab-citizenship-ceremony-ruling-will-be-appealed-pm-says-1.2955418

Chambers, L., & Roth, J. (2014). Prejudice unveiled: The niqab in court. *Canadian Journal of Law and Society*, 29(3), 381-395. doi:10.1017/cls.2013.62

Collins, P. H., & Bilge, S. (2016). *Intersectionality*. Cambridge, UK; Malden, MA: Polity Press.

Crenshaw, K. (1991). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. *Stanford Law Review*, 43(6), 1241-1299. doi:10.2307/1229039

Dubrow, J. K. (2007). Guest editor's introduction: Defining political inequality within a cross-national perspective. *International Journal of Sociology*, 37(4), 3-9. doi:10.2753/IJS0020-7659370400

Dubrow, J. K. (2015). Political inequality is international, interdisciplinary, and intersectional: Political inequality. *Sociology Compass,* 9(6), 477-486. doi:10.1111/soc4.12270

Fleras, A. (2017). *Unequal relations: A critical introduction to race, ethnic and Aboriginal dynamics in Canada*. (8th Edition). Toronto: Pearson.

Fournier, P., & See, E. (2012). The "naked face" of secular exclusion: Bill 94 and the privatization of belief. *Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice*, 30(1), 63.

Hancock, C., & Mobillion, V. (2018). "I want to tell them, I'm just wearing a veil, not carrying a gun!" Muslim women negotiating borders in femonationalist paris. *Political Geography*, 69, 1-9. doi:10.1016/j.polgeo.2018.11.007

Helly, D. (2004). Are Muslims discriminated against in Canada since September 2001? *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal*, 36(1), 24.

Lau, R., Ferreras, J., & Joseph, R. (2017, January 29). Quebec City terrorist attack on mosque kills 6, injures 8. *Global News*. Retrieved from https://globalnews.ca/news/3213042/shooting-quebec-city-centre-culturel-islamique-mosque/

Mathelet, S. L. (2015). A hidden ideological scheme under new secularism: Explaining a peak of Islamophobia in Quebec (2013-2014). *Islamophobia Studies Journal*, 3(1), 29-43. doi:10.13169/islastudj.3.1.0029

McAndrew, M., & Bakhshaei, M. (2012). The difficult integration of Muslims into Québec since 9/11: International or local dynamics? *International Journal*, 67(4), 931-949. doi:10.1177/002070201206700405

Meer, N., Dwyer, C., & Modood, T. (2010). Embodying nationhood? Conceptions of British national identity, citizenship, and gender in the 'Veil affair'. *The Sociological Review*, 58(1), 84-111. doi:10.1111/j.1467-954X.2009.01877.x

Musolf, G. R. (2009). The essentials of symbolic interactionism: A paper in honor of Bernard N. Meltzer. *Emerald Group Publishing Limited*, 305-326. doi:10.1108/S0163-2396(2009)0000033021

Nagra, B., & Maurutto, P. (2016). Crossing borders and managing racialized identities: Experiences of security and surveillance among young Canadian Muslims. *Canadian Journal of Sociology/Cahiers Canadiens De Sociologie*, 41(2), 165-194.

Sampson, W. (2008). Institutional discrimination. In R. T. Schaefer (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of race, ethnicity, and society* (Vol. 1, pp. 727-729). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc. doi:10.4135/9781412963879.n289

Sharify-Funk, M. (2011). Governing the face veil: Quebec's bill 94 and the transnational Politics of Women's identity. *International Journal of Canadian Studies*, (43), 135-163. doi:10.7202/1009458ar

Steuter-Martin, M. (2018, May 9). Bill 62: Quebec releases criteria for requesting, granting religious accommodation. *CBC*. Retrieved from https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/montreal/quebec-bill-62-guidelines-accommodations-1.4655620

Stolle, D., Harell, A., Soroka, S., & Behnke, J. (2016). Religious symbols, multiculturalism and policy attitudes. *Canadian Journal of Political Science*, 49(2), 335-358. doi:10.1017/S0008423916000561

The Ugly Engineering of the Beauty Industry: Mica Mining in the Globalized Age

Charmaine Lee
University of British Columbia

Abstract. In today's globalised age, the unprecedented expansion of the global cosmetic industry affects the lives of millions in tangible and intangible ways. This paper delves into the darker truths behind this illustrious industry, which is embedded in the global production chain and in particular, the mica mining industry. By examining the linkages between the cosmetic industry and the perpetuation of development asymmetries within the context of "the globalisation project," this paper analyses the relationship between the mica mining industry and the maintenance of a hegemonic Western beauty standard in reinforcing development dichotomies. A discussion on the labour costs and subversion of rights incurred in the process is also addressed, and concludes by examining the merits and limitations of possible solutions, namely legal and educational initiatives by the government, as well as non-governmental efforts in increasing sourcing transparency and tackling child labour.

Introduction

The glamorous cosmetic industry is an omnipotent force within modern society, with sprawling advertisements featuring the latest shade of lipstick, eyeshadow, and highlighter on effortless models across the globe. As the latest cosmetic releases become the talk of the town, YouTubers and beauty reviewers rush to review the product, asking questions such as "is this eyeshadow pigmented?", "is it long-wearing?", which provide practical information for consumers to make informed decisions as they assess the competing products on the market. Yet, are we making informed decisions when the questions we ask merely glean the surface of the product in terms of its quality and value added to our appearance? Can we consider ourselves informed consumers when we do not know the origins, the components and the human sacrifices implicated in the products we use?

The documentary *The True Cost* sheds light on the mica mining industry and its controversy in the global cosmetic and automotive industry (Morgan, Ross, Siegle, Mc-Cartney, Firth, Shiva & Blickenstaff, 2015). Mica is the staple mineral that gives the "glitter" to the makeup, found commonly in the lipstick, nail polish, foundation, body glitter we use, as well as in our car paint (World Vision Canada, 2018). As global consumers, the hidden truths behind the cosmetic industry simply represents a microcosm of the complexity of the global production chain and its relationship to development. Yet, the dire consequences borne by a few to satisfy the needs of the majority are exemplified in the case of mica mining and the world of cosmetics – where the deaths of child workers are hidden behind the "glamour" of consumerism.

DanWatch – a Danish independent watchdog conducting investigative journalism on global corporate ethics and impact, produced a research brief titled *Who Suffers For Beauty*, which provided a holistic presentation of the mica mining industry and its lax regulations with regards to child labour (2014). The industry is especially prominent in India, where sixty percent of the mineral is mined in two major provinces, Jharkhand and Bihar (Nesbitt, 2014). The lack of regulations surrounding the industry, the preference for "small hands to pick and sort the valued mineral," and the burgeoning demands from major beauty companies – namely L'Oreal and other beauty brands – have produced an industry rife with criminality relating to the employment of child labour – which has become an endemic issue due to the reporting of mica mine deaths over the past few years. Though no official figures are presented, local reports have indicated at least 20 fatalities in Jharkhand in June 2016 alone (Firstpost, 2016).

> Normally, we hear about 10 fatalities on average in a month. But in June, we documented over 20 deaths, including two of boys aged around 15 years old (Firstpost, 2016).

These counts are likely underestimated as deaths are often covered up in the crumbling aftermath of unregulated mining accidents that elude official radar. This paper aims to explore the ethics of consumerism through demystifying the globalized production chain of the cosmetic industry through its mica mining practices. In exploring the nuances in the development dichotomy which characterizes the global supply chain today, this paper uses dependency theory to explain asymmetric development, which will be highlighted by a discussion on child labour and human rights in the industry.

Guided by the central question—*How does mica mining in the global cosmetic industry reinforce the aspirations of the globalization project in deepening the development divide*?—this paper asserts that although the mica mining industry is microcosmic in the breadth of the globalization project, it is nonetheless reflective of the consequentialist approach of the fragmented global supply chain towards the production of goods. It argues that within the case of mica mining, development asymmetries are reinforced through the maintenance of a hegemonic Western beauty standard and the subversion of universal

labour rights.

To develop this claim, the paper will be divided into two parts and two sub-parts, where it will first examine how mica mining goes hand-in-hand with the globalizing "Western beauty project," albeit at the cost of child labour and human right violations, before drawing parallels to the maintenance of a hegemonic beauty standard in cementing development asymmetries in the global economy.

Mica Mining in Fueling the Globalisation of the "Western Beauty Project"

The paradox of how the mica industry fuels the production of cosmetic goods to sustain hegemonic Western beauty standards

The mica mining industry and the cosmetic industry is characterized by a significant paradox. The glitter from the newest Urban Decay palette boasts different shades for any occasion. Yet, glitter only serves to mask uncomfortable truths. In the aforementioned states of Jharkhand and Bihar, mica mining is the main source of income for impoverished local families – who send their children to mica dumps to earn a meagre income in order to sustain their basic needs. The extracted mineral is sourced by major companies, such as L'Oreal – one of the top five multinational corporations in the global beauty industry, whose vast profile of products, despite its increasingly diverse consumer base, is nonetheless rooted in the constructs of the "Western beauty project" (Fivek, Hovis & Miller, 2015). This term implies an extensive operating system that investigates factors such as "cultural sensitivity, business ethics, [and] proactivity" to fulfil the corporation's vision in capturing consumers from different geographical and cultural backgrounds whilst maintaining the fabrics of Western beauty standards (Chung, 2014).

This systematic collection of information feeds into L'Oreal's assessment of their products and marketing strategies, which vary across regions. These strategies are, however, united by the industry's promulgation of a hegemonic Western standard of "beauty" – an intangible benchmark constructed and honed through time that pervades our subconscious thinking and perception of beauty. European features, such as having pale skin or deep set eyes, have been largely popularized and idealized by mainstream media in the East. As Chung argues, the ideal of having fair, white skin has been capitalized on by the global beauty industry to become a multi-billion dollar business (2014). L'Oreal itself came out with a line named "White Perfect," sold in India, where the desire for fair skin stems from the country's colonial history (Habib, 2009). As the beauty and cosmetic industries are inextricably linked, this translates to the production of a wider cosmetic line

that caters to the fairer skinned, whilst the rest of the darker-skinned population is largely omitted in terms of the choices offered. As these transnational beauty companies originate from the global North, the nature of the supply chain and the marketing of products "often represent Western standards of beauty, even in new markets" (Chung, 2014).

The neo-colonialism of the "Western beauty project" is thus manifested in the extraction of resources – in particular, mica – from the developing state, manufactured into a cosmetic product that *embodies* Western beauty standards, and then sold to the non-Western hemisphere to sustain the hegemonic standard that ensures the continuation of profits. As such, the paradox, fuelled by the mica industry, perpetuates a narrow, Western beauty standard that is involuntarily assimilated by the rest.

Child labour, "blood money" as a means and ends to the project?

The endemic problem of child labour in mica mining, which has gained traction within the international community in recent years, has exposed the consequentialist approach adopted by the global cosmetic industry towards the production of goods. World Vision Canada has condemned the hidden cost of beauty in a comprehensive report that describes the consequences of illegal child labour in mica mines:

> "Over 22,000 children work in dangerous conditions that put their health and life at risk. Child mica miners are exposed to hazards ranging from long-term exposure to toxic air that can lead to chronic and fatal lung diseases, to working near explosions or in underground mines that pose the ongoing risk of cave-ins. Instead of attending school, they work long days doing hard labour, earning a wage that perpetuates the cycle of poverty." (World Vision Canada, 2018)

The poverty cycle, coupled with the health hazards that child labourers are exposed to, compound the grievances of the mica mining industry. To cite international labour standards, this is in direct violation of two conventions by the International Labour Organization – namely Convention 138, which sets the minimum age for admission to employment as 18 – and Convention 182 on the worst forms of child labour, where the presence of toxic gas and dangerous substances qualify as "hazardous activities" (No.138, 1973; No.182, 1999; Shipper & Cowan, 2018).

This is due in part to the lax regulations of the mica mining industry under the Indian government, where it is reported that in Jharkhand and Bihar, only 10% of the mica mines are legally operated (DanWatch, 2014). This glaring legal loophole means that the unregulated mica mines are exempt from the enforcement of labour laws, which exacerbates the problem of child labour due to the aforementioned vacuums. The blood

money that is generated through the absence of regulations have, therefore, been occluded as a means to justify the ends of the "Western beauty project".

Though the international community has increased its criticism of the mica industry, as evident from articles that highlight the risk of consumers' complicity in supporting child-labour through their cosmetic purchases, the lax regulation extends to a lack of action that can be taken to increase transparency towards the labour landscape in the mica industry. For instance, it is reported that 65% of the cosmetic companies operating in Canada "do not report what measures are being taken to prevent child labour-produced ingredients from entering their products" (Canadian beauty industry at risk of supporting child labour, 2018). The legal loophole prevents the Indian government from addressing the gravity of the situation, rendering the source of mica and the use of child labour a murky question for corporations alike. It can, therefore, be concluded that the regulatory latitude of the industry itself defeats international efforts toward transparency and the suppression of child labour.

Parallels Between the Asymmetric Development of the Beauty Standard and the Globalising Economy

How the dominant beauty standard consolidates development dichotomies and constitutes a self-perpetuating cycle

As we have established an understanding that the sustenance of a hegemonic Western beauty standard is instrumental to the globalizing cosmetic industry in reaping economic profits, we can explicitly see the linkages between the two, and how development dichotomies come into play. Drawing on Andre Gunder Frank, we can use dependency theory as a lens of analysis. Frank argues that contemporary underdevelopment is a result of the historical and continuing economic relations between the satellite and metropolis, where this structure of dependency limits the agency of the exploited whilst benefiting the exploiter (Frank, 1969). If we apply this lens of analysis to the case of mica mining and the global cosmetic industry, we see that the dependency between countries is reinvented within the globalization project and the fragmented production chain. Though the colonial structures have been dismantled, the rise of the global division of labour and new technologies cement the forces of interdependency, where both the multinational beauty corporations and the mica industry, as well as the intermediate stakeholders, play *equally* important roles in the consequential production of the cosmetic good. Yet, as the gains of globalization are disproportionately distributed along the production chain, the development dichotomy continues as the global South lags behind the North, where marketing manpower and paint glitter over the truth of how the good came to be.

If we look at mica mining as a case study within the globalization project framework, it is perhaps best to combine the dependency theory with the globalization theory (Reyes, 2001) in order to acknowledge that the intersection of technology, culture, and economics has created a new development paradigm—where the insertion of a Western beauty hegemony into various cultures is now enmeshed with economics. Consequently, the nested linkages between the "Western beauty project"—a dominant cultural construct exported to players along the global production chain—and the asymmetric development between the global South and the North, is indicative of the complex relationship between development and globalization. The vicious cycle of development asymmetries is rooted in the presence of a dominant culture of Western beauty, and so the discussion of development cannot be isolated from the potency of said culture.

Moving beyond the status quo?

To progress beyond the current situation where legal gaps only buffer child labour and labour rights violations, this being a situation which leaves both corporations and global consumers confused as to whether the lack of transparency and official data translate to a complicit endorsement of this unregulated mining industry, much must be done to change the status quo. Possible avenues such as improved government legislation, public education campaigns and the role of international condemnation will be examined.

In terms of governmental legislation, the Indian government has taken steps to alleviate the situation. Authorities in eastern India have begun the process of legalizing the mica mining industry in order to combat child labour after the explosion of reports documenting the deaths of children working in illegal mines. Through plans to "sell off dumps of scrap mica and auctioning off old mica mines and other reserves for mining," the government hopes to regulate the sector by eliminating child labour, ensuring better wages and working conditions for mine workers, and identifying mica dumps for local auctioning (Dash, 2017). The privatization of the sector offers incentives to increase efficiency as well as halt child labour. Indeed, this novel solution promotes a higher degree of regulation over the industry and the enforcement of legitimate labour contracts. However, the success of regulation is contingent on the identification of mica mines, for which the provisions and definition of what constitutes a mica mine (such as the size of the mine, etc.) remain vague. To bridge the gap between legalization and effective law enforcement, better articulation of the procedure is needed in order to fully stem the issue of child labour and prevent further deaths. The potential pushback to this, however, is that it may take away the livelihood of impoverished families who do rely on the unregulated mines and their children to earn a living. In this case, this is symptomatic of a larger poverty issue that the government must tackle through poverty alleviation and other employment programs. However, child labour and hazardous work are priorities that the government must not forego addressing.

Secondly, public education campaigns or educational programs can be launched to improve public awareness of the situation. Though the impact of this is hard to measure, the relevant government or civil society organizations should consider increasing the quantity and quality of educational programs, targeting poor families or regions that may be more prone to the use of child labour as a source of income. It should be considered a long-term, consistent effort that is implemented *in addition to* the government's legalization of the industry in order to achieve maximum success. This is similar to a scheme initiated by the National Resources Stewardship Council (NRSC), a non-profit that promotes responsible sourcing to construct "child-friendly villages" that aims to get children in poor regions into school instead of the mining industry, by working with local communities to improve educational infrastructure. By working together with the local authorities, nonprofits play a key role in providing education to the poor to eliminate child labour (Paddison & Bengtsen, 2016).

