

To: Colby Song, 301 Student
From: Solomon Vandt, 301 Student SV
Date: March 4, 2015
Subject: **Review of Your Formal Report Draft**

Content of Overall Report

In your report on Feasibility of Introducing Player Profile to Intramurals to Balance Skill Level, you presented data from multiple studies that you conducted. All these studies are important for determining the best solution to the skill imbalance in Tier 2. However, there are some points and questions to consider that will help you enhance your report.

- General Intramural Participants' Opinion of Player Profile:

- The report should include the number of teams represented by the ten random participants in this study. It is important to minimize bias by allowing all teams in the league to participate in this study. Detail should be provided on how the participants were randomly selected.

- Assessment of Current Skill Imbalance in Basketball Tier 2 division:

- How the 20 participants were selected and the number of teams represented in this study should be detailed.
- The hours spent playing basketball *over what period of time* (e.g. a week) should be detailed in the main portion of the report and not just in the Figures or in the Appendix.
- Would it be appropriate to have one player who scored more than 10 points on the Player Profile survey on a Tier 2 team? I think it would be a good idea to consider implementation of an allowance of one over-skilled player on a Tier 2 team. I imagine that these over-skilled players are not intending to impose skill imbalance, but they have other reasons to be playing in a particular division.
 - Because it works out with their schedule?
 - Because they would like to play with their friends?
 - Because they think they belong in this Tier?
- I think you should consider averaging the Player Profile point totals in order to determine whether or not a team is in an appropriate tier.
- Besides the opinion of players, can you provide other evidence of skill imbalance, such as the Tier 2 Standings, team records, and point differentials?
- Is there a team participating for multiple seasons in Tier 2 basketball that is notoriously over-skilled? From your findings, it seems that all players are willing to participate in a Player Profile survey, but can skill imbalance be dealt with on a case-by-case basis so that Player Profile surveys don't have to be conducted?

- If teams are mainly concerned about unfairness in the Tier 2 playoffs, is it possible for the over-skilled team to be placed in the Tier 1 playoff bracket?
- This report focuses on the *current* state of the skill imbalance in the Tier 2 Division. If skill imbalance is only a significant issue for one season, then it may not be reasonable to implement the Player Profile system. Is there evidence showing that skill imbalance has been an issue for a long time?
- The purpose of the report is to find a way to prevent *clearly experienced players* from participating in the novice, Tier 2 division. Players you interviewed expressed concerns with the accuracy of the Player Profile. Would it be appropriate to define clearly experienced players are those that have varsity and provincial level experience? Would it be easier to simply create a rule stating that Provincial and Varsity players are restricted to playing in the Elite and Tier 1 divisions?
 - From your recommendations, it seems like you are trending toward a zero-tolerance rule for current Varsity basketball players participating in Tier 2 basketball. I suggest making this more clear in your report.
- In order for this report to be considered a feasibility report, it should address the extra work or cost incurred due to implementation of your proposed solutions.
 - Where exactly online would this Player Profile survey be accessed?
 - What would it cost to implement this Player Profile system?
 - Will it really satisfy more players if this system was implemented?
 - Is introducing a Player Profile really necessary to make the divisions fairer?

Has the report identified and analyzed a problem or an area for improvement, and has it recommended workable and affordable solutions?

- The report has identified and analyzed a problem and has recommended a solution that seems like it would work. However, the report does not address potential downfalls in this Player Profile system. Such as players purposefully giving themselves lower point totals so that they can participate with friends. I would imagine that a more complicated system would have to be implemented in order to deal with such problems that could arise, but nonetheless this possible problem should be stated.
- More information should be provided to suggest that this is the best solution to this problem. A comparison between different solutions would be very informative in this report.

Do any important technical terms in the report need definition for the intended audience?

- What does it mean to be a Provincial level player? Does it mean that they play or have played on a Provincial basketball team? Does it mean that they competed in Provincial Basketball Championship tournaments?