Finally, to transcend the importance of grassroots awareness to the international arena, the role of international criticism cannot be neglected. As global consumers, we should be more aware the consequences behind our consumption. As globalization only further entrenches the international division of labour in light of development dichotomies, transparency and awareness are important qualities to tackle the complacency of consumers of the global North. The issue of mica in cosmetics and beauty products may be microscopic within the totality of the globalization framework, however, it is one that pertains to the ideals of ethical consumerism, the elimination of child labour and the promise of better labour conditions. Though producers and consumers are constrained within the globalizing superstructure of neoliberalism and the global supply chain, an informed awareness, which is dependent on access to reliable information that should improve with the legalization of the mica mining industry, is a basic responsibility each consumer is tasked with. As such, when labour or human rights standards are foregone to satisfy the consequentialism of production, international condemnation can be mobilized to bring awareness to the situation. The role of international awareness and productive criticism are thus important to safeguard universal standards alongside grassroots mobilization.

Conclusion

To conclude, this essay has sought to examine the frames of ethical consumerism by situating the issue of mica mining and the cosmetic industry within the globalization project. By drawing from a mélange of academic literature, news and publications by think tanks and non-governmental organizations, this essay raised the paradoxical asymmetries that underlie not only the perception of beauty, but also the development dichotomy as sustained by the imposition of a hegemonic "Western beauty project". This, in particular,

exemplifies the inextricable ties between culture and economics as the dissemination and upholding of a dominant beauty standard are crucial to cementing development asymmetries along the global production chain. The discussion on child labour as the hidden cost behind the production process further raises the need for legal discourse to tackle vacuums in government legislation, and potential educational efforts to transform the mentality and situation of the impoverished.

Behind the facade of a Western-dictated beauty is the suffering of many – transparent sourcing and the guarantee of basic and fair labour conditions are the minimum requirements to be fulfilled, so that the costs of beauty can be offset and the privilege of being "beautiful" can be extended to all.

References

Chung, K. (2014). Symbiosis in the World of Beauty: The Cosmetics Industry and the Western Beauty Ideal. Retrieved from https://japansociology.com.

CTV News (2018, June 14). Canadian beauty industry at risk of supporting child labour: Study. Retrieved from https://www.ctvnews.ca/business/canadian-beauty-industry-at-risk-of-Supporting-child-labour-study-1.3973699

DanWatch (2014). Who Suffers For Beauty: The child labour behind makeup's glitter. Retrieved from https://old.danwatch.dk/wp-content/uploads/2015/03/Who-Suffers-for-beauty.pdf

Dash, J. (2017, May 4). India begins legalizing mica mining after child worker deaths expose. *Reuters*. Retrieved from https://www.reuters.com/article/us-india-child-labour/india-begins-legalizing-mica-mining-after-child-worker-deaths-expose-idUSKBN1802AC

Firstpost. (2016, August 3) Child workers die in illegal mica mines as operators exploit their poverty, lack of education. *Firstpost*. Retrieved fromhttps://www.firstpost.com/living/child-workers-die-in-illegal-mica-mines-as-operators-exploit-their-poverty-lack-of-education-2932858.html

Fivek, E., Hovis, C., & Miller, M. (2015). L'Oreal: Beauty for Everyone? *Community, Environment, and Development: An Undergraduate Research Journal.* Retrieved from https:// aese.psu.edu/students/research/ced-urj/news/2015/l2019oreal-beauty-for-everyone

Frank, Andre Gunder. (1969). "The development of underdevelopment" *Monthly Review* 18(4):17-31.

Habib, Shahnaz (2009, February 9) *The ethics of global branding*, The Guardian. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2009/feb/20/race-beauty-branding

International Labour Organization (ILO), *Minimum Age Convention, C138,* 26 June 1973, C138, available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/421216a34.html [accessed 11 November 2018]

International Labour Organization (ILO), *Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, C182,* 17 June 1999, C182, available at: http://www.refworld.org/docid/3ddb6e0c4.html [accessed 11 November 2018]

McMichael, P. (2012). *Development and social change: A global perspective*. Newbury Park, CA: Pine Forge Press.

Morgan, A., Ross, M., Siegle, L., McCartney, S., Firth, L., Shiva, V., Blickenstaff, D., (2015).*The True Cost*. Life Is My Movie Entertainment (Firm)

Nesbitt, H. (2014, November 8). Child Labour: Mineral make-up boom raises fears over ethical extraction. The Guardian. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/india-child-labour-mica-mineral-cosmetics

Paddison, L., & Bengtsen, P. (2016). Beauty companies and the struggle to source childlabour-free mica. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/sustainable-business/2016/jul/28/cosmetics-companies-mica-child-labour-beauty-industry-india-

Reyes, G. E. (2001). Four main theories of development: modernization, dependency, world-systems and globalization. *Nómadas. Revista Crítica de Ciencias Sociales y Jurídicas*, 4(2), 109-124

Shipper, I., & Cowan, R. (2018). Global mica mining and the impact on children's rights executive summary. *Terres Des Hommes, SOMO*. Retrieved from https://www.somo.nl/global-mica-mining/

World Vision Canada. (2018). Hidden Cost of Beauty: The Risk of Child Labour in Canadian Cosmetics. Retrieved from https://www.worldvision.ca/WorldVisionCanada/media/NCFS/Reports/risk-of-child-labour-in-canadian-cosmetics-mica-research-brief-2018.pdf

Culture as Intervention: Applying Indigenous Knowledge & Self-Determination to Suicide Prevention Policies in Northern Saskatchewan

Alexandria Pavelich

York University

Abstract. National attention began to focus on Northern Saskatchewan after 6 young, Indigenous women, ages 10 to 14, died by suicide in in October 2016. Data collected in Saskatchewan in 2017 has been made public, and it states that nearly 500 suicides have been completed by First Nations people in the province since 2005. While governmental bodies have made repeated pledges to work with these First Nations communities to solve the suicide crisis, no provincial or federal suicide prevention strategies have been enacted, and poor data collection methods further inhibit the ability to implement effective measures. Beginning with a theoretical discussion on Durkheim's conceptualization of suicide, I will highlight the importance of social variables that should be viewed as enabling forces for suicidal behaviour. This will lead into a discussion on colonialism as a social determinant of mental health, as oppressive practices present in Canada's history—such as The Indian Act, the reserve system, and a legacy of residential schools—have had considerable, negative consequences on the mental health of Indigenous people. However, symbolic healing through the act of cultural reclamation has been cited as a promising solution. Using the narrative of one individual's story of symbolic healing as an entry point for inquiry, I will tie this healing process into a larger commentary on its potential to be applied as a preventive suicide measure for First Nations youth. The paper will conclude with a discussion on the current, biologically reductionist therapeutic responses being employed by the Saskatchewan government which should be viewed as an enabling force that perpetuates suicide rates in Northern Saskatchewan communities. It is necessary for the implementation of new mental health procedures that incorporate not only holistic worldviews into psychiatric practices, but also culturally relevant and trauma-informed approaches that are based in Indigenous knowledge and self-determination.

Introduction

Indigenous suicide among youth populations in Northern Saskatchewan began to garner national attention after six young women, ages 10 to 14, took their own lives in October 2016. As of 2017, the Federation of Sovereign Indigenous Nations (FSIN) began releasing data indicating that there have been nearly 500 Indigenous suicides in Saskatchewan since 2005. While governmental bodies have pledged to work with Indigenous communities to solve the crisis, no provincial or federal suicide prevention strategies have been enacted. Further, there has been little discussion on the social variables that enable suicide, such as the impact of white settler colonialism. Upon presenting what little data is currently available on Indigenous suicides in Saskatchewan, this paper will introduce Durkheim's typology of suicide which advances the importance of cultural context as it affects suicidal behavior. I will then correlate Durkheim's framework to Fanon's postcolonial theoretical position which argues that colonialism acts as a social determinant of mental health, as supported by the oppressive colonial practices that have historically occurred in Canada which have had immensely negative health consequences on Indigenous populations.

In introducing this theoretical discussion, I will explain the concept of symbolic healing which, to many, is an act of cultural reclamation that has been suggested as a promising solution to healing from colonial trauma. The biographical work of Sharon Acoose, a Cree/Saulteaux woman based in Saskatchewan, will provide the entry point for my discussion on the integral role that culture can play in healing for Indigenous groups in Saskatchewan, especially as it is applicable to preventive suicide measures for Indigenous youth. By placing Durkheim, Fanon, and Acoose in conversation with one another, I will argue that the biologically reductionist therapeutic responses based in individualized public health discourse currently being employed by governmental bodies should be viewed as an enabling force that increases suicide rates in Northern Saskatchewan communities. I will close by highlighting why it is necessary for the implementation of new mental health procedures that incorporate not only holistic worldviews into psychiatric practice, but also trauma-informed approaches based in Indigenous knowledge and self-determination.

Please note: despite being an individual who has been granted the privilege of working alongside Inuit youth on a community based mental health project, I struggled to write this paper because of the potential ethical implications. Given my position of privilege – both as a researcher and a white settler - I took every care and precaution possible when approaching this topic, and I feel I have presented this data in a respectful and authentic manner. In no way is this paper meant to (re)produce colonial attitudes and/or behaviors, and permission was granted by Dr. Acoose in (re)sharing her story and wisdom as it may apply to a broader public health epidemic.

In acknowledging my position of privilege, I still felt compelled to share this work because of the immediacy that this topic warrants. While I am aware of the tenuous and

often problematic dynamic that can occur between the researcher and the researched, I wrote this paper from the standpoint of an ally and advocate for the rights of the Indigenous peoples of Northern Saskatchewan, a population that has been repeatedly overlooked by the provincial and federal government. Given the limited research that presently exists on youth suicide occurring in Northern Saskatchewan, this is a crisis that requires as many voices and collaborators as possible. As such, the most pressing concerns to date are, first, bringing as much exposure to this topic as possible, and second, providing whatever potential ideas we have for suicide prevention to the forefront. Therefore, the social location of the contributor should be received as secondary to their motivation to help in collective healing activities.

Suicide in the Saskatchewan Context

Suicide can be defined as, "all cases of death resulting (in)directly from a positive or negative act of the victim himself, which (s)he knows will produce this result" (Durkheim, 1897, p. 44). In Canada, Indigenous populations disproportionately suffer from higher suicide rates (Statistics Canada, 2017). Northern Saskatchewan communities, which are populated predominantly of First Nations individuals, are experiencing mass mental health disparities which some suggest is a result of lacking mental health services available within the remote region (FSIN, 2017; Mehl-Madrona, 2016). While suicide mortality has decreased nationally since 2012, Saskatchewan remains far above the national average with suicide remaining the leading cause of death for First Nations youth (Hatcher, Crawford, and Coupe, 2017; FSIN, 2017; Mehl-Madrona, 2016). The rate of suicide by First Nations girls, aged 10 to 19, has now exceeded the rate of First Nations Boys (Statistics Canada - Saskatchewan Census, 2017), and the rate of death by suicide of First Nations people in Saskatchewan is 4.3 times higher than their non-First Nations counterparts in the province (FSIN, 2017).

Though suicide clusters are frequently reported in the media, few preventative or post-vention measures have been put in place, and little has been done to mobilize essential mental health interventions, which appear to be impeded by poor systemic planning. Saskatchewan currently has no suicide prevention strategy (SPS), and Canada remains the only G8 country without a national prevention plan (FSIN, 2017; Mehl-Madrona, 2016). The World Health Organization states that the most effective prevention interventions for suicide rely on systematic surveillance of rates to detect trends and identify at-risk populations (Tait, Butt, Henry, and Bland, 2017). Saskatchewan does not have any such surveillance, and suicide rates are not reported by ethnicity; as such, suicide trends may fall heavily upon First Nations individuals across the entire province, but this will remain unseen as poor surveillance makes distinguishing rates for the purposes of prevention tactics an impossible feat (Tait et al., 2017).

A point continually observed in the literature pertaining to SPSs targeting Indigenous groups is that they predominantly focus on detailing the *need* for interventions based on a high prevalence of mental disorder present in communities, or they simply describe the proposed intervention itself (Hatcher et al., 2017; Nelson & Wilson, 2017). This becomes problematic on two grounds: first, it appears that when proposed interventions are implemented, they rarely collaborate with Indigenous communities during development; and second, there is repeated failure when it comes to examining the efficacy of the prevention strategy based on outcomes (Hatcher et al., 2017; Nelson & Wilson, 2017). This means that ineffective interventions will likely continue to be implemented and, presumably, continue to fail at reducing rates of self-harm. A key factor that plagues unsuccessful SPS attempts for Indigenous groups has to do with the conflicting beliefs regarding the causes of suicide, of which I will unpack further.

Theorizing Causes of Suicide

Before exploring the theoretical position that I support as to why suicide rates are so high in Northern Saskatchewan, I must make two notes regarding competing theories to understanding suicide. First, there currently remains no evidence that psychiatric disorders-often perceived to be the main cause of suicide - have an underlying biological mechanism (Tempier, 2016). Much of the current discourse around causes of suicide in popular culture and public health campaigns claim that suicide is singularly caused by the inability to treat mental disorder; yet, this does not explain why those with diagnosed mental disorders do attempt or die by suicide (White, Marsh, Kral, and Morris, 2016). Second, psychological models to suicide have limitations: pre-existing studies which claim that people take their own lives for a myriad of psychological/emotional reasons should be analyzed critically as these observations are frequently concluded after individuals have died, meaning the validity of data can be unfounded when derived from family or friends (Hjelmeland in White et al., 2016; Tempier, 2016). In contrast, sociological theorizations of suicide speak to the social variables and cultural contexts that can lead to self-injurious behavior or suicide, which is where my focus will lie.

The influence of aforementioned social forces is what led Durkheim to develop a useful typology for theorizing suicide. Durkheim's (1897) typologies were not developed explain why individuals decide to take their own life, but to explain how the structuring of different societies results in different suicidal acts, illuminating the importance of cultural context. Durkheim cites regulation and integration as the most important social variables pertaining to *anomic* and *fatalistic* suicide, the two (of four) types I will highlight. Durkheim advanced the dictionary definition of *anomie* by referring to it as a (1) social condition resulting in instability as originating from a collapse of norms and values, as well as a (2) personal condition, wherein alienation (or lack of integration) breeds from a

purposelessness or absence of values. Additionally, *fatalistic* suicide is understood as resulting from excessive regulation - as enforced by oppressive forces - which can correlate to a collapse of traditional, cultural norms.

Contextualizing Colonial Oppression & Historical Trauma as a Variable in Suicide

Colonizing practices are still heavily present in Saskatchewan and enable a setting for cultural discontinuity and a lack of social cohesion. Current educational curriculums still largely ignore the Indigenous perspective as it pertains to Canada's history of colonization, and physical separation continues through the reserve system leading to feelings of alienation, estrangement, or confusion among Indigenous youth in relation to wider Saskatchewan society (Nelson & Wilson, 2017). The application and interplay of both *anomic* and *fatalistic* suicide in the context of colonization is vital, as social ruptures enforced by oppressive forces are often cited as a reason for suicide by Indigenous communities themselves, providing a stark contrast to the more frequently assumed pathological explanations where suicide is understood as an outcome of long-standing, untreated depression or substance use (Bantjes, Swartz, and Cembi, 2018). Regardless of the explicit cause, there is little attention paid to the impact of social variables when it comes to Saskatchewan's responsive measures, which is why I turn to the important theoretical framework developed by Fanon: colonialism as a social determinant of health, arguably the largest contributing factor concerning heightened suicide rates in Northern Saskatchewan.

Since contact with Europeans, Indigenous communities in Canada have experienced adverse physical, emotional, and spiritual harm by enduring countless massacres, forced assimilation practices, incredible dehumanization, and denial of rights and freedoms (Mussel, 1998). Colonization itself can be understood as the establishment and maintenance of a colony in a specific region, where oppressive practices exercised in an unjust or cruel manner over the colonized have negative consequences falling upon the colonized person (Hilton, 2011). Such oppression - through racism, alienation, segregation and dehumanization - has been studied by Frantz Fanon, a psychiatrist whose collective works discuss the immense psychological ramifications colonialism can have on individuals (Hilton, 2011). Hilton (2011) summarizes Fanon's views as they pertain to human suffering by explaining that colonial rule, established on repressive social/legal codes, positions Indigenous populations as inferior to the status of the colonizer. A psychological toll occurs when the oppressed comes to know themselves through the eyes of the oppressor as a lesser "other." This shift in self-worth and alienated identity happens as the colonized subject internalizes the supposed "civilization" the colonizer is pressing upon them. With this shift, the Indigenous individual comes to self-identify with being less-than-human, thus legitimizing the act of colonization. As the psychological destruc-

tion and disruption of the self unfolds, the Indigenous person adopts a "white mask" to assimilate, leading to further alienation from their inherent culture and identity, resulting in *anomie*.

Durkheim (1897) has shown that low levels of *anomie* indicate high levels of social stability in society. In the Canadian context, it has been shown that communities with a strong sense of culture, as it pertains to self-governance, ownership, and control over services like health care, policing, and education, report lower suicide rates, if any at all (Mehl-Madrona, 2016; Chandler & Proulx, 2006). Culture, here, is conceptualized as the beliefs, behaviors, language, customs, norms, organizations, or institutions common to members of a particular group of society (Helman, 2007).

As Hatcher et al. (2017) have pointed out, my sentiment of colonization enabling *anomie* resonates globally among Indigenous populations, as the highest rates of suicide are among those who have experienced recent colonization. Thus, oppressive practices present through colonization should be considered a crucial variable when discussing suicide because white colonial settlers have played an enormous role in Canada's history. An important historical moment pertains to the introduction of The Indian Act in 1876, a comprehensive piece of legislation implemented to manage Indigenous people (Kirmayer, Simpson, and Cargo, 2003). Within the Act, policies of forced assimilation were institutionalized as Indigenous people were restricted from participating in cultural activities, an attempt to completely erase Indigenous culture (Kirmayer et al., 2003). As colonizers gained power, Indigenous groups were forced to relocate onto "reserve lands" with poor game which further disabled traditions of hunting, creating a disconnect with the land, while also isolating Indigenous people from the rest of Canadian society (McQuaid, Bombay, McInnis, Humeny, Matheson, and Anisman, 2017).

The implementation of The Indian Act was incredibly oppressive and its far-reaching consequences are still present today, as more recently exemplified through introduction of Indian Residential Schools (IRS). The right that Indigenous parents once had to pass on their culture to their children was disrupted when children were taken from their homes and placed in an institutional school-setting; this process was ongoing for more than 100 years, with the last IRS closing in Saskatchewan in 1996 (FSIN, 2017). Run upon strict Christian ideology, IRS' were truly designed to "kill the Indian" in children by making them ashamed of their cultural beliefs, traditions, and languages (Bombay, Matheson, and Anisman, 2014). Parenting behavior was altered during the IRS experience, with subsequent children being exposed to poorer economic well-being and social disadvantages due to weak familial relationships (Bombay et al., 2014; Nelson & Wilson, 2017). McQuaid et al. (2017) explain historical trauma theory as how the collective experience of events can accumulate over generations, and Kirmayer et al. (2003) has provided a summary of the transgenerational effects of IRSs:

The transmission of explicit models and ideologies of parenting based on ex-

periences in punitive institutional settings; patterns of emotional responding that reflect the lack of warmth and intimacy in childhood; repetition of physical and sexual abuse; loss of knowledge, language and tradition; systematic devaluing of Aboriginal identity; and, paradoxically, essentializing Aboriginal identity by treating it as something intrinsic to the person, static and incapable of change. These accounts point to a loss of individual and collective self-esteem, to individual and collective disempowerment and... to the destruction of communities (p.4).

Studies have been conducted linking the experience of IRS with suicidal ideation and/or attempts, where parental stress carried from such experiences has been clearly shown to influence their children, thus proving the cumulative effects of familial IRS attendance with trauma (Bombay et al., 2014). To further support this, McQuaid et al. (2017) revealed that communities where individuals didn't attend IRS reported relatively low levels of suicide. Though more research needs to be conducted, SPSs frequently overlook the growing empirical evidence linking adverse childhood experiences to increased suicide risk which are becoming increasingly present on an intergenerational basis (FSIN, 2017; Bombay et al, 2014).

Relevant to the discussion of systemic oppression as it intersects child-rearing activities is also the issue of gender. As previously noted, suicide rates are much higher for Indigenous women in Northern Saskatchewan than their male counterparts (FSIN, 2017). One could argue that this is because Indigenous women have historically been, and continue to be, the target of violence (FSIN, 2017). The primary goal of colonization has been to gain access over Indigenous lands and territories, and the quickest way to enable success in this realm has been the infliction of violence in an attempt to sever an Indigenous women's ability to carry life forward, thus disabling any potential exercise of sovereignty over traditional lands (Women's Earth Alliance and Native Youth Sexual Health Network, 2015). While violence against women and the crisis of Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women, Girls, and Two Spirits (MMIWG2) more broadly is a discussion in and of itself, the issue of gender cannot be overlooked in this context.

All over North America structural violence against Indigenous women persists, as manifested through the aforementioned legacy of colonization which comes with extreme oppression in the form of ongoing state and environmental violence. Therefore, Indigenous women disproportionately suffer from mental, physical, emotional, and spiritual harm at rates higher than Indigenous males. Recently, scholars have brought forth how "there are links between the presence of tar sands industry and the heightened rates of missing and murdered Indigenous Two Spirits, women and girls" (Awasis, 2014, p. 255). Violence incurred against the land reflects violence against women directly: extractive industries with its associated patriarchal culture has ultimately normalized harmful activities as they fall upon Indigenous women and girls. This statement holds true in the context of sexual assault and in the resulting social ills that occur because of the des-

ecration of the land where negative environmental activities (i.e. pollution, water and food supply toxicity) cause irreversible damage to the bodies and spirits of these women, further inhibiting their ability to reproduce (Women's Earth Alliance and Native Youth Sexual Health Network, 2015).

Intersecting an Indigenous Worldview with Symbolic Healing

As exemplified, Indigenous people have faced multiple layers of oppression through overtly racist policies and practices, with the Canadian government facilitating an attempted cultural erasure via oppressive practices. Given this information, Waldram, Herring, and Young (2006) have studied the process of symbolic healing among Indigenous people in Canada wherein they highlight the importance of returning to cultural traditions to overcome historical trauma, a process that must begin with a foundational understanding of Indigenous worldviews.

Indigenous worldviews differ greatly from that of Euro-Americans, and this differentiation is crucial for understanding the complex cultural disconnect Indigenous people face from colonization, particularly in terms of how individual's view the self. Many Indigenous people perceive the self from a collectivist approach while Euro-American conceptualizations are frequently egocentric and individualistic; Indigenous identity, self-esteem, and well-being are drawn from collective identity based in ecocentrism (connection to the land, wildlife, and natural world) and cosmocentrism (connection to ancestral lineage and the spirit world) (Kirmayer et al., 2003). With this understanding, Indigenous views of the self should be perceived as holistic and relational: connections to one's language, land, ancestry, and communal environment is seen as vital to wellness (Fiedeldey-Van Dijk et al., 2017). While a Western or Euro-American model of health may be based on scientific facts and separation of mind/body, the Indigenous worldview is informed by the integrated balance of spiritual, emotional, mental and physical well-being. Because of this interconnection, the manifestation of the spiritual world through the act of healing, as seen in physical reality, is taken as proof of the efficacy of generational teachings and knowledge which can be enacted daily through ceremony and ritual (Fiedeldey-Van Dijk et al., 2017).

With an Indigenous worldview in place, it is imperative to define symbolic (or ritual) healing as an act of healing that relies on language, ritual, or the use of cultural symbols in contrast to material and physical consumption of pharmaceutical treatment (Helman, 2007). Anthropologist Dow (1986) spoke to the importance of social relations as a precursor to psychological problems, with social variables being part of the pattern of symbolic healing as enforced by the mythic world. In the anthropological context, a mythic world

can be understood as the interlinking symbols or ideas that provide a framework for understanding the source or nature of a patient's problems so that they can be understood for the purposes of healing (Davies, 2009). Dow (1986) purports that the most important factor in symbolic healing is the matching of mythic worlds; this is essential as healing does not rely so much on empirical reality and essential facts as much as corresponding views. This sentiment is shared by Levi-Strauss who believed that efficacy was located not in its resemblance to essential facts but in belief (Davies, 2009). To further exemplify: Western psychotherapy places the mythic world as belonging in the mind of the patient. In contrast, Elders (as therapeutic practitioners in an Indigenous context) would place the mythic world as holistically inseparable from relations to nature, the cosmos, community, and the self. As such, colonialism, with its oppressive practices intent on disrupting cultural continuity for Indigenous individuals, should be viewed as the force that creates a disconnect between the Indigenous people and mythic world. This opens a discussion by Csordas (1999) who indicates there is a strong relationship between identity and symbolic healing.

Csordas (1999) drew a theoretical connection between personal and collective identity, as it pertains to mental suffering, by showing how symbolic healing itself should be considered a form of cultural power beyond resolving illness or disorder because it manifests as a form of resistance against oppressive forces. By speaking to how representations, negotiations, and transformations are present in both ritual healing and the politics surrounding the development of personal identity (as present in colonizing practices), Csordas highlights how the transformation of the self through the symbolic healing process is political in nature. It has been observed in Saskatchewan in recent years that Indigenous individuals are having a mass resurgence of cultural pride: many communities are reclaiming and openly celebrating their traditions which had previously been banned, now actively passing them onto younger generations, perhaps, as a form of resistance (FSIN, 2017). One such example is that of Sharon Acoose, a Cree/Saulteaux woman from Saskatchewan, who has written about her own process of cultural reclamation and identity transformation as she continues on her path to markedly improve her mental health.

Acoose's Perspective: Culture-As-Intervention as Symbolic Healing

Acoose's narrative perfectly illuminates the intersection of symbolic healing and identity transformation, and her ritual practices also have far-reaching implications for preventative suicide strategies as they pertain to healing from colonization. As a note, I did correspond with Acoose to gain permission to share her words as they apply to SPSs. A former self-proclaimed addict, Acoose is a respected social scientist and tenured faculty member in Social Work at the First Nations University of Canada. In her book, *A Fire Burns Within*, Acoose (2016) speaks to how reclaiming Indigenous identity has been the

ultimate form of symbolic healing; by returning to traditional roots, Acoose was able to improve her health with the process also acting as a powerful force of decolonization. Decolonization, here, is conceptualized as the process "whereby Indigenous peoples reclaim that which was lost or degraded as a result of colonialism through traditional healing, rituals, and ceremony" (Marsh et al., 2016, p. 4). This is important to mention since higher rates of suicide have, as aforementioned, resulted from settler colonial activities. As such, Acoose's narrative acts as an entry point to detail the effectiveness of symbolic healing practices, and speaks to how culture reclamation mitigates the legacies associated with forced assimilation.

Acoose (2016) begins sharing her journey of healing from intergenerational trauma by first explaining the importance of re-learning her culture through ceremonial practices, as taught by Elders. In First Nations Saskatchewan communities, Elders carry knowledge on both the physical and spiritual realms, and they are frequently employed as traditional healers to help individuals back to wellness through various ritual practices (Marsh et al., 2016). Acoose (2016) speaks to how cultural teachings enabled *mi'no – pi'maat'zhi'win* (in Saulteaux)—"how to live a good life"—with ceremony helping her heal. One of the most significant aspects of her healing journey has been the application of the Medicine Wheel.

In a therapeutic context, Gone (2011) explains the Medicine Wheel as a topography of the self which can teach someone about their holistic being. The Medicine Wheel contains four quadrants associated with the aspects of the human experience that are meant to be in balance: the physical, mental, emotional, and the spiritual. Acoose (2016) states how lessons learned from the Medicine Wheel allowed her to address what was out of balance in her life, helping resolve conflicts pertaining to an unstable sense of self and past trauma. Acoose indicates her daily application of the Medicine Wheel brings her, "wholeness, restitution, and serenity to the disorder of living in an unkind society. It gives breadth to our lives and fills the holes of the suffering... it is a sacred tool used in the healing journey... to bring back balance, hope, and reciprocity" (2016, p. 23).

There are numerous First Nations-specific cultural ceremonies and/or rituals that are used as an aid for healing within Northern Saskatchewan communities such as sweat lodge ceremonies, smudging, drumming, sharing circles, and oral stories (Gone, 2011). Gone has indicated the Sweat Lodge is an important ritual for maintenance and cleansing, where individuals are encouraged to sit in a closed hut containing a fire which creates steam for the purposes of purification to promote healthy living. Acoose (2016) likens the sweat lodge ceremony to "climbing back into mother earth's womb... [it] brings balance to a life gone wild by opening and repairing wounds" (p. 17). By relating the ritual to a womb, Acoose suggests that the sweat incites a realization of oneness - that all participants come from the same human family. Acoose explains the physical experience of a Sweat can be tough to complete but that, "no matter how hot it is, I just accept my environment and suffer for all people... every fibre of your being is awakened [from the

heat]; it woke me up when I needed to be awakened" (2016, p. 55).

Sharing circles are also frequently used for healing amongst Indigenous communities and Gone (2011) explains how denying any personal trauma or pain will only perpetuate misery. As such, verbally sharing or disclosing personal pain results in an emotional catharsis that is necessary for healing. Acoose's (2016) story repeatedly returned to the importance of personal narrative and the sharing circle. By providing a safe place to speak where time is not a concern, individuals can learn to build trust with others by articulating what is within for the purposes of releasing it.

Acoose has also led an independent study where the impact of narrative in the form of writing was proven as an enormously helpful technique for women suffering from substance misuse in the promotion of healing (Acoose, Blunderfield, Dell, and Desjarlais, 2009). Research outcomes indicated that sharing stories ignited a feeling of hope for the women participants, as it created something they could offer to others in need while also disrupting traditional power inequalities that often occurs among researcher and the researched (or more historically, among the colonizer and colonized). Speaking further to the historical importance of narrative and oral traditions among Indigenous groups, Mehl-Madrona (2016) also found that being able to view words on paper was a confirmation of healing for many, suggesting that narrative-oriented approaches would be an appropriate deterrent among Indigenous people who would attempt suicide.

Acoose's story and activities present a unique take on healing compared to the dominant and more frequently employed biomedical approaches to overcoming trauma and social suffering. A more distinctive approach is a necessity for Indigenous groups given the culmination of cultural wounds that have been inflicted upon Indigenous communities and their ways of life vis-à-vis colonial activities within Canada. This is especially true of Indigenous women, given the history of symbolic, structural, and sexual violence that has been incurred against them, as previously mentioned.

As Koss-Chiooino (2006) has pointed out, if self-transformation is considered central to the ritual healing process – and ideas of personhood are undoubtedly affected by colonizing practices - those planning proposed therapies need to consider how the concept of the self may vary between cultural groups where recent colonization may be a factor, something which is beyond the bounds of both the biomedical and social determinants of health model. Reinforcing the belief that suicide is the result of social variables and not exclusively psychopathology.

Bantjes et al. (2018) observed SPSs among Indigenous groups in South Africa and indicated that traditional healers also understand suicidal behavior as a symptom of cultural discontinuity and social disconnection (anomie). In this context, fragmentation of traditional identities and loss of social cohesion—which came from urbanization and colonial rule—is what many Black Africans cite as the source of suicidal behavior, where

solutions are often found by re-establishing interpersonal connections to family and ancestors alongside renewing or self-transforming identities by practicing cultural rituals (Bantjes et al., 2018). Patients in South Africa overcoming suicidal crises through ritual ceremonies and practices - because they enabled a renewal in wholeness - can be likened to Acoose's "Culture as Intervention" approach because both speak to the importance of cultural context when considering appropriate prevention practices. However, these collectivist positions conflict with Western, individualistic biomedical model approaches to suicide that are currently and predominantly employed in Saskatchewan. These competing views will be put into conversation with one another to highlight why current medicalized approaches are clearly ineffective for many Indigenous people.

Limitations of Saskatchewan's Approach & the Way Forward

Concerning the currently available mental health treatment, as observed from my time working for the Saskatchewan Health Authority in Pediatric Psychiatry—where many of our patients were First Nations—the Saskatchewan government is employing a biomedical approach which predominantly perceives mental illness as a biologically-driven disease phenomenon separate from the person. The recognition of a collectivist identity, which acknowledges the historically oppressive treatment Indigenous people have received, is often ignored by health care providers who are frequently of an egalitarian mind that "all patients should be treated as the same," rendering discussions on the social determinants of mental health as irrelevant (Tang, 2008). However, it is important to recognize that people are not the same, and the recognition of these differences – whether the dimension is racial, gendered, economic, or historical – is necessary for planning treatment as these differences affect one's ability to navigate stressful situations such as seeking health care.

Numerous issues have been noted when addressing suicide from a solely biomedical framework, and many Indigenous individuals find Western medicine perplexing as it not only devalues the patient's subjective view but is also philosophically inconsistent with their own mythic world (Hatcher et al., 2017). Separating body, mind, and spirit in the process of healing may make little sense to an Indigenous individual seeking treatment assistance for psychological concerns, which is why many current biomedical interventions are failing. Ontological differences aside, simple logistics regarding care access also plague Northern communities Saskatchewan: travel time is often too great or expensive for many to come to a larger city center to receive care (FSIN, 2017). Additionally, social workers are frequently cited as having inadequate (or zero) training in preparatory suicide prevention (Morris & Crooks, 2015), and they are the ones predominantly deployed to remote Northern communities. Lastly, many who do manage to seek mental health support

are disappointed there are not Indigenous therapists available, and there is currently no listings of Indigenous psychologists in Saskatchewan (FSIN, 2017).

The overall tone of mental health care in Saskatchewan seems to disregard wider social determinants of health and developmental risks that may contribute to suicide later in life, as very few therapeutic models work specifically with Indigenous communities in Saskatchewan to plan preventative mental health measures (Hatchet et al., 2017; FSIN, 2017). As many Indigenous individuals use cultural reclamation and the revitalization of traditional values as an effective therapy for healing, the issue now lies within the Saskatchewan government to recognize its validity and applicability to the suicide crisis occurring in the Northern region of the province. Resistance to culture-based interventions makes little sense when one considers the existing body of research which confirms that suicide prevention measures are rendered ineffective when interventions have culturally discordant and clashing paradigms (Barker, Goodman, and DeBeck, 2017). Additionally, what we know from SPSs currently being conducted in Inuit communities is that suicide rates can stop altogether when Indigenous communities design their own interventions based on cultural values (Morris & Crooks, 2015).

Acoose (2016) has stated that an inability to implement cultural and ritual aspects into healing practices is leading to issues for many First Nations people, and there is virtually no written work on ceremony, especially on the prairies. A first step for implementing more culturally tailored programs means executing research methodologies that align with Indigenous design and honour their knowledge system, with the inclusion of young First Nations people at the forefront to create a youth-centered solution for their home communities.

I do not mean to generalize or simplify a complex social phenomenon by suggesting that cultural interventions will work for every Indigenous person to solve high rates of suicide. The culture and diversity of Indigenous identity does need to be considered when planning mental health interventions, especially as it contrasts with current public health discourse focused on biological mechanisms. Furthermore, I do not wish to suggest that cultural interventions and biomedical approaches are mutually exclusive: though outside the scope of this paper, "Two-Eyed Seeing" validates and integrates both symbolic healing alongside scientific medicine, an approach that has been successfully implemented for Indigenous populations in the context of addictions therapy (Fiedeldey-Van Dijk et al., 2017).