Content of Introduction

Notes on Introduction:

- **Unnecessary Information:** Intramural Manager, Scott Shirley, should be well aware of what the UBC Recreation Basketball Intramural league is called. Also, the level of competitiveness/skill is implied in the name of each Division.
- **Unnecessary Words:** For example, "...divided into different divisions..."

Consider the first paragraph of the Introduction:

"The UBC basketball intramural, known as the Nitobe Basketball League, is divided into different divisions where teams of different skill level can register. The top division (most competitive) is called "Elite", which is followed by "Tier 1", then "Tier 2", and finally "Just For Fun" in the order of decreasing competitiveness. These different divisions are meant to separate teams of different skill levels and allow competition to be as fair and fun as possible for teams with similar skill level."

Consider the following rewritten first paragraph (sentence) of the Introduction:

The Nitobe Basketball League consists of four divisions – Elite, Tier 1, Tier 2, and Just For Fun – to allow for teams of similar skill to play against one another, which promote fair competition and a good atmosphere.

Consider the first few sentences of the second Introduction paragraph:

"Generally, the most skilled players and teams compete in the top two divisions (elite and tier 1). These teams generally consist of provincial level players or players currently on the varsity team. Tier 2 is meant for average players who are still looking to compete but are not professionals at the sport."

Notes second Introduction paragraph:

- "Generally, the most skilled players and teams compete in the top two divisions (elite and tier 1)." The top two divisions do not have to be detailed in parentheses in this sentence. Since the Intramural Manager should be aware of how the league is set-up and also because this was described recently in the previous paragraph.
- Sentences 1 and 2 could be rewritten as:
"The most skilled players (often those with provincial or varsity experience) and teams compete in Elite or Tier 1."

Organization

With the help of informative headings, the report is logically laid out. Overall, the report flows naturally and is easy to navigate. With the content you currently have, I cannot make suggestions that will improve your report with respect to organization.

Style

Is the tone objective rather than subjective?

- The tone remains objective and unbiased throughout the report.

Does tone reflect the you-attitude toward the identified reader emphasized in *Technical Communication*?

- The benefit for addressing the issue you present and ease by which your solution can be implemented should be reiterated throughout your report. It is important for your audience to realize the importance of your report.

Are there any individual paragraphs or passages where a reader has difficulty following the writer's thinking?

- Third paragraph: In the first sentence, it is suggested that the solution to the problem is to introduce a Player Profile for all participants. However, the real solution is the Player Profile *restrictions* that you intended to implement. The restrictions given a player's particular Player Profile should be introduced in the first sentence.

Grammar and Spelling:

- Third paragraph, third sentence: "...a participant who have indicated..." should be changed to "a participant who has indicated."
- The last sentence of the third paragraph of the Conclusion is one example of a very long sentence that could be revised to read more concisely.
- Page 5, first paragraph: "basket team" should be corrected to "basketball team."
- 'Tier 2' should be consistently capitalized.

Design

Overall, the design of the report is visually appealing, but extra attention should be paid to keeping spaces after headings consistent. Also, the use of a running header is standard in a formal report.

Figures:

- Figure 2:
 - The description of the figure could be more concise and informative. For instance, it could read, “Summary of Player Profile survey responses of the 15 participants scoring 0 to 10 survey points.” It is important for the intended audience to understand the figure given the accompanying description and without the surrounding text.
 - In the figure itself over “past team experience,” High School and Casual bars should be switched.
 - Capitalization of the sections in the figure should be consistent.
 - The maximum value on the graph should be the maximum number of responses from a given option. So the maximum in this case should be ten.
 - Finally, the “hours spent playing” title should be more accurately described as, “Hours Spent Playing per Week.”
- More informative figure descriptions would help enhance your report.

Your formal report draft was very easy to read and informative. However, you can further improve the content of your report and the overall quality of your conclusions and recommendations if you consider the points I mentioned above. If you have any questions regarding my comments, please email me at svandt@hotmail.com.