Conclusion

This paper set out to draw attention to the importance of Canadian settler colonialism as it pertains to the importance of sociocultural factors in the aetiology of suicide. The

collaboration between Aboriginal communities alongside Western biomedical care could potentially maximize effectiveness of SPSs, which is why Waldram et al. (2006) has stated that, "at the heart of the matter is the need for increasing dialogue between healers and physicians, including the possibility of collaboration" (p. 247). However, this requires health care professionals to advocate for policy change that recognizes the health disparities between Indigenous and non-Indigenous people.

It is imperative that a multi-dimensional lens be applied to the youth Indigenous suicide crisis occurring in Northern Saskatchewan, and it is only by triangulating the works of various minds that a potential route for healing may be reached. Durkheim's typology of suicide, as it intersects with Fanon's postcolonial position - which recognizes colonization as a determinant in social suffering - provides a unique theoretical perspective for making sense of this current public health crisis. These thinkers, aligned with Acoose's subjective experience and position that culturally discordant responses will continue to fail if they perpetually disregard Indigenous voices, provides a new avenue for illuminating potential solutions in suicide prevention.

Corey O'Soup, a government Advocate for Children and Youth in Saskatchewan, spent the early half of 2017 interviewing 264 Indigenous youth to spotlight suicide as a public health crisis and is quoted saying, "If [the government] says, 'Well, we're already doing this, this and this' - which is what typically happens – 'this, this and this' are not working. The results are clear: our children are dying... the North have to be the ones generating strategies. But the government needs to be able to recognize that, and they need to properly fund it" (CBC News, 2017). Situations like these, where provincial authorities continually limit effective, evidence-based funding is why I argue that the Saskatchewan government's inability to recognize the value of Indigenous knowledge inclusion, self-determination methodology, and importance of alternative, holistic approaches in healing practices, should be viewed as an enabling force that perpetuates suicide rates.

As suicide rates increase nationally - and seemingly ineffective biomedical approaches for prevention continue to be utilised for First Nations populations - I call for a larger interdisciplinary research framework that is aimed at capturing the complex phenomenon of Indigenous youth suicide. If properly implemented, such an undertaking could guide academics in the medical and psychology-based disciplines to cross boundaries and collaborate for the application of more community-driven solutions. A paradigm shift is necessary, as there is an urgent need to encapsulate holistic approaches to wellness from an Indigenous worldview.

References

Acoose, S., Blunderfield, D., Dell, C. A., & Desjarlais, V. (2009). Beginning with our voices: How the experiential stories of First Nations women contribute to a national research project. *Journal of Aboriginal Health*, 4(2), 35.

Acoose, S. (2016). *A fire burns within: teachings from ceremony and culture*. Vernon, British Columbia: J. Charlton Publishing.

Awasis, S. (2014). Pipelines and resistance across Turtle Island. In T. Black, S. D'Arcy, T. Weis, & J. Kahn (Eds.), *A line in the tar sands: struggles for environmental justice* (pp. 253-266). Oakland, CA: PM Press.

Bantjes, J., Swartz, L., & Cembi, S. (2018). "Our lifestyle is a mix-match": Traditional healers talk about suicide and suicide prevention in South Africa. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 55(1), 73–93. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461517722065

Barker, B., Goodman, A., & DeBeck, K. (2017). Reclaiming Indigenous identities: Culture as strength against suicide among Indigenous youth in Canada. *Can J Public Health*, 108(2), 208. https://doi.org/10.17269/cjph.108.5754

Bombay, A., Matheson, K., & Anisman, H. (2014). The intergenerational effects of Indian Residential Schools: Implications for the concept of historical trauma. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 51(3), 320–338. doi: 10.1177/1363461513503380

CBC News (2017, December 06). 'Our kids are crying out for help': Sask. report shares Indigenous youth solutions on suicide. Retrieved January 1, 2018, from http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/saskatoon/sask-child-suicide-north-advocate-1.4433961?mc_cid=09faad7d83&mc_eid=aa8a0a4a3c

Chandler, M.J. & Proulx, T. (2006). Changing selves in changing worlds: Youth suicide on the fault-line of colliding cultures. *Archives of Suicide Research*, 10, 125-140.

Clifford, A. C., Doran, C. M., & Tsey, K. (2013). A systematic review of suicide prevention interventions targeting indigenous peoples in Australia, United States, Canada and New Zealand. *BMC Public Health*, 13(1), 463.

Csordas, T. J. (1999). Ritual healing and the politics of identity in contemporary Navajo society. *American Ethnologist*, 26(1), 3-23

Dow, J. (1986). Universal aspects of symbolic healing: A theoretical synthesis. *American Anthropologist*, 88(1), 56–69. https://doi.org/10.1525/aa.1986.88.1.02a00040

Durkheim, E. (1951). *Suicide: a study in sociology*. New York: The Free Press.

Fanon, F. (2011). *The wretched of the earth*. New York: Grove Press.

Fiedeldey-Van Dijk, C., Rowan, M., Dell, C., Mushquash, C., Hopkins, C., Fornssler, B., Shea, B. (2017). Honoring Indigenous culture-as-intervention: Development and validity of the Native Wellness Assessment TM. *Journal of Ethnicity in Substance Abuse*, 16(2), 181–218. doi: 0.1080/15332640.2015.1119774

Federation of Sovereign Indigenous Nations' (FSIN) Mental Health Technical Working Group. (2017). *Discussion Paper regarding a Saskatchewan First Nations Suicide Prevention Strategy.* September 22, 2017. Saskatoon, Saskatchewan: FSIN.

Gone, J. P. (2011). The Red Road to wellness: Cultural reclamation in a Native First Nations community treatment center. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 47(1–2), 187–202. doi:10.1007/s10464-010-9373-2

Greenwood, M., De Leeuw, S., Lindsay, N.M., and Reading, C. (2015). *Determinants of Indigenous peoples' health in Canada: Beyond the social*. Second edition. Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars.

Hart, M. A. (2005). *Seeking mino-pimatisiwin: an Aboriginal approach to helping*. Halifax, Nova Scotia: Fernwood Publ.

Hatcher, S., Crawford, A., & Coupe, N. (2017). Preventing suicide in Indigenous communities: *Current Opinion in Psychiatry*, 30(1), 21–25. doi: 10.1097/YCO.0000000000000295

Helman, C. (2007). *Culture, Health and Illness* (5th ed.). Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press.

Hilton, B. T. (2011). Frantz Fanon and colonialism: A psychology of oppression. *Journal of Scientific Psychology*, 12(1), 45–59.

Huseman, J. and Short, D. (2012). "A slow industrial genocide": Tar sands and the Indigenous peoples of northern Alberta. *The International Journal of Human Rights*. 16(1):216-37

Kirmayer, L., Simpson, C., & Cargo, M. (2003). Healing traditions: Culture, community and mental health promotion with Canadian Aboriginal peoples. *Australasian Psychiatry*, 11(sup1), S15—S23.

Koss-Chioino, J. D. (2006). Spiritual transformation, relation and radical empathy: Core components of the ritual healing process. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 43(4), 652–670. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461506070789

McQuaid, R. J., Bombay, A., McInnis, O. A., Humeny, C., Matheson, K., & Anisman, H. (2017). Suicide ideation and attempts among First Nations peoples living on-reserve in Canada: The intergenerational and cumulative effects of Indian residential schools. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 62(6), 422–430. doi: 10.1177/0706743717702075

Mehl-Madrona, L. (2016). Indigenous knowledge approach to successful psychotherapies with Aboriginal suicide attempters. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 61(11), 696–699. doi:10.1177/0706743716659247

Morris, M., & Crooks, C. (2015). Structural and cultural factors in suicide prevention: The contrast between mainstream and Inuit approaches to understanding and prevention suicide. *Journal of Social Work Practice*, 29(3), 321–338. doi:10.1080/02650533.2015.1050655

Morse, J. M., Young, D. E., & Swartz, L. (1991). Cree Indian healing practices and western health care: A comparative analysis. *Social Science & Medicine*, 32(12), 1361–1366.

Mussel, B. (2008). BC Partners for Mental Health and Addictions Information: Aboriginal People. *Visions Journal*, 5(1). Retrieved from http://www.heretohelp.bc.ca/visions.

Nelson, S. E., & Wilson, K. (2017). The mental health of Indigenous peoples in Canada: A critical review of research. Social Science & Medicine, 176, 93–112. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2017.01.021

Osteen, P. J., Jacobson, J. M. & Sharpe, T. L. (2014) 'Suicide prevention in social work education: how prepared are social work students?', *Journal of Social Work Education*, 50(2), 349-364.

Tait, C. L., Butt, P., Henry, R., & Bland, R. (2017). "Our Next Generation": Moving towards a surveillance and prevention framework for youth suicide in Saskatchewan First Nations and Métis populations. *Canadian Journal of Community Mental Health*, 36(1), 55–65. https://doi.org/10.7870/cjcmh-2017-004

Tang, S. (2008). "Race" matters: racialization and egalitarian discourses involving Aboriginal people in the Canadian health care context. *Ethnicity & Health*, 13(2), 109-127. doi: 10.1080/13557850701830307

Tempier, R. (2016). Suicide among Aboriginals: A "burning" public health issue in need of solutions. *The Canadian Journal of Psychiatry*, 61(11), 682–683. doi:10.1177/0706743716655787

Thatcher, R. (2016, October 31). Aboriginal suicide a concern for all of us; Grief should fuel a collective urge to action. *The Star – Phoenix, Saskatoon*, SK, pp. A5

The Canadian Press: Toronto. (2016, October 31). Saskatchewan NDP calls for action after another Aboriginal girl kills herself. *The Canadian Press, Toronto*, ON. Retrieved from http://ezproxy.library.yorku.ca/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/1835

Waldram, J.B., Herring, D.A., and Young, T.K., (2006). *Aboriginal health in Canada: Historical, cultural and epidemiological perspectives*. Toronto, Ontario: University of Toronto Press.

Waldram, J. B., & Hatala, A. R. (2016). The role of sensorial processes in Q'eqchi' Maya healing: A case study of depression and bereavement. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 53(1), 60–80. https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461515599328

Women's Earth Alliance and Native Youth Sexual Health Network. (2015). Violence on the land, violence on our bodies. In Greenwood, M., De Leeuw, S., Lindsay, N.M. & Reading, C. (Eds), *Determinants of Indigenous peoples' health in Canada: Beyond the social* (pp. 204 – 223). Toronto, ON: Canadian Scholars.

White, J., Marsh, I., Kral, M.J., and Morris, J. (2016). *Critical suicidology:*
  Transforming suicide research and prevention for the 21st century. Vancouver, BC:
  UBC Press.

Contemporary Political Debate and Contextual Understanding: A Study of Immigration as a Lived Experience

Kurtis J. Samchee
University of Toronto

Abstract. Immigration has moved from a topic that has received periodic mention to the forefront of political debate. While the official rhetoric of Canadian immigration claims to value a more inclusive standpoint (Breton 2015; Garcea, Kirova and Wong 2008), "inclusiveness" as propagated, is rather glorified and hence largely ignores the specific stressors and obstacles immigrants are subject to. In light of this, this study aims to explore the complex process of immigration by examining four Canadian immigration cases. Using qualitative methods centered on four semi-structured interviews, I explore the factors influencing migration to Canada while drawing on the personal narratives of my participants. Three major thematic subsets were generated from the analysis of the data: the first section, "Before Canada," provides a glimpse into my interviewees pre-migration lives and their underlying motives for migration; the second section, "During the Application," tracks the process of becoming a landed immigrant of Canada from the preliminary application period through the review process and ensuing waiting period. Lastly, "Life After" first examines the symbolic relevance of the citizenship ceremony and then turns to explore the legal reflections my participants were able to draw in contrast with their native land. I conclude with how this study may serve as the useful groundwork for future qualitative research on the individual perspectives behind the Canadian immigration process.

Introduction and Context

The election of Donald Trump as the 45th American president has brought immigration to the forefront of political debate. The immediacy of this was so pronounced that, in

fact, the official Canadian government website for Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship crashed following the official U.S. election results (Beeby 2017). Sources reveal that the site was most likely brought down by undocumented (U.S.) foreigners scrambling to get electronic travel authorization documents[1] aligned before the imminent deadline proposed by the victorious Republican party (Beeby 2017). The overwhelming activity of Americans wanting to flee to Canada was resultant from the Trump administration's polemic stance on immigration reform: more specifically, the administration's proposal to build a wall along the U.S.-Mexico border, the "extreme vetting" of refugees seeking asylum, and the "total and complete shutdown" of Muslim immigration into the U.S. (Liu 2016; Winders 2016). Although such proposals have yet to be fully realized, these events have transformed how undocumented migration is perceived and addressed and has subsequently moved immigration policy to the center of large public demonstrations and political debate—a topic that has generally remained dormant since the abominable September 11th al-Qaeda terrorist attacks in New York in 2001.

Although Canada and the U.S. have been marked by a degree of equivalence for their "traditional immigrant-receiving societies" (Gabriel 2015:29) and the resultant immigration policy paths, the Canadian immigration model remains distinctive in its belief that immigration represents a positive opportunity for not only economic but also social and cultural development (Reitz 2012). Since Confederation in 1867, over 17 million immigrants have settled in Canada—and for a country with a current population of approximately 35 million, it is for this reason that Canada has long been labelled the land of immigration (The Daily 2017).[2] Colonization did occur in both countries and some issues regarding this still remain today, to varying degrees. Canada, for instance, continues an open and ongoing dialogue with Indigenous peoples. Despite variations in the annual figures representing the number of landed immigrants in Canada, data reveals that considerable fluctuations are linked to policy reform and/or the current political situations of neighbouring countries (Immigration and Citizenship 2017b). In correspondence with the illustration posed above, the land of immigration may well be characterized as a land of refuge during certain historical epochs.

While the official rhetoric of Canadian immigration claims to value a more inclusive standpoint (Breton 2015; Garcea, Kirova and Wong 2008), "inclusiveness," as propagated, is rather glorified and therefore largely ignores the specific stressors and obstacles immigrants are subject to. Alternatively, immigration as a lived experience can be a rather restrictive process. The discernable challenges immigrants face are nothing new, yet their 'voice' is continually displaced from political debate. In other words, statistics and comprehensive policy proposals do not tell the story of immigration—people do.

---

[1]As listed on the website, "visa-exempt foreign nationals who fly to, or transit through a Canadian airport, need an Electronic Travel Authorization (eTA)." The cost for this is listed at $7 CAD (see Immigration and Citizenship 2017d).

[2]Also: "land of immigrants," "land of migrants". These terms are used collectively to convey the idea that immigration is one of Canada's principal and defining characteristic.

In light of this, this study aims to explore the complex process of immigration by examining four Canadian immigration cases while addressing two research questions. First, what factors influence migrants to pursue immigration to Canada? Second, how do immigrants recollect the process of immigration? Using the data collected from semistructured interviews, I address these issues by using the narratives of my respondents. Lastly, I conclude with how this study may serve as useful groundwork for future qualitative research on the individual perspectives behind the Canadian immigration process. Although the sample size limits the scope and applicability of the findings from this study, it can nonetheless contribute to Canadian immigration debates, especially as they regard the legal and bureaucratic aspects of this process, by providing an in-depth analysis of the case studies discussed here. As Black and Hicks (2008) point out, the relationship between political discussions, immigration, and traditional research methods is not easily discernible. Thus, the main purpose of this study is to provide some groundwork for the future integration of these components.

Research Design and Methods

Qualitative research interviews are a preferred approach for gaining an in-depth understanding of the 'interior' experiences and perspectives of participants (Weiss 1994). Using an interview guide to usher the discussion between interviewer and interviewee, semistructured interviews, in particular, are an effective tool for attaining this type of insight into a specific topic or issue (Weiss 1994). This approach focuses on revealing people's feelings or first-hand perspectives on the subject chosen as the researcher's focus (Davies 2007). The present study employed this specific qualitative approach to explore the experiences of four middle aged adult immigrant males from South America, Europe, and Asia. These men all went through the immigration process from their late-teens to their early 30s. All data was collected after the immigration process had occurred. A convenience sample method was used to recruit these participants (Auberbach and Silverstein 2003) and gender was not identified or intentionally sought as a topic of interest for this study. I interviewed each participant using a semi-structured interview guide to facilitate discussion. All interviews took place in a private setting and lasted anywhere from thirty minutes to one hour in length. The interviews were digitally recorded with the participants' consent and were later transcribed verbatim and coded by myself. Consent was also obtained for the publication of these narratives. Open coding allowed for a thematic analysis as the primary method of data analysis. As such, the present study adopted a grounded theory approach, which operates inductively (i.e., "emerges from") when analyzing the data (Auberbach and Silverstein 2003; Emerson, Fretz, and Shaw 1995). The central reason for this was to allow for a better opportunity to, align with the theme of this study, to let the data speak for itself. All of the participant's names were translated into pseudonyms in the discussion below for anonymity purposes. Finally, I encountered no

ethical concerns over the course of the study.

As a qualitative researcher, it is useful to reflect on my own standpoint. Perhaps most important to this study was the fact that I am not myself an immigrant to Canada. This could have influenced the direct ways or even subtle nuances of the approach that I took when questioning the participants. Furthermore, this could have had an ambiguous effect on data collection as it may have encouraged discussion on the finer, and often overlooked, details of the process or else discouraged data sharing in general as taking part from an 'outsider' as well as 'researcher' role. Importantly, being aware of this dynamic can reduce such barriers and contribute to objectivity in data collection. I also took every opportunity to develop strong rapport with the participant, such as ensuring I would represent their story in a truthful way.

Findings

Three major subsets were generated from the analysis of the data. The first section, "Before Canada," provides a glimpse into my interviewees pre-migration lives and the underlying motives behind their decision to migrate to Canada. The second section, "During the Application," tracks the process of becoming an official landed immigrant of Canada from the preliminary application period through the review process and ensuing waiting period. Lastly, "Life After" first examines the symbolic relevance of the citizenship ceremony[3] and then turns to explore my participants' 'legal reflections'.

I. Before Canada

Immigration is often the most difficult decision immigrants will face in their lifetime. Often having to part from family members, spouses, and an accumulation of social ties and commitments, immigrants must abandon their native community in exchange for an unfamiliar territory, foreign landmarks, and for the most part, an entirely new formal communication system, all with the future in mind (Hilburn 2014; Portes and Rivas 2011; Pumariega and Rothe 2010). As such, the migration process is embedded with a host of "push" and "pull" factors. The first theme I identified in my analysis accounts for this

---

[3]The citizenship ceremony functions to welcome new immigrants to the "Canadian family". Immigrants are expected to accept the rights and responsibilities associated with Canadian citizenship. A citizenship judge usually presides over the ceremony where they lead the "Oath of citizenship". After taking the Oath, immigrants are presented with a citizenship certificate which provides proof of the status and date of their official Canadian citizenship. At the end of ceremony, immigrants are given the lyrics of the Canadian National anthem and are encouraged to sing it in French or English (or bilingually) as a group. (see Immigration and Citizenship 2016b).

process by examining some of the larger macro-level structures influencing this decision, ultimately shaping the individual's capacity for agency. The second theme I identified provides a framework for understanding immigration as a restrictive process—the status of arrival was hinged upon a settling process. That is, immigrants often did not inhabit their first, and thus preferred, choice of territorial settlement. Taken together, Section I.I. outlines some of the central push and pull factors influencing my interviewee's decisions to immigrate, including the structural guiding principles they were subject to.

I.I. Negotiating Push/Pull within the Global Sphere

The collective analytic framework of political, economic, social, and technological external macro-level factors is a helpful tool for examining some of the reasons why my interviewees sought immigration status. As stated, one theme I identified throughout my analysis is that this decision was the product of either push or pull—or some combination of such factors. For instance, Edgar, an industrious man in his mid-twenties, was pushed from both his native Colombia and then later, from the United States. Edgar describes his tellingly coercive departure from Colombia at age 16:

> Ah, well you hear about Colombia—and it used to be pretty bad until the '90's—around the 80's and '90s because of all the drugs and wars and everything... people was trying to 'storition [extortion]—trying to get money of out of my dad, or stuff like that, and yeah, we had to leave, right? It was really bad, like I was going to get kidnap or something like that.

He goes on to tell me that his family was confronted by "guerillas," inextricably linked to the drug cartel—moreover, narco-terrorist and Colombian drug lord Pablo Emilio Escobar Gaviria and the Medellín Cartel who were at the height of their power around this period.[4] Business owners were seen as an opportune population for the guerilla extortionists to target as Edgar's family-owned farm was assumed to be a source of income—the drug cartel wanted their *share* of the operation. Upon confrontation, the decision his father was faced with was, in Edgar's words: "you either pay us or *you die*." It is evident from this encounter that a central motivation behind Edgar's family's decision to immigrate was to pursue a safe and secure nation. Edgar's experiences represent what the Government of Canada would label a *Humanitarian and Compassionate*[5] case, where the motive for seeking refuge is the potential for suffering or undue hardship. Typifying one end of the "push spectrum," Edgar's family was presumptively *pushed* to the brink of death. Under these circumstances, immigration can hardly be considered a 'choice' at all.

---

[4]Thompson (1996) notes that Escobar's rise was resultant from the United States "insatiable" cocaine demand (p.55). With his heavy domination in the creation, packaging, and wholesaling of drug culture both in America and Colombia, Escobar's fortune in the early 1980's was pegged at an estimated $5 billion USD.

[5]See (Immigration and Citizenship 2016a).

Nevertheless, his immigration experience also demonstrates that push factors can take on less severe implications, as his family was also coercively pushed from the United States, but this time, for administrative infractions. After finding refuge in the United States, Edgar's family stretched their residency there for nine years through the strategic process of successive appeals: "We just keep appealing, appealing, appealing, appealing...," but, as Edgar makes clear, the logic behind this strategy was bound to subside: "you get so many 'appealing's—after that, they just, well, deport you." Only after the conjunctive coercive efforts of Colombia and the United States does Edgar and his family arrive in Canada—permanently.

Further, my analysis revealed that the decision to immigrate was affected by a myriad of pull factors. Raj, a decorated scholar nearing his 40s, outlined that a central motivation behind his migration was for the betterment of his education: "well, I just came here to finish my Ph.D." When later probed, his specific preferences included: "a university for which was preferably located in a big city... somewhere where it's English and you get some funding." Raj also mentioned to me that salary was an important determinant in his decision where Toronto seemingly met these criteria, or rather, as Raj illuminates: "everything kind of *fit* together." As we shall discover below, the process of arriving at this preferential equilibrium does not occur swiftly nor is it definitive.

By way of contrast, the immigration experience of Andrew, an insightful and humorous Ukrainian native, demonstrates a mix of both push and pull factors as the situation in his homeland was plagued with both political and employment issues. Andrew explained to me that the situation in Ukraine was "not getting any better," outlining the apparent conflicts with Russia and the overall refusal made on part of then-President Viktor Yanukovych to sign an association agreement with the European Union.[6] Like Edgar, Andrew first found refuge in the United States and was then later *pushed* out due to an expiring Visa (H-2B).[7] When I asked him of his available options at the time of expiry, Andrew facetiously listed the *numerous* ways of extending his United States Visa: he could be granted temporary residency through a study permit (yet not be able to work legally), enter a marital union, or face deportation. Citing his moral code, Andrew decided he must "move on," that is to say, find alternative means to remain in the "North American continent." Almost by pure happenstance, Andrew received a call from a previous employer who offered to sponsor his relocation to Western Alberta. Andrew's response: "Yeah. Why not?"

The interview passage below demonstrates how Andrew's immigration process con-

---

[6]Armandon (2013) reports that citizens remain deeply divided on the regional integration path the country of Ukraine should take. Although the short-term solutions to this disagreement remain grim, data reveals that the younger generation of Ukrainians are more supportive of European integration and should thus sway these discrepancies in the near future (Armandon 2013; Kubicek 2016).

[7]Also known as a "temporary non-agricultural worker permit" (see U.S. Department of Homeland Security 2016).

sisted of an increasingly complex negotiation of both push and pull factors regarding economic insecurity:

> "I graduated from my university down there, got my Bachelors degree and I had this difficulty to find a job over there. In Ukraine, as you know, employment rate is so high, and it's basically really difficult to find jobs for new graduates...Like you know, elderly people don't want to leave, they have already reached pension age but nobody wants to leave because it's basically impossible to survive having only pension. So they continue work till they're about 70-75—'till they can't still work. That's why it's really hard for the new, fresh young people to find a job."

This transcript excerpt is worth quoting in full because it outlines the complexity of the decisions immigrants face. On one hand, Canada is viewed as an improvement to at least one aspect of employment, that is, new hirings. Andrew perceives Canada to be an arena of employment opportunity—even though, as Andrew notes, "it's not gonna be the *fancy* one to start with, but just a junior position or entry-level per se—it's much more easier [in Canada]." On the other hand, however, as a recent graduate, Andrew must sacrifice the recognition of his academic credentials (Houle and Yssaad 2010), in hopes of maintaining a secure job that will compensate for the scant prospect of receiving a private pension in Canada (Marier 2008; Milligan and Schirle 2008; Meng 1989). In sum, the cases discussed here demonstrate how structural forces play an integral role in influencing the decisions surrounding immigration—arriving at the decision to migrate is not a straightforward process.

I.II. The Unsettling Echoes of Canadian Migration

Apparent from the data I collected was the overall narrative that found my interviewees not inhabiting their preferred country of settlement. That is, my participants were forced to reconcile 'first choice' with 'flexibility' with regards to geographical mobility. Raj, for instance, describes how he was "hung up on coming" to a certain city, yet it took him over 10 years to do so. Overall, he labelled himself as "lucky," ultimately describing the quandary of arriving at his preferred city as coming "totally out of the blue." Raj initially worked his one-year student permitted Visa for an employer in Western Canada, and after it's expiry, found himself alternating between working in Singapore and Japan for a period of nine years. After being recruited through the federally funded Canada Research Chairs (CRC) Program[8], Raj finally found his ticket into Canada, albeit returning to Western

---

[8]The CRC program is a national strategy that aims to make Canada "one of the top countries in research and development." As a tri-agency initiative (Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council, Canadian Institutes of Health Research), this program recruits top-tier researchers both locally and internationally, and as is the case here, may grant temporary work

Canada, not his preferred city. Although Raj explained to me that the CRC program had a "fast tracked" agenda, his experiences can be taken to illustrate how geographical settlement is not a simple trajectory and is accompanied by a lengthy and even 'orbital' process of arriving at a preferred site of settlement.

As apparent from the excerpts presented above, Edgar and Andrew also encountered a host of difficulties at arriving at their preferred location of settlement. Edgar first found himself fleeing from a state of civil unrest and, after being effectively kicked out from his original location in the U.S., found refuge in Canada close to 10 years after his original departure from Colombia. Andrew, in a similar position, received a call from a previous employer who sponsored his Canadian migration just as his U.S. Visa was nearing expiry. This depiction of Canada as a surrogate is slightly misleading here, however, as acquiring secure status had a tremendous impact on their perception of the host country, as Andrew elucidates: "it's one of the best countries in the world."

II. During the Application

The Government of Canada offers a website for immigration inquiries that cite anything from "Express Entry" (achieved through the Federal skilled worker program), to "Start-up Visa" (investment in the Canadian economy), to "Refugee" status as potential areas of entry.[9] Although the website offers a user-friendly interface and is seemingly stationed as a great source for information for potential immigrants, specific components related to the immigration process, e.g., application processing times, the "point system"[10] methodology, are not openly listed on the site, nor are the formal requirements listed in a coherent manner—legal representation and/or interpretation may be required for non-native speakers. After being redirected through a series of links, users will find themselves at the official *processing times tool* page [11] where a drop-down list will reveal a 12 month processing period for citizen application grants applied after April 1, 2015.[12] For further inquiry, the site is equipped with an "FAQ" section which outlines that "processing times

---

permits to foreign candidates. (Chairs Administration Guide 2017).

[9](Immigration and Citizenship 2017a).

[10]Adopted in 1967 and since revised, the points based system provides objective criteria (English/French skills, Education, Experience, Age, Arranged employment in Canada, and Adaptability) for immigration-based assessment. The current "cut-off" is listed at 67 points (out of 100). This policy is primarily geared towards recruiting "skilled workers" as defined by state standards (see Immigration and Citizenship 2017f; Anwar 2014; Sidney 2014:110).

[11]See Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada (2011).

[12]The exact message I received was: "Processing times tell you how long it took Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada (IRCC) to process applications in the past after receiving a complete application package. Processing times can vary, depending on how many applications IRCC receives. Your application may be delayed if it's not complete. If it has been longer than the time shown since you applied, and you cannot check the status of your application online, you may contact us by using this Web form." (Immigration and Citizenship 2017c).

are difficult to predict" while ensuring the user that their applications are "processed as efficiently as possible" as well as "updated on a weekly basis."[13] Align with this rather indirect and cryptic process, I found two key themes associated with my participants' application process: the first concerning what sociologist Jack Katz (1995) would distinguish as "emotional experience"[14] ; and the second, regarding supportive networks.

II.I. *"Just Another Day": Tolerance and Coping*

In general, I found that my respondents likened their provisionary settlement to 'just another day', often not consciously attending to the tentativeness of their citizenship status. Parallel with this, Edgar describes his experience: "well, you apply, and then you wait and see what happens." Comparably, in Andrew's words: "Well I wasn't just waiting-waiting, I was just having my regular life." This apathy may be reflective of the broader recognition that bureaucratic processing often features increased waiting periods thus a part of everyday life (Rung and Young 2015; Simich 2003; Blau 1995).

In addition, to coping with the uncertainty of their departure, my interviewees seemingly actively engaged in emotional management—masking sensitivity with the routines of everyday life (Norgaard 2014; Garot 2004). As Leshner, Aw, and Alden (2015) have pointed out, the bureaucratic administration of immigration can act as both a barrier and a friend to immigrants. In this case, surface level anxieties and bureaucratic stressors were countered with the reciprocal token of being offered, what Andrew frames as a "new life"—manifested in official citizenship status.

II.II. *The Importance of Close Ties: Migrant Support Networks*

Support networks, as represented by acquaintances, friends, and communal ties represented a significant determinant on the outcomes of my interviewees. To further the relative ease of their transition, support networks acted as major sources for informational support. Kamyar, a soft-spoken Iranian immigrant, describes his experiences at an annual Iranian assembly where his fellow immigrants were able to share their similar experiences. In general, a place where "everyone is on the same page." Andrew characterizes the Ukrainian community as a "very active" one, citing the source of this achievement to the hard work of previous Ukrainian immigrant generations' intensive farming efforts in the Canadian prairies. He later recounts his perspective of the Ukrainian community:

> They will give you all kinds of information, where you can go, and get rent for
> a nice price. . . where you can go and study, where you can go and work. They

---

[13] See (Immigration and Citizenship 2017e; 2017g).
[14] As cited in (Garot 2004:737).

have nice database with jobs and they keep on posting you on your email if you like.

He further explains to me that organizational efforts have developed to help Ukrainian "newcomers" to Canada get "established" and incidentally, that "hearing your native dialect is always nice"—an overall humbling experience.

Later in the interview, Andrew draws a parallel between this type of support to Canadian immigration services. He describes the relative effort of Canadian "social services" to be a valuable resource, conducive to his integration: "Over here, you're not ashamed, you're not scared and shy to ask for help, they always trying to support you and help you, you know?" Collectively, these experiences add to the well-documented doctrine of Canada's 1971 propagation, recognition, and celebration as the land of *multiculturalism* (Eisenberg 2016; Berry 2013; Garcea et al. 2008) and the corresponding opportunity to start at what Andrew defines as the "very beginning," or, from "social zero." These results also indicate how both macro- and micro-level social support is particularly useful for facilitating the successful integration of immigrants into the host country.

III. Life After

Although the process of getting out of their native land proved much easier than getting into Canada, receiving official citizenship was regarded as a highly anticipated event. I identified two particular themes pertaining to this occasion—one relating to the official grant itself, the other, on the reflective process of comparing their new country to their old.

III.I. Citizenship Status and Symbolism

A rite of passage involves a significant change in the status of an individual in society, often involving the abandonment of one group for another. My interviewees were particularly keen on the exact moment they entered this paradigm, that is, received notice of their approval to enter Canada. In Kaymar's words: "Yeah, I was in taxi, I had the lawyer and he phoned—I was shocked actually." Furthermore, Andrew recollects his experience: "Wow! Thank God." After the interview was finished recording, he recounts his subsequent celebration of this achievement. Taken together, my respondents referred to this moment as distinctively pleasurable and fulfilling.

The events leading up to this, however, were not so jaunty, as Canada's citizenship test did pose a final hurdle to entry: only upon completion of this exam do immigrants receive official citizenship status. My interviewee's described the exam as "simple," yet

when probed further, ironically explained to me how it involved a considerable amount of preparation, with one participant tallying his preparation at private classes, every Saturday for three months, with each class lasting two to three hours in length. This preparation is of course in accordance with Canada's official study guide: *Discover Canada: The Rights and Responsibilities of Citizenship*[15] which gives immigrants a cursory glance of what to expect from Canadian civil society. Andrew effectively summarizes the main components of the guide: "it's like basic knowledge: like the industry, culture, and economic level stuff." Potentially testing on both written and verbal skills, the citizenship test acts as the final step before conferring citizenship at the official ceremony. As narrated by Edgar:

> "If you pass—then you gotta go to a ceremony. You dress up nice, there's a big room full of people—all of us getting the certificate. They just call you one-by-one and you go, and you give the hand to the judge—boom, boom. Thank you very much, sir."

Indeed, Edgar's portrayal of this final step consolidates gratitude and respect in such a way as to highlight the realization of moving from the abstract, alienated process of migration to the discrete labeling of a new national identity. Although this status, in itself, does not fully unveil the social and political struggles my interviewees endured, it is this title that effectively releases the tensions and unease generated from the application period.

III.II. Legal Reflections

A final theme that was recurrent in the data I collected was the tendency for the interviewees to contrast Canada's current legal system with that of their native land. Two specific components are worth mentioning. First, was the level of bribery in their homeland. Edgar recalls:

> Over there, if you get pulled over, they just want money out of you—the police, they just ask you for money: 'Okay, I'll let you go if you give me...' it was nothing man, '...if you give me five or ten dollars, I'll let you go'. That's a lot of money for them, right?

Andrew's experience—mirroring that of Edgar's—is illustrated in this excerpt:

> We are in his car [his friend] and the policeman stopped us and was like: 'Oh, where you guys going so fast?', and he's like: [his friend] 'Oh, sorry, sorry', then he's like: [police officer] 'You have two options right, either you gonna pay the fine or you gonna give me like ten bucks or so and I'll let you go.'

---

[15] See Immigration and Citizenship (2016c).

Andrew also recalls a second instance, this time where the level of bribery extended beyond motor vehicle violations to a legal infraction that is commonly recognized as a criminal offence—this time, unsurprisingly, with a much larger bribe:

> Well, it was the anniversary of my friend's [a different friend] father. He was 50 and he was coming back from a big party from the restaurant and had a couple drinks. They caught him. Obviously, he was driving under the influence of alcohol, right? They let him go home right, but they registered the violation and they called him in the morning saying: 'Okay, you are in big trouble. You have to pay a thousand dollars—American. Or we will take you to court and you gonna get into big trouble.' So he's like, he had to pay, right?

These experiences demonstrate cases of what Ewick and Silbey (1992) refer to as "legal consciousness" or, the ways in which people make sense of law and legal institutions.[16] Seemingly, with the benchmark of Canada's legal system, my interviewees were able to more effactually distinguish that the bribery depicted above was a deviation from legal norms, namely, that under their previous legal system everything was "legitimate and official," albeit with "different options."—including the ability to "pay cash, under the table," as Andrew puts it. En masse, this makes for a different legal reality. When speculating possible reasons for this legal and/or normative departure, my interviewees pointed to the possibility that the police in Canada would not find it very rational to challenge their status as a legal official as the public sector offers exceptional compensation packages along with stable employment. Hence, assuming a rational actor, engaging in this type of behaviour is simply not worth the risk of forfeiting these benefits. It is worth noting that embedded in this portrayal is the presumption that bribery exists as an externality to national police force policy. In other words, civil servants perform these acts to meet basic economic needs not provided by the state—not for reasons of individual malice.

A second aspect of legal consciousness was the recognition of Canadian legal enforcement. Although my respondents perceived both de jure legal systems as legitimate such that "law is law," the de facto legal system in their native land was plagued with visible instances of illegitimacy which ultimately forced them to turn a critical eye towards the legal institution itself. This narrative provided by Kaymar outlines key components within this precept:

> "Back in Iran, there are funny things like, it was unlawful to like watch satellite TV. The police *itself* is not enforcing that law. There are like these unorganized security guys, they put a notice on your door saying that, we've heard that you're using satellite TV in your home...we need to confiscate that, you need to come to our station and like...me myself, I didn't go there, I saw the notice on my door once, I didn't *follow* that notice, and then they didn't get

---

[16]Also, see Silbey (2005); Silbey and Ewick (2000).

back to me. They just want to like, *threaten you*, to see what's the outcome."

This perspective outlines how the legitimacy of legal institutions may falter when the law itself is not respected. Along these lines, Kaymar, later in the interview, goes on to describe how instances of ineffectual intimidation and threats undermined his faith in the "goodness" of the law, ultimately proposing a link between the validity of the law itself and legal conformity. The perception of 'valid' law can thus act as an "instrument or a tool" (Ewick and Silbey 1992:736) for arranging social affairs. In light of the caveats mentioned here, it is important to emphasize how conceptions of law and legality can be constitutive in nature (Silbey and Ewick 2000:49). This approach incorporates the reciprocal relationship between law and social practice and the accompanying subjective interpretations of what is significant and consequential (De Groot and Vrielink 1998). As apparent from the above discussion, law can exist as an objective force governing human affairs as well as through critique and opposition, be excluded as exceptional. As was the case for Kaymar's, law can be perceived as laughable or "funny."

Conclusions and Policy Implications

This qualitative study explored the experiences and perceptions of immigrants from this country both before and after immigration to understand immigration in a more 'personal' and holistic fashion. Several themes emerged from the data that provided a perspectival analysis of the narratives of the participants, including the structural forces that guided their migration decision, the importance of a strong supportive group, and their reflexive legal consciousness. Although the small sample exists as an obvious limitation to the study—affecting both the generalizability and transferability of the data (Auerbach and Silverstein 2003:80)—the findings represented here can act as a springboard for future qualitative research investigating the subjective perceptions related to pre- and post-immigration processes.

There are also numerous implications with regard to immigration policy. Czaika and De Haas (2013) elaborate on the current conceptual framework for assessing the character and effectiveness of immigration policies—arguing that the public academic controversy concerning this issue is due to fuzzy definitions of policy effectiveness—but moreover, that various discrepancies exist between policies on paper and public discourse. The results from this study can add much-needed contextual configuration to public discourse. Second, non-selective immigration policy choice affects the migratory decisions of skilled and unskilled foreign workers, ultimately leading to immigration policy to be self-confirming (Giordani and Ruta 2016). By providing an in-depth look into how the immigration process rolls out as a lived experience, policymakers can be better informed on the natives' expectations and how certain barriers to immigration can arise. Lastly, as

alluded to in the first section of this paper, there are ongoing immigration policy shifts south of the border—the stories from the participants in this study counteract fragmented notions of economic and legal matters and allow for a human dimension to enter these discussions.

Acknowledgements

References

Anwar, Arif. 2014. "Canadian Immigration Policy: Micro and Macro Issues with the Points Based Assessment System." *Canadian Ethnic Studies* 46(1):169–179.

Armandon, Emmanuelle. 2013. "Popular Assessments of Ukraine's Relations with Russia and the European Union under Yanukovych." *Demokratizatsiya* 21(2):289–308.

Auerbach, Carl, and Louise Silverstein. 2003. *Qualitative Data: An Introduction to Coding and Analysis*. New York: NYU Press.

Beeby, Dean. 2017. "Canadian Immigration Website Crash Started Hours before Trump Victory, Documents Show." *CBC News*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/website-crash-immigration-trump-electronic-travel-authorization-u-s-election-canada-1.4003637)

Berry, John W. 2013. "Research on Multiculturalism in Canada." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 37:663–675.

Black, Jerome, and Bruce Hicks. 2008. "Electoral Politics and Immigration in Canada: How Does Immigration Matter?." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 9(3):241–267.

Blau, Peter M. 1995. "A Circuitous Path to Macrostructural Theory." *Annual Review of Sociology* 21:1–12.

Breton, Charles. 2015. "Making National Identity Salient: Impact on Attitudes toward Immigration and Multiculturalism." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 48(2):357–381.

Chairs Administration Guide. 2017. "Canada Research Chairs." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.chairs-chaires.gc.ca/program-programme/admin_guide-eng.aspx)

Czaika, Mathias, and Hein De Haas. 2013. "The Effectiveness of Immigration Policies." *Population and Development Review* 39 (3): 487–508.

Davies, Martin B. 2007. *Doing A Successful Research Project: Using Qualitative or Quantitative Methods*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan Publishers Limited.

De Groot, Muriel, and Mirjan O. Vrielink. 1998. "Legal Theory and Sociological Facts. *Law and Philosophy* 17(3):251–270.

Eisenberg, Avigail. 2016. "Multiculturalism and Canada's Founding Peoples." *Canadian Issues* 1:35–40.

Emerson, Robert M., Rachel I. Fretz, and Linda Shaw. 1995. *Writing Ethnographic Fieldnotes*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Ewick, Patricia, and Susan S. Silbey. 1992. "Conformity, Contestation, and Resistance: An Account of Legal Consciousness." *New England Law Review* 26:731–749.

Gabriel, Christina. 2015. "A Different Road? Canadian Immigration Policy in the 1960s." *Labor: Studies in Working-Class History of the Americas* 12(3):29–33.

Garcea, Joseph, Anna Kirova, and Lloyd Wong. 2008. "Introduction: Multiculturalism Discourses in Canada." *Canadian Ethnic Studies Journal* 40(1):1–10.

Garot, Robert. 2004. "'You're Not a Stone': Emotional Sensitivity in a Bureaucratic Setting." *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 33(6):735–766.

Giordani, Paulo E., and Michele Ruta. 2016. "Self-confirming Immigration Policy." *Oxford Economic Papers* 68 (2): 361–378.

Hilburn, Jeremy. 2014. "Challenges Facing Immigrant Students Beyond the Linguistic Domain in a New Gateway State." *The Urban Review* 46(4):654–680.

Houle, René, and Lahouaria Yssaad. 2010. "Recognition of Newcomers' Foreign Credentials and Work Experience." *Statistics Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/75-001-x/2010109/article/11342-eng.htma1)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2016a. "Guide 5291 — Humanitarian and Compassionate Considerations." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/information/applications/handc.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2016b. "Prepare for the Citizenship Ceremony." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/citizenship/cit-ceremony.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2016c. "Prepare for the Citizenship Test." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/citizenship/cit-test.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017a. "Apply to Immigrate to Canada." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/immigrate/apply.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017b. "Canada: A History of Refuge." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/timeline.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017c. "Check Application Processing Times." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/information/times/index.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017d. "Electronic Travel Authorization (eTA)." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/visit/eta.asp?utm_campaign=eta_20150417_travel &utm_ source=online_vanity-url&utm_medium=web-marketing&utm_content=canada.ca-eta/)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017e. "How Long will it Take to Process my Application?" *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/helpcentre/answer.asp?qnum=031&top=3)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017f. "Six Selection Factors - Federal Skilled Workers." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/immigrate/skilled/apply-factors.asp)

Immigration and Citizenship. 2017g. "Why Did Processing Times Information Change?" *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/helpcentre/answer.asp?qnum=1185&top=3)

Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada. 2011. "Backgrounder — Four-year Limit for Foreign Nationals Working in Canada." *Government of Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/backgrounders/2011/2011-03-24.asp)

Kubicek, Paul. 2016. "Dancing with the Devil: Explaining the European Union's Engagement with Ukraine under Viktor Yanukovych." *Journal of Contemporary European Studies* 6: 1–20.

Leshner, Alan I., Fanta Aw, and Edward Alden. 2015. "Immigration Reform." *Issues in Science and Technology* 31(2):5–7.

Liu, Louise. 2016. "Here's where President-elect Trump Stands on Immigration." *Business Insider*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.businessinsider.com/heres-where-donald-trump-stands-on-immigration-2016-11)

Marier, Patrik. 2008. "The Changing Conception of Pension Rights in Canada, Mexico, and the United States." *Social Policy & Administration* 42(4):418–433.

Meng, Ronald. 1989. "Collective Bargaining, Firm Size and Pensions in Canada." *Economics Letters* 31(1):99–103.

Milligan, Kevin, and Tammy Schirle. 2008. "Improving the Labour Market Incentives of Canada's Public Pensions." *Canadian Public Policy* 34(3):281–303.

Norgaard, Kari M. 2014. "People Want to Protect Themselves A Little Bit: Emotions, Denial, and Social Movement Non-Participation." in *Environmental Sociology: From Analysis to Action*, edited by Leslie King and Deborah M. Auriffeille. Latham, MA: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

Portes, Alejandro, and Alejandro Rivas. 2011. "The Adaptation of Migrant Children." *The Future of Children* 21(1):219–246.

Pumariega, Andres J., and Eugenio Rothe. 2010. "Leaving No Children or Families Outside: The Challenges of Immigration." *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry* 80(4):505–515.

Reitz, Jeffrey G. 2012. "The Distinctiveness of Canadian Immigration Experience." *Patterns of Prejudice* 46(5):518– 538.

Rung, Jillian M., and Michael E. 2015. "Learning to Wait for More Likely or Just More: Greater Tolerance Delays of Reward with Increasingly Longer Delays." *Journal of The Experimental Analysis of Behavior* 103(1):108–124.

Sidney, Mara. 2014. "Settling In: A Comparison of Local Immigrant Organization in the United States and Canada." *International Journal of Canadian Studies* 49:105–133.

Silbey, Susan S. 2005. "After Legal Consciousness." *Annual Review of Law and Social Science* 1:323–368.

Silbey, Susan S. and Patricia Ewick. 2000. "The Rule of Law - Sacred and Profane." *Society* 37(6):49–56.

Simich, Laura. 2003. "Negotiating Boundaries of Refugee Resettlement: A Study of Settlement Patterns and Social Support." *The Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology* 40(5):575–587.

The Daily. 2017. "150 Years of Immigration in Canada." *Statistics Canada*. Retrieved March 2017 (http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/11-630-x/11-630-x2016006-eng.htm)

Thompson, David P. 1996. "Pablo Escobar, Drug Baron: His Surrender, Imprisonment, and Escape." *Studies in Conflict and Terrorism* 19(1):55–91.

U.S. Department of Homeland Security. 2016. "H-2B Temporary Non-Agricultural Workers." *Working in the United States*. Retrieved March 2017 (https://www.uscis.gov/working-united-states/temporary-workers/h-2b-temporary-non-agricultural-workers)

Weiss, Robert S. 1994. *Learning from Strangers: The Art and Method of Qualitative Interview Studies*. New York: The Free Press.

Winders, Jamie. 2016. "Immigration and the 2016 Election." *Southeastern Geographer* 56(3):291–296.

A Continued History of Rebellion: Negotiating the Realities and Possibilities of Queering Substance Use

Curtis Seufert
University of British Columbia

Abstract. Much research has been done on the politically subversive implications of LGBTQ+ party nightlife, but little work has been done to address the queering potential of substance use among said sexual minorities. The following paper looks to substantiate the political subversiveness of three examples of LGBTQ+ substance use—the use of poppers, the practise of chemsex, and substance use at the Sydney Mardi Gras festival—and consider the bodily, social, and cultural implications of engaging in substance use as a queer act. The paper examines both the opportunities and risks associated with queer substance use, serving as an introduction to the discussion around substance use as a means of rebellion against neoliberalism and heteronormativity. I conclude that these acts of substance use, which are queer in subverting the normalizing powers of neoliberalism and heteronormativity, present caution-worthy but potentially liberating means of living life more freely from ever-present restrictive social and cultural forces.

Introduction

The history of Western LGBTQ+ party culture, particularly as it relates to rebellion and resistance, is one that is well-documented. Whether it is gay bars, house music, rave culture or disco dancing, the various scenes of LGBTQ+ nightlife have long represented something more than a simple "escape" from everyday life for its patrons. Indeed, a theme of real rebellion, of resistance in the face of oppression, underlines this afterhours retreat perhaps just as much as the protests and demands for change of the latter half of the 20th century. Yet, while scholars have discussed the implications of LGBTQ+ music and party culture as sites of resistance, few have addressed how the indelibly linked drugs and substances common to these scenes fit in with discourses of queering society.

As such, in this essay I seek to critically engage with the histories and realities of substance use among Western LGBTQ+ communities, and posit how recreational substance use could be conceived of as a queering practice. Drawing on existing research of both the histories of drug use, and the pleasurable and harmful realities among members of the LGBTQ+ community, I will take a Queer Theory approach to ask if and where pleasurable, recreational substance use can work as a "queer act," as a rebellious and radical choice against neoliberal and heteronormative social norms and regulations.

To do this, I will first lay out a definition of queer politics that goes beyond the often-used umbrella term "queer" which has become a common catch-all for marginalized sexual and gender identities. Instead, I will define queer politics as one that emphasizes, in the tradition of academic work in the realm of queer theory, a resistance to social, legal, and political constraints of heteronormativity and neoliberalism. Next, I will lay out a series of trends regarding substance use by various LGBTQ+ communities which I will argue can be considered as "queer acts" of resistance. Finally I will discuss the potential implications of these kinds of queer acts of substance use with regards to the goals of queer politics. I seek to answer the following: what does it mean for LGBTQ+ communities to engage in queer substance use acts as a means of social, cultural, and bodily resistance to heteronormativity and neoliberalism?

Defining "Queer" as an Act of Resistance

Going beyond the often-used definition of "queer" as a catch-all for LGBTQ+ communities and identities (Queer 101, 2018), I bring forth a more broad definition of "queer" which extends beyond labeling ones gender and sexuality, and into the disruption of institutions and social norms guided by heteronormativity and neoliberalism.

For the basis of my definition of "queer politics," I draw on Cathy Cohen's seminal *Punks, Bulldaggers, and Welfare Queens: The Radical Potential of Queer Politics?* (1997). In it, Cohen describes the birth of "queer politics," as informed by queer theory academia of the early 1990's, as a response by groups such as Queer Nation to the perceived "assimilationist tendencies of AIDS activism [and] invisibility in the more traditional civil rights politics of lesbian and gay organizations" (Cohen, p. 439, 1997).

> Similar to queer theory, the queer politics articulated and pursued by these activists first and foremost recognizes and encourages the fluidity and movement of people's sexual lives [. . .] In addition to highlighting the instability of sexual categories and sexual subjects, queer activists also directly challenge the multiple practises and vehicles of power which render them invisible and at risk. . . the label "queer" symbolizes an acknowledgment that through our existence and everyday survival we embody sustained and multisited resis-

tances to systems. . . that seek to normalize our sexuality, exploit our labor, and constrain our visibility (Cohen, p. 439-440, 1997).

In *Punks, Bulldaggers and Drag Queens*, Cohen discusses queer politics primarily as a resistance to "heteronormativity," which she defines as those "localized practices and those centralized institutions which legitimize and privilege heterosexuality and heterosexual relationships as fundamental and "natural" within society" (Cohen, p. 440). While acknowledging that there are other factors regarding queer politics that can be addressed, Cohen focusses on resistance to heteronormativity here, given that it is the most often-discussed "normalizing practice/power" in the realm of queer politics (p. 440). But while heteronormativity may be the most immediately relevant "normalizing power" to be addressed by queer politics, other prevalent normalizing powers exist which are arguably in equal need of confrontation.

For example, more recent works within the field of queer theory have focused on neoliberalism as a key "normalizing power" in question (Long, 2018), particularly as it pertains to the regulation and maintenance of an "ideal self" on which neoliberalism is based (p. 80). For Long (2018), this neoliberal ideal self, as contested by queer bodies among others, consists of a healthy, productive, self-responsible, autonomous individual interested in filling out the roles that neoliberal norms would prescribe, eg. pursuing a conventional, "male-female monogamous coupledom" (p. 80), as well as being able to work productively, of sound mind and body, to complete the tasks that are assigned of them.

I include Long's discussion of resisting neoliberalism within my definition of queer politics for two main reasons. Firstly, I include this because it highlights the kind of normalizing powers outside of heteronormativity, which Cohen only alludes to in her own definition, which can be resisted by queer acts. Secondly, I argue that this elaboration is particularly relevant to understanding how acts of queer substance use are regulated not only by the bounds of heteronormative expectations, but also by the expectations of the "ideal [neoliberal] self".

Such is the definition that will underline other terminology used throughout this essay (eg. "queering," "queer acts"): actions, discourses, and practises which act as a resistance to the norms of heteronormativity and neoliberalism. The following is an overview of three practises pertaining to LGBTQ+ substance use that fall under this definition.

A Brief History of Queer Substance Use

Poppers and Disco

In the 1970's, "poppers," or alkyl nitrites, became a popular drug of choice for many LGBTQ+ party-goers. Though originally developed as a symptom reducer for angina in the mid-19th century (Stolberg, n.d.), after a little more than a century of use the drug was forced to find a new market once glycerine tablets became the preferred form of treatment (Rewbury et al., 2017).

Eventually, poppers would be marketed to gay party-goers (G.I.N.A.D., n.d.) likely for how they had a double function as both a psychoactive inhalant and as a sex enhancing drug. Indeed, in addition to its psychoactive effects, alkyl nitrites have the additional property of being a relaxant of the body's 'smooth muscles'—such the throat and anus (as well as other parts, like the intestines and stomach) (Stolberg, n.d.).

Poppers became a popular recreational inhalant in gay party scenes throughout the latter half of the 20th century, especially during the 1970's, at the height of disco music (Israelstam et al., 1978). The disco scene itself finds its earliest roots within black and latinx communities, and LGBTQ+ culture (Weinraub, 2002), with the height of the era underlined by themes of positivity, acceptance, and resistance. These themes were encapsulated by songs such as Gloria Gaynor's 1 single "I Will Survive," a powerful and resonating song which became a gay anthem at the time, embodying the will to fight for acceptance against discrimination and adversity (Hubbs, 2007).

Throughout all this, there was of course no rule against partying sober. But while the more iconic and conventionally political moments of LGBTQ+ culture might appear more vividly in the public's collective consciousness, the use of poppers represents an important piece of rebellious queer existence. Being inextricably linked to both gay parties and sex—which were raided and outright illegal (respectively) at the time (Ogles, 2018)—the use of poppers embodies a resistance both against legally-enforced heteronormativity and the "ideal productive self".[1] Their use can be considered an act of living a fast life in the face of bigotry and heteronormativity, and finding respite in a community of outsiders.

---

[1]With the height of their use in the 1970's, the era of disco poppers slightly precedes the rise of neoliberal economic policy's implementation in the 1980's. As such, I primarily argue for the use of poppers as a queer act against heteronormativity, rather than neoliberalism, even though themes of self-regulation transgressed by the use of poppers likely pre-date the official policies given the rise of neo-liberal academic in the decades prior.

Chemsex

When used for sexual purposes, the consumption of poppers represents a precursor to one of the most discussed drug-related social phenomena associated with Western LGBTQ+ communities: "chemsex". While poppers were used for either party or sex purposes (or both), chemsex, as the name would imply, refers more specifically to the consumption of psychoactive substances for the explicit purpose of enhancing sexual activity. But while poppers were the original sex-enhancing substance in these communities, existing literature discusses chemsex as referring to the use of longer-lasting, more powerful substances such as GHB and crystal meth, drugs that gained more traction in the 2000's and which are still commonly used for chemsex today (Weatherburn et al., 2017).

Additionally, with chemsex there's usually less of a club-related aspect compared to previous trends in recreational substance use. Instead, with the focus squarely around sexual activity, chemsex gatherings (involving two, or often more people) can involve hours (or sometimes even days) of continuous substance use and sexual activity, as the continuity of chemsex is facilitated by the choice of crystal meth, among others, as the choice substance used (Idem.).

As such, chemsex represents a direct transgression against heteronormativity, challenging the "fundamental" and "natural" value of heterosex. In addition to being a practise that is most often non-heterosexual, it is a practise aided by "unnatural" substances not typical of conventional heterosex. Additionally, chemsex arguably represents a significant challenge to the neoliberal "ideal self". With chemsex being illegal because of the unapproved substances typically consumed in its practise, it represents both a socially and legally transgressive queer act which devalues neoliberal norms around the maintenance of the "ideal self" in favor of personal pleasure.[2]

However, chemsex represents a curious, but potentially concerning progression in the intersection between LGBTQ+ communities (particularly of gay men) and recreational substance use. While some participants may have stricter rules or rituals with regards to chemsex, other might be "unwittingly led to take risks" with regards to STI transmission, citing substance use as "adversely [affecting] their capacity to perceive or respond to risks in their environment" (Bourne et al., 2015, p. 566). Additionally, compared to alkyl nitrites, the use of crystal meth has a more addictive potential to it, which could risk leading to more problematic and/or dependent use. As such, while considering the explicitly pleasurable benefits facilitated by this form of substance use, chemsex

---

[2]Some activities which involve enhancing one's physical and/or mental state through substance use are allowed, and even encouraged under neoliberalism. For example, alcohol is freely sold and marketed despite, at a glance, violating the "ideal" productive self. Given that the permission to use alcohol often hinges on the condition that it doesn't impede one's productive work (eg. policies detailing consequences for showing up to work intoxicated) one would likely argue that this represents a condoned, acceptable, and perhaps even necessary "escape" from the norm of maintaining an ideal, productive self.

seems to tread closer to problematic substance use, a query that will be discussed later on.[3]

Syndey Mardi Gras

The history of Mardi Gras in Sydney, Australia is one expressly linked to LGBTQ+ community and celebration. The history of Sydney's Mardi Gras festivities date back to the original celebration in 1978 which took place in order to commemorate the Stonewall Riots of 1969. But far from a smooth or apolitical celebration, the original Sydney Mardi Gras parade ended in more than 50 arrests over the course of the night (Bruce et al., 1997). As Kane Race notes in *Party Animals* (2011), the first Sydney Mardi Gras (which is now titled the Sydney Gay and Lesbian Mardi Gras) represented a culmination of sexual minority history and pride in the Kings Cross area since the 1920's and 1930's.

Since then, the annual Mardi Gras parade has remained somewhat of a cultural litmus test regarding police interactions with the LGBTQ+ community in Sydney. After a relatively tension-free relationship between festival organizers and police during the 1990's, Race describes how a 2009 opinion piece decrying the use of sniffer dogs at that year's festival was received with both a wave of support, as well as an official police response arguing that the Sydney Mardi Gras festival was not singled out for these measures. But with the writer of the piece comparing the use of sniffer dogs at the parade to the antagonistic police presence at the 1978 Mardi Gras festival, there is reason to consider evaluating the police presence at Mardi Gras as a "normalizing force" of neoliberal regulation and heteronormativity.

In *Party Animals*, Race further problematizes this police presence at Mardi Gras as it is justified by the minimal level of violence at these events. He describes how police uncritically link illicit substance use with "anti-social behaviour" of the attendees in order to justify the use of sniffer dogs at the event. Race argues that the practice of employing drug-sniffer dogs "disproportionately [affects] those forms of urban culture that have been elaborated around the use of illicit drugs" in a manner poorly justified both by the express lack of violence and the ineffectiveness of sniffer dogs to even find said substances (Race, pp. 48-50).

In essence, communities and scenes for whom substance use is more culturally meaningful—in this case, LGBTQ+ party scenes—are disproportionately targeted for police surveillance and regulation. This police mandate is not only minimally rationalized

---

[3]It's worth noting that harmless and problematic substance does not necessarily equate to intermittent and consistent/addictive substance use respectively. For example, someone can have more consistent, but less problematic substance use than someone who only uses intermittently, depending on the substance, how it's used, and for what reasons, etc.

by the very low levels of violence within these party scenes, but it also reflects a continued history of poorly justified (or entirely unwarranted) police presence in LGBTQ+ spaces of retreat as a means of regulating deviance. Following a history of bathhouse raids and mass arrests in gay bars (Ogles, 2018), this latest chapter of the relationship between the LGBTQ+ community and law enforcement represents a continued attempt by police powers to enforce an "acceptable" level of queerness for a given era.

The result is a clear case of enforcing the cultural and bodily norms of sexual minorities, a mandate that continues today, given that police presence—for the purpose of enforcing drugs laws—remains a part of the Sydney Mardi Gras festivities (Know Your Rights, 2019). As such, the consumption of illicit substances at Sydney Mardi Gras remains a queer act by both resisting the neoliberal ideal self enforced by the police, and by engaging in cultural practises common to LGBTQ+ Mardi Gras celebrations which fall outside of the norms of heteronormativity.

Implications of Queer Substance Use

In this paper, I hope to have established a solid foundation for the idea that certain acts of substance use by various LGBTQ+ communities, particularly as they pertain to the resistance of cultural, legal and bodily norms, can be considered "queer". However, the implications of what this actually means going forward have yet to be discussed, and so I seek now to address the implications of said "queerness" of certain transgressive, unsanctioned acts of substance use by sexual minorities. I ask the following: what cultural, social, and bodily consequences and/or opportunities might come about by breaking away from the normalizing powers of heteronormativity and neoliberalism with queer substance use?

Risks and Opportunities

The opportunities to be gained by transgressing heteronormative and neoliberal bodily and cultural norms are significant. Underlying the very reason for the transgression, committing "queer" acts which push or break the bounds of acceptability allows for an arguably more free approach to life. In challenging taboos and social norms through non-heterosexual sex practises or through illicit and/or illegal substance use, one opens up a world of opportunities for living as one wishes. One gains the opportunity, at least in theory, to be guided more by their own desires and less by the norms and regulations of society's powers such as neoliberalism and heteronormativity. In transgressing the former, the values of maintaining of an ideal productive self could give way to values of pursuing one's own life interests beyond productivity. In transgressing the latter, the values

of pursuing a monogamous, "natural," heterosexual coupledom could give way to other romantic and sexual options to be pursued, options which might be informed by one's existing non-heterosexual sexual orientation or by any other sets of sexual or romantic desires.

The potential gains to be made for freedom, rather than just "acceptance" that less "queer" movements may pursue, are great, but it is worth noting here that their pursuit is not without risk. As one ventures outside of the known bounds of social norms, one inevitably ventures outside of what those bounds have not only determined as acceptable, but also, potentially, as safe.

Chemsex, for example, is de facto banned in its current state, provided that participants are in fact using crystal meth or other illegal substances during the affair. In 2015, the conversation around chemsex was reaching a fever pitch with headlines calling the practise a significant public health risk (Meikle, 2015), warning of the potential for HIV risk (Gallagher, 2015) or even death (Guarino, 2015). The discussion around chemsex bordered on being a moral/health panic in the U.K., as the alarms were sounded to the potential consequences and extreme stories of an apparently wild, hedonistic, drug-filled (and not least of all, gay) sexual phenomena. It threatened not only the state of public health, but also the norms of sexual monogamy and heteronormativity. It was perhaps a bridge too far for a country whose same-sex marriage bill came into action only two years prior (BBC, 2013). As such, I argue that chemsex was, and still is, perhaps one of the most queer sexual practises involving recreational substance use, and one that many, at least in the U.K., were not ready for in 2015.

That said, chemsex is not necessarily a wholly safe or harmless practise either, and so the queer nature of chemsex does not preclude potentially legitimate grounds for concern in discussing its public health implications. In fact, *because* chemsex operates outside of a number social and legal boundaries, those participating in the practise are perhaps inherently at risk of engaging in behaviours that may be harmful not just to the status quo, but to themselves.

To elaborate, neoliberal norms and regulative institutions attempt to ensure the continuation of a productive population. But in doing so, a certain, limited level of health is indeed required, and so this level of health is guided, encouraged, and even enforced. So while it may be worth pushing against the boundaries of these institutions which dictate that one must be a productive and capable member of society, one may run the risk of hampering themselves from pursuing their own life and values if they venture into a social, moral, and/or psychoactive and experiential "uncharted territory". As discussed earlier, Bourne et al. (2015) find, for example, that while some who engage in chemsex do so in a relatively safe manner, others find themselves particularly at risk of contracting an STD given that their cognitive ability to engage in regular safe sex practises is affected by the use of substances.

Additionally, the question of negative consequences of substance use by sexual minorities is a particularly salient one. If we are to posit substance use as a potentially rebellious and liberatory queer act, it would be irresponsible to ignore the current reality and risks of substance use in general, particularly for sexual minorities. For example, some studies around problematic substance use, which focus on sexual minority women (SMW), show that these women are more likely than heterosexual women to engage in problematic substance use (Green Feinstein, 2012). Other studies indicate that greater involvement in LGBTQ+ communities may lead to an increased exposure to areas where heavy drinking is common, or to increased substance abuse (Trocki et al., 2005). Similarly, Carpiano et al. (2011) suggest that gay men living in the same neighbourhood and/or socializing more with other gay men can increase the likelihood of substance use.

To clarify, this is not an argument in favour of obeying neoliberal norms and institutions for the purpose of self-maintenance. Not only is it possible for queering practises to be safe and rebellious, queer politics and acts represent a pathway to the betterment of society, potentially including a more holistic sense of 'health' and 'well-being'. As such, I hope only to call attention to the need to carefully chart the ways in which one engages in queering practises, especially as they pertain to recreational substance use. I have mostly elaborated on how this pertains to chemsex here, but this could also be applied, to an extent, to any level of social illicit substance use among LGBTQ+ people that I discussed earlier.

Conclusion

The actions and directions proposed in Queer Theory literature can often make for some very subversive politics. Beyond demanding incremental political reform or acceptance into already-existing normalizing powers, queer politics seek to dismantle and reorganize social priorities in a truly revolutionary way. But with such bold ambitions and opportunities come great risks and resistance against these political moves. As such, any act which seeks to subvert neoliberalism, heteronormativity, or any other normalizing powers requires a good deal of deliberation, especially if said subversive act has hardly been discussed prior.

Such was the goal of this paper. In this essay, I hope to have provided an introductory overview of understanding substance use as a potentially queer act, providing three examples that I argue demonstrate this potential. Additionally, I hope to have opened up a potential dialogue on the implications of said substance use, with regards to both the opportunities and risks of engaging in substance use as a subversive practise.

Further research should look at different levels of contextualization (local, national, international) of these spaces (or many others case examples), in terms of the effects of

relevant drug laws and attitudes, or laws and attitudes pertaining to LGBTQ+ identities and communities. Indeed, a substantial portion of my analysis pertained to the legality of substances and tended to focus on the national level of legality.

Furthermore, despite my scope of LGBTQ+ people and communities, two of the three main case studies in this essay pertain more towards cisgender men who have sex with men. Further research (following the work of Race, for example, which does have a broader scope in this sense) could be done to examine queer substance use among other LGBTQ+ communities.

For now, I hope to have provided a limited but exploratory set of questions and examples for future consideration around the queering possibilities of substance use, and how recreational substance use among LGBTQ+ people has the potential to be a subversive and rebellious act, depending on the practises, substances, and legal, historical, bodily, and, social contexts that surround its use.

References

Bourne, A., Reid, D., Hickson, F., Torres-Rueda, S., Weatherburn, P. (2015). Illicit drug use in sexual settings ('chemsex') and HIV/STI transmission risk behaviour among gay men in south london: Findings from a qualitative study. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 91(8), 564. doi:10.1136/sextrans-2015-052052

Bruce, I., Murphy, P., Watson, S. (1997). Gay Sites and the Pink Dollar. In *Surface City: Sydney at the Millenium*(pp. 62-94). Annandale, NSW: Pluto Press.

Carpiano, R. M., Kelly, B. C., Easterbrook, A., Parsons, J. T. (2011). Community and drug use among gay men: The role of neighborhoods and networks. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*, 52(1), 74-90. doi:10.1177/0022146510395026

Cohen, C. J. (1997). Punks, bulldaggers, and welfare queens: The radical potential of queer politics? *GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies*, 3(4), 437-465. doi:10.1215/10642684-3-4-437

Gallagher, P. (2015, November 19). Experts want Chemsex to be a public health priority. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.independent.co.uk/life-style/love-sex/chemsex-should-be-public-health-priority-due-to-hiv-risk-experts-say-a6719886.html

GINAD. (n.d.). Amyl Nitrite. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from http://www.ginad.org/en/drugs/ narcotics/324/amyl-nitrite

Guarino, B. (2016, May 10). The 'chemsex' scene: An increasingly popular and sometimes lethal public-health problem. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2016/05/10/the-

chemsex-scene-an-increasingly-popular-and-occasionally-lethal-public-health-problem/?utm_term=.dd6a9bb06739

Green, K. E., Feinstein, B. A. (2012;2011;). Substance use in lesbian, gay, and bisexual populations: An update on empirical research and implications for treatment. *Psychology of Addictive Behaviors: Journal of the Society of Psychologists in Addictive Behaviors*, 26(2), 265-278. doi:10.1037/a0025424

Hubbs, N. (2007). 'I will survive': Musical mappings of queer social space in a disco anthem. *Popular Music*, 26(2), 231-244. doi:10.1017/S0261143007001250

Israelstam, S., Lambert, S., Oki, G. (1978). Poppers, A New Recreational Drug Craze*. *Canadian Psychiatric Association Journal*, 23(7), 493–495. https://doi.org/10.1177/070674377802300711

Know Your Rights and Stay Safe at the 2019 Mardi Gras Party. (2019, February 20). Retrieved April 06, 2019, from http://www.mardigras.org.au/news/know-your-rights-and-stay-safe-At-the-2019-mardi-gras-party

Long, R. (2018). Sexual subjectivities within neoliberalism: Can queer and crip engagements offer an alternative praxis? *Journal of International Women's Studies*, 19(1), 78-93.

Meikle, J. (2015, November 03). Chemsex rise prompts public health warning. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.theguardian.com/society/2015/nov/03/chemsex-Rise-public-health-warning-drugs

Ogles, J. (2018, February 02). 30 Infamous Police Raids of Gay Bars and Bathhouses. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.advocate.com/politics/2018/2/02/30-infamous-Police-raids-gay-bars-and-bathhouses

Queer 101: Identity, Inclusion, and Resources. (2018, July 20). Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.uua.org/lgbtq/identity/queer

Race, K. (2011). Party Animals: The significance of drug practices in the materialization of urban gay identity. In S. Fraser D. Moore (Eds.), *The Drug Effect: Health, Crime and Society* (pp. 35-56). Port Melbourne, Victoria: Cambridge University Press. doi:10.1017/CBO9781139162142.004

Rewbury, R., Hughes, E., Purbrick, R., Prior, S., Baron, M. (2017). Poppers: Legal highs with questionable contents? A case series of poppers maculopathy. *British Journal of Ophthalmology*, 101(11), 1530-1534. doi:10.1136/bjophthalmol-2016-310023

Stolberg, V. (2009). Amyl nitrite. In G. L. Fisher N. A. Roget (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of substance abuse prevention, treatment, recovery* (pp. 72-72). Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc. doi:10.4135/9781412964500.n25

Trocki, K. F., Drabble, L., Midanik, L. (2005, January). Use of heavier drinking contexts among heterosexuals, homosexuals and bisexuals: results from a national

household probability survey *. *Journal of Studies on Alcohol*, 66(1), 105+. Retrieved from http://link.galegroup.com.ezproxy.library.ubc.ca/apps/doc/A132050582/HRCA? u=ubcolu mbiasid=HRCAxid=2617b411

Weatherburn, P., Hickson, F., Reid, D., Torres-Rueda, S., Bourne, A. (2017). Motivations and values associated with combining sex and illicit drugs ('chemsex') among gay men in south london: Findings from a qualitative study. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*, 93(3), 203-206. doi:10.1136/sextrans-2016-052695

Weinraub, B. (2002, December 10). ARTS IN AMERICA; Here's to Disco, It Never Could Say Goodbye. Retrieved December 10, 2018, from https://www.nytimes.com/2002/12/10/arts/arts-in-america-here-s-to-disco-it-never-could-say-goodbye.html

About the Authors

Alexandria Pavelich

Alexandria Pavelich recently received her Honours B.A. through the Department of Sociology at York University. During her undergrad, she was employed as a research assistant on a youth-driven CIHR-funded project centered upon suicide prevention in Nunavut. Currently, Alexandria is working as a research assistant in the office of One Health and Wellness under the supervision of the previous Canada Research Chair in Substance Abuse, Dr. Colleen Dell. Alexandria will be commencing her graduate studies as a medical sociology student at the University of Saskatchewan in Fall 2019. Here, she will continue to employ an interdisciplinary lens at the intersection of social psychology, clinical sociology, and public health. Her upcoming CGS-M SSHRC funded thesis will explore the construct of mattering as it applies to suicide prevention for re-deployed military veterans utilizing psychiatric service dogs.

Andy Holmes

Andy is graduating with an Honours degree in Sociology with a Minor in Critical Studies in Sexuality from the University of British Columbia. Throughout his undergraduate degree, he has been a teaching assistant for seven introductory Sociology courses, delivered 10 guest lectures on the topic of LGBTQ2+ social inequalities and research methods, was appointed as a policy advisor to City Councilors on the City of Vancouvers LGBTQ2+ Advisory Committee, served on four peer-review editorial journals at UBC, including co-Editor-in-Chief of UBC's Sociology Journal, Sojourners, attended conferences including the American Sociological Association Annual Meeting, and presented findings from his Honours thesis at Harvard University. Andy is most passionate about understanding inequalities and social movements affecting racialized members of LGBTQ2+ communities as they intersect with crimes and law enforcement. Andy would like to thank his editor, Suki Xiao, for her incredible edits and feedback. He will begin a Master's degree at the University of Toronto in Sociology in September 2019 and anticipates pursuing a career in academia to bridge social research with pragmatic policy changes.

Charmaine Lee

Charmaine is a 3rd-year student enrolled in the Dual BA program between UBC and Sciences Po Paris. She spent her past two years in France before coming to UBC the previous fall. She is currently pursuing her Honours in Political Science, which has been a rigorous yet fulfilling experience. She is also the national Communications Co-director of STAND Canada a non-profit, youth-led organisation that does anti-genocide advocacy and educational campaigns across Canada. An integral member of STANDs UBC Chapter on campus, she helped organise a seminar discussion on statelessness in the 21st century this past March.

Outside of her academic life, she is an avid lover of books, second-hand records, and

wholesome plant-based food. She also likes to hike and run. Her crowning achievement has to be trekking the Atlas Mountains in Morocco with her high school classmates a few years back. She plans to return someday.

Curtis Seufert

Curtis Seufert is a 5th year Sociology and French student at the University of British Columbia. This past academic year has been his 2nd with *Sojourners*, UBCs sociology undergraduate journal. Having acted as both an Associate Editor for the journal last year, as well as Co-Editor in Chief and author for this years volume, Curtis has learned much over the past two years about the many aspects of organizing, editing, and writing for an undergraduate journal of this scope. An aspiring journalist and researcher, Curtis has found his experience with *Sojourners* to be both and enjoyable and invaluable experience. He would like to give a special thanks to Nicole Cheng and Nina Chiang for their invaluable work in editing his submission to the journal this year.

Kurtis J. Samchee

Kurtis J. Samchee completed his bachelors degree at the University of Toronto with high distinction and moved on to study public policy at Carleton University in Ottawa, Ontario. He has a broad range of research interests that extend anywhere from crime, punishment, and justice, to Platonic realism, from environmental sustainability to Gestalt psychology, and from morality to Weberian rationalityevery now and then he will drop in on a calligraphy class.

Maude Bachand-Bergeron

Maude Bachand-Bergeron is in her final year at McGill University, where she will be graduating with a bachelors degree in Sociology and a minor in Sexual Diversity Studies. Born and raised in Montreal, Maude plans to attend Columbia University in order to continue her studies at the masters level. Her research interests include structural inequality, community-building, and grassroots organizing. She is incredibly excited for the opportunity to appear in Sojourners Volume 11 and is especially grateful to her associate editor, Ella Kim, as well as the entire Sojourners team, for their help.

Sana Fatima

Sana Fatima is a fifth-year undergraduate student at the University of British Columbia, pursuing a major in Sociology and a minor in Law and Society. She is fascinated by the ways that law and social norms, interactions and institutions intersect, and is particularly interested in exploring these ideas as they apply to topics of race, culture, religion, immigration, global labour relations, and more. She aspires to take these interests into the future through law and public policy. Sana is also involved with inclusivity and anti-discrimination efforts on campus, working with organizations such as UofMosaic and Arts for Awareness. After reading incredible Sojourners publications for the past three years, she is honoured to finally be one of the individuals published in the undergraduate

journal. For this, she is immensely grateful to her family, her friends, the professors that guided her along the way, and the wonderful editing team at *Sojourners*.

Paige Lougheed
Paige Lougheed is a recent UBC BA Honours Sociology graduate. She has an interest in understanding how media framing can both shape and maintain lived experiences of privilege and oppression. Paige is currently working at UBC Counselling Services and is working toward pursuing a Masters in Counselling Psychology degree. She hopes to draw upon her sociological knowledge to enrich her education in Counselling Psychology.

About the Editors

Andy Holmes

Andy is graduating with an Honours degree in Sociology with a Minor in Critical Studies in Sexuality from the University of British Columbia. Throughout his undergraduate degree, he has been a teaching assistant for seven introductory Sociology courses, delivered 10 guest lectures on the topic of LGBTQ2+ social inequalities and research methods, was appointed as a policy advisor to City Councilors on the City of Vancouvers LGBTQ2+ Advisory Committee, served on four peer-review editorial journals at UBC, including co-Editor-in-Chief of UBC's Sociology Journal, *Sojourners*, attended conferences including the American Sociological Association Annual Meeting, and presented findings from his Honours thesis at Harvard University. He is most passionate about understanding inequalities and social movements affecting racialized members of LGBTQ2+ communities as they intersect with crimes and law enforcement. Andy will begin a Master's degree at the University of Toronto in Sociology in September 2019 and anticipates pursuing a career in academia to bridge social research with pragmatic policy changes.

Curtis Seufert

Curtis Seufert is a 5th year Sociology and French student at the University of British Columbia. This past academic year has been his 2nd with *Sojourners*, UBCs sociology undergraduate journal. Having acted as both an Associate Editor for the journal last year, as well as Co-Editor in Chief and author for this years volume, Curtis has learned much over the past two years about the many aspects of organizing, editing, and writing for an undergraduate journal of this scope. An aspiring journalist and researcher, Curtis has found his experience with *Sojourners* to be both and enjoyable and invaluable experience. He would like to give a special thanks to Nicole Cheng and Nina Chiang for their invaluable work in editing his submission to the journal this year.

Bruno Belevan

Bruno is a 2nd-year international Arts student from Peru, looking forward to double major in Sociology and Economics. He worked during the summer as a Research Assistant for Dr. Katherine Lyon and is currently a Residence Advisor at UBC. Bruno is very passionate while talking about his country and Latin American culture. He likes asking his friends how they represent their culture away from home and hopes to do his own research about it soon. This passion for his culture encouraged him to found the AMS Peruvian Student Association at UBC with a couple of friends, where he is currently working as the president.

Once he graduates, Bruno wants to work in economic and social development in Peru, assisting remote areas to access basic necessities as water and food. Outside of his academic interests, he is a devoted cook. Ask him to cook any Peruvian dish you want, he will happily serve it to you.

Cherie Tay

Cherie is a 2nd- year Arts student majoring in sociology and (possibly) minoring in GRSJ. She is particularly interested in the trajectory that womens rights and LGBTQ+ rights have taken in recent years, especially within the context of an ever-changing political landscape and a society enamored with technology. She aims to be a future Honours student within the Sociology department to begin work on a thesis exploring social movements in current society. As well, she would love to gain the opportunity to work as a Teaching Assistant for an introductory Sociology course in her upcoming years at UBC.

Aside from *Sojourners*, she is the Junior Corporate Relations Director for UBC HOPE Club and aids in coordinating Warmth of Winter (WoW) events that spread care packages among Downtown Eastside community members. As well, she volunteers as part of SASCs Project and Events Committee to hold events that raise awareness of the prevalence of sexual assault. When she is not keeping up with readings and writing essays, she likes to travel, find new eating-places and sleep. Hopefully, she will be doing an exchange at the University of Amsterdam in the 2019-2020 school year (coincidentally enough, the Netherlands is a fascinating place for sociological study due to its liberal stance on prostitution and recreational drug use!). Finally, she really enjoyed working with the *Sojourners* team this year and greatly appreciates learning from the wealth of knowledge they had to share.

Ella Kim-Marriott

Ella Kim-Marriott is going into her third year at UBC, studying sociology and geography. Ella is a passionate environmentalist, and she hopes to focus her future research on consumerism and solutions surrounding environmental issues. Editing for Sojourners was a fantastic experience, and she would like to thank the Co-editor-in-chief team, as well as the author she worked with, for making it such an enjoyable experience. She commends all the authors for putting together thoughtful and intriguing papers, tackling a wide range of sociology topics and issues. Ellas favourite part of working on Sojourners this year was the opportunity to gain knowledge and widen her perspective on topics outside of her area of focus through reading her peers work, and she hopes that the readers of this years journal have a similar experience.

Jessica Zhai

Jessica is a fourth-year student majoring in Sociology with a minor in Law and Society. She was born in China, and spent her entire life moving back and forth between Vancouver and Guangzhou. Due to her lived experiences within both Western and Asian societies, her research interests span from race and ethnicity, immigration, and more specifically, identity formation within diasporic communities. Her passion for sociology stemmed from her volunteer trips to communities in need in rural China, and trying to unpack the root causes for social inequalities. She hopes to pursuit a future in legal studies, and be-

lieves that her sociological background will provide a valuable perspective on ways to make a difference in this unjust, harrowing world. She strongly believes in the importance of viewing the social world through a feminist intersectional lens, looking at how the axis of gender, race, and class are interwoven to create a discrete yet powerful system of social hierarchy. Aside from sociology, her second passion would be reading and watching horror classics. Some of her favorite works are *Silent Hill*, Guillermo del Toros *Pan's Labyrinth*, and Stephen Kings *Carrie* and *The Shining* (both the novels and the film adaptations). She is looking forward to working with the amazing team of editors and writers on *Sojourners* this year. If you ever catch her at ANSO, dont forget to say hi!

Leo Chu
Leo is a first-year MA student in Science and Technology Studies. Receiving his BSc at Hong Kong, he is now integrating his training in biology with the critical insight of science studies. His focus is especially on the entanglement between the development of system ecology, planning, and environmental politics in British Columbia in the 1970s. By joining *Sojourners*, he intends to learn more about the editing and publishing work of academic journals, while making new friends in the amazing world of sociology.

Nicole Cheng
Nicole is a Sociology graduate with a minor in Commerce. Her main area of focus is in economic sociology, with a particular interest in analyzing the dynamics between inequality, financialization, economic regulation, and financial crises. She is also impassioned by research in inclusive development and the effects of global supply chains in developing countries. Through the utilization of economic philosophy and a sociological lens, her academic goal is to create healthy, inclusive, and sustainable societies through social policies.

At UBC, Nicole has been a Teaching Assistant for a course on Development and Underdevelopment in Sociology, and a Research Assistant for a study on online dating in Vancouver. She hopes attend graduate school in the near future to further her studies in economic sociology and hone in her quantitative data analysis skills. Outside her studies, Nicole is a thrill-seeking backpacker that loves to explore the natural and cultural beauty of the world, and to observe the economic transitions that are currently underway in developing nations. As a recent graduate, she is excited to be spending her time travelling Burma and Vietnam this summer.

Nina Chiang
Nina is a 4th-year student majoring in Psychology and minoring in Family Studies. Her areas of focus vary, but broadly speaking, she is interested in the interaction between society and the individual. In the past year, she has previously worked as a Research Assistant, and currently works as a Human Resources Assistant, where she is able to apply her academic background in psychology and sociology to help create a more inclusive

workplace. Aside from academic interests, her hobbies include travelling and seeking out new dessert shops. For the *Sojourners Volume 10* publication, Nina hopes to gain insight into the process of writing, editing and publishing for a formal paper, and she looks forward to graduating this summer!

Selina Lo
Selina Lo is a 4th year Art History Major/Sociology minor with a concentration in 20th Century Art and the Post-Modern at the University of British Columbia. This is her second year as an Associate Editor on the Sojourners Team. For the past 6 years Selina has been the voice behind one of Vancouvers leading food blogs: www.vancitynoms.com. Having been a part of the Yelp Elite Squad since 2014, she was certified GOLD in 2018 and hopes to achieve Yelp Elite BLACK by 2024. Within Sociology and GRSJ, her fields of interest include the dialogue surrounding racial microaggressions against immigrants and POC, stigma in regards to disability, gentrification within the Greater Vancouver area, and the intersectionality of disability, race, and gender. She is especially fervent about the de-stigmatization of speech disorders, OCD, food allergies and eating disorders having experienced said diseases first hand. On a lighter note, Selina is known to scour thrift stores for vintage tennis rackets, Singer sewing machines, and art books, having amassed quite the collection. She is hopelessly infatuated with the following: Bauhaus, plaid mini skirts, luxury fashion, Whole Foods, and KFC (Korean Fried Chicken.) Selina aspires to someday work as a writer or editor-in-chief at a literary, art, or lifestyle publication.

Siqi Xiao
Siqi Xiao is an Honors Sociology student. Siqi is deeply interested in understanding how gender, race/ethnicity, and social policy intertwine in complex ways to shape power relations, affect individual mental health as well as life chances, and reproduce or ameliorate social inequalities. Her current research focuses on online dating and educational assortative mating both in Shanghai, China and Vancouver, Canada. (Ask her if you are interested in how to stand out in online dating!) With a genuine care for human rights and individuals well-being, she is dedicated to bringing discussions about inequality and mental health from a sociological aspect to everyday conversations, while supporting her peers and communities. She also dedicated herself to promoting comprehensive and holistic sex education in China especially through community-based initiatives and public blogs that are accessible and inclusive for the LGBTQ community and individuals with different SES. Besides research and community work, two things she could talk about for hours are: lyrical contemporary dance and trees. For the past two years, Siqi had a wonderful time learning and working with other amazing editors of *Sojourners*